EMERGING DIMENSIONS OF NON-TRADITIONAL SECURITY: HUMAN SECURITY IN PAKISTAN

*Safia Mansoor and Dr Asia Mukhtar**

Abstract

The concept of security has undergone profound transformation marked by a paradigm shift, consequent of the growing importance of non-traditional threats periling human security and state security. Non-traditional security threats have not been adequately addressed by Pakistan. Moreover, the fall-out of Global War on Terrorism (GWOT) affected Pakistan the most, given its geostrategic location and role as a frontline ally of the US. It undermined Pakistan's human dimension of security in two ways: firstly, the scourge of terrorism directly aggravated the situation of human security, and secondly, it further led to the marginalisation of various issues such as water scarcity, environmental degradation, food insecurity, population explosion and energy crises which have been transformed into non-traditional security threats and are horrendously affecting the human security and state stability. This paper is an attempt to investigate the delicate issue of Pakistan's increasing human insecurity in the theoretical context of non-traditional security paradigm. To establish the main hypothesis, both primary and secondary sources are consulted. Major research outcomes mostly comply with the core hypothesis which is an urgent call to deal with the ever-enhancing human security concern in Pakistan.

Keywords: GWOT, Human Security, Non-Traditional Security Threats.

Introduction

Security has acquired new facets after the end of the Cold war, conjoined with galloping globalisation, environmental issues, and most importantly international terrorism. The incessant change in security discourse and nature of emerging threats has led to the expansion of security agenda which has now transcended the state security. The constant flux in the global strategic environment has led to a paradigm shift from traditional or hard security, which regards military power as a core determinant of international security, to non-traditional or soft security which considers the threats emanating from non-military sources.[1] The rise of radicalisation at global and regional levels further highlighted the key limitations of traditional security approach and reawakened the non-traditional threat

*Safia Mansoor is a graduate of Kinnaird College for Women University, Lahore and Dr Asia Mukhtar is Assistant Professor in Kinnaird College for Women, Lahore.

perception. Consequent to the 9/11 attacks, Global War on Terrorism (GWOT) was launched, and Pakistan decided to join it due to the international community's call and geo-strategic imperatives.[2]

Being embroiled in traditional security challenges since its inception, unfortunately, Pakistan never focused on the non-traditional threats and its human security concerns remained neglected. The situation worsened after 9/11, as the fallout of GWOT formidably affected Pakistan's stability, and further cornered human security. Diversion towards GWOT at its Western border and scourge of terrorism inside the state, combined with the negligence of policymakers, grim socio-political situation, and bad governance provided a conducive environment to the non-traditional security threats to flourish. Pakistan is currently overwhelmed by acute non-traditional threats such as terrorism, environmental degradation, water scarcity, food insecurity, population explosion and youth bulge, and energy insecurity which are cumulatively undermining and threatening human security as well as stability and security of the state.

In this backdrop, this paper highlights 1) traditional and non-traditional security paradigm, 2) significance of non-traditional security threats after the event of 9/11, 3) intrinsic link between human security and non-traditional security threats, 4) human security profile of Pakistan through the prism of non-traditional security challenges facing Pakistan in post 9/11 era and recommends 5) human security approach to counter non-traditional security threats.

Theoretical Framework

Security, as defined by academicians and scholars from an International Relations perspective implies the freedom from vulnerabilities and threats, real or putative, originating from an anarchic international system. The subject of security was constructed through the lens of Realism during the Cold War era, which led to the emergence of the concept of security as a state-centred approach. This is known as the traditional security paradigm, which emphasizes the protection of a state and accents the role of military power, as it considers that security threats arise primarily out of external sources.[3] The end of the Cold War marked the emergence of new threats, particularly the awareness of the pervasive threats that had been inadequately addressed such as ethnic confrontations, intra-state conflicts, forced displacement, terrorism, HIV/AIDS, extreme poverty, environmental degradation etc.-threats that were closely connected, borderless and potentially crippling for the societies.[4] The transformation of the socio-political configuration in the international arena raised the limitations of the traditional state-centric security

perspective which marked a shift in the analysis and study from a traditional security approach to a non-traditional security framework.

Richard H. Ullman asserted that considering national security merely in military terms is doubly misleading; firstly, it ignores the threats emanating from non-military sources which have potential to undermine stability of the state in the forthcoming years; secondly, it surmises that threats cropping up from state's outside sources are more perilous to its security than hazards that emanate within it. His comprehensive definition of non-traditional security entails, a threat to the national security is an action or sequence of events that dramatically jeopardizes and over a short time duration to deteriorate the quality of life for the state's inhabitants or gravely threatens to circumscribe the policy options to the government, non-governmental and private entities within a state.[5]

Mely Caballero-Anthony has defined non-traditional security threats as those threats which fundamentally emanate from non-military sources. This list includes climate change, cross-border environmental degradation, depletion of resources, food shortages, natural disasters, infectious diseases, irregular migration, drug trafficking, people smuggling, and other categories of transnational crime posing challenges to the survival and well-being of humans as well as states.

Apart from the non-traditional security threats, various other threats are non-traditional such as transnational terrorism, energy insecurity, and cybercrime.[6] Non-traditional threats have six distinct characteristics:

- Non-traditional security threats have a transnational character extrapolated apropos of their genesis, conceptions, and consequences.
- They are delineated in socio-economic and political terms.
- Non-traditional threats beget political and societal instability and eventually become security threat.
- The effects of these threats are arduous to revert or repair.
- Non-traditional security threats require multilateral and regional cooperation due to the inadequacy of national solutions.
- Non-traditional security threats are perilous for people (either individuals or societies) and states (sovereignty and territory).[7]

Threats to the state not merely emanate from the military of the enemy, rather the environment including social and economic issues, pandemics, and climate change has been added to the security agenda.[8] Intra-state conflicts and non-state actors have assumed substantial significance as new-age threats periling the national security of the states. Other non-traditional security threats, particularly

environmental degradation has emerged as a serious and credible threat to the existence of present-day states.[9] Another rising concern is that non-traditional security threats have the potential to transform into traditional security threats among states and the best example in this regard is energy and water security issues among the Central Asian States (CARs).[10]

The value or emerging significance of the non-traditional security threats can be summed up into two assumptions; firstly, various well-known phenomena such as food shortages, infectious diseases, and illegal migration, which previously had an indirect impact on security, now directly threatens the well-being and survival of peoples as well as states due to processes of globalization. However, the issue is not the essence of these threats – starvation, epidemics, and migration, etc. have been present throughout the entire history of mankind – but rather to their novel attributes: scale, speed in transmission, potential to roll out on extremely short notice, and the powerlessness to be completely prevented. Secondly, the new face of these threats incapacitates the states to unilaterally solve the problems, necessitating multilateral cooperation.[11]

Non-Traditional Security Elements in the Post 9/11 Era

Though a non-traditional security paradigm emerged in the last decade of the 20th century, these threats were not fully appreciated and recognized as a global security concern until the 9/11 terrorist attacks on the World Trade Centre and Pentagon.[12] Before this catastrophic event, the soft security concerns were rebuffed and refuted, and considered as third-world problems.[13] Terrorism was catapulted to the world affair's centre stage due to the 9/11 event, rendering terrorism a cardinal threat to security in the 21st century. The 9/11 event corroborates the incessant transformation of non-traditional or soft security threats such as terrorism, which is although not a new phenomenon but has become complex and multidimensional. Besides, it once again highlighted key limitations of the traditional or hard security paradigm in tackling terrorism and led to the revisiting of the traditional security approaches to develop a counter-terrorism framework in the post-9/11 security environment.[14]

Non-Traditional Security Threats-Human Security Nexus

The 1994 Human Development Report (HDR) loosely defined human security as freedom from fear and want.[15] Human security can be explicitly defined as protection from chronic threats such as disease, hunger and repression, and safety from hurtful and sudden disruptions in daily life. Human security is a people-centric approach, its components are interdependent; it is of universal concern and early

prevention is an easier way to ensure human security.[16] The four assumptions which characterize human security are given below:

- Protection of fundamental freedom which constitutes the essence of life.
- Protection of people from pervasive and critical situations and threats.
- Use of processes that build on strengths and aspirations of people.
- Creating social, political, economic, environmental, cultural, and military systems that through integration provide humans with the building blocks for existence, livelihood, and dignity.[17]

The relation between non-traditional security threats and human security is very explicit. Non-traditional security threats such as terrorism, environmental degradation including water scarcity, food insecurity, population explosion, and energy insecurity, etc. are the main challenges to human security and are the fundamental source of human insecurities. Table-1 shows the various elements of human security, their essential components, and the threats which cause human insecurity.

Table-1: Components of Human Security and Threats to Human Security's Components[18]

Components of Human Security	Essentials of Respective Components	Threats Causing Insecurity
Economic Security	Assured basic income, employment, access to social safety net	Unemployment, poverty
Food Security	Physical, economic and social access to food supply, basic nutrition	Lack of access to sufficient and nutritious food supply, famine, hunger
Health Security	Access to basic health services, protection from unhealthy lifestyles and diseases	Lack of access to basic health services, diseases, malnutrition, unsafe food
Environmental Security	Protection against environmental degradation, safety of masses from environmental dangers caused by human or natural process	Environmental degradation (Pollution, natural disasters, depletion of resources such as water, oil, natural gas)
Personal Security	Protection of civil liberties and human rights, protection from physical violence of state as well as other entities	Physical violence, human rights violation

Community Security	Protection of community identity and ethnic groups, conservation of cultures and traditions, protection from harsh practices and discrimination against indigenous and ethnic groups	Ethnic violence, discrimination, harsh treatment, oppressive traditional practices
Political Security	Protection from political repression, mistreatment, torture and abduction, abolishment of systematic ill-treatment, political detention and imprisonment	Ill-treatment, political repression, systematic torture, human rights abuses

Source: Janusz Gierszewski, Personal Security within the Human Security.

Mapping Contours of Human Security in Pakistan

Before describing the human security profile of Pakistan, it is essential to highlight the national security orientation of Pakistan. Since Pakistan's inception in 1947, serious security threats to territorial integrity and national sovereignty have been faced by it, particularly from perennial enemy India. Kashmir dispute, fateful episode of East Pakistan separation and the massive role played by India in this regard, undeniable support of India in fuelling secessionism in Balochistan, turbulent relations with Afghanistan, and fears pertaining to rising Indian influence in Afghanistan have created a security psyche which dictates the policy of Pakistan in the realm of national security. [19] Resultantly, a state-centric national security approach was adopted by Pakistan to counter local and regional threats and led to the evolution of the national security state in Pakistan. [20]

The traditional security paradigm led to the complete marginalization of human security in Pakistan. This is also posited by Dr Maleeha Lodhi in her book 'Pakistan: Beyond the crisis state' that the increase in the hard power of the state, particularly against India has deteriorated the human security in Pakistan. [21] Situation of human security in Pakistan in post 9/11 era can be analysed through the prevalence of various non-traditional security threats (terrorism, environmental degradation and climate change, water scarcity, food insecurity, population explosion, and energy crises) and their ramifications on human security and its several components.

Terrorism

9/11 attacks further deteriorated Pakistan's already grim situation of human security. Global War on terrorism (GWOT) was launched and Pakistan became the frontline state, with a primary role to provide logistical support and ensure supply's

route safety through the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa to the International Security Assistance Force (ISAF).[22] Consequently, the security environment of Pakistan was affected the most in the entire world. The attacks of 9/11 and the resultant war on terror have aggravated traditional security parameters as well as non-traditional security concerns of Pakistan. As far as traditional security threats are concerned, Pakistan's involvement in the global security situation and fighting a global war against terrorism on its Western border has made its security situation more volatile.

The disastrous repercussions of 9/11 on non-traditional security have direct and indirect effects. The direct impact includes the penetration of the terrorist outfits in Pakistan's territory jeopardizing personal and economic security. After the ISAF operation, various terrorist outfits escaped from Afghanistan and sought refuge in the border areas near Pakistan. Pakistan faced colossal life, economic, and infrastructure loss because of recurrent suicide terrorist attacks carried out by various armed insurgents groups as a castigation of Pakistan's alliance with the US, and kinetic operations in Swat and FATA. It became an alarming situation for the security and sovereignty of Pakistan.[23] Humongous human capital loss from 2003 to 2016 due to terrorist attacks in Pakistan includes the deaths of 6660 security forces and 21,485 civilians. Pakistan has also suffered from economic and financial losses due to terrorism particularly after 9/11. Since 9/11, Pakistan has faced the direct and indirect economic cost of almost $126.79 billion, linked to terrorist activities. Further, normal trading and economic activities have been adversely affected, increasing the cost of investing and doing business in Pakistan. It has also severely affected the international trade of Pakistan, which has caused the loss in market share and has been an impediment in achieving targeted growth rates.[24] Pakistan army carried out military operations such as Zarb-e-Azb and Radd-ul-Fasaad to eliminate the terrorist outfits[25] and National Action Plan (NAP) began in 2014 to fetter the scourge of terrorism. Although NAP and military operations have remained successful in curbing terrorism, the ramifications of terrorism on socio-economic development and human security are long-lasting.

Indirect impact entails marginalization of various salient sectors and issues: environment, water, population, and food, which have now emerged as non-traditional security threats to Pakistan, periling human security as well as the national security of Pakistan.

Beyond Terrorism
The human security predicament of Pakistan can further be extrapolated through the prevalence and severity of various non-traditional security threats, apathy to the looming destructive consequences of these threats, and lack of policy

mechanisms to mitigate or curb the challenges. Institutional consolidation of human security as UN millennium development goals, later upgraded as Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), demonstrates the dire need for prioritization and adoption of human security agenda by states. Pakistan in this regard represents the sorry state of affairs. Pakistan ranked 154 out of 189 on the 2020 Human Development Index measured by combining indicators of income, educational attainment, and life expectancy. [26] Besides terrorism, below mentioned non-traditional security threats are illustrative of the neglected and deplorable human dimension of security in Pakistan.

Environmental Degradation and Climate Change

Environmental degradation has become a colossal threat to Pakistan. The quality of the environment is depleting due to various factors such as population growth, urbanization, and accelerated industrial growth causing land, water, and air pollution. The unsustainable pattern of natural resources' consumption and production methods is also an underlying cause of degradation of the environment. Air contamination due to industrial and vehicular emissions has caused Pakistan to be ranked as the world's second most polluted country with PM2.5 reading of 74.3 microgram per cubic metre ($\mu g/m^3$) exceeding the maximum criteria of 10 microgram per cubic metre.[27] Quality of underground water and freshwater bodies are deteriorating rapidly due to sewage discharge into supplies of water system, and disposal of unsafe and untreated waste from industries posing serious health risks.[28] Additionally, environmental degradation is triggering climate change. Pakistan is the 5th most vulnerable state to climate change according to the 2020 Global Climate Risk Index.[29] In Pakistan, the annual mean temperature has increased by 0.5°C in the last 50 years which is expected to rise by 3°C to 5°C by the end of the 21st century.[30] The climate change concerns of Pakistan include likely repercussions of receding glaciers of the Himalayas on the Indus River system, rapid increase in variability of monsoons, reduction of hydropower during years of drought, hydrological reserves shrinkage, and extreme events such as droughts and floods. Besides this, climate change-induced ramifications entail severe water scarcity, food insecurity caused by decreasing livestock and agricultural production, loss of biodiversity, degradation of ecosystems, and shifting of some biomes towards the North.[31]

The impacts of climate change will be destructive for agrarian economies such as Pakistan, where there is already low per capita income and inadequate capacity building. Climate change will significantly impact the melting rate of glaciers and precipitation patterns, especially changing the strength and timing of monsoon rainfall. Quintessentially, this will affect the efficiency and productivity of Pakistan's water-dependent sectors such as energy and agriculture.[32] Being an

agrarian state, 80% of the country's exports are agro-based. Northern snowfall and Himalayan glaciers which are melting rapidly supply water for two-third of Pakistan's irrigable land. Moreover, two-third of Pakistan's population is related to the agricultural sector, but still there is no apt infrastructure in Pakistan necessary for the mitigation and adaptation to the effects of climate change.[33] Another worrying sign of climate change is glacier lake outburst floods which can affect seven million people in Pakistan's mountainous region.[34] Furthermore, the coastal cities of Sindh, Thatta, and Badin would drown by 2050, and Karachi by 2026 due to sea level risings if the sea erosion in coastlines and Indus Delta continue unbridled.[35] The appalling situation concerning environmental security is evident from continuous degradation of environment and depletion of resources, particularly water in Pakistan.

Water Scarcity

Water availability is not only necessary for direct human consumption but is also needed for the socio-economic development of any state, as it is a basic requirement to produce food, energy generation, and maintenance of ecosystems that essentially sustain human survival. Pakistan is facing severe water shortage which is creating vulnerabilities and multipronged social challenges. Pakistan ranked third on the list of countries encountering acute water shortages as per a report of the International Monetary Fund. Another report by Pakistan Council of Research in Water Resources (PCRWR) has documented that there will be an absolute water scarcity in Pakistan by 2025.[36] Currently, Pakistan's average water potential is 236 BCM (Billion Cubic Meter) while consumption is around 160 BCM. The exponential rise in population means that by 2025, projected water demand in Pakistan could be 337.9 BCM which implies that Pakistan will be facing a water shortage of nearly 102 BCM. The dramatic reduction of water availability in the country is also quite alarming, as it has decreased from 1500 cubic meters per annum to 1017 cubic meters per annum which could further become meagre.[37]

The various factors which are causing the water crisis are urbanization and population growth. It has further been exacerbated by poor water management, climate change and lack of political will to overcome the crisis.[38] Pakistan's irrigation system is also dilapidated and least efficient which consumes 93 % of total available water whereas loses up to 60% of irrigation water during transportation and application in fields.[39] The water crisis has also been kicked off by India's construction of dams on Pakistani rivers and silting of dams. The water enigma is a threat for Pakistan and the simple reason behind this argument is that the agrarian state's economy will collapse due to water scarcity leading Pakistan on the verge of obliteration.[40] Security conflicts in the country will be triggered due to water scarcity

as provinces and people will fight for this scarce natural resource. Balochistan and Sindh already accuse Punjab of appropriating the lion's share of water.[41] Water scarcity in Pakistan would cause more food insecurity as it will bar food production.[42] Moreover, the depletion of this social resource which is necessary for running households, agricultural and industrial practices will halt development and horrendously impact social life causing economic insecurity and health insecurity. Moreover, water scarcity has a lethal potential to trigger or exacerbate conflict which will cause personal and community insecurity.

Food Insecurity

Food security and meeting the nutrition targets of SDG-2 by 2030 is a major challenge that is being faced by Pakistan. Prevalence of Undernourishment (PoU) in the country is 20.3%, which has declined from 25.8% in 2001-2003; this reduction in PoU has been reverted by the burgeoning population which means that nearly 40 million people in Pakistan are deprived of enough food. With every passing year, the absolute number of hungry individuals is rising because of various factors such as population growth rate of 2.4%, regular natural disasters, poverty, economic downturns, and slowdowns, which have adversely impacted food accessibility and availability in Pakistan. Despite substantial funds which were allocated for reducing micronutrient deficiency and under nutrition either directly or indirectly, Pakistan remains as one of the slowest countries in the region in terms of improving statistics related to food insecurity, as there is no significant progress in the statistics related to childhood wasting, child stunting and underweight. According to the 2018 National Nutrition survey, wasting among children is at 17.7 %, stunning is at 40.2%, and underweight at 28.9%.[43] The plight of food security can further be determined through the 2019 Global Food Security Index (GFSI), an assessment of food availability, quality, quality, and safety, which has placed Pakistan at 78th position amongst 113 states.[44]

Glacier reservoirs feeding the irrigation system of Pakistan will deplete after a few decades resulting in a 40% reduction of river flows in the Indus basin which is already under the considerable strain of water competition between provinces and sectors. The reduction in river flows will pose a colossal challenge to Pakistan's agriculture and food security.[45] The dry conditions because of 45% average rainfall shortage which Pakistan has been witnessing since 2018, particularly in the South, have adversely affected the Kharif crops-Sugar cane, rice, maize, and millet. The increasing food stress has been a burden on human resources, cause of undernourishment and a toll on the health of women.[46] Another important aspect underpinning food insecurity is market dependency for getting food for masses that are insecure in urban and rural district. Although food is mainly produced in rural

vicinities of Pakistan, people living in villages have comparatively lesser economic accessibility to food than that of urban population. Economic development and concerns of food security are intrinsically linked and buttress one another in the development process. A state that is either unable to produce required food or don't have affordability and resources for food procurement meeting lacuna in demand and supply is insufficient in terms of food sovereignty. Therefore, food security is crucial for the national security of Pakistan as food insecurity can make society insecure, cause grievances, and initiate civil conflict.[47] Consequently, it will severely undermine human security in Pakistan.

Population Explosion

Pakistan is the 5th most populous country in the world, with a mammoth population of 220.1 million. According to the United Nations, there is a six-fold increase in Pakistan's population between 1950 and 2020. The population growth rate in Pakistan stands at 2.8 % which implies that 3.6 million people will be born every year. By 2030, the population in Pakistan is projected to reach a whopping 250.13 million, and the continuity of this pace will double its size in the next 34 years.[48] The gigantic growth in population is unsustainable and poses a serious threat to the socio-economic development of Pakistan. Massive population growth has already been eroding modest socio-economic development gains and inhibiting the efforts of the government to provide for the people's basic needs. It is also making it extremely difficult for the government to eradicate inequality and poverty, combat malnutrition and hunger, invest in health and education, protect local ecosystems, enhance access to basic services and promote an inclusive and peaceful society. A substantial proportion of natural resources of the country are consumed due to ballooning population; and the housing society's encroachments to accommodate continuously increasing demands for houses is causing environmental degradation, severe electricity and water crises, and shrinking agricultural land. It has also exacerbated urban congestion, contraction in the job market, and food shortages.[49]

Population explosion is a threat to the national security of Pakistan as high population growth in the least developed states is a critical destabilizing factor. An example in this regard is of 80% of 1970s civil conflicts in the world took place in those states with a fast-growing young population. A huge youth bulge poses a serious challenge to the internal security of the country as it is becoming a liability due to slow economic growth and little investment in the education sector. The inability of the state to use this demographic power has already turned Pakistan into a breeding ground for radicalism and violent extremism, which can further cause conflict and social dislocation.[50] Youth constitutes 63% of the total population [51] but

the issue of youth bulge and population explosion remains missing from the policy discourse of Pakistan which can further deteriorate the already lamentable situation of human security and can be disastrous for the internal stability of the state.

Energy Crisis

Acute energy insecurity is being experienced by Pakistan in the form of energy poverty, demand and supply gap, soaring energy prices and import dependency, refined energy resources and lack of access to the electricity grid, and load shedding. Additionally, it includes the burgeoning cost of procurement, declining reliability of energy infrastructure, bounded diversification in supplies, and energy production and consumption's negative externalities.[52] Pakistan's current transmission and distribution capacity is 22,000MW (Megawatt), while the consumer demand is 25,000MW, leading to an energy deficit of about 3,000MW.[53] This demand is expected to increase by 500MW in the upcoming years in various sectors such as agriculture, construction, manufacturing and education. Moreover, Pakistan's electrification rate is the lowest amongst its neighbours, as 51 million Pakistanis have no access to the electric grid.[54] This data depicts the grim state of energy security in Pakistan.

A third of Pakistan's energy resources are imported in the form of oil, liquefied natural gas and coal. This unsustainable import-driven energy policy creates long term energy insecurity. It exposes the country's economy to energy price shocks, drains its foreign exchange reserves, making the already strangled economy vulnerable to inflation. Competitiveness of the state's exports is reduced due to inflationary pressures, further stifling the capacity of the economy to import energy.[55] Power shortages in Pakistan are rooted in the increasingly unaffordable and irrational energy mix: 58.4% thermal, 30.9% hydropower, 8.2 % nuclear and 2.4% renewable energy.[56] Pakistan's heavy dependence on expensive thermal power generation (through oil, natural or coal) and hydropower don't assure an unrestricted flow of power. High reliance on oil-based energy increases the prices of power in Pakistan. Moreover, the critical energy crisis is costly to the state's economy in the form of high circular debts and huge subsidies. The misguided energy mix also deteriorates the already grave and critical environmental issues, which demonstrates itself in unsafe drinking water and poor air quality.[57]

A string of energy challenges has led to profoundly negative impacts on people's normal lives but also created impediments in the progress and development of the country. Shortage of energy is hobbling the state's industry and has led to the closure of many industries causing further unemployment. According to Michael Kugelman, the acute energy crisis of Pakistan has tremendous repercussion for the

floundering economy and volatile security situation.[58] Besides having the potential to destabilize the state's stability, energy crisis can cause human security challenges in three ways: environmental insecurity due to the current energy mix, health insecurity particularly caused by exposure to air pollution which is in turn caused by colossal reliance on thermal power, and economic insecurity from rising unemployment as a result of industries' closure and GDP loss.

Integrating UN's Human Security Approach to Counter Non-Traditional Security Threats to Pakistan

According to the UN General Assembly Resolution 66/290, the human security approach aims at assisting the UN member states in identifying and addressing the cross-cutting challenges to the livelihood, survival and dignity of the respective state's people. This approach demands comprehensive, people-centred, prevention-oriented and context specific responses to protect and empower the people.[59]

According to the United Nations Human Security Handbook, the appeal and strength of human security as an operational tool for analysis, implementation and impact lies in the components which are described in Table-2.[60]

Table-2: Human Security as an Operational Tool

Axioms of Human Security	Description
People-centred	Human security policy and actions are people-centric
Comprehensive	Human security is an all-encompassing approach, it addresses the human insecurities in totality, and advances prioritized and integrated solutions through advancing multi-actor/multi-sectoral responses
Coherence	To avoid negative outcomes, coherence is required between different interventions
Contextualization	Human security is a context-specific approach as it is a universally flexible and broad approach that considers the varying nature of insecurities in different communities and countries
Partnership & Collaboration	Human security foregrounds the formation of an inter-connected network comprising of diverse stakeholders to draw resources and expertise from various actors
Emphasis on Prevention	This approach emphasizes the development of mechanism for early prevention of threats to diminish their impacts

Greater Resilience & Sustainability	Human security presents a dual policy framework based on the two mutually enforcing pillars: protection and empowerment; it combines top-down and bottom-up norms, pinpoints gaps in existing framework
Bench-marking, Evaluation & Assessment	Human security provides contextual and all-inclusive account of needs of people along with factors jeopardizing their survival, dignity, and livelihood; the holistic analyses can be very useful in assessing already existing policies and institutional arrangement and benchmarks for impact evaluation and assessment

Source: Author's own compilation.

While keeping into consideration the various axioms of human security approach described in Table-2, Pakistan can integrate and implement this approach to curb or adapt to the lethal non-traditional security threats. It would adequately address the non-military threats to the integrity of Pakistan by extending the scope of policy and security analysis from traditional state-centric security to human security. Policymakers in Pakistan in collaboration with the United Nations must design a human security program under this approach to identify and address human insecurities, formulate people-centric policies, and come up with the holistic and integrated solution by involving multiple actors and forging collaboration with various stakeholders. This approach will be immensely useful in adopting proactive preventive responses, protecting Pakistanis from previously mentioned soft security threats, and in empowering them. On one hand, the human security approach is a proven analytical and effective framework for responding to contemporary and emerging intricate-cum-interconnected challenges, while on the other hand, it complements state security rather than compromising it.

Conclusion

Traditional security or securing the border has always remained the core issue of Pakistan security policy owing to historical reasons, particularly the threat perception from the eastern border. Lamentably economic, political, social, environmental security, in sum human security, never remained the agenda or priority of policymakers or security planners. The woefully inadequate situation of human security became more deplorable after the calamitous event of 9/11, which made Pakistan endure an immeasurable loss by becoming a Front Range ally in the global war on terror. Following 9/11, states began to recognize the deadly potential of non-traditional security threats and started broadening their security orientation, but unfortunately, Pakistan due to its geo-strategic location, previous policies with

respect to Afghanistan and almost no other policy option was compelled to fight a foreign war having enduring effects and neglected human security aspects.

The inevitable trade-off combined with the traditional security paradigm alongside weak economic and political performance has transformed various issues such as energy, water, population, environment and food into the grave and compelling non-traditional-security threats which are catastrophically jeopardizing the human security in Pakistan and will continue to do so in future if not addressed adequately. Soft security threats also possess the devastating potential to destabilize and hurt the state and society. These non-traditional security challenges to Pakistan have now risen to prominence and become more acute which threaten the very sustainability of human life as well as the state, but these are not under much deliberation and nothing effective is done to manage this security deficit.

Resources are merely focused on protecting borders rather than ensuring long-term security for people, governments and states. Adopting the human security approach and formulating mitigation and resilience strategies remains missing from Pakistan's security approach. Besides securing its border, a human security approach must be adopted by Pakistan, to address and curb the chronic non-traditional security challenges. Human security is not merely a theoretical perspective as various states have successfully employed it in their domestic and foreign policy agendas. A holistic security paradigm comprising of traditional and human security in contrast to purely military concept of security is indispensable due to the broad spectrum of threats facing Pakistan that are inextricably conjoined and simultaneously reinforcing periling the human security and state integrity.

Moreover, traditional security elements are generating challenges/hazards or crisis situations for the non-traditional security elements. Hence it is prime time to address them. In the case of Pakistan, it has become even more pivotal as Pakistan is the prime victim of the GWOT and is facing deadly soft security threats. Additionally, several managerial and administrative issues related to economic, social and development planning are further deteriorating the human security elements in the country. A shift in the security paradigm has now become the last resort to ensure the existence of mankind and the state.

References

1   Saurabh Chaudhuri, "Defining Non-Traditional security threats," Global Indian Foundation, accessed February 19, 2021, https://www.globalindiafoundation.org/nontraditionalsecurity.html.

2   Adeel Muhktar Mirza, "Pakistan Has Contributed Significantly to the Fight against Terrorism," *The Diplomat*, January 9, 2021, https://thediplomat.com/2021/01/pakistan-has-contributed-significantly-to-the-fight-against-terrorism/.

3   Ningthoujam K. Singh and William Nunes, "Nontraditional Security: Redefining State-centric Outlook," *Jadavpur Journal of International Relations* 20, no.1 (2016): 102-124, doi:10.1177/0973598416658805.

4   Shahrbanou Tadjbakhsh, "Human Security: Concepts and Implications with an Application to Post-Intervention Challenges in Afghanistan," *L e s É t u d e s d u C E R I, N° 117-118*(2005), https://www.sciencespo.fr/ceri/sites/ sciencespo.fr.ceri/files/etude117_118.pdf.

5   Richard H Ullman, "Redefining Security," *International Security* 8, no. 1 (1983): 129, doi:10.2307/2538489.

6   Farzana Zaheer Syed and Saba Javed, "Deterrence: A Security Strategy against Non Traditional Security Threats to Pakistan," *International Journal of Social Sciences and Management* 4, no. 4 (2017), 267-274. doi:10.3126/ijssm.v4i4.18503.

7   Mely Caballero-Anthony, "Understanding Non-Traditional Security," in An Introduction to Non-Traditional Security Studies: A Transnational Approach, ed. Mely Caballero-Anthony (Sage Publications, 2016), 6, https://uk.sagepub.com/sites/default/files/upm-assets/73976_book_item_73976.pdf.

8   Shebonti Ray Dadwal and Uttam Kumar Sinha, *Non-Traditional Security Challenges in Asia: Approaches and Responses*. (London: Routledge, 2017), 4.

9   Divya Srikanth,"Non-traditional security threats in the 21st century: A review," *International Journal of Development and Conflict* 4, no. 1 (2014): 60-68, http://www.ijdc.org.in/uploads/1/7/5/7/17570463/2014junearticle4.pdf.

10 Martand Jha, "Does Non-Traditional Security Threats Need to Be Re-defined?" Indian Defence Review. Last modified April 16, 2017,https://www.indiandefencereview.com/news/does-non-traditional-security-threats-need-to-be-re-defined/#:~:text=For%20the%20purpose%2.

11 Hab. Katarzyna Marzęda-Młynarska, "Non-Traditional Security Challenges And Regional Governance: EU and ASEAN answers to the Migration Crisis(paper presented at the CEEISA-ISA Conference, Maria Curie-SklodowskaUniversity,Lublin,23-25June2-16),
    https://www.wsc.edu/download/downloads/id/1843/chicago_citation_style_examples_-_17th_edition.pdf

12 Leanne Jennifer Smythe, "Non-traditional security in the post-Cold War era: implications of a broadened security agenda for the militaries of Canada and Australia." (PhD diss., University of British Columbia, 2013), 22, https://dx.doi.org/10.14288/1.0073732.

13 Martand Jha, "Does Non-Traditional Security Threats Need to Be Re-defined?".

14 Muhammad Ijaz Latif and Rehman Afzal Khan, "Tackling Terrorism: Traditional Security Approaches." *Pakistan Horizon* 64, no. 2 (2011): 21-31, https://www.jstor.org/stable/24711175.

15 Oscar A. Gómez and Des Gasper*,"Human security: A thematic guidance note for regional and national human development report teams.*" (UNDP, 2013), http://hdr.undp.org/en/content/human-security-guidance-note.

16 United Nations Development Programme, "*Human Development Report 1994.*,"(New York: Oxford University Press, 1994), https://www.undp.org/content/undp/en/home/librarypage/hdr/human-development-report-1994.html#:~:text=The%201994%20Report%20introduces%20a,global%20co

17 Cristina Churruca Muguruza, "Human Security as a policy framework: Critics and Challenges," *Yearbook of humanitarian action and human rights* 4 (2007): 15-35, https://djhr.revistas.deusto.es/article/view/1126/1308.

18 Table's data has been retrieved from Janusz Gierszewski, "Personal Security within the Human Security Paradigm," *Security Dimensions. International and National Studies* 23 (2017): 51-66, DOI 10.24356/SD/23/2;Taylor Owen, *Challenges and opportunities for defining and measuring human security*, No. 3 2004 (UN DisarmamentForum,2004),https://www.peacepalacelibrary.nl/ebooks/files/UNIDIR_pdf-art2138.pdf

19 Syed Ali Zia Jaffrey, "Pakistan's Security Paradigm," Centre for Strategic and Contemporary Research, updated November 25, 2016, https://cscr.pk/explore/themes/defense-security/pakistans-security-paradigm/.

20 Arshad Ali and Robert G. Patman. "The Evolution of the National Security State in Pakistan: 1947–1989." *Democracy and Security* 15, no. 4 (2019), 301-327. doi:10.1080/17419166.2019.1566063.

21 Maleeha Lodhi, "Beyond the Crisis State", *in Pakistan Beyond the Crisis State* (Karachi: Oxford, 2011), 51.

22 Nirmala Joshi, "Responses to non-traditional threats and challenges," in *Reconnecting India and Central Asia: Emerging security and economic dimensions*, ed. Nirmala Joshi,(Singapore: Central Asian-Caucasus Institute Silk Road Studies Program, 2010),86, https://www.silkroadstudies.org/resources/pdf/Monographs/2010_03_MONO _Joshi_India-CentralAsia.pdf.

23 Saima Afzal, Hamid Iqbal, and Mavara Inayay, "Terrorism and extremism as a non-traditional security threat post 9/11: Implications for Pakistan's security," *International Journal of Business and Social Science* 3, no. 24 (2012): 194-203, http://ijbssnet.com/journals/Vol_3_No_24_Special_Issue_December_2012/21.pdf

24 Muhammad Zakaria, Wen Jun, and Haseeb Ahmed, "Effect of terrorism on economic growth in Pakistan: an empirical analysis," *Economic research-Ekonomska istraživanja* 32, no. 1 (2019): 1794-1812, https://doi.org/10.1080/1331677X.2019.1638290

25 Madiha Afzal, "Terrorism in Pakistan Has Declined, but the Underlying Roots of Extremism Remain," Brookings, Updated January 15, 2021,https://www.brookings.edu/blog/order-from-chaos/2021/01/15/terrorism-in-pakistan-has-declined-but-the-underlying-roots-of-extremism-remain/.

26 Mehtab Haider, "Pakistan's HDI falls 2 notches to 154th position," *THE NEWS*, December 17,2020, https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/760035-pakistan-s-hdi-falls-2-notches-to-154th-position#:~:text=National&text=ISLAMABAD%3A%20Pakistan's%20ranking%20on%20Human,it%20fell%20to%20154th%20position.

27 "Air Quality in Lahore,"IQ*Air,* updated Feb16, 2021, https://www.iqair.com/us/pakistan/punjab/lahore.

28 "Call for End to Dumping Industrial, Domestic Effluent, Solid Waste in Freshwater Bodies," *DAWN,* March 23, 2017, https://www.dawn.com/news/1322188/call-for-end-to-dumping-industrial-domestic-effluent-solid-waste-in-freshwater-bodies.

29 David Eckstein, Vera Künzel , Laura Schäfer, and Maik Winges, *"Global climate risk index 2020,* (Bonn: Germanwatche.V.,2019),9,https://www.germanwatch.org/sites/germanwatch.org/files/20-2-01e%20Global%20Climate%20Risk%20Index%202020_14.pdf

30 Qamar Uz Zaman Chaudhry, "*Climate change profile of Pakistan,*"(Asian Development Bank,2017), https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/publication/357876/climate-change-profile-pakistan.pdf

31 "Pakistan", UNDP Climate Change Adaption, accessed February 16, 2021, https://www.adaptation-undp.org/explore/pakistan#:~:text=Pakistan's%20climate%20change%20concerns%20include,events%20including%20floods%20and%20droughts.

32 Qamar Uz Zaman Chaudhry, "*Climate change profile of Pakistan,*"

33 Mudassar Hussain et al., "A comprehensive review of climate change impacts, adaptation, and mitigation on environmental and natural calamities in Pakistan," *Environ Monit Assess* 192, no. 1 (2020): 1-20, https://doi.org/10.1007/s10661-019-7956-4

34 Syed Muhammad Abubakar,"Can Pakistan's Mountain Communities Protect Themselves against Melting Glaciers?" *DAWN*, May 7, 2020, https://www.dawn.com/news/1532235.

35 Atif Butt, "Karachi May Sink into the Ocean by 2060, Senate Warns," *DAWN*, March 13, 2015,https://www.dawn.com/news/1169339.

36 Zahra Khan Durrani, "Water Scarcity and Social Vulnerabilities: A Multi-Dimensional Perspective of Water Challenges in Pakistan," *The Journal of Sustainability Education,*(2020), http://www.susted.com/wordpress/content/water-scarcity-and-social-vulnerabilities-a-multi-dimensional-perspective-of-water-challenges-in-pakistan_2020_03/.

37 Tayyab Ali, "Whooping Water Crisis: A National Security Challenge for Pakistan," *The Frontier Post,* June 28, 2020. https://thefrontierpost.com/whooping-water-crisis-a-national-security-challenge-for-pakistan/.

38 "Water Crisis: Why is Pakistan Running Dry? ,"*Deutsche Welle*, February 16, 2021, https://www.dw.com/en/water-crisis-why-is-pakistan-running-dry/a-44110280

39 Myra Imran, "More than 60 per cent of irrigation water is wasted," *The News*, September 24,2018, https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/372313-more-than-60-per-cent-of-irrigation-water-is-wasted#:~:text=Islamabad%20%3A%20Irrigated%20agriculture%20in%20Pakistan,and%20application%20in%20the%20field.&text=Irrigated%20agriculture%20consumes%2093%20per%20cent%20of%20the%20available%20water%20resources.

40 Naveed Abbas Maitlo,"Water Scarcity - a Threat for Pakistan," *The Nation*, May 28, 2019, https://nation.com.pk/29-May-2019/water-scarcity-a-threat-for-pakistan.

41 "Pakistan Water Crisis: Country to Run out of Water by 2025," ValueWalk, updated May 31, 2018, https://www.valuewalk.com/2018/05/pakistan-water-crisis-clean-water-2025/.

42 Muhammad Amir Fahim, "Impact of water scarcity on food security at macro level in Pakistan," Munich Personal RePEc Archive(2011), https://mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/35760/

[43] FAO, WFP, WHO, UNICEF, and Ministry of National Food Security and Research Government of Pakistan, *Pakistan Overview of Food Security and Nutrition: Improving access to food* (2019), https://www.wfp.org/publications/pakistan-overview-food-security-and-nutrition-2019.

[44] "Rankings and Trends: Performance of countries based on their 2019 food security score," Global Food Security Index (GFSI), Accessed February 17, 2021, https://foodsecurityindex.eiu.com/index.

[45] Muhammad A. Fahim, "Impact of water scarcity on food security at macro level in Pakistan".

[46] Stephanie Psaki et al., "Household food access and child malnutrition: results from the eight-country MAL-ED study," *Population Health Metrics* 10, no. 1 (2012), doi: 10.1186/1478-7954-10-24.

[47] Iram Khalid, "Food Security: Understanding Pakistan's National Security Concerns," *Journal of Political Studies, Special Issue* (2018),121-132, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/ 344173260_Food_Security _Understanding_Pakistan's_National_Security_Concerns

[48] "Pakistan Surpasses Brazil to Become World's 5th Most Populous Country," *Gulf News,* July 12, 2020, https://gulfnews.com/world/asia/pakistan/pakistan-surpasses-brazil-to-become-worlds-5th-most-populous-country-1.72557051.

[49] UNDP Pakistan,"Population Growth: Implications for Human Development," (Islamabad: UNDP Pakistan, 2019) https://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/library/development_policy/dap-vol6-iss1-population-growth.html.

[50] Zahid Hussain,"Population and Security," *IPS News Agency,* October 24, 2018. https://www.ipsnews.net/2018/10/ population-and-security/.

[51] Mahar Munawar, "Human (in) security in Pakistan," *Daily Times,* May 3, 2019. https://dailytimes.com.pk/387192/ human-insecurity-in-pakistan/.

[52] Muhammad Asif and Naila Saleh, "Human Security and Energy Security: A Case Study of Pakistan," *Policy Perspectives* 16, no. 1 (2019): pp. 99–116, www.jstor.org/stable/10.13169/polipers.16.1.0099.

[53] Maha Rehman, "Pakistan's Electricity Generation Has Increased over Time. So Why Do We Still Not Have Uninterrupted Supply?," *DAWN,* June 10, 2019, https://www.dawn.com/news/1430728.

[54] "Pakistan-Country commercial guide," International Trade Administration, updated October 13, 2019, https://www.trade.gov/knowledge-product/pakistan-renewable-energy#:~:text=Pakistan's%20energy%20sector%20remains%20one%20of%20the%20main%20obstacles %20to%20economic%20growth.&text=According%20to%20International%20Energy%20Agency,not%20 have%20access%20to%20electricity.

[55] Sadia Malik et al., "Energy security in Pakistan: A quantitative approach to a sustainable energy policy," (ADBI Working Paper 1024, ADBI Institute, 2019), https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/ publication/535821/adbi-wp1024.pdf.

[56] "Thermal Has Largest Share in Pakistan's Energy Mix," *The Express Tribune,* June 11, 2020, https://tribune.com.pk/story/2240789/thermal-largest-share-pakistans-energy-mix.

[57] Muhammad Salar Khan, "Powering the Powerless in Pakistan," *The Diplomat,* November 7, 2018, https://thediplomat.com/2018/11/powering-the-powerless-in-pakistan/.

[58] Muhammad Sufyan et al., "The energy crisis in Pakistan: A possible solution via biomass-based waste," *Journal of Renewable and Sustainable Energy* 8, no. 4 (2016): 043102, doi:10.1063/1.4959974.

[59] "What is Human Security?," United Nations Trust Fund for Human Security, Accessed February 25, 2021, https://www.un.org/humansecurity/what-is-human-security/.

[60] "Human Security: A CCOE info sheet, Civil Military Cooperation", Centre for Excellence, https://www.cimic-coe.org/resources/fact-sheets/info-sheet-human-security.pdf.