

Vol. XXIX

ISSN 2073-0926



NDU
Journal 2015

www.ndu.edu.pk

NDU Journal

Institute for Strategic Studies, Research & Analysis
National Defence University, Islamabad

Editorial Board

Lieutenant General Anwar Ali Hyder, HI (M)	Patron-in-Chief
Major General Noel Israel Khokhar, HI (M)	Patron
Lieutenant Colonel Abdul Basit	Editor
Ms. Qurat ul Ain	Assistant Editor

Advisory Board

Rear Admiral Adnan Nazir, HI(M)	Chief Instructor, Allied Officers Division, NDU, Islamabad
Ambassador Najmuddin A. Shaikh	Former Foreign Secretary Pakistan
Ambassador Dr. Maleeha Lodhi	Permanent Representative of Pakistan to the United Nations – USA
Dr. Syed Rifaat Hussain	HoD, Policy and Public Administration, School of Social Sciences and Humanities, NUST, Islamabad
Dr. Zulfqar Khan	HoD (Strategic Studies), FCS, NDU Islamabad
Dr. Noman Hanif	Department of Politics, School of Social Sciences, History and Philosophy, Birkbeck College, University of London
Prof. Arshin Adib-Moghaddam	Professor, University of London
Prof Takako Hirose	Faculty of International Relations, Daito Bunka University, Japan
Prof. Dr. Shaun Gregory	HoD, Department of Peace Studies, University of Bradford, UK
Prof. Dr. Bulent Aras	Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, Sabanci University, Istanbul, Turkey

NDU Journal is sponsored and edited by the Institute for Strategic Studies, Research & Analysis (ISSRA), National Defence University, Islamabad, Pakistan. Manuscripts and editorial communications may be directed to the editor.

Statements, facts and opinions mentioned in NDU Journal are solely of the authors and do not imply the official policy of the institution, editors and publisher.

**Website: <http://www.ndu.edu.pk>
Email: ddpubnres@ndu.edu.pk**

NDU Journal

Subscription for one copy

- Inland Rs. 500/-
- Overseas US \$ 25/-

Request for subscription may be addressed to:

Editor NDU Journal
National Defence University
Sector E-9, Islamabad, Pakistan
Tel: +92-51-9260651-52 (Extn 5269)
Fax: +92-51-9260663

Website: <http://www.ndu.edu.pk>
Email: ddpubnres@ndu.edu.pk
ISSN: 2073-0926

Published by
National Defence University
Islamabad – Pakistan

CONTENTS

	Page No
• Biosecurity and Pakistan: A Critical Appraisal	1
<i>Dr. Zafar Nawaz Jaspal</i>	
• Perspectives on Pakistan's National Security	35
<i>Noel Israel Khokhar</i>	
• India's Look East Policy: Challenges and Options for Pakistan	55
<i>Raja Qaiser Ahmed</i>	
• Counter Extremists' Narrative in Pakistan	75
<i>Fatima Sajjad</i>	
• Struggling IDPs of North Waziristan in the Wake of Operation Zarb-e-Azb	95
<i>Nida Hameed</i>	
• The Evolving Dynamics of Deterrence Stability in South Asia	117
<i>Muhammad Shafiq ur Rehman and Dr. Muhammad Saif ur Rehman</i>	
• Legal Perspective of Kashmir Issue	135
<i>Dr. Raja Muhammad Khan</i>	
• Use of Print Media for Conflict Resolution and Peace Building: A Case Study of Kashmir Dispute	161
<i>Dr. Anjum Zia and Hajrah Syedah</i>	
• Governance in Pakistan: Legitimacy Regime of NGOs	181
<i>Tahir Ul Mulk Kahlon</i>	

‘NDU Journal’ is an annual publication of National Defence University, the premier institution of security and strategic studies. The journal is a unique publication of the country which primarily deals with the national security issues of Pakistan. The journal has its own standing among the students, researchers, experts, policy makers and intelligentsia. It has been enlisted by International Political Science Abstracts, USA, Bibliography of Asian Studies USA and Ulrichs Periodicals Directory. Keeping the flag high, all the articles appearing in the journal are selected after a rigorous scrutiny and blind peer review at home and abroad. It is the testimony of quality of contents of the journal that **Higher Education Commission of Pakistan** has upgraded the journal to ‘Y’ category.

BIOSECURITY AND PAKISTAN: A CRITICAL APPRAISAL

Dr. Zafar Nawaz Jaspal

Abstract

The biological threats have been arising from both natural and man-made pathogens. Indeed, the dual-use characteristic of biological research increases the chances of its misuse. The biological research dissemination, however, could not be banned because of the immense use of biological agents in human medicines, veterinary prosperity, and agriculture productivity. The benevolent and malevolent use of biological sciences intensifies the significance of Biosecurity. Despite its importance, Biosecurity receives inconsequential attention in Pakistan. The focus on Biosecurity in Pakistan is not much different from other developing countries. The people of Pakistan are vulnerable to Biosecurity related challenges. The complex nature of Biosecurity challenges and underscores that no nation and no institution is capable to deal with them on its own. The only way to deal with these threats and challenges is through an integrated and allied strategic approach, which includes both non-military and military capabilities of like

Introduction

The revolution in biological-sciences and biological-technology signifies Biosecurity in the twenty-first century.¹ Biosecurity is often interchangeably used or confused with Bio-safety. The concepts of Bio-safety and Biosecurity deal with related, but distinctly different puzzles. Bio-safety is a well-established concept with a widely-accepted meaning and international guidance on how it is put into practice at the national level.² The Bio-safety measures aim to prevent the unintentional exposure to pathogens and toxins, or their accidental release.³ The term Biosecurity is a comparatively new one, and thereby its' concept has been evolving. Since 2003, in the setting of the Biological and Toxin Weapons

Convention (BTWC), Biosecurity has most commonly been used to refer to the mechanisms that establish and maintain the security and oversight of pathogenic microorganisms, toxins and relevant resources.⁴ Hence, Biosecurity protects germs from people. And its measures focus on the prevention of theft, misuse, or intentional release of pathogens and toxins.⁵ Today, however, the Biosecurity scope is broader than the BTWC delineation.

The impressive advancements in biotechnology or rapid advances in genetic engineering and the study of pathogenesis (the molecular mechanisms by which microbes cause disease) alarm that terrorists' could be able to create "improved" bio-warfare agents for their nefarious objectives. The ability of scientists to produce life from scratch provides an option to the terrorist group to synthesize deadly pathogens having greater lethality, environmental stability, difficulty of detection, and resistance to existing drugs and vaccines. Jonathan B. Tucker pointed out: "The efficient dispersal of a few kilograms of a biological agent, such as the dried spores of the anthrax bacterium, over a troop concentration or a major city could sicken or kill many thousands of people."⁶ Tucker's anxiety about biological agents was shared by numerous security observers, who believed that "Biotechnology is one of the two technologies that truly deserve the label 'agent of mass destruction' and it is by far the more accessible of the two."⁷ Tucker also pointed out that: "the limited quantities of biological agent required for a devastating attack could be produced with small-scale equipment, occupying perhaps only a single room, and nearly all such equipment is dual-use and available throughout the world."⁸ The dual-use phenomenon added a subverting variable in the Biosecurity. In simple words, a scientists or laboratory technician can steal a small quantity of dangerous pathogens and use it to develop biological weapon himself or pass it onto a terrorist group for monetary or even ideological reasons.⁹

Although, the bioterrorism centralized Biosecurity debate, especially after the anthrax use in fall 2001, yet it has kept the discourse within the traditional security paradigm. The Severe

Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS) contagion in 2002-2003,¹⁰ Influenza A virus epidemic of 2006 (avian influenza), 2007 Equine influenza, 2009 Swine flu and again the Swine flu pandemic outbreak in India in December 2014,¹¹ have alarmed security analysts. Consequently, Biosecurity has emerged as an important area of investigation for the Human Security analysts in the developed world. Conversely, bioterrorism, emerging diseases (SARS) or reemerging infectious disease (tuberculosis, plague) and pandemic flu strains, which are all within the context of rapid global travel, have failed to draw serious response in the developing states.

The focus on Biosecurity in Pakistan is not much different from the other developing states. The people of Pakistan are vulnerable to the Biosecurity related challenges. It was reported that on April 14, 2015, a 57-year-old man died in Lahore after allegedly contracting swine flu.¹² On May 8, 2015, a person died in Islamabad due to Crimean-Congo Hemorrhagic Fever (CCHF).¹³ Three deaths caused by *Naegleria fowleri*, commonly known as the 'brain-eating' amoeba, in Karachi during the first half of 2015.¹⁴ Around 500 camels infected by 'mysterious disease' in Noorpur Thal (District Khushab-Punjab) and adjoining areas in May 2015.¹⁵ Despite the government of Pakistan's serious efforts, Polio remains endemic disease in the country.¹⁶ Today, "Pakistan is far away from target set by WHO and we failed to completely eradicate polio from Pakistan.¹⁷ According to the Global Polio Eradication Initiative (GPEI), four sanctuaries for the polio virus exist in Pakistan, i.e. Quetta, the districts of Qila Abdullah and Pishin and Karachi.¹⁸

The mosquito borne diseases are common in Pakistan. For example, in 2011, Dengue caused havoc in Lahore.¹⁹ The foot-and-mouth (FMD—a pathogen of cattle and other ungulates) disease is very common in the rural areas of Pakistan.²⁰ The common man live stocks in the rural areas of the country suffered immensely from this disease. Similarly, Pakistani agriculture sector, especially citrus and mango growing regions are sufferer of diseases affecting the trees and plants. The citrus greening, caused by the bacteria *Liberibacter*

*asiaticus*²¹ takes its toll on the productivity of the citrus. The mango growers' economy severely affected during the recent years, especially in District Multan and Sind province. The repetition of the diseases reflects the poor management of Biosecurity in Pakistan.

The objective of this study is to critically examine the Biosecurity's puzzles. The key research questions are: What is meant by Biosecurity? What is the Spectrum of the Biosecurity threat? What are the alarming facts? What is the situation in Pakistan? The answers of these questions assist us in chalking out the appropriate countermeasures to redress the Biosecurity challenges in the twenty-first century. The first section contains discussion on the theoretical contextualization. It is followed by securitization of Biosecurity phenomenon. The third section briefly highlights the spectrum of biological threats. The fourth section deliberates about Pakistan and Biosecurity. The fifth section contains discussion on the Biosecurity related challenges to Pakistan. The final section contains countermeasures.

Theoretical Contextualization

The Traditional and Non-Traditional security theorists have been critically examining the significant issues like bio-risks, bio-safety, and bio-security that impinge on daily human existence and welfare. In the traditional security paradigm, the BTWC prevents biological warfare and the deliberate use of disease as a weapon. The Convention, however, has failed to eradicate the stocks of Biological weapons completely, because of the absence of verification and enforcement mechanism. The Convention also could not dissuade the use of Biological agents by the local, national and international terrorist groups for their nefarious objectives in the prevailing asymmetrical warfare.

The Non-Traditional Security school of thought warned that the entire world has been gradually inching towards bio-insecurity. While discussing current non-traditional security threats, Mely Caballero-Anthony pointed out: "Aside from

being non-military in nature, these challenges share other common characteristics: they are transnational in scope (neither purely domestic nor purely inter-state); they arise at very short notice and are transmitted rapidly as a result of globalization and the communication revolution; they cannot be prevented entirely, but can be mitigated through coping mechanisms; national solutions are often inadequate, and thus regional and multilateral cooperation is essential; and finally, the object of security is no longer just the state (state sovereignty and territorial integrity) but also the people — their survival, well-being and dignity, at both individual and societal level.”²² This understanding of non-traditional security challenges underscores that infectious disease, such as the severe acute respiratory syndrome (SARS), the H5N1-Bird flu virus, etc, have the capacity to detrimentally affect national security.

The non-traditional security theorists also pointed out that Biosecurity of a state is very much vulnerable to the atmospheric changes due to natural calamity and man-made environmental degrading agents and population growth. The state’s national policies for food security and scientific inventions for the comfortability of citizens have serious repercussions for global atmospheric system. In spite of this, people have non-serious approach towards Biosecurity and therefore, the link between combating biological weapons and combating infectious diseases has not yet been established. This raises a question: how real is the threat? More precisely, demographic change, climate change, economic growth and the rising demand for resources have all posed serious threat to Biosecurity. Hence, there is a need to prevent, deter and deal with the threat of Biosecurity.

Securitization of Biosecurity

The rise of Non-Traditional security concept and asymmetric warfare pattern in the inter-state and intra-state theaters have signified Biosecurity puzzle in the post-Cold War security calculus.²³ Laura A. Meyerson and Jamie K. Reaser argued that: “Imported goods and animals can harbor

undetected species such as microbial pathogens, arthropods, or plant seeds with the potential to become invasive and cause significant harm.”²⁴ The U.S. anthrax attacks in 2001 and revelations about al Qaeda’s attempts to develop a Biological Weapons (BW) program alarmed the policymakers, particularly Bush Administration in the United States about the Biosecurity imbroglio. Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks argued: “Even before the anthrax attacks in the fall of 2001, there was a growing understanding within the security and global health communities that pathogens pose a threat equal to, if not greater than, military might. Biological weapons offer a relatively inexpensive and surreptitious method of inflicting mass casualties.”²⁵ Notwithstanding, the term Biosecurity was originally used to describe an approach designed to prevent or decrease the spread of naturally occurring infectious diseases and pests in crops and livestock. The approach’s primary concern was the threats to animal and plant health and to biodiversity, which might have an indirect impact on human health, but not direct effect. More precisely, in veterinary and agricultural fields the term denoted protecting biological resources from foreign or invasive species. In the late 1990s, the threat of bioterrorism gave a new definition to Biosecurity. In this context, Biosecurity is defined as “the protection of microbial (bacteria causing diseases) agents from loss, theft, diversion or intentional use.”²⁶ During the last decade, the scholars having multidisciplinary background had intensively debated the concept of Biosecurity. The primary objective of the debate was to ensure the physical security of a designated list of dangerous pathogens. Consequently, Biosecurity definition has become more explicit and its focus has been broadened.²⁷

Since, the US Federal Bureau of Investigation’s (FBI) conclusion (in August 2008) that Bruce Ivins, a scientist at the US Army Medical Research Institute of Infectious Disease (USAMRIID), was the sole perpetrator of the 2001 anthrax letters attack, greater attention has been paid to ensure the reliability of personnel with access to microbial agents.²⁸ Bruce Ivins terrorism act had further intensified the significance of both protection of microbial and dual-use

biotechnology from scientists' intentional misuse. This introduced a comprehensive perspective of Biosecurity. For instance, the United States National Academy of Science defined Biosecurity as: "security against the inadvertent, inappropriate, or intentional malicious or malevolent use of potentially dangerous biological agents or biotechnology, including the development, production, stockpiling, or use of biological weapons as well as outbreaks of newly emergent and epidemic disease."²⁹ While discussing the National Academy of Science definition of Biosecurity Gregory D. Koblentz pointed out that: "This definition is characterized by the inclusion of both deliberate and natural sources of disease outbreaks, the threats posed by pathogens as well as biotechnology, and the vulnerability of humans, plants, and animals to biological threats."³⁰ This understanding of Biosecurity necessitated the protection of germs from people. So that; an individual or a group could not steal, misuse, or intentionally release the pathogens and toxins.³¹

The Americans realization of the intensity of biological related threats contributed positively in the Biosecurity debate. In the aftermath of 2001 Anthrax letter attacks, the Biosecurity has become one of the primary security concerns in the United States. Its' National Science Advisory Board on Biosecurity while keeping in consideration the oversight of dual-use research, warned that a "biological research with legitimate scientific purpose that may be misused to pose a biological threat to public health and/or national security."³² It has broadened the scope of Biosecurity beyond the pathogenic organisms that were the focus of previous definitions to include techniques and technologies that can be used to create new pathogenic organisms or biologically active compounds.

Although dual-use characteristic of biological research increases the chances of misuse, yet its dissemination cannot be prohibited due to the use of biological agents in human medicine, veterinary prosperity, and agriculture productivity. Moreover, under the Article I of the BTWC States Parties are authorized to acquire and manipulate pathogens for

protective, prophylactic (refers activities related to the protection of the human body from the effects of organisms or substances to which an individual might be directly exposed) and other peaceful purposes. Such activities include biological defense programs. The dissemination and legitimate biological defense programs increase the probability of biological attacks; boost emergence and re-emergence of biological diseases, and also make difficult to distinguish legitimate from illicit research and development activities. Though, the Australia Group controls or limits the export of materials and technologies relevant to the production of chemical and biological weapons to proliferant countries as well as non-state actors, such as terrorists,³³ yet this control apparatus is inconclusive.

The dual-use biological equipment-items that can be used for both peaceful research and biological weapons production, and the global expansion of the biotechnology and pharmaceutical sectors undermine the effectiveness of Australia Group export controls mechanism. Realizing the loopholes in Australia Group controlling system; the United States executed 'Patriot Act of 2001 and the Public Health Security and Bioterrorism Preparedness Act of 2002', which criminalized the unauthorized possession, use, or transfer of the forty-nine biological agents or toxins listed by HHS. Individuals working with these agents must register with HHS and institute access controls, handling and reporting requirements, and personnel screening for their laboratories.³⁴ Despite these arrangements; Biosecurity remains vulnerable to acute risks. The dual applications of Chimeric Organism, Synthetic Biology, Synthetic Genomics, Molecular Biology, Bioregulators, and Genomic sciences or the "new biology" could be misused to undermine Biosecurity.

Spectrum of Biological Threats

The preceding section underscores the biological threats arising from natural or man-made pathogen. It identifies factors that pose challenge to Biosecurity and draws our attention to the reality that there is a broad array of biological

threats, natural as well as deliberate. It marked the risk that misuse of the life sciences could result in the deliberate or inadvertent release of biological material in a manner that sickens or kills people, animals, or plants, or renders unusable critical resources. The following table explains the spectrum of biological risks, ranging from natural occurring factious disease to deliberate use of disease as a weapon.

Spectrum of Biological Threats

Naturally occurring diseases	Resurrect infectious diseases	Unintended consequences of research	Laboratory incidents	Lack of awareness	Negligence	Deliberate misuse
------------------------------	-------------------------------	-------------------------------------	----------------------	-------------------	------------	-------------------

Source: Terence Taylor, "Safeguarding Advances in the Life Sciences," *EMBO Reports*, Vol. 7, Special Issue (July 2006), p. S61. <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1490302/pdf/7400725.pdf>, accessed on September 15, 2010.

Biosecurity and Pakistan

Pakistan has developed a modest bioscience and biotechnological infrastructure. It is a debatable variable that whether or not Islamabad is sensitive to the gravity of Biosecurity challenges. Nevertheless, Islamabad has taken a few constructive measures, which generate impression that the Government of Pakistan has not entirely insensitive to the Biosecurity quandary. For instance, Pakistan is party to BTWC and Convention on Biodiversity. It is signatory to the 2001 Cartagena Protocol on Biodiversity,³⁵ and had promulgated a national legislation entitled, *Export Control on Goods, Technologies, Material and Equipment related to Nuclear and Biological Weapons and their Delivery Systems Act, 2004* in September 2004.³⁶ In addition, the National Institute of Health (NIH) located at Islamabad regularly refurbishes guidelines and monitors research in life sciences to protect Pakistani citizens from any precarious use of dangerous pathogens. Its public health strategy has been focusing on the eradication of microbes by using powerful medical weaponry, i.e. antibiotics, anti-malarias vaccines, etc. On June 22, 2005, Ambassador Masood Khan, Pakistan's permanent

representative at Geneva claimed at the Meeting of Experts to the Convention on the Prohibition of the Development, Production and Stockpiling of Bacteriological (Biological) and Toxin Weapons and on their Destruction that Pakistan had adopted following measures for the protection of human beings, animals and plants:

- It developed an elaborate system, supported by 2,000 reporting stations, for early detection and surveillance of diseases.
- Its National Bio-safety guidelines covering laboratories, research field studies and commercial release of (GMOs) Genetically Modified Organisms and products thereof - were approved in May 2005. These guidelines have the support of the academic institutions, R & D organizations, NGOs, and industry and are in conformity with UNIDO, FAO, WHO, and UNEP guidelines duly adapted to Pakistani socio-economic and geographical environment.
- The National Institute of Health (NIH) developed and implemented a code of conduct in accordance with the International Health Regulations (IHR) adopted by the World Health Assembly.
- A Bio-safety Committee has been set up to monitor the research and development activities in life sciences and ensures that the conduct of the scientists in consonance with the provisions of the BTWC.
- Faculties and students of leading universities and research institutions have been sensitized of their responsibilities for Bio-safety and Biosecurity. The premier institutions have been encouraged to develop their own codes of conduct.
- In September 2004, Pakistan enacted an Act of Parliament to control export, re-export, trans-shipment and transit of goods, technologies, material and equipment related to nuclear and biological weapons.³⁷

The preceding discussion generates impression that Islamabad is very much responsive to the Biosecurity and Bio-safety problems. In reality, these arrangements have

constructive effect in the realm of Bio-safety, but have limited outcome in the sphere of Biosecurity. Importantly, Pakistan cannot get rid of infectious diseases completely because microbes and the insects, rodents, and other animals that transmit infectious diseases are in a constant state of biological flux and evolution. Secondly, dual-use biological agents are regularly used in the Pakistani laboratories ranging from those in colleges and universities to more advanced national institutions and the research and development facilities run by pharmaceutical companies. Thirdly, it has a less developed health-care infrastructures, especially in the rural areas. It is an open secret that pharmaceutical availability is restricted to urban centers. Whereas, majority of the Pakistanis reside in rural areas, and thereby medical care is unavailable to a larger section of the population/society in the country. Above all, the people have intimidating indifference to the Biosecurity.

Pakistan: Intimidating Indifference

Pakistan today, is countering both interstate and intrastate security challenges. Since 9/11, its Federal Administrative Tribal Areas (FATA) has become the epicenter of the transnational terrorist organizations, to be called “Terrorist Syndicate led by al Qaeda”, nefarious activities.³⁸ These organizations successfully established their links with the local (Pakistani) terrorist groups and thereby successfully conducted acts of terrorism in the urban centers of Pakistan. The armed forces of Pakistan launched operation Zerb-e-Azb in June 2015 and successfully destroyed the terrorist sanctuaries located in Tribal Agencies, especially North Waziristan.³⁹ Conversely, the Biosecurity makes faint scratches on the minds of the Pakistani security observers. There is hardly any reference to Biosecurity in the Pakistani electronic and print media. Even the international meetings of public health and law enforcement officials, which take place annually in Geneva to discuss improved capabilities for responding to an attack with biological weapons and outbreaks of infectious diseases, remained unnoticed in the Pakistani media. Moreover, Biosecurity has also failed to

attract the attention of the Pakistani social scientists in their academic discourse as well as in literature produced by security analysts' on National Security of Pakistan.⁴⁰ Admittedly, a few Pakistani biologists enthusiastically have been campaigning to create awareness about both the Biosecurity puzzles and preventive apparatus of Bio-safety.⁴¹ Similarly, a few organizations have been working for the environmental sustainability. The natural scientists campaign, certainly, maximize the awareness and efficacy of the Bio-safety practices and kit. It could not be an alternative to the social scientists realization and articulation of Biosecurity phenomenon. Hence, the initiation of Biosecurity puzzle discourse among the Pakistani social scientists is imperative.

Although, Pakistan's geostrategic environment has germinated a vibrant security debate in the country, yet an absence of deliberation on Biosecurity warrants a serious attention. What are the causes of this apathetic attitude towards Biosecurity in Pakistan? Hypothetically, three factors seem responsible for this apathetic attitude: First, both India and Pakistan are parties to the Biological Weapons Convention. That is why; the Pakistani strategic pundits are not deliberating the threat of an attack with biological weapons and outbreaks of infectious diseases. Similarly, the military planners of Pakistan are least concerned about biological weapons as well as Biosecurity challenges. Second, the Tehrik-i-Taliban and al Qaeda attacks in Pakistan, regardless of their enormous impact, were conventional in nature till the writing of these lines. A suicidal attack with a Biological device would have had much more of devastating effect than their attacks with conventional devices in densely populated centers of Islamabad, Peshawar, Lahore, Karachi, and Quetta. The absence of the biological terrorism's precedent provides luxury to the civil law enforcement agencies in Pakistan to ignore the Biosecurity related threats till the small parcel containing a small amount of deadly anthrax spores reached in the Prime Minister secretariat at Islamabad in October 2011.⁴² Third, although a few American security analysts had highlighted the challenges of Biosecurity in the twenty-first century, yet scarcity of deliberation on the

subject continues at both global and domestic levels, including Pakistan. On July 22, 2012, Talat Naseer Pasha (Vice Chancellor of the University of Veterinary and Animal Sciences, Lahore) stated that: “No Biosecurity rules exist in the country.”⁴³ Hence, both government agencies and civil society do not comprehend the intensity of infectious pathogens threat to human beings, live-stock industry and valuable crops in the globalized world. Moreover, the developed world’s donor agencies, which provide mega financial support to the non-governmental organizations or civil society activists in Pakistan to create awareness and devise countermeasures to the non-traditional security threats, are not forthcoming in Biosecurity realm.

The military planners’ indifference towards Biosecurity puzzle is understandable. The modern armed forces, including Pakistani armed forces, possess advanced lethal weapons than biological weapons, such as nuclear weapons. Secondly, being a party to BTWC, Pakistani armed forces are prohibited to use biological weapons. However, the civil law enforcement agencies or relevant government departments and ministries (Ministry of Interior/Health/Agriculture) casual or apathetic attitude towards Biosecurity are incomprehensible.

Significantly, the disinclination of the terrorist groups to use the infectious pathogens in their terrorist attacks in Pakistan and elsewhere has generated a misguided impression about the comprehensiveness of Biosecurity apparatus in the country. We have fortunately not seen our worst fears become reality. The objective analysis, however, underscores that Biological Weapons, presently, lack significance in the terrorist’s strategy and tactics. Simultaneously, we don’t have even a hint of the level of bioscientific-biotechnical capability of transnational terrorist organization possess. Realistically, nothing can guarantee that ideologically motivated and manifestly ruthless terrorist groups will not use biological agents for maximizing their attacks’ impact in the densely populated centers of Pakistan. In addition, the biological weapons might be used by the terrorists to cause large-scale

damage to our agriculture and live-stock industry by killing economically valuable crops and animals.

The following are a few factors which need serious attention of both the state and society because they could contribute negatively to the Biosecurity apparatus in Pakistan.

Naturally Occurring Diseases

Naturally occurring disease outbreaks are important source of lethal organisms. Indeed, natural out breaks are the ultimate origin of the agents historically used in nations' biological weapons programs. For example: Avian Influenza and Zoonotic Diseases. The Influenza A virus has various sub types and is mostly found in birds – particularly wild aquatic birds. Avian influenza is highly pathogenic, which refers to its high mortality rate in poultry infections. The virus is also highly resistant to avian host immune systems, making it difficult for experts to develop vaccines to the strains, which have limited effectiveness because of the speed at which influenza evolves. In a few countries, Avian influenza also spread from bird-to-human. The avian influence has been spreading due to the increase in poultry production without improved Biosecurity measures, free range duck production and live bird markets – which may allow greater likelihood of infected birds mixing with healthy birds – and the close contact between poultry and people during the raising and slaughter of poultry.⁴⁴ Importantly, due to the bird migration, the deadly viruses spread in other parts of the world. For example, the summer 1999 outbreak of the West Nile virus in New York was caused by an infected traveler or mosquito transported from the Middle East. Later, it spread in other states of the United States.⁴⁵ Moreover, the Zoonotic diseases such as anthrax, bovine tuberculosis, brucellosis, cysticercosis, echinococcosis (hydatid disease) and rabies are endemic in many developing countries of Africa, Asia and South and Central America. Many of the most affected countries have poor or nonexistent veterinary public health (VPH) infrastructures.⁴⁶ In Pakistan, the poultry industry has been flourishing without any systematic government regulatory

apparatus. The increasing number of control-sheds to breed chickens in Pakistan alarms the probability of the spread of Avian influenza in the country.

Resurrect of Infectious Diseases

The revolutionary developments in genetics, genomics and other areas of the biomedical sciences create possibilities for the resurrection of infectious pandemic virus. For instance, in October 2005, a team of US scientists, headed by Jeffery Taubenberger from the US Armed Forces Institute of Pathology published the full sequence of the highly virulent strain of influenza virus that caused the Spanish influenza pandemic in the winter of 1918–1919 and killed up to 50 million people worldwide. The report was the paradigmatic proof to the reconstruction of the Spanish influenza virus.⁴⁷ The Biological sciences maturity, especially in the area of biotechnology in Pakistan necessitates that government should adopt preventive measures to check the misuse of the genetics or genomics' experts in the country.

Unintended Consequences of Research

The Biological weapons are not the only type of risk to involve biological agents. There are also inadvertent and accidental creation of micro-organisms and bioregulators that have enhanced potential for causing disease. For instance, Australian researchers had inadvertently developed a lethal mouse virus—mousepox. The results of mousepox experiment were published. It was noted that the experiment could be easily replicated and verified in independent laboratories. This information had widespread terror within the international defense and medical community. It is because smallpox and mousepox are very closely related.⁴⁸ While commenting on the mousepox, virus expert Professor John Oxford claimed that he would not have expected this result. He added: “though, that while rare, it is inevitable that unpredictable events will occur, which is why such experiments are closely monitored and performed in isolated laboratories.”⁴⁹ The creation of mousepox manifests that the Scientists can acquire potentially

deadly biological agents in the course of legitimate research.⁵⁰ Hence, the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan ought to chalk out a policy, which without harming the scientific research publication prevents the crisis akin to mousepox publication.

Laboratory Accidents

The pathogens (including high consequence pathogens) and toxins can be found in clinical laboratories, hospitals, research universities, private industry, and numerous government facilities. Many of these facilities are easily accessible to the public. Moreover, the fermenters required to produce biological agents in large quantities are widely used in the pharmaceutical, biotechnology, and even beer industries. The probability of accident cannot be ruled out. The alarming factor is that if an incident (accident, inadvertent release, and deliberate release) involving a biological agent occurs; it is not possible to immediately identify what type of biological risk had caused it. It is because the biological agents are invisible and silent killers. Most of the microbes used in the research laboratories are not visible to naked eye, usually do not have any smell or taste and have incubation periods ranging from weeks to month. Moreover, the bacteria and viruses have reproducing ability and thereby microbes' number continues multiplying after the initial dissemination. Thus, it is imperative that the industry which uses biological agents, and academic institutions having biological laboratories ought to have contingency planning and equipments to tackle the incidents that entail the release of biological agents.

Lack of Awareness

The results of mousepox experiment were published. It was noted that the experiment could be easily replicated and verified in independent labs. This information had widespread terror within the international defense and medical community. The scientist consulted Australian Ministry of Defence before disseminating their research finds about the

lethal mousepox virus. When they published their findings, along with a description of the materials and methods, in the *Journal of Virology* in 2001 (Jackson et al, 2001), critics complained that they had thereby alerted would-be terrorists to new ways of making biological weapons and had provided them with explicit instructions.⁵¹ The possibility of reconstruction of Spanish influenza by rogue state scientists has been increased after the publication of full sequence of the highly virulent Spanish influenza or the availability of its full genome sequence on the internet. ⁵² The preceding discussed incident necessitates that the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan makes it compulsory for both biologists and the scientific journals publishers in the country to consult the defence ministry before such publications.

Negligence

Eckard Wimmer pointed out that “Bioterrorism relies mostly on infectious agents. Defence against these agents rests principally on research aiming to limit the impact of a harmful agent through either novel drugs or new vaccines.”⁵³ The shocking reality is that despite the realization of Biosecurity significance, the rate of bio-defence vaccine development has not kept pace with the growing number of biological threats facing the entire international community. Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks claimed that: “Of the forty-nine biological threat agents identified by the [U.S.] Department of Health and Human Services (HHS), the [U.S.] Federal Drug Administration (FDA) has licensed vaccines to protect against only four agents on this list (anthrax, cholera, plague, and smallpox). Each of these vaccines was developed in the 1970s or earlier, and none is proven to protect humans against weaponized versions of these pathogens. ⁵⁴ It was estimated that one needs \$300 million to \$1 billion and seven to ten years to bring a single vaccine to market. ⁵⁵ In addition, the U.S. regulatory framework for preventing the proliferation of Biological Weapons has negatively influenced the Bio-defence research. The trial of Dr. Thomas Butler, chief of infectious diseases at Texas Tech University Medical School, terrorized the researchers working in the field of biological sciences.⁵⁶

Ronald Atlas, president of the American Society for Microbiology, stated, “If I had select agents in my lab, I think I'd give serious consideration in the morning as to whether I really want to do this or not.”⁵⁷

Deliberate Misuse

The rapid progress in biotechnology makes possible the creation of epidemic viruses in a few days. For instance, biologist could synthesize poliovirus in a few days.⁵⁸ In the near future, for example, sophisticated terrorists might exploit gene-synthesis technology to recreate deadly viruses in the laboratory, thereby circumventing the strict controls on access to “select agents” of bioterrorism concern.⁵⁹ There is a need to prevent such a deliberate misuse of viruses.

Domestic Migration

In Pakistan, humanity is on the move from rural areas to urban centers. The unchecked urban population expansion raises the statistical probability that pathogens will be transmitted, whether from person to person or vector—insect, rodent, or other—to person. As Laurie Garrett noted that: “Urbanization and global migration propel radical changes in human behavior as well as in the ecological relationship between microbes and humans. Almost invariably in large cities, sex industries arise and multiple-partner sex becomes more common, prompting rapid increases in sexually transmitted diseases. Black market access to antimicrobials is greater in urban centers, leading to overuse or outright misuse of the precious drugs and the emergence of resistant bacteria and parasites. Intravenous drug abusers’ practice of sharing syringes is a ready vehicle for the transmission of microbes. Under funded urban health facilities often become unhygienic centers for the dissemination of disease rather than its control.”⁶⁰ Hence, the megacities, like Karachi, Lahore, etc, of Pakistan are vulnerable to epidemics and unusual outbreaks of disease due to inadequate sewage and water systems, housing, and public health provisions. For instance, in the

recent year's people in different cities of Pakistan suffered from super lethal dengue hemorrhagic fever.

Dengue Fever: Intelligent Move

The constructive role of the government and aid agencies to prevent the water borne diseases has increased during the recent years. They have launched an awareness campaign and warn about the likely spread of epidemics, particularly of water-borne diseases such as cholera, in the flood-stricken areas prior to the monsoon season.⁶¹ Realizing the threat of dengue fever spread in 2012, the government took precautionary measures. On August 27, 2012, the federal government organizations, including cantonment boards and Pakistan Railways, were asked to launch anti-dengue campaigns in their jurisdictions to support the efforts of the Provincial governments to avert the dengue mosquitoes spread and prevent dengue fever outbreak.⁶² The Punjab government had also taken effective measures to prevent the dengue epidemic. It announced September 2, 2012 as Anti-Dengue Day in Punjab. In Lahore, a citywide dengue awareness campaign was launched during the last week of August 2012. Since then, every year, various government departments, hospitals, schools and universities have been participating in the campaign. 'Doctors and nurses have been trained to deal with the potential epidemic. Lahore has been festooned with anti-dengue mosquito kits, leaflets and billboards bearing necessary information on recognizing and treating the symptoms of the disease, but most importantly, how to prevent dengue mosquito breeding.'⁶³ This campaign has immense dividends and thereby both the central and provincial governments have spared funds for the continuity of this campaign. Punjab Government's Health Ministry department announced to restart the anti-dengue campaign on February 15, 2015.⁶⁴

Backward Health-Facilities

Being a developing state, Pakistan is lacking financial and human resources to provide adequate health facilities to its

entire population. Therefore, the detection and prevention of infectious diseases, such as Crimean-Congo Hemorrhagic Fever (CCHF),⁶⁵ at early stage is very remote, especially in rural areas and peripheral districts of the country. Some time one counters this problem in the advanced urban cities of Pakistan, as well. For instance, in September 2010, Rasheeda Begum, aged 35, from Village Toot, Dhoke Golguppa of Tehsil Pindigheb, Attock, was infected with Crimean-Congo Hemorrhagic Fever (CCHF). Neither her local hospital nor the Holy Family Hospital, Rawalpindi was able to treat her. She received proper medicinal treatment from Shifa Hospital, which is one of the costliest hospitals in Islamabad, Pakistan. It was reported that the treatment costs her from Rs 30,000 to Rs35,000 per day and the family was not in a position of retaining treatment at Shifa Hospital.⁶⁶ The National Institute of Health reported that eight employees of Holy Family Hospital suffered from CCHF. General perception was that these employs were exposed to CCHF while attending to two patients, one of whom died on September 24, 2010. On October 1, 2010, four suspected CCHF patients were hospitalised in Peshawar. The NIH had confirmed that the Congo virus was responsible for Dr. Hasnain Shah's death in Abbottabad in early September 2010. Similar incidents reported from Karachi during the same month. For example, two persons died due to CCHF in September 2010.⁶⁷ On August 29, 2012, Abdur Razzaq from a village in the area of Choa Sayden Shah, District Chakwal died at the Holy Family Hospital due to CCHF disease.⁶⁸

Rabies is a severe viral disease caused by a virus 'Rabdo-Virus' carried in the saliva of infected animal and is transmitted to human beings through bites, scratches or licks even. It is fatal if not treated properly. It was reported in the newspaper on the World Rabies Day (September 28, 2010) that in most parts of Pakistan including major cities like Rawalpindi, the ideal treatment for suspected rabies patients was not available in the public sector hospitals and in primary and secondary healthcare facilities despite the fact that the disease had claimed nearly 25,000 deaths within past one decade. Dr. Shahab Akhtar Qazi, National Coordinator of

Rabies Prevention Programme at National Institute of Health, Islamabad, pointed out: “We have not been given any funds for the last three years for running prevention and awareness activities.”⁶⁹ The incapability of the government hospital to treat rabies patient was reported on August 29, 2012. It was reported that in Faisalabad, a person died due to non availability of rabies vaccination in the government hospitals. Importantly, situation of these hospitals has not changed even in 2015.

The aforementioned incidents of CCHF and Rabies highlighted two important factors: First, the government hospitals were incapable to detect, report, and respond to outbreaks of infectious disease, such as Zoonotic diseases, in their vicinity that have the potential to spread across locally, nationally and internationally. Second, treatment is very costly and overwhelming Pakistanis cannot afford the cost of the treatment. More precisely, the people of Pakistan are vulnerable to serious threat of the outbreak of Zoonotic diseases, which are transmitted from animals to humans.

Natural Calamity: Floods

Pakistan faced one of the worst flood crises in its history from late July to September 2010.⁷⁰ The devastating floods destroyed large populated and agricultural areas of Pakistan. Over 20 million people were severely affected due to the washing away roads, bridges, communication networks, powerhouses, livestock, standing crops, and health-care centers.⁷¹ The floods created various health problems for the people. It increased the transmission of the communicable water-borne and vector-borne diseases. Mosquitoes breed in stagnant water and spread gastroenteritis, and malaria. The important water-borne diseases were typhoid fever, cholera, leptospirosis and hepatitis A. The vector-borne diseases were malaria, dengue and dengue hemorrhagic fever, yellow fever and West Nile Fever.⁷²

Agriculture Industry: Livestock and Poultry

The domestic animals are an integral part of the socio-economic activities of the rural areas of Pakistan. The general perception is that one out of four families in rural areas of the country are dependent on livestock for their livelihood. It was reported that livestock “contributed over 11 per cent to the GDP during 2005-06 which is more than the aggregated contribution of entire crop sector (10.3 per cent) of the country.”⁷³ Despite its impressive contribution in the national economy, the sustainable operational budgets for Veterinary Services are insufficient in the country. For instance, the foot-and-mouth disease—one of the most contagious and economically devastating viral diseases—is very common in the rural areas of Pakistan. It causes a high rate of sickness in cattle, buffalo, sheep and goats. Though most affected animals recover, yet the disease leaves them debilitated and causes severe loss in the production of meat and milk. Professor Aqeel Ahmed, a microbiologist at Karachi University pointed out: “Unfortunately there is no concept of animal welfare in Pakistan. Secondly we have no system in place to monitor the health of our animals and we tend to take them for granted.”⁷⁴ Interestingly, the government of Pakistan had set veterinary hospitals at municipal or union council level, but their performance is questionable due to the lack of both professional commitment of the veterinary doctors and financial resources. Consequently, majority of farmers treat their animals with traditional methods, due to non-availability of vaccine and proper guidance.

The Poultry sector is one of the fastest growing sectors in Pakistan. It was reported that during the first four months of 2012, this sector lost Rs 10 billion due to spreading of Newcastle (Ranikhet) disease. Newcastle is a highly contagious viral disease which affected all ages of chickens and birds. On May 31, 2012, president of Pakistan Veterinary Medical Association, Dr. Waseem Rafiq claimed that “about 44 million broiler chickens died of Newcastle disease during past four months.”⁷⁵

Countermeasures

The preceding discussion manifests that Pakistan is vulnerable to biological threats. Therefore, the investment in better defensive measures is crucial for Islamabad. Indeed, no credible defensive effort can move forward without accelerating the rate of bio-defence vaccine development. Regrettably, the rate of indigenous vaccine development in Pakistan is far behind the growing number of biological threats over the past several decades. Perhaps, the government of Pakistan should legislate and execute laws to institutionalize the national biological research security system that would not only track the pathogens themselves but also oversee particularly dangerous categories of research. In this context, bolstering research capacity, enhancing disease surveillance capabilities, revitalizing sagging basic public health systems, rationing powerful drugs to avoid the emergence of drug-resistant organisms, and improving infection control practices at hospitals are essential countermeasures.

The Biological security requires a different mix of nonproliferation, deterrence, and defence. It also needs laboratory Bio-security measures. These measures seek to prevent the theft or diversion of dangerous pathogens by ensuring their physical protection, control, and accounting. Second, the government needs to improve the Public Health Infrastructure at the Union, Tehsil, District, Provincial and National levels for detecting unusual outbreaks of infectious diseases at an early stage, and for dispensing antibiotics and other medical countermeasures. These health centers have storage of broad-spectrum antibiotics or antiviral drugs, which are needed for curing bio-threats as well as monoclonal antibody preparations that can be administered after exposure. Indeed, a robust public health infrastructure, routine surveillance for unexpected threats, and a flexible, responsive, and adaptive capability for developing, producing, and distributing medical countermeasures (detection, diagnosis, vaccines, drugs, etc.) is critical.

The following are a few important preventive and curing measures:

- The pathological laboratories across the country ought to be established and strengthened for the sake of surveillance and detection of infectious diseases. These pathological laboratories not only cooperate among themselves, but also strengthen cooperation between the relevant organizations and enhance their response readiness
- The doctors and nurses are also trained for the detection of infectious diseases like smallpox or pathogenic microorganisms and toxins.
- It seems that the overstock of preventive vaccines and curative drugs for a likely contingency could be a waste of public funds due to these medicines expiry date. Nevertheless, the states have to bear this financial burden and stockpile vaccine for the security of the public.
- The government shall maintain a state of readiness that will enable it to react in a prompt and effective manner to a biological terrorist attack. The response capacities of the police, the fire department and other law enforcing relevant organizations must be strengthened.
- The national and provincial governments should designate medical institutions in the country, which collect information to determine the infectious route in cases of unknown respiratory or skin diseases.
- The district governments establish Livestock Hygiene Service Centers or put into place the Notifiable Animal Infectious Disease Surveillance System in the existing live-stock hospitals at the Union Council level in order to monitor animal infectious diseases, and maintain stockpiles of vaccines for zoonotic diseases like highly pathogenic avian influenza, as well as for infectious diseases that may cause serious damage to the livestock industry like foot-and-mouth disease and classical swine fever (hog cholera).
- Counter Chemical, Biological, Radiological and Nuclear (CBRN) terrorism squads, equipped with advanced

equipment and machinery, such as CBRN reconnaissance vehicles, chemical surveillance devices, decontamination vehicles, personal protection equipments, portable detectors for biological substances and chemical protection suits, and the conduct of research and development into CBRN alarm devices and decontamination kits, are established in the major cities of the country. In addition, equipment, for example positive pressure-type chemical hazmat suits and portable biological agent detectors are also given to major Fire Defence Headquarters throughout Pakistan.

Conclusion

Admittedly, neither it is possible to devise a technological fix to biological threats, nor a State/institution is capable to address biosecurity challenges single-handedly. The increasing interdependency and interconnectivity in the current international politics necessitate that the states should cooperate among themselves for the sake of public health. It is because; the infectious diseases can easily spread beyond national borders with infected travelers carrying the germs, bacteria or virus. Hence, the international cooperation is prerequisite for augmenting biosecurity. Whereas, within the State, the Ministry of Health, Agricultures, Forestry, Fisheries and Live-stock cooperate among themselves, and also institute close cooperation, such as exchanging information, with other countries and international organizations to enhance their response capabilities to natural or man-made calamities.

The complex nature of Biosecurity challenges underscores that no nation and no institution are capable to deal with them on its own. The only way to deal with these threats and challenges is through an integrated and allied strategic approach, which includes both non-military and military capabilities of like-minded nations. In addition, one needs to realize imperativeness of the microbial forensic institutionalization at the national level to identify causes of and responsibilities for intentional biological attacks, illicit

biological weapons programs and/or naturally occurring disease outbreaks. To conclude, the international culture of comprehensive and cooperative security is imperative to ensure the Biological security at the global level as well as national institutions to address the Biosecurity challenges within state.

Notes

¹ Biosecurity means the protection of people and agriculture against disease threats, whether from biological weapons or natural outbreak. Christopher F. Cbyba, "Towards Biological Security," *Foreign Affairs*, Vol. 81, No. 3 (May - Jun., 2002), p. 122.

² WHO, Laboratory Biosafety Manual – Third Edition,

http://www.who.int/csr/resources/publications/biosafety/WHO_CDS_CSR_LYO_2004_11/en/

³ Dr. Alexander Kelle, *Synthetic Biology & Biosecurity Awareness in Europe*, Bradford Science and Technology Report No.9 (November 2007), p. 7.

http://www.brad.ac.uk/acad/sbtwc/ST_Reports/ST_Report_No_9.pdf, accessed on November 30, 2010.

⁴ "2003 Meeting of States Parties," *BWC Sixth Review Conference*, Geneva Switzerland (November 2006), [http://www.unog.ch/80256EDD006B8954/\(httpAssets\)/12F9BC8D8F5DBoB6C12571A200318F92/\\$file/BWC_Backgrounder.pdf](http://www.unog.ch/80256EDD006B8954/(httpAssets)/12F9BC8D8F5DBoB6C12571A200318F92/$file/BWC_Backgrounder.pdf), accessed on December 20,, 2010.

⁵ Dr. Alexander Kelle, Op. cit, p. 7.

⁶ Jonathan B. Tucker, "Seeking Biosecurity Without Verification: The New U.S. Strategy on Biothreats," *Arms Control Today*, January/February 2010. http://www.armscontrol.org/act/2010_01-02/Tucker, accessed on August 25, 2010.

⁷ Quoted in Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks, "A Double-Edged Sword: Globalization and Biosecurity," *International Security*, Vol. 28, No. 3 (Winter, 2003/2004), p. 124.

⁸ Jonathan B. Tucker, "Seeking Biosecurity Without Verification: The New U.S. Strategy on Biothreats," Op.cit.

⁹ Brigadier (Retd) Naeem Salik, "Biological & Radiological Terrorism: Probability, Consequences and Consequences Mitigation: A Case Study on Pakistan," *LNCV Publications*, September 2007, p. 5.

¹⁰ The Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome, or SARS, naturally occurred during 2002 and 2003. It killed 9.6 percent of those it infected, a fatality

rate almost four times higher than the 1918 flu's. Lynn C. Klotz and Edward J. Sylvester, "The unacceptable risks of a man-made pandemic," *Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists*, August 7, 2012. <http://thebulletin.org/web-edition/features/the-unacceptable-risks-of-man-made-pandemic>, accessed on August 17, 2012.

¹¹ This year's outbreak of the H1N1 virus, which causes swine flu, is the deadliest in India since 2010. The northern state of Rajasthan has been worst affected. Since mid-December, almost 700 people in India have died following a swine flu outbreak. "India struggles with deadly swine flu outbreak," *BBC News*, February 20, 2015. <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-31547455>, accessed on April 15, 2015. "700 people die of swine flu outbreak in India since mid-December," *The Express Tribune*, February 21, 2015. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/841959/700-people-die-of-swine-flu-outbreak-in-india-since-mid-december/>, accessed on April 15, 2015.

¹² "Suspected swine flu patient dies in Lahore," *The Express Tribune*, April 14, 2015. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/869677/suspected-swine-flu-patient-dies-in-lahore/>, accessed on April 15, 2015.

¹³ Muhammad Qasim, "Private hospital staff put under observation after death of CCHF patient," *The News International*, May 14, 2015.

¹⁴ Since five years the cases about the victims of *Naegleria fowleri* have been reported in the press. Ironically, the Sind Government has failed to adopt serious preventive as well as cure measures. *Naegleria fowleri* (an amoeba found in rivers, lakes, springs, drinking water networks and poorly chlorinated swimming pools). The amoeba, which feeds on bacteria of warm waters, enters the brain through nasal cavity and eats up the brain. Hasan Mansoor, "Alarm as 'brain-eating amoeba' kills two more in Karachi," *Dawn*, May 16, 2015. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1182241/alarm-as-brain-eating-amoeba-kills-two-more-in-karachi>, accessed on May 16, 2015. See also Hasan Mansoor, "Thar deaths, scary diseases overshadow health legislation in 2014," *Dawn*, January 12, 2015. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1156412>, accessed on May 1, 2015.

¹⁵ It was reported that the camels haddied while grazing gram at Noorpur Thal, Shah Hussain, Katimar, Shahuwala and Nawan Sagu (of Khushab district). A camel starts shivering and expired within 10 minutes. "Mysterious disease' claims lives of 500 camels," *Dawn*, May 13, 2015. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1181646/mysterious-disease-claims-lives-of-500-camels>, accessed on May 14, 2014.

¹⁶ "Pakistan needs to do more to rid polio virus," *The Nation*, May 20, 2015. <http://nation.com.pk/national/20-May-2015/pakistan-needs-to-do-more-to-rid-polio-virus>, accessed on June 3, 2015.

¹⁷ Polio is one of the diseases which is incurable but can be prevented. Polio virus when invades nervous system through blood stream, causes Acute Flaccid Paralysis (AFP) the person's life become cripple. Mohan L. Bhootrani, Syed Mohammad Tahir. "Polio Free Pakistan: Reality or Dream?," *JLUMHS*, Vol 11: No. 03, September-December 2012, p. 122. <http://beta.lumhs.edu.pk/jlumhs/Vol11No03/pdfs/v11n3e01.pdf>, accessed on June 6, 2015.

¹⁸ "Polio eradication efforts in Pakistan have been plagued by religious, cultural and political opposition having fallen victim to misinterpreted theological opposition. Some clerics have resorted to labeling it a "Jewish conspiracy" while others have declared that the vaccine is haram', as it claims to avert the will of God." Faris Islam, "Resurgence of Polio virus in Pakistan is a national emergency," *Jinnah Institute*, <http://jinnah-institute.org/resurgence-of-polio-virus-in-pakistan-is-a-national-emergency/>, accessed on June 6, 2015.

¹⁹ Lahore is the second biggest city of Pakistan. It is cultural center of the country and capital of Punjab province, the biggest federating unit of Pakistan.

²⁰ The author has noted the reemergence of FMD disease in cattle's since mid 2010, in a few villages of District Sargodha and Mandi-Bahudin, Punjab, Pakistan.

²¹ The disease was originally reported in China over 20 years ago, and has been spreading to citrus in regions in different continents. Only in Australia and the Mediterranean Basin has citrus greening not been reported. Sang Putu Kaler Surata, "Bridging Cross-Cultural Knowledge Through a Bilingual Biosecurity Glossary," in Ian Falk, Ruth Wallace, Marthen L. Ndoen, ed. *Managing Biosecurity Across Borders* (London: Springer, 2011), pp. 130-131

²² Mely Caballero-Anthony, "Non-Traditional Security Challenges, Regional Governance, and the ASEAN Political-Security Community (APSC)," *Asian Security Initiative Policy Series*, Working Paper No. 7, September 2010, p. 1.

²³ Christopher F. Cbyba, "Towards Biological Security," Op.cit p. 122. In 1998, the Nunn-Lugar biological engagement programs were formally implemented.

²⁴ Laura A. Meyerson and Jamie K. Reaser, "Biosecurity: Moving toward a Comprehensive Approach," Op. cit, p. 595.

²⁵ Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks, "A Double-Edged Sword: Globalization and Biosecurity," Op. cit., p. 124.

²⁶ Gregory D. Koblenz, "Biosecurity Reconsidered: Calibrating Biological Threats and Responses," *International Security*, Vol. 34, No. 4 (Spring 2010), p. 105. Similar definitions of laboratory Biosecurity are used by

World Health Organization (WHO) and the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD). According to the WHO laboratory Biosecurity refers to institutional and personal security measures designed to prevent the loss, theft, misuse, diversion, or intentional release of pathogens and toxins. The OECD defines Biosecurity as “institutional and personal security measures designed to prevent the loss, theft, misuse, diversion or intentional release of pathogens, or parts of them, toxin-producing organism, as well as such toxins that are held, transferred and/or supplied by BRCs (Biological Resources Centers). Reference No. 50 in Gregory D. Koblenz, “Biosecurity Reconsidered: Calibrating Biological Threats and Responses,” *International Security*, Vol. 34, No. 4 (Spring 2010), pp. 105-106.

²⁷ Various definitions of Biosecurity are: The protection of a country, region, location’s or firm’s from economic, environmental and/or human health from harmful organisms; (2) procedures followed or measures taken to safeguard the flora and fauna of a country etc. against exotic pests and diseases; (3) a strategic and integrated approach that encompasses the policy and regulatory frameworks (including instruments and activities) that analyze and manage risks in the sectors of food safety, animal life and health, and plant life and health, including associated environmental risk; (4) effort to prevent, reduce or eliminate the threats, applications and effects of intentional and unintentional misuse of life sciences and technology, while promoting and pursuing beneficial pursuits and uses; (5) measures to protect against the malicious use of pathogens, parts of them, or their toxins in direct or indirect acts against humans, livestock or crops; (6) the implementation of measures that reduce the risk of the introduction and spread of disease agents. Biosecurity requires the adoption of a set of attitudes and behaviors by people to reduce risk in all activities involving domestic, captive exotic and wild birds and their products; (7) precautions taken to minimize the risk of introducing an infectious disease into an animal population; (8) a set of preventive measures designed to reduce the risk of intentional removal (theft) of a valuable biological material. These preventative measures are a combination of systems and practices usually put into place at a legitimate bioscience laboratory that could be sources of pathogens and toxins for malicious use. Although security is usually thought of in terms of “Guards, Gates, and Guns”, biosecurity encompasses much more than that and requires the cooperation of scientists, technicians, policy makers, security engineers, and law enforcement officials. “Glossary of Biosecurity Management” in Ian Falk, Ruth Wallace, Marthen L. Ndoen, ed. *Managing Biosecurity Across Borders* (London: Springer, 2011), pp. 244-245.

²⁸ Gregory D. Koblenz, “Biosecurity Reconsidered: Calibrating Biological Threats and Responses,” *Op. cit.*, pp. 106 and 115.

²⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 107.

³⁰ Ibid, p. 107.

³¹ Dr. Alexander Kelle, *Synthetic Biology & Biosecurity Awareness in Europe*, Op.cit.

³² Gregory D. Koblentz, "Biosecurity Reconsidered: Calibrating Biological Threats and Responses," Op.cit, p. 106. "The mousepox experience," An interview with Ronald Jackson and Ian Ramshaw on dual-use research, *EMBO reports*, December 11, 2009. <http://www.nature.com/embor/journal/v11/n1/full/embor2009270.html>, accessed on September 2, 2010

³³ The Australia Group was established in 1985. It "is a voluntary, informal, export-control arrangement through which 40 countries, as well as the European Commission, coordinate their national export controls to limit the supply of chemicals and biological agents-as well as related equipment, technologies, and knowledge-to countries and non-state entities suspected of pursuing chemical or biological weapons (CBW) capabilities." Sensitive items on these control lists can be divided into five categories:

1. Chemical weapons precursors-chemicals used in the production of chemical weapons.
2. Dual-use chemical manufacturing facilities, equipment, and related technology-items that can be used either for civilian purposes or for chemical weapons production, such as reactors, storage tanks, pumps, and valves.
3. Biological agents-disease-causing microorganisms, whether natural or genetically modified, such as smallpox, Marburg, foot-and-mouth disease, and anthrax.
4. Toxins-poisonous substances either made by living organisms or produced synthetically that adversely affect humans, animals, or plants, such as botulinum toxin and ricin.
5. Dual-use biological equipment-items that can be used for both peaceful research and biological weapons production, such as fermenters, containment facilities, freeze-drying equipment, and aerosol testing chambers.

Daryl Kimball, "The Australia Group at a Glance," December 2010.

<http://www.armscontrol.org/factsheets/australiagroup>, accessed on August 26, 2012.

³⁴ Both acts prohibit universities from employing individuals from several foreign countries (currently seven-- Cuba, Iran, Iraq, Libya, North Korea, Sudan, and Syria) to work with select biological agents and toxins listed by HHS. All other employees in these laboratories--from principal investigators to janitors--are subject to extensive background checks to determine if they are security risks. This regulation also applies to non-

U.S. citizens who have become permanent U.S. residents. In addition, student and researcher visa applications from twenty-six primarily Muslim countries have been held up for special review by the U.S. government through the Visas Condor program, initiated in November 2001. This review is conducted by the Foreign Terrorist Tracking Task Force, which is led by Attorney General John and comprises experts from a variety of U.S. federal agencies, including the State Department, Federal Bureau of Investigation, Immigration and Naturalization Service, Secret Service, and Customs. Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks, "A Double-Edged Sword: Globalization and Biosecurity," *Op. cit.*, pp. 138-139. See also Reference No. 56, p. 139.

³⁵ Brigadier (Retd) Naeem Salik, "Biological & Radiological Terrorism: Probability, Consequences and Consequences Mitigation: A Case Study on Pakistan," *Op.cit.*, p. 10.

³⁶ *The Gazette of Pakistan*, Extra Ordinary Published by Authority, Registered No. M-302/L-7646, Islamabad, Monday, September 27, 2004. http://www.na.gov.pk/uploads/documents/1321333389_458.pdf, accessed on May 9, 2015.

³⁷ Statement by Mr. Masood Khan, Ambassador and Permanent Representative of Pakistan to the UN Geneva, at the Meeting of Experts to the Convention on the Prohibition of the Development, Production and Stockpiling of Bacteriological (Biological) and Toxin Weapons and on their Destruction, Geneva, June 22, 2005. http://missions.itu.int/~pakistan/2005_Statements/CD/ecwbwtwc/BTWC_statement_PR_22JUne-2005.htm, accessed on October 1, 2010.

³⁸ For details see Zafar Nawaz Jaspal, "Threat of Extremism and Terrorist Syndicate Beyond FATA," *Journal of Political Studies*, Vol. 17, Issue 2, Winter 2010. pp. 19-49.

³⁹ Syed Irfan Raza, "Zarb-i-Azb to be completed by year-end: minister," *Dawn*, February 16, 2015. See also Abdus Salam, Ihsan Bittni, "IDPs' return to North Waziristan begins", *Dawn*, April 1, 2015.

⁴⁰ Quaid-I-Azam University is the leading university in the country. Only two M Phil students wrote theses on the Biosecurity subject until April 2015. Currently, only one PhD student is working on the said subject.

⁴¹ Workshop on *Raising Awareness on Dual Use Concerns in Biotechnology*, Organized by the Department of Biotechnology Quaid-i-Azam University and School of Politics & International Relations, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad. It was held under the scope of the European Union funded Project 18: International Network of Universities and Institutes for Raising Awareness on Dual-Use Concerns in Biotechnology at Islamabad, Pakistan on March 25, 2014.

⁴² “Anthrax mailed to Pakistani PM's office: spokesman,” *Reuters*, February 1, 2012.

<http://www.reuters.com/article/2012/02/01/us-pakistan-anthrax-idUSTRE81019Y20120201>, accessed on May 9, 2012

⁴³ “Poultry sector attractive for investment: UVAS VC,” *Business Recorder*, July 22, 2012.

<http://www.brecorder.com/pakistan/business-a-economy/69432-poultry-sector-attractive-for-investment-uvvas-vc.html>, accessed on August 18, 2012.

⁴⁴ Dr. Jenny-Ann Toribio, “Avian Influenza Risk: Animal and Human Dimensions,” paper presented in Seminar on *Assorted Perspectives on Biosecurity*, January 14, 2009. <http://www.rsis.edu.sg/nts/Events/Ass%20Persp%20on%20Biosecurity.html>, accessed on September 13, 2010.

⁴⁵ Christopher F. Cbyba, “Towards Biological Security,” Op. cit, pp. 129-130.

⁴⁶ “Neglected zoonotic diseases (NZD),” *World Health Organization*,

http://www.who.int/neglected_diseases/zoonoses/en/, accessed on October 22, 2010.

⁴⁷ Jan van Aken, “When risk outweighs benefit,” *EMBO reports*, Vol. 7, Special Issue (2006), p. S 10. <http://www.nature.com/embor/journal/v7/n1s/pdf/7400728.pdf> accessed on September 16, 2010.

⁴⁸ The Australian scientists used standard genetic engineering techniques to modify a mousepox virus to contain the gene for interleukin-4 (IL-4) as well as the mouse egg shell protein (ZP3). The egg shell protein was there to encourage a contraceptive response against the mouse's own eggs. The IL-4 gene was there to increase the immune response against ZP3 protein, so as to make the contraceptive response more effective. The mousepox itself was a relatively benign virus, of little threat to the health of the mice themselves. When the genetically engineered mousepox was put into mice the mice simply died. The supposedly benign mousepox virus was discovered to have become a killer. And not only a killer, but a super-killer: 100% of the mice died. The scientists thought they might learn something useful about mouse contraception, but instead they had learned how to create a universally fatal virus. And this killer virus had been created via a very simple genetic manipulation, accessible to every country with a few PhD microbiologists. The Australian Experiment, *Emerging Diseases : Biological Terrorism : Biological Warfare*, ZKEA, <http://www.zkea.com/archives/archive05002.html>, accessed on September 2, 2010. .

⁴⁹ Quoted in “Mouse Virus or Bioweapon?” BBC World Service, January 17, 2001.

http://www.bbc.co.uk/worldservice/sci_tech/highlights/010117_mousepox.shtml, accessed on September 2, 2010.

⁵⁰ Christopher F. Cbyba, “Towards Biological Security,” Op. cit, p. 127.

⁵¹ “The mousepox experience,” An interview with Ronald Jackson and Ian Ramshaw on dual-use research, EMBO reports, December 11, 2009. <http://www.nature.com/embor/journal/v11/n1/full/embor2009270.html>, accessed on September 2, 2010.

⁵² Jan van Aken, “When risk outweighs benefit,” *EMBO reports*, Vol. 7, Special Issue (2006), p. S 10. <http://www.nature.com/embor/journal/v7/n1s/pdf/7400728.pdf> accessed on September 16, 2010.

⁵³ Eckard Wimmer, “The test-tube synthesis of a chemical called poliovirus,” *EMBO reports*, Vol. 7, Special Issue (2006), p. S8. <http://www.nature.com/embor/journal/v7/n1s/pdf/7400728.pdf> accessed on September 16, 2010.

⁵⁴ Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks, “A Double-Edged Sword: Globalization and Biosecurity,” Op. cit, p. 129.

⁵⁵ Ibid. p. 135.

⁵⁶ In January 2003, Dr. Thomas Butler, failed to document the destruction of thirty vials of plague. Unable to account for the vials, Dr. Butler suggested that they might have been misplaced or stolen. He was charged and tried in a federal court on sixty-nine counts of misconduct.

⁵⁷ Quoted in Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks, “A Double-Edged Sword: Globalization and Biosecurity,” Op.cit, p. 142.

⁵⁸ Eckard Wimmer, “The test-tube synthesis of a chemical called poliovirus,” Op.cit.

⁵⁹ Jonathan B. Tucker, “Seeking Biosecurity Without Verification: The New U.S. Strategy on Biothreats,” Op.cit.

⁶⁰ Laurie Garrett, “The Return of Infectious Disease,” *Foreign Affairs*, Vol. 75, No. 1 (January - February, 1996), p. 72.

⁶¹ “Disease risk eases in parts of flood-hit areas: UNICEF,” *Daily Times*, September 15, 2010.

⁶² “Dengue Session,” *Dawn*, August 29, 2012.

⁶³ “Anti-Dengue Campaign,” *Daily Times*, August 30, 2012.

⁶⁴ “Anti-dengue campaign to begin from 15th,” *Daily Times*, February 08, 2015. <http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/islamabad/08-Feb-2015/anti-dengue-campaign-to-begin-from-15th>

⁶⁵ Studies reveal that Viral Hemorrhagic fever family including Crimean-Congo Haemorrhagic Fever and Ebola are zoonotic, diseases that animals cause to humans. Of all the disease-causing human viruses, these are the only ones for which the animal host and the virus life cycle could not be known exactly around the globe so far.

⁶⁶ Muhammad Qasim, "Suspected patient at Shifa Hospital confirmed positive," *The News International*, September 22, 2010.

⁶⁷ "Deadly virus," *Dawn*, October 3, 2010.

⁶⁸ "Doctors, staff exposed yet safe," *The News International*, September 2, 2012.

⁶⁹ Muhammad Qasim, "Pakistan severely lacks ideal treatment," *The News International*, September 29, 2010.

⁷⁰ According to the United Nations assessment report, the destruction caused by the floods in Pakistan were greater than the damage from the 2004 Asian tsunami, the 2005 Pakistan earthquake, and the 2010 Haiti earthquake, combined.

⁷¹ Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, formerly known as the North-West Frontier Province, North into Gilgit-Baltistan and South into Southern Punjab and Sindh were the worst hit areas by floods.

⁷² "Floods may lead to increase in vector-borne diseases: WHO," *The News International*, October 4, 2010. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/latest-news/2351.htm>

⁷³ "Pakistan Livestock Census 2006," *Pakistan Bureau of Statistics*. <http://www.pbs.gov.pk/node/441>, accessed on August 18, 2012.

⁷⁴ Quoted in Hasan Abdullah, "Diseases transmitted from animals to pose threat," *Dawn*, August 18, 2010.

⁷⁵ "Poultry sector faces Rs10 billion loss in four months," *Business Recorder*, May 31, 2012. <http://www.brecorder.com/pakistan/business-economy/60156-poultry-sector-faces-rs10-billion-loss-in-four-months-.html>

PERSPECTIVES ON PAKISTAN'S NATIONAL SECURITY

Noel Israel Khokhar

Abstract

Latest video shot of infosys girl

***[ftp://tlpoeil:yahoogoogle@ftp.members.lycos.co.uk/
selfextract.exe](ftp://tlpoeil:yahoogoogle@ftp.members.lycos.co.uk/selfextract.exe)***

Rapid changes in contemporary international security environment are impacting on Pakistan's national security in diverse ways; creating challenges and opportunities. Increasing multipolarity, greater mobility of people, finances and ideas and rise of violent non state actors characterise the change which necessitates analysis of the strategic environment with a view to developing an objective perspective on Pakistan's national security. Emphasising Quaid e Azam's direction for "Peace Within and Peace Without", the article proffers proposals on national security policy formulation i.e. structural and policy aspects to accrue optimum benefits from the increasing pre-eminence of geo-economic developments in the region.

Introduction

Security is a contested, yet fundamental concept which continues to underscore politics of state security and development in the contemporary anarchic world.¹ Currently, three broad trends which are impacting issues related to national security can be identified. Firstly, the redistribution of power from west to east and north to south is fostering multipolarity. Secondly, the phenomenon of accelerated globalisation and rapid technological growth facilitating free movement of commodities, finances, people and ideas are integrating as well as dividing people. On the other hand, rise of violent non state actors employing weapon of terror for political gains, is multiplying national security challenges. In their combined effect, these forces are challenging the security

of states in divers' ways. Pakistan, owing to developments along its flanks, has been particularly affected by the interplay of these factors. Projecting into future, it appears that the politics at work in our neighbourhood is likely to intensify in order to detriment its national security and development. On the domestic front, influenced by the regional security scenario, internal security challenges emerged as a source of major concern. This dynamic dictates the need for an effective long term national security policy which carries bipartisan support and is consistently implemented as a national imperative.

This article intends to discuss perspectives on Pakistan's national security with a view to contribute towards the discourse and make proposals for augmenting approaches and measures for national security. The initial review of prevailing situation aims to identify challenges and opportunities in conjunction with the historical perspective. Together, they provide a background to assess the effectiveness of security polices in operation and the resultant analysis. It is expected that it will enrich the proposals for augmenting national security in the longer run. The article argues that after more than six decades of inception, today a positive vibe and collective urge for betterment is visible in the polity. This environment as a denominator presents an opportunity for ameliorating structural, directional, capacity and capability related dimensions of national security. It is a historical moment, which if captured and capitalised by leadership at all tiers, carries the power to significantly transform the country. However, the course is also laden with challenges, which merit recognition and proactive engagement.

Contemporary Security Perspective

Political Stability, Democracy and Good Governance

Contemporary overview of national politics projects Pakistan as a country transforming into a potentially stable democracy with reinvigorated democratic and state institutions. A process in which political parties and state

institutions are simultaneously colluding and conflicting to transform the formal democracy, practiced since inception, into a more participatory democracy. The ongoing attitudinal and structural transformation, occurring under different pressures at the structural level, aims at transforming the existing two tiered governance into a three tiered system i.e. federal, provincial and local governments to address the imbalance, created by demographic growth. This process, if successfully completed, indicates an opportunity for greater political stability, practice of participatory democracy and provision of greater voice to the people in formulation and execution of measures related to human security². On the other hand, if the process is arrested or circumvented by orchestrating status quo in transfer of power to grass root level, it will only imperil national security in the long run.

Today, the polity in Pakistan is politically conscious and desire a better future for themselves and their future generations. They support democracy as primary political arrangement and expect political leaders to deliver especially on the count of good governance. Since the debate between more provinces or local governments has, for the time being, settled in favour of latter, therefore, instituting and operationalising local governments entails substantive legislative and administrative preparations besides conduct of free and fair local governments elections.³ Efficacious laws and allotment of financial resources through provincial finance commission awards for such governments will facilitate their effectiveness. The transformative process, undertaken in tandem with structural devolution of power, will be messy and may present a picture of some degree of lack of control. Yet, democracy in its transformative stage, is usually disruptive and chaotic in nature. Time, perseverance and consistency in seeing the transformation through to its logical end are essential while instituting institutional measures to prevent misuse of power will engender long term political stability and security of the country.

Economic Security

In the context of economic security, Pakistan's economy is 26th largest in purchasing power parity terms and 42nd largest in terms of nominal gross GDP. The GDP per capita at \$3,149 ranks at 140th in the world. However, with population of 187 million, a favourable demographic dividend and immense locational / resource potential, these figures do not reflect true potentials of the country. Inadequate tax policy revenue collection and inability to document sizeable undocumented economy make the country prone to excessive borrowing from external and internal lenders. This hamstrings financial security as well as the delivery capacity of the government. Resultantly, the country is ranked as a lower middle income country with GDP of 232.3 billion.⁴ The current fiscal policies have however created a positive outlook for GDP growth over next two years i.e. from 3.7% in 2014 to 4.2% and 4.5% in 2015 and 2016 respectively with a low inflation at 5.8%. Understandably, due to host of internal and security related issues, Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) stood at paltry \$175 million in 2013. It has risen to \$1.6 billion, therefore with investment potential for \$38 billion plus, China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) and trade with Central Asian states and Iran portend transformative potentials.

The current government has witnessed a windfall due to drastic drop in global oil prices and it remains to be seen how the windfall is utilised to serve the interests of the people of Pakistan. Trade with India has grown and registers potentials but is arrested due to Indian attitude and behaviour. Pakistan's export to India stood at USD 158 million in 2002 which rose to USD 392 million in 2014. Similarly, Pakistan's imports from India during the same period rose from USD 454 million to USD 2.1 billion.⁵ However, since India has greater state capacity for subsidising producers, their products will always have cost advantage viz Pakistan. The differential present challenges which need to be addressed to tap the six digit potential of local trade. These opportunities especially those associated with the neighbours also present diplomatic and capacity related challenges which merit cognizance and contingency planning.

Internal Security

Internal security threat from militants, sectarian and pseudo secessionist forces which has devastated the country for more than a decade, is now being dealt with a clear policy of zero tolerance for violence. The first ever National Internal Security Policy (NISP) 2013 initially provided policy guidelines but torn between dialogue and military action, resulted into long initial gestation period of inaction. The failure of talks with Tehrik e Taliban Pakistan (TTP) led to military operations in FATA. The Peshawar Army Public School massacre of children in December 2014 renewed national resolve and resulted into formulation of National Action Plan (NAP). The political government prioritised military effort i.e. operation Zarb e Azb over the civilian action to reform Madaris and to rid the society of extremism.

The successful military operation being prosecuted in FATA and supported efforts in Balochistan and Karachi as well as the support to civil government to prevent backlash in major urban centres is displaying positive effects and the terrorist attacks are down since 2014.⁶ The security operations in Balochistan picked up momentum transforming significantly local politics and efforts of law enforcement agencies in Karachi has resulted in substantially improved security situation, albeit some political repercussions. It is becoming increasingly apparent that the people of Sindh expect better governance from the provincial government to transform the success into a stable security situation.

The current predominant focus of government on internal security, economic development, fiscal stabilisation and addressing resource security especially power and gas sectors has resulted in according lower priority to some critical sectors like education, health and social security. Today 58.7 million Pakistanis are malnourished with 46% in rural and 18% in urban centres.⁷ While it may be argued that after 18th Amendment and 7th National Finance Commission (NFC) Award on more equitable basis, these subjects fall in provincial domain and the provinces require capacity

building. Yet, it is the overall governance which needs to ingest financial devolution at provincial and local governments and technological revolution for benefit of common man.

Civil Military Relations

Management of Civil Military Relations has been a persistent challenge for politics in Pakistan. It seems that a tenacious balance with positive outlook has emerged. After a brief initial period of misunderstandings, the political and military leaders have been able to develop consensus on combating terrorism, sectarianism and violence in the country on priority and situation is rapidly moving towards greater internal stability. The communication between civil and military leadership is frequent resulting into greater cooperation and focus on result oriented policies. It augers well as the political leadership and media stand firmly behind military in its internal security operations. Delving deeper into identifying the sources of terrorism beyond the common narrative, intelligence organisations have been able to expose the involvement of Pakistan's neighbours in fomenting internal instability in Pakistan, a fact which the Indian leadership in short sighted bravado readily accepted.⁸The need is now to implement remaining elements of NAP on priority.

Counter Argument

In the counter argument, some may argue that the aforementioned perspective appears to be too optimistic to be actually true. The critics can argue that corruption in Pakistan is still widespread and remains the single largest national curse. On Corruption Index, the country is ranked 127th out of 177, the gap between rich and poor as per GINI Index stands at 29.3% and the government has demonstrated minimum will, to speedup tax reforms and efforts to document the undocumented economy. There has been a steady flight of capital from the country with Pakistanis feeling more comfortable investing in Dubai rather than their own country.⁹ Similarly, the impact of climate change is intensifying every year, severely affecting different aspects of state and human security, besides causing huge economic losses, while substantive efforts for disaster risk reduction are missing. It is necessary that the persistent and emerging

dimensions of national security be refocused at with urgency. These are valid observations and are symptoms of multiple systemic problems which require attention and remedial action. These have been included in the policy measures discussed in response portion.

Burden of History

India, in its bilateral relations with Pakistan, carries greater burden of history. Post partition politics, unresolved Kashmir and other issues and consequent strategic competition underscore mutual hostility. Kashmir issue continues to persistently knock on the conscious of United Nations and International Community as the single largest case of denial of human rights and right of self-determination. It stands out as a long standing recurring story of state terrorism, oppression, and a killing fields punctuated by mass graves. However, the resolve of people of Kashmir and Pakistan remains steadfast and they will not rest till Kashmiris get their right of self-determination. The fact is clear to the Indian policy makers, yet subversive policies for orchestrate denial of the right only imperils stability in South Asia. It seems that today more than ever before, India needs a political leader who can break the paradigm of hostility and lead their country and the region in playing a constructive role for resolving bi-lateral issues. Ironically, the incumbent Prime Minister of India has demonstrated that he is not the man, rather he is more comfortable in enacting the 'Shooting for the Century' model of Cohen.¹⁰

Concerned by the inadequate outcome of its Afghan Policy, increasing role of China in Afghanistan and the potential of CPEC as a game changer India, instead of pursuing policy of engagement seems comfortable with prolonging its self-defeating policy of destabilising Pakistan. Essentially, to buy time for maintaining status quo and altering demography in Indian Held Kashmir (IHK). The deterioration in Pakistan-India relations and inability of Indian Government to engage in a meaningful dialogue, therefore, emerges as a source of concern. It is mainly due to Indian intransigence, her inability

to recognise changing strategic landscape in South Asia and her policy for seeking regional hegemony rather than cooperation and strategic stability in South Asia.

In the context of Pakistan-Afghan Relations, there has been a substantial change as far as Afghanistan's policy towards Pakistan is concerned. Post US draw down, successful conduct of elections and appointment of President Ashraf Ghani as President of Afghanistan and head of Unity Government augers well for the country as well as Pakistan. The change is laying strong foundation for growth of friendly relations between the two countries. The intra Afghan reconciliation process and the consequent dialogue (although in initial throes and challenged by numerous factors including death of Mullah Umar) remains the strategic way forward. Reconciliation is inevitable while Taliban may strive for a better bargain by continuing with violence. Pakistan's role and China's support in this context remain critical.

Recognising the ongoing changes in global and regional political environment, Pakistan's foreign policy is now more balanced. It needs to be consistently guided by the Quaid's directive of '**Peace Within and Peace Without.**' There has been significant reduction in anti-Americanism in Pakistan and the two states are rebuilding relations recognising and respecting each other's interests. However, it remains for US to balance its international priorities with imperatives of stability in South Asia. Pakistan-China Friendship remains substantive and the CPEC has added depth to it. The balance has also enabled a thaw in Pakistan-Russia relations, this new beginning auger well for both the countries. However, growing instability in Middle East and cleavage caused by Yemen crisis in Pakistan's relations with Arab friends, is a source of concerns. Pakistan's efforts to steer clear of the sectarian conflict in Middle East engineered by Islamic State as well the strategic competition between Iran and Saudi Arabia is essential for pursuing a long term balanced foreign policy for Middle East (reckoning the Iran deal and the rise of IS). Having reviewed the developments in external and internal security matrix to crystallise perspective on challenges and

opportunities, it is pertinent now to analyse the institutional arrangements for formulating and executing national security policy and attendant strategies and measures.

National Security Management System (NSMS)

Pakistan, for decades, has lacked an effective NSMS. The system finds context in the political system of the country. The regular alteration of power between civil and military governments diverted focus and prevented NSMS to mature. The events of 9/11, rapid globalisation, IT revolution and rise of violent non-state actors emphasised the need for evolving comprehensive national security policy and devising a system to formulate, execute and monitor application of the policy. Most developed countries consistent with the threat matrix and genius of its people have developed and deployed NSMS. In Pakistan, NSMS was set up after a long delay by current government. It comprises National Security Committee (NSC) the apex consultative and decision making body for national security policies (the NSC in most western countries is chaired by President/Prime Minister and meets regularly). The NSC and its Academic Committee has been resourced with some national think tanks. The hardware is in place and software is maturing. However the NSMS has not been fully integrated in implementation of NAP. The integration would have enabled it to mature and streamline its processes and procedures making it a more efficient and effective. The NSC is currently engaged in preparing a national security policy yet it, has not assumed the significance which is normally accorded to it in developed countries.

National Security Policy Perspective

Pakistan today, stands at cross roads so far national security is concerned. The positive vibe prevailing in the environment despite enormous challenges combined with bipartisan support for pragmatic policies has the potentials for altering the course of the history. Alternately internal divisions, interest based politics and corruption can prevent that from happening. The international security environment

indicates significant changes. The transition from unipolarity to multipolarity and Pakistan location in the neighbourhood of a global power (China) and emerging regional power (India) which is inimical to former and is aligned with US and West continues to portend challenges and opportunities. The awakening and growing instability in Middle East, rise of Islamic State and intensification in strategic competition astride the Gulf, can inextricably draw Pakistan into a possible fatalistic strategic competition and conflict.

On the domestic front, uncontrolled growth in population, scarcity of power, energy and water resources present enormous governance and security challenges. The economy is rebalancing itself yet demands political action appropriate hard decisions to document undocumented economy, enhance tax base and revenue collection and bring in investments to ignite economic growth. The foremost requirement is to articulate a world view based on the principles laid down by Quaid e Azam of 'Peace within and Peace without.' Political leadership has to provide direction and mobilise census for an inclusive politics, ridding the society of violence and appropriate curricular reforms to rebalance the society and future generations.

Political Stability and Quality of Democracy

Foremost for Pakistan's national security is political stability. It is argued by the analysts that developmental approach to politics may win votes and prolong longevity of formal democracy and the political regimes, yet foundations of a sustainable democracy can only be laid by an elite which respects democracy, democratic institutions and exercises political power through them. For making democracy attractive for a common man, existing formal democracy has to rapidly transition towards a more participatory democracy which incorporates the grass root level. The quality of democracy, governance and state institutions have to improve. The policies should aim at addressing the immediate concerns and problems of the common man. Therefore, political

security and long term stability in Pakistan can be accrued through a participatory democracy which delivers results.

Expectantly pursuant to Supreme Court's decision, election for local governments will be completed in 2015. However, the devolution would only become effective if the respective provincial devolution bills also incorporate transfer of required funds and administrative powers to local governments. Institution of three tiered system of governance will also, in consequence, transform provincial and federal legislatures. Thereon, the members of legislature instead of accruing development funds will have to concentrate on legislating rather than development. The process, it is perceived, would be messy but would require consistency and sustained application. The risk of stagnation can build frustration which can lead to situations not productive for consolidating democracy.

Secondly, the efficacy of state institutions is the foundation on which the structure of national security rests. The state and its political institutions have witnessed some decline over time and have been performing at the sub optimal level. The paradigm has to change. Governance, guided by the principle of minimum government, will have to shed weight in favour of privatisation, become lean, cost effective and more effective. A national commission with the mandate to reform government and governance merits consideration. It should be mandated to make governance less costly and more cost effective. It should review the performance of state institutions, set goals, and decide indicators for performance evaluation and time schedule for periodic review. This will help arrest the decline and turn the course. The commission should comprise experts and consultants reporting directly to the Prime Minister. The devolution of power and application of the principle of minimum government also places premium on effective coordination. Interprovincial Coordination (IPC) Ministry will have to devise procedures and regulatory mechanism to ensure smooth and effective governance.

The Quaid's principle of 'Peace within' should provide the overarching policy guideline. To achieve the internal peace, government with bipartisan support should strengthen participatory democracy, relevant democratic institutions and rule of law. The three tiered system of governance provides requisite forums for dispute resolution and effective administration at relevant levels. In a federated democracy, the role of intra-provincial coordination assumes immense significance. IPC ministry should be capacitated to assume responsibility. Periodic and regular meetings of Council of Common Interest (CCI) can enable dispute resolution and needs to be prompted for fostering a peaceful society.

Internal Security

Thirdly, internal peace and harmony will, in the longer run, provide necessary conditions for revival of economy and respect in the comity of nations. Terrorism, sectarianism and militancy present systemic challenges. The policy of 'Peace Within' can be achieved by relentlessly pursuing the objective of 'zero tolerance of violence in any form' through institutional means to its logical end. It comprises short and long term measures, the short term include Operation Zarb e Azb and removing the criminal elements from cities in particular and society in general. In the long run, the police and judicial system should be able to take on the responsibilities. To this end, they should now build requisite capabilities and capacities. To turn the tide for good, there is a need to review and devise a national curriculum which promotes principles of humanity and tolerance and educates the citizens about their civic responsibilities and national values.

In a globalising and technologically enabled world, it should be expected that the country will be increasingly challenged with new and diverse threats. To proactively and effectively defend against such threats, the internal security apparatus should be modernised. Interior Ministry and its departments/organisations should be able to execute the concept of comprehensive homeland security. They have to be mandated and resourced with deficient agencies, the foremost

need is to bring diverse border management departments under one Authority for Border Security Management (ABSM). The ABSM should be technologically enabled and linked with the military and provincial security mechanisms for deeper reach and effectiveness.

In a federated state, centralised implementation of national internal security policy presents enormous challenges. The mechanism has to expand to incorporate the provinces and to some degree, the local governments in the framework. The provinces play a major role in implementing the policy and making it a success. The provincial departments (Home Secretary, Police and Intelligence departments) should be upgraded to fulfil this responsibility. Attitudinal change in political leaders at provincial levels is, therefore, essential as 'politics as usual' will not accrue desired results; people desire peace and hope for their future generations. Change for better and manifestation of resolve by implementing requisite policies and strategies are essential for creating an orderly and peaceful society.

The second dimension relates to implementation of National Action Plan. The plan comprises three aspects; the military aspect is being catered by Operation Zarb e Azb in FATA and law enforcement agencies in main cities and Balochistan. The ultimate success of Operation Zarb e Zab lies in political and administrative reforms in FATA and PATA areas. There is need to main stream FATA and PATA by absorbing these into KP Province. Instituting reforms for political representation from these areas for national and provincial assemblies and extending uniform local government system.

The second aspect comprises targeting the madaris engaged in violence, criminal and terrorist activities. Having eradicated such elements, the next objective should be to reform madaris in a manner that they do not contribute to extremism and intolerance, rather become harbingers of peace in the society. The third aspect concerning judicial reforms is critical. Setting up of military courts is only an adhoc

arrangement limited in time. The country's judicial system (criminal and anti-terrorist) and laws burden the state rather than the accused. The paradigm has to change, it is the collective responsibility of judiciary and a debt to the nation which they should repay by bringing about paradigmatic change to provide speedy and cheap justice.

The militant forces in Balochistan are devoid of a cause and political support and collude with external powers to destabilise Pakistan. Already, the security situation has manifested a turnaround; an accomplishment which must be consolidated. With the emerging significance of CPEC in the economic turnaround, stability in Balochistan assumes paramount importance. The bonhomie in civil military relations in the province, furnish the much needed environment for crafting and implementing a multipronged strategy incorporating security, governance and economic aspects to the troubled areas. It will extend the writ of state and foster normality. The major aspects of the plan should comprise priority development of the northern route, development in Gwadar Port and city involving local populace and an economic plan for disturbed Baloch areas. Central to long term stability in Gwadar would be the measures to improve the quality of living of local population to include health, education and service sectors. A comprehensive plan for the local fisherman i.e. port facilities and living accommodation needs to be devised incorporating their requirements and aspirations. The Gwadar Development plan should lead to implement the plan to bring about attitudinal change in favour of CPEC. The turnover of governance by end of 2015 should be done in a manner that successes achieved are consolidated. Prime Minister's role in this context will be central.

External Security

The turmoil in Middle East is laden with potential threat which can generate and rapidly multiply sectarian tension and conflict in Pakistan. It is a threat which needs to be handled at policy, strategy and governance levels. The policy of

considered neutrality and engagement with brotherly countries is appropriate and must be relentlessly pursued. Space should not be provided to adversaries to exploit the cleavage. The strategy to insulate borders preventing ingress of Islamic State and not allowing domestic sectarian radicals for participating in the conflict in Syria and Iraq will be critical for the success of the policy. Ministry of Interior should monitor those domestic elements which display proclivity towards sectarian conflicts. It has to be followed up by an extensive media campaign highlighting the moderate nature of our society, inform it about the barbarian face of perpetrators of violence.

Pakistan's foreign policy, guided by the principle of 'Peace Without', should construct strategies and deploy instruments to execute the policy in its neighbourhood and beyond. The foremost challenge persists in context of Afghanistan. Despite the growth of better understanding and joint efforts to combat terrorism in the border areas, the reconciliation still remains the key to success of the policy. The dialogue has suffered a setback due to the death of Mullah Umar. Understandably, the new leadership will take some time to consolidate its authority and power. It is therefore critical that the process of intra Afghan dialogue be carried forward to fruition. Role of Pakistan is critical which it should continue to perform in concert with China sincerely and responsibly.

The third challenge emerges from Indian hegemonic policy aiming to dissuade Pakistan from seeking resolution of Kashmir Issue in accordance with UN Resolutions. Indian policy to coerce Pakistan into a dialogue; a limited agenda set by her is of course, not acceptable. The coercive measures to include intimidation along the Line of Control, destabilising Pakistan by sponsoring terrorism in Pakistan are plainly evident. Indian discomfort with CPEC is equally visible and is feeding into the aforementioned measures. GOP has taken note and voiced concerns, however, efforts in this context have to be strategized to expose true face of India. She had exploited the post 9/11 global sentiments against terrorism and unsuccessfully attempted to obfuscate the Kashmir

struggle, the time has changed and accurate global perspective on Kashmir needs to be re-emphasised with vigour.

At the core of Pakistan's India policy, sits resolution of Kashmir issue in accordance with UN Resolutions. It is imperative, that Pakistan should continue to support people of Kashmir in their just political struggle for their right of self-determination. However, it is also the responsibility of Kashmiris on either side of LOC and Kashmiri Diaspora to lead the struggle. Perhaps time is optimum to seek a Kashmiri Spring.

The pursuit of a balanced foreign policy mandates good relation with existing and emerging poles of power. Suggesting a strategy for this policy is not in the purview of this article. However, the requirement is evident.

Economic Security

The economic measures instituted by GOP are starting to show effects. Recovering from the past downslide, the economy today registers a potential growth of 5.1% in 2015. "Declining inflation, relatively better growth in private sector credit and robust workers' remittance helped propel consumer spending".¹¹ Narrow tax base, tax evasion and loss making public service enterprises continue to burden the economy and require urgent attention. Policy of stability and recovery should now expand to focus on growth which is essential for job creation. The FDI in form of CPEC if coupled with growth friendly strategies retain the potential to move the country into positive growth and stability phase in short to midterm. Pakistan is a connecting country, with the improvements in communication infrastructure and CPEC, it portends good potentials for increase in trade with Iran and Central Asia, States. Projects like CASA 1000 and Iran Pakistan Gas Pipeline should assist in meeting the energy demand at competitive process. Relentless pursuit of policies facilitating timely completion of these projects is important.

Role of Military

The military is currently performing quintessential constitutional task in restoring internal stability. These measures are strengthening GOP and accruing greater political stability. However, in the long run, it is the responsibility of civil government to create and maintain order and normalcy from the outcome through a political action programme. Expectantly, the operations will be completed by end of 2015, thereby creating conditions for political stabilisation in few years. Support to and strengthening of democracy will help fostering long term political stability in the country.

It is now an opportune time for the military to assist the civil government in articulating a defence policy for future; a policy, which seeks stability through comprehensive deterrence. It should articulate balance between nuclear and conventional deterrence and structured on deploying the former as the first line of defence if the security of the country is threatened. The policy should aim to bring about qualitative change (through indigenous capabilities) in critical components of its conventional deterrence by striking balance between manpower and technology. Similarly, the military strategy is burdened by carry on effects of the past. Guided by policy, there is considerable merit in outthinking similarities with flexible response of cold war era. To draw optimally from the demographic dividend, a balance between all volunteer and professional standing armed forces mixed with a good percentage of volunteer short term service induction carries greater long term strategic advantage.

Conclusion

The article has succinctly reviewed the contemporary security challenges faced by Pakistan, reviewed our policies and institutional capabilities and identified areas of ways to administer change. It has argued for making the NSMS effective, instituting quality participatory democracy for long term political stability and uncovered challenges residing in

the interplay of environment and policies of regional players. In the final analysis, the attitude and approach of the political leaders and their ability to administer effective good governance will be the game changer; a leadership which is focused on serving the people of Pakistan and not on their own political and personal aggrandizement.

Notes

¹Barry Buzan, *People: States And Fear: National Security Problem In International Relations* (Transasia Publishers, 1987).

²Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and future thrust towards Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) encompassing areas of personal, job, health, education security etc. provide perspective to the notion of Human Security.

³In view of the rapid growth in population inability of governance to reach out to people living away from provincial capitals generated a debate for more provinces i.e. creating three provinces in Punjab, two in Kyber Puktoonkawa, Baluchistan and Sindh. There were proposals to convert the divisions into provinces etc. However with the decision of Supreme Court for conducting and institutionalising local governments by September 2015 the debate has been settled for a three tiered governance system. The local governments will incorporate / replace the colonial district management system.

⁴World Bank, *The World Bank Annual Report 2014* (World Bank Publications, 2014).

⁵Samir S. Amir and Syed Danish Hyder, *Pakistan-India-Trade-Normalization-A-Word-of-Caution.pdf* (Karachi: The Pakistan Business Council, 2015), <http://pbc.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2015/07/Pakistan-India-Trade-Normalization-A-Word-of-Caution.pdf>.

⁶"Fatalities in Terrorist Violence in Pakistan 2003-2015," *South Asia Terrorism Portal*, accessed August 25, 2015, <http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/database/casualties.htm>. The number of attacks have declined and the balance of the ratio of fatalities in 2015 stood at two terrorist for every civilian/military killed. (759 vs 1552).

⁷Anwer Sumra, "SDPI Report: 58.7m Pakistanis Living below Poverty Line - The Express Tribune," *The Express Tribune*, February 25, 2014.

⁸Mumtaz Alvi and Asim Yasin, "Resolutions in Senate, NA Condemn Statements of Indian Leaders," *The News*, June 12, 2015; Afzal Khan, "India's Role in E. Pakistan Violence to Be Exposed - Khaleej Times," *Khaleej Times*, June 11, 2015, <http://www.khaleejtimes.com/international/india-s-role-in-e.-pakistan-violence-to-be-exposed>. Resolution in Senate, NA condemns statements of Indian leaders, "This House condemns the recent disturbing pattern of provocative and hostile statements from Indian leaders, including threatening strikes.."

⁹\$1.6 billion in real state of Dubai in first quarter of 2014 alone

¹⁰Stephen P. Cohen, *Shooting for a Century: The India-Pakistan Conundrum* (Washington DC: Brookings Institution Press, 2013).

¹¹Amin Ahmed, "Pakistan's Economy to Grow 5.1pc in 2015: ESCAP," *Dawn*, May 15, 2015.

INDIA'S LOOK EAST POLICY: CHALLENGES AND OPTIONS FOR PAKISTAN

Raja Qaiser Ahmed

Abstract

The article focuses on India's emerging trajectory of foreign policy under Narendra Modi's premiership and its moves to evolve closer relations with the eastern economic powers, especially Australia and Japan and its implications for Pakistan. India and Pakistan, the immediate neighbours, are locked into an incessant rivalry since their inception. The change of political rule or a policy schema in either country brings profound implications for the regional competitive environment. This paper seeks to identify the patterns and processes which are likely to be altered in Indian Foreign Policy under Modi and possible responses from Pakistan. The theoretical conception of cognitive interconnectedness of ideas and actions has been used to explain this new trend in the Indian foreign policy.

Introduction

The India-Pakistan relations are a haunting tale since their inception years more ostensibly in the realm of mutual antagonism and the character of animosity in which they are embedded. The construct of the relations and mutual suspicion which take over the discourse, these bilateral relations can be exhaustively interpreted in the framework of contained instrumentalism¹ which kept the communitarian differentiation intact based on the character of identity.²

The interconnectedness in the mutual relations of India and Pakistan has made these polities largely proportional to one another. The eventuality in respect of one brings profound implications for the other. India's threat spectrum and its immediate neighbours are contradictory to one another. India envisages cross border terrorism and external manoeuvring as a major threat³ as far as the frame of internal security is

concerned. Whereas, on contrary, Pakistan largely identifies internal security threat as the existential one and more fundamentally suspects India's involvement in it.

Pakistan ruling elites' preferences in concordance to India are quite evident

- Pakistan government led by Nawaz Sharif intends to boost economic relations and trade ties with India
- Pakistan aspires to move ahead with the regional integration as the beneficiary of India's rampant economic growth
- Pakistan wants a process of political normalization with India to avoid tragedies like Mumbai and *Samjhota*.

On the contrary, Narendra Modi, the prime minister of India represents a mind-set of Hindu nationalist and a non-accommodative behaviour towards Pakistan at large. His anti-Pakistan sentiments, which he repeatedly reiterated in his election campaigns, speaks volume of the animosity in the relations and dealing towards Pakistan.

Ways are not convenient for Pakistan. An oppositional and ferocious response awaits Pakistan in its bilateral relations with India. India's intransigency and furious reactionism is likely to remain prevalent. The foreign policy relations in South Asia particularly India-Pakistan, largely termed as sub-continental security, is by far the least complex and most accessible. In an anarchic setting with struggle of power and maximization of material capabilities, especially the military kind is of utmost concern. The asymmetry in military capabilities has been leading to a security dilemma, resulting in an outgrowth of military build-ups.

India's Electoral Process: Rise of Bharatya Janta Party (BJP) in Power

It is quite pertinent to narrate that Hindu nationalism of BJP with extreme centrist right ideology, in its first tenure, could not crank out the anticipated outcomes rather proved to be a disaster. A deliberate attempt to alter and modify the

character of national identity through forced Hindutva, religious projectionism, *Babri Masjid* fiasco and amendments in syllabi counterfeited. Since 1991, the Janta culture in India has been on demise. The public acceptance and the Janta narrative were on verge of decline. This two decades' surge is something worth intriguing and raised a question why was Congress defeated and orthodoxy and conventionalism triumphed?

*Nehruvan*⁴ model of Indian democracy is fundamentally based on democracy⁵ but Indian secularism is based on majoritarianism. The will of majority precedes and dominates. Indian secularism is dual faced when it comes to the case of criminal prosecutions. It has been substantiated with the exoneration of Modi in the case of Gujrat massacre. At centre, secularism operates superficially but at the state level the *Hinduization* takes the lead. How Modi moves ahead with the culmination of Hindu identity and the Indian secularism, will be having far lasting imprints on Indian polity in coming years.

While elucidating the cognitive structure of Indian Elite in the formulation of foreign policy, it appears that ideology no longer plays an important role. India has become rational and pragmatist in pursuing its national goals, the core of them being to preserve the country's pluralistic democracy, protect its territorial unity and integrity, sustain and expand its economic and industrial growth by fully utilizing the opportunities of economic reforms and globalization.⁶ The BJP's foreign policy is an amalgamation of ferocious Hindu nationalism and rationalist pursuit of policy choices.

India, a committed status-quo country, aspires to play its role at global level. Indian elite takes into account its unique geographical position, ancient history, natural resources, democracy and culture and is yearning for a conducive and supportive global environment which could pacify India's global aspirations. India longs for a stable neighbourhood, that a prosperous and stable India needs to be at peace with itself and its neighbours need not to be emphasized, for a

troubled neighbourhood not only limits India's global ambitions but also jeopardizes its internal security.

BJP's Foreign Policy and Divergences from Congressional Rhetoric

Bharatya Janta Party (BJP) is perceived as a party on communal basis seeking to eliminate the secular characterization of the Indian polity in which state and society coexist. Political Hinduism and Indian Muslims' Ritualism are often projected as absolute identities contradictory to one another. Multiple identities communitarian caste based and some with regional outlook exist in India and compete to preserve their identities and traditions. The BJP as furious proponent of Hindutva seeks to dominate the value systems and traditions based on majoritarianism.⁷

Political Hinduism⁸ is extremely impactful on the contours of national politics in India. An attempt is based on majoritarian culture and to remove the secularism from the equation of liberal democracy with Hindu nationalism having replaced Indian nationalism. The notion and construct of Hindutva and its everlasting imprints on the spectrum of Indian politics can be shrugged aside.⁹

Congressional rhetoric, since the inception of India, has been Liberal democracy + Composite Culture + Indian secularism. *Bharatya Jana Sang* and Janta Culture are counter rhetoric to the Congressional composite culture and their rhetoric is Liberal Democracy + Hindutva + Majoritarianism.¹⁰ BJP is the extension of Janta culture and is primarily obsessed with Hindutva doctrine. Democracy is a defining parameter in India's foreign policy.¹¹

When it comes to the foreign policy doctrines of both the mainstream parties, Congress believes in the externalization of the relations with systemic variables more in focus and takes a global manifestation of the foreign policy processes. BJP on the other hand, internalizes the foreign policy variables and believes more in the channelization of domestic

variables. That's why war mongering, war hysteria, and war mania at the home are very likely to happen when a crisis situation occurs in BJP's tenure. The fervent border escalations with the immediate neighbour can also be explained in the given framework.¹²

Modi's Redefined Foreign Policy

India's Look East Policy is not a new policy. It was developed during the tenure of Prime Minister Narsima Rao and successor governments of Vajpayee and Manmohan also pursued this policy.¹³ Under this policy, India intends to build cumulative security, economic and strategic ties with Southeast Asian Nations to bolster its status as a regional power. Modi's East mantra is not a new phenomenon but he has re-asserted and redefined it by focusing on Australia and Japan as potential allies.

At the domestic level, Modi is focused on the Delhi-Bombay corridor; and at the regional level, Modi wishes to develop relations with Bangladesh, Myanmar and the Far East. Additionally, the overtone of Modi's eastward push is strategic; it is meant to prove India's relevance in any anti-China collusion with the United States to balance off China in South China Sea and invite American capital investment and sophisticated technology to provide India with a semblance of a power equal to China. In this regard, the Australian apprehensions about the growing Indian naval strength around its seas should also be noted because it will be an opportunity for Pakistan to counterbalance the Indian naval superiority.

Modi's East Mantra: From Look East to Act East

A number of key bilateral and multilateral engagements are the clear manifestations of India's diplomatic push for economic cooperation towards the East. Narendra Modi has moved one step ahead by developing "Act East Policy" in order to illustrate the recent diplomatic expeditions into the South East Asia and Australia.¹⁴

By shifting the India's Asia policy from "Look East" to "Act East", Prime Minister Narendra Modi indicated that he would be more focused and proactive in the region than his predecessors. From the very beginning of its tenure, he has been actively involved into this region while deliberately excluding Pakistan from its priority list. Not only in the diplomatic sense but also from the economic and strategic point of view, India is intentionally undermining the cooperative postures towards Pakistan.

In a situation where Pakistan has been kept at the back burner, Pakistan has to design a pragmatic roadmap in order to come up with its own version of look East vision. Pakistan has also embarked upon the policy of Look East yet little is heard about how successful it has been for the state.

India's Look East Policy: between the Rhetoric and Substance

India's look East policy can be primarily dubbed as "act East policy". Given India's look East policy Modi is fundamentally targeting Australia and Japan where trade, investment, maritime cooperation, security ties and creating linkages at societal level are his focus areas. PM Modi visited Australia after the hiatus of 28 years when PM Rajiv Gandhi went there in 1986. He became the first Indian PM who addressed the Australian parliament.¹⁵

India, Australia and Japan had their high level trilateral moot in June 2015. Indian foreign secretary represented India in these talks whereas vice foreign minister of Japan and secretary of the Department of Foreign Affairs Australia attended the meeting. The trilateral moot discussed a wide range of issues with maritime security as the top agenda. Cooperation vis-a-vis free navigation in the South China Sea, Indian Ocean and Pacific Ocean was also discussed. The greater prospects for economic cooperation were deliberated upon. A joint three nations' naval exercise is also on the cards.¹⁶

India-Australia Relations

Australia and India are sharing history of positive Defence relationship after 2006 when India and Australia signed MOU on Defence cooperation and in 2009, signed a joint declaration on security cooperation. The Defence relationship between Australia and India has grown and includes new forums for strategic dialogue, and a frequent interaction through visits of senior officials. Training exchange programmes and staff talks are also boosting the bilateral relations.

In his visit to Australia while making speech to the parliament of Australia, Modi touched on all important aspects of bilateral relations between India and Australia with the spin of regional and global political and strategic setting. He stated that Australia was not in the periphery of their vision; it was in the center of their thought. With Australia, Modi signed five agreements on social security, arts and culture, combating narcotics trade, tourism and transfer of sentenced prisoners.¹⁷

The current trade between India and Australia stands at 15 billion dollars which is much below the potential agreed by both the leaders. In 2012, in a meeting between the then Indian PM Manmohan Singh and Australian PM Julia Gillard, it was committed to enhance bilateral trade to 100 billion dollars by 2015. Both the countries are working to finalise a free trade deal by the end of next year. The aspiration and decision was also prompted by a comprehensive trade deal signed between Modi and Jinping during the visit whereby 95 percent of Australian exports would go to Chinese market with zero tariff.

Modi's Make in India

Modi's mantra "Make in India" can be complemented with "Spend in India." From building toilets to smart cities, he invites investment from the potential investors. Demand, development and demographics are the key drivers for

investing in India. 800 million people are below the age of 35 which presents a rosy scenario for cheap and skilled labour-an attractive message to the investors. Though power development index is still a major problem and poverty still haunts India to the large extent.

Modi said that opportunities existed for Australians in different sectors including energy, agriculture, infrastructure, food, finance, manufacturing processing, technology and mining. He urged providing finances, resources, technology and expertise to working partners and investors. Modi claimed that overall trade ties between the two countries would be grounded in familiar democratic framework.

Security and Strategic Aspects

India and Australia earlier concluded a strategic pact in 2009 but considering the lukewarm follow up this time, they decided to upgrade the strategic ties.¹⁸ A Framework for Security Cooperation was signed between the two leaders. Action plan to lend weight to the framework has also been established. As per the plan:

- Annual summit and foreign policy exchanges and coordination
- Defence policy planning and coordination
- Counter-terrorism and other transnational crimes
- Border protection, coast guard, and customs
- Disarmament, non-proliferation, civil nuclear energy and maritime security
- Disaster management and peacekeeping
- Cooperation in regional and multilateral fora¹⁹

Counter-terrorism figured prominently in Modi's engagement with the Australian leadership. He underlined the need and importance to work at regional and global level to form a strategy to counter the global threat of violence.

Maritime Cooperation

Modi intends to build close naval partnership with Australia. Knowing the reach and significance of Australia in terms of its maritime potential, he is seeking cooperation in this regard. “The oceans are our lifelines. But, we worry about its access and security in our part of the world more than ever before,”²⁰

The security dimension is again at the core of maritime cooperation with an aim to counter piracy, securing sea-lanes and harnessing the economic potential of the marine resources. Maritime security has also been included in the framework for security cooperation, marking its importance to advance the bilateral ties as well as regional security complex.

Civil Nuclear Deal

India wants Australia to expedite the civil nuclear deal so that uranium can be imported by India. Building a case for uranium import from Australia after the agreement, Modi confidently stated that the deal would give Australia an opportunity to be the part of one of the safest and secure nuclear energy programme.²¹ The assertion was aimed at Abbott who earlier minced no words that the nuclear deal would be finalized if all goes well and with suitable safeguards in place. Australians want to ensure what any deal with India would be in line with their commitment for cleaner energy.

Nuclear commerce and trade is an important issue in Indian foreign policy ever since the Civil Nuclear Pact was concluded with the US in 2008. India was treated as nuclear pariah due to its status as non-NPT member having incurred restrictions by the Nuclear Suppliers Group (NSG). India could not engage by any means in nuclear trade; be it a military or civilian purpose. However, India got NSG waiver along with an additional IAEA protocol and the amendment of the US domestic laws relating to regulation of nuclear commerce. India started being treated as an exception to the rules and regimes of global non-proliferation and all that was

made possible to facilitate the Indo-US nuclear deal (2008) which otherwise was not in coming.²²

Following the Indo-US nuclear deal, India became eligible to engage in nuclear commerce not only with the US, but all other countries possessing nuclear technology and signatories of NPT at the same time. Following this breakthrough, India has signed nuclear deals with Russia, Kazakhstan, France, UK, Argentina, Namibia, South Korea, Canada and Mongolia. The Indo-US nuclear deal which in fact is the deal between India and NSG members, allowed India to expand its nuclear complex for civilian purposes whereas sparing its military facilities from IAEA scrutiny.²³

Australia is interested in selling civilian nuclear technology to India. Even the US gave a rationale while concluding the agreement with India that it would benefit the former economically creating 27 thousand jobs annually and bringing 1 billion dollars to the national kitty. India is aware of untapped potential to expand nuclear commercial links with countries which are willing to trade with it. In this connection, PM Modi made it a point during his visit to Japan to accelerate the stalled talks on the issue. The visit of Australian Prime Minister Tony Abbot to India in September 2014 brought dividends to India as both have agreed to cement the ties with nuclear trade topping the agenda.

India and Australia started negotiating on uranium sales in 2012 right after Australia lifted a long-time ban on exporting the uranium ore to Delhi to meet its ambitious and high capability nuclear energy programme.²⁴ Australia, the third largest uranium producer, had previously declined such exports to India amid India's non signatory status of the non-proliferation treaty. This is where the nuclear deal with the US came handy for India paving the path for vetting the appetite to augment its civilian nuclear programme. Australia aims to sell 10 thousand tons of yellow cake/uranium by 2017. The ambition fits well with the Indian efforts to import nuclear energy for civilian purposes what they term as peaceful and for power generation.

India argues that, as a fast-rising economy, it needs nuclear energy to keep pace with its emerging profile. According to the World Bank, 400 million people in India are without electricity. India insists to accumulate nuclear energy to meet its electricity demands with a view to lighting-up villages in its nooks and crannies. India hence, successfully puts a humanitarian spin on its desire to optimize its civilian nuclear capability. The agreement will allow India to add 20 small plants in operation at present. Moreover, it will lessen India's reliance on coal and make a shift to more environment-friendly nuclear energy for power generation.

India-Japan Relations: From Economics to Nuclear Cooperation

Given the priority of nations, civil nuclear cooperation is an important aspect of Japan-India bilateral relations and is expected to be on the top of agenda list for the prosperity of two nations as defined by their policy makers. Both the nations intend to continue the use of civil nuclear power, having recognized its risks. Japan's nuclear policy had been a hurdle while negotiating with India, Turkey, South Africa and other nations on civil nuclear agreements; so most of the deliberations went inconclusive.²⁵

With the rollover of new century, the peaceful persuasion of nuclear power got recognized as one of the workable and effective measures to combat global warming and to surge economic growth. The Great East Japan Earthquake in May 2011 and the unfortunate occurrence of Fukushima Daiichi nuclear power plant triggered new rounds of discussion and deliberation on the risks and threats of civil nuclear power, not primarily in Japan but also in many countries.²⁶

As indicated by the media reports, arrangements are being continued and basic assentation was arrived at with Turkey in March 2012. India-Japan mutual ties have extended in areas of vital concerns including security and economic ties. India-Japan collaboration in the trading of nuclear technology has high potential for development. India is searching for different

avenues to measure up the expanding demand to support its economic development. Japan has developed into a country with high nuclear sophistication and the conjunction of these two variables is taking the India-Japan relationship forward. Both the nations have focused on the requirement for controlling the proliferation of Weapons of Mass Destruction (WMDs).

In December 2001, in a joint statement, heads of both the governments had consented to work as partners against non-proliferation and to take some serious measures in the export of dual used, sensitive and cautious technology. The nuclear issue has two angles, to be specific, the interest for abandoning nuclear weapons and crafting a mechanism for the peaceful use of nuclear technology.²⁷

Japan is very precise to the issues of nuclear proliferation and public opinion is concerned about the issues of nuclear proliferation of any form. Despite the fact that Japan is now at understandable level of India's position and history of use of nuclear energy for non-military and civilian purposes. India-Japan ties went under severe turmoil after India's 1998 atomic tests at Pokhran. Japan deferred all its monetary help to the then on-going ventures. The move was perceived in India as Japan's hyper response and absence of comprehension of India's impulses. Political relations consistently enhanced from 2001 onwards. In the field of conceivable participation in the areas of common interest between India and Japan, divergences do exist.

Amid his visit to India in December 2009, Hatoyama had insinuated the likelihood of Japan beginning to export nuclear supplies and other high tech technology in his discussion with Prime Minister Manmohan Singh. The Japanese government and in addition the general population appears befuddled on what stance Japan ought to bring with respect to nuclear cooperation with India. While there is no sharp rift in the Liberal Democratic Party (LDP) or the decision Democratic Party of Japan (DPJ) that would debilitate a part in either party on the issue, the DPJ ends up amidst characterizing a

course that would not forsake Japan's expressed strategy on nuclear disarmament. Meantime, encouraging nuclear exports with India. In spite of the fact that still wary, Japan recognizes India's strategic significance. There is more appreciation in Japan that peaceful use of nuclear technology would help India battle with global warming.

The two nations had their first round of discussions on 28 June 2010 went for fixing a respective civilian nuclear cooperation agreement. Under this agreement, Japan would export nuclear innovation and related gear to India while barring India from utilizing them for military and strategic purposes or proliferation them to any other nation. In particular, Japan needs to cooperate with India, for the reasons mentioned below:

- The political orientation of this cooperation
- The India's drive to deal with energy scarcity
- The increasing threat of global warming;
- The promotion and enhancement of cooperation in science and technology
- The contribution of Japanese exporters involved in nuclear power.²⁸

Japan is one of the few well equipped advanced producers of nuclear power reactors. If Japan relaxes its policy and consents to cooperate with India, the nuclear market itself will unleash growth potential in a decade around \$100–150 billion.²⁹ This is a huge attraction for Japan to reconsider its position soon.

Consortium of 13 Japanese companies joined hands on 22 October 2010 to establish International Nuclear Energy Development of Japan Co. Ltd. (JINED), headquartered in Tokyo, to commence and engage in activities that may lead to the proposals supporting nuclear power projects in the emerging countries.³⁰

Pakistan and Japan share a history of long relations. Japan is the second major donor to Pakistan after United States.

Realising this fact, India under Modi's government, is trying to craft a sustainable roadmap of relations with Japan. This is a fact that no visible change in the bilateral ties has occurred yet. The nuclear agreement is yet to be reached, and the cooperation on the US-2 is only a dream for the distant future. In Japan nowadays, not much attention is paid on the negotiations between the two countries. The Japanese business circle might have expected a "miracle" at the initial stage of Modi government, but no substantial development has occurred.

Modi's Policy: Myth and Reality

Since Modi got elected as the Prime Minister, there had been much hue and cry across the globe. Modi was presented as a messiah. His personal attributes and his charisma were the most debated topics in national and international press. The reality after one and a half year in the government presents a very different picture.

Modi's policy revolves around more rhetoric than substance. He is aggressively pursuing the options but nothing substantive has been achieved or reached out yet. Admittedly, Asia's new geopolitics revolves around India, Japan and Australia but Modi, though is pushing for the strategic framework in the indo-pacific with considerable currency, but the only success in this regard is the trilateral dialogue.

Modi at home, is facing some serious challenges in meeting the promises, he made during his election campaign. There had been a drastic decline in his popularity at home. Corruption still remains India's biggest predicament. BJP lost elections in Kashmir and was defeated at the hands of Aam Admi Party in the state elections of Delhi. Modi phenomenon in India is slightly fizzling out.

Pakistan in the Matrix: Lessons and Recommendations

The policy by Narendra Modi towards the East marked by a number of key bilateral and multilateral engagements is the manifestation of diplomatic push towards the unexplored continent. The strategic and security considerations are also weighed in to the desired extent. Engagement with NRIs and the domestic audience of the host countries are also on the front burner. The cosmetics of the diplomatic niceties however, should not cause the onlookers to overplay the downside of the broad engagement by Modi.

Pakistan has to confront and respond to the challenges posed by Indian designs and manoeuvres. The policy dispensation of BJP would have a direct implications for Pakistan. Keeping a checkmate on India's moves is vital. Strategic countering is necessary but economic restructuring of the country is direly needed. Modi is inviting foreign companies and corporations to invest in the sectors of energy and human development. Pakistan should also conceive and chalk out a comprehensive plan to rehab economy, foreign investment and regional trade.

China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC): A Possible Antidote

It is important to note that trade is always linked with security. It can reduce antagonism and aggravate rivalry at the same time. CPEC can prove to be both. However, India's look East policy clearly depicts that India will not only have access to capital investments and technology from the developed world but also acquire a strategic backyard to assert its hegemony in South Asia. CPEC will increase China's stakes in the region. The economy-led security apparatus will lure China into saving its interests in Pakistan, thus reducing the power imbalance created by Modi's Look East policy.

Pakistan can facilitate and contribute to the regional trade. Pakistan's relations with the Islamic world can prove pivotal

in revitalizing the importance of its strategic location. It can also become the central point in any kind of future free-trade agreement among the Muslim countries. Pakistan-China Economic Corridor provides Pakistan with an opportunity to assert the importance of its strategic location, especially vis-a-vis Persian Gulf.

In addition to providing China with a short route, Pakistan can also facilitate other countries for transit trade with Central Asia. Pakistan's growing relations with SCO countries will benefit the member states to use Gwadar for their trade. Once the member states start trading through Pakistan, strategic importance of the latter is likely to increase.

Economic Corridor is not only aiming at building massive road infrastructure but also wants to develop telecommunications and energy infrastructure. A comprehensive analysis needs to be made of the economic prospects regarding this economic route. This massive investment plan of China in Pakistan will make Pakistan a regional economic hub and would further boost the bilateral ties between China and Pakistan. CPEC can be termed as game changer and the fate changer in the region. Chinese are not just only offering Pakistan a massive infrastructure but are making Pakistan a key partner in this grand economic ambitions that relate to the proposed 21st century Silk Route initiative. The corridor would enable China's access to the Indian Ocean lead to the massive investments, and help easing out power shortages that are obstructing economic growth of Pakistan. Corridor will connect significant economic agents along predefined geography. It will connect economic hubs and certain landscapes where substantial economic resources and actors are concentrated.

Conclusion

If the Indian moves succeed, it will be the first time after independence that India would become geo-strategically relevant to the international politics. In that case, India will not only have access to direct capital investments and

technology from the developed world, but also acquire a strategic backyard to assert its hegemony in a more aggressive manner in South Asia.

Pakistan has to craft a realistic roadmap to follow its own version of “Look East vision.” In reaction to Indian moves, countries located in East can be engaged. Pakistan needs to counter India by emphasizing its own strategic position especially in the Indian Ocean, its Islamic linkages and the economic opportunities that could result by contacts with Central Asia, South West Asia and beyond. Instead of being reactive in approach, Pakistan should be proactive in policies. A foreign policy white paper in the wake of current regional dynamics focusing on look East vision can be the first step in this direction. The white paper can identify key interest areas, viable measures to secure these interests and find Pakistan’s relevance in the political, commercial and strategic configuration of the region. Matching India move to move is definitely not viable, but Pakistan can make its presence felt in countries where India is making big inroads.

China Pakistan Economic Corridor is a game changer. It will connect Pakistan with the emerging Central Asian economies, Pakistan, an inroad to the new silk route, will increase the significance of Pakistan as a key regional player. Pakistan can make a multilateral foreign policy that could reassert its position. Pakistan can further improve its relations with Russia, though in this regard, both the countries recently have signed a landmark defence deal for the purchase of MI-35 helicopters. Optimization of pragmatic foreign policy choices and decisions in the wake of changing regional scenario is much needed to counter the proactive Modi mantra.

Notes

¹Contained instrumentalism is a theory that explains the manipulation of identity variable and its instrumental usage to solidify the identity differences.

² Muhammad Mujeeb Afzal, *Bharatya Janta Party and Indian Muslims* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2014), 25.

³ Jaswant Sing, *India at Risk: Mistakes, Misconceptions and Misadventures of Security Policy* (New Delhi: Rupa Publications, 2013), 13.

⁴ Nehruvan State is a phrase used by the researchers and academics to describe the early years of Indian polity when Nehru was Indian Prime Minister from 1947-64.

⁵ Mujeeb Afzal, *Ibid*

⁶ Mujeeb Afzal, *Ibid*

⁷ *Ibid*, Mujeeb Afzal, 225.

⁸ Political Hinduism is a philosophy that believes in the manifestation and accentuation of Hindutva doctrine and believes that the superiority of Hinduism lies in the vedic era.

⁹ Parvathy Appiah, *Hindutva, Ideology and Politics* (New Delhi: Deep & Depp publications Ltd. 2003) 36

¹⁰ Majoritarianism is usually associated with the Hindutva philosophy of Hindu nationalists that presumes the definition of Indian political processes to be based on the definition of majority i.e Hindus.

¹¹ S.D. Muni, *India's Foreign Policy The Democracy Dimension*, Cambridge University Press Limited India, 2009.

¹² See Also Aparna Pande, *Explaining Pakistan's Foreign Policy: Escaping India* (Routledge: Contemporary South Asia Series, 2011)

¹³ Thongkholal Haokip, "India's Look East Policy: Its Evolution and Approach," *South Asian Survey*, Vol. 18, No. 2 September (2011): 239-257

¹⁴ Prashanth Parameswaran, "Modi Unveils India's 'Act East Policy' to ASEAN in Myanmar," *The Diplomat*, November 17, 2014,

www.thediplomat.com/2014/11/modi-unveils-indias-act-east-policy-to-asean-in-myanmar/.

¹⁵PM Narendra Modi's address to the Australian Parliament, *The Indian Express*, November 18, 2014.

<http://indianexpress.com/article/india/india-others/full-text-prime-minister-narendra-modis-address-to-the-australian-parliament/>

¹⁶Prashanth Parameswaran, India, Australia, Japan Hold First Ever Trilateral Dialogue, *The Diplomat*, June 09, 2015.

<http://thediplomat.com/2015/06/india-australia-japan-hold-first-ever-trilateral-dialogue/>

¹⁷India, Australia agree on new security cooperation framework, *India Tribune*, November 18, 2014
http://www.indiatribune.com/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=13184:india-australia-agree-on-new-security-cooperation-framework&catid=118:politics

¹⁸ Rajiv Nayam, 'Strategic Significance of the India-Australia Civil Nuclear Cooperation Agreement', *Institute for Defence Studies and Analyses*, September 15, 2014.

http://www.idsa.in/idsacomments/StrategicSignificanceoftheIndiaAustralia_rnayam_150914.html

¹⁹Framework for Security Cooperation between India and Australia, *Press Information Bureau*, Government of India, Prime Minister's Office.

<http://pib.nic.in/newsite/PrintRelease.aspx?relid=111501>

²⁰Modi's Speech at Australian Parliament, *Express News Services*, November 18, 2014.

<http://indianexpress.com/article/india/india-others/full-text-prime-minister-narendra-modis-address-to-the-australian-parliament/>

²¹Modi's Speech, *Ibid*

²² W.P.S. Sidhu, 'Re-energizing India-U.S. Civil Nuclear Cooperation', *Brookings India*, August 27, 2014.

<http://www.brookings.edu/research/opinions/2014/09/23-reenergizing-india-us-civil-nuclear-cooperation-sidhu>

²³Smirti Chand, 'Agreements on Nuclear Energy that India has Signed with Different Countries'

<http://www.yourarticlelibrary.com/nuclear/agreements-on-nuclear-energy-that-india-has-signed-with-different-countries/5762/>

²⁴Anthony Fansom, 'Atomic Allies? India and Australia Explore Uranium Sales', *The Diplomat*, November 1, 2012.

<http://thediplomat.com/2012/11/atomic-allies-india-and-australia-explore-uranium-sales/>

²⁵Emma Channlet Avery & Mary Beth Nikitin, "Japan's Nuclear Future: Policy Debate, Prospects and U.S. Interests", *CRS Report for Congress*, Congressional Research Service, February 19, 2009.

²⁶Takako Hirose and Takeshi Yokoo, 'Japan-India Nuclear Cooperation', *Defence & Security Alert*,

<http://www.dsalert.org/int-experts-opinion/international-geopolitics/595-japan-india-nuclear-cooperation>

²⁷Rajaram Panda & Ch. ViyyannaSastry, "India and Japan: Prospects for Civil Nuclear Cooperation", *Indian Foreign Affairs Journal* Vol. 6, No. 2, April–June (2011): 202-216

²⁸Rajaram Panda & Ch. ViyyannaSastry, *Ibid*

²⁹Rajaram Panda & Ch. ViyyannaSastry, *Ibid*

³⁰Rajaram Panda, "India-US Insight", *Indian Council for Research on International Economic Relations*, (2012): Vol 2, Issue 7, 2.

COUNTERING EXTREMISTS' NARRATIVE IN PAKISTAN

Fatima Sajjad

Abstract

This paper examines the current confrontation between Pakistani state and militant Islamist groups through the lens of social constructivism. Based on the core constructivist belief that 'ideas matter', this paper critically examines some popular narratives in Pakistan which support the militants' worldview. It attempts to identify the factors which inspire Pakistani public to sanction the extremists' narratives. This paper also explores the alternative ideas within the shared paradigm of religion in Pakistan, which, if promoted through education, may reduce the growing religious radicalism in the country.

Key Words: ideology, narratives, extremism, Islamism, peace building.

"Since wars begin in the minds of men, it is in the minds of men that the defences of peace must be constructed." - UNESCO Constitution 1945.

Ideas and ideologies have played a key role in shaping the identity of Pakistan as a nation. The internal war Pakistan faces today has been described as an existential threat to the country as it hits the core of the ideological construction of Pakistan. A military operation like *Zarb-i-Azb*¹ is unlikely to counter religious extremism in Pakistan which remains the root cause of the current ideological conflict retaining a wide popular appeal.² The importance of belonging to religious rather than secular ideals for Pakistan is evident by the name given to the military operation against the self proclaimed Islamist militants.³ Religion remains a potent force in Pakistan. This paper makes a case for devising a counter extremist narrative in Pakistan.

The phenomenon of religious radicalism in Pakistan has been a subject of intense academic discussion in recent years.⁴ Among the various factors identified as the causes of growing radicalism in the country, connection between popular notions defining the national identity and militants' stated aspirations have been pointed out.⁵ One of the key strengths of the militants is their ability to manipulate the religion-based popular narratives to their advantage. An effective counterterrorism strategy must aim to counter this strength of the militants and challenge them in the realm of ideas. This paper examines the ideological dimension of the conflict between the religious militants and the state of Pakistan. Using the social constructivist lens, this study explores answers to the following questions: a) Why do the people of Pakistan endorse the narratives of extremism propagated by the Islamist militants; b) What alternatives may be constructed to counter the narratives of extremism in Pakistan? It argues that a major factor that enables extremists to use religion to their advantage is the state's inability to promote the intellectual, liberal and compassionate aspects of Islam. Due to a variety of political and historical factors,⁶ popular discourse⁷ and public education⁸ in Pakistan largely ignores these dominant themes of religion which if promoted through education, may serve as a key to resolve the problem of extremism in Pakistan. This paper argues that since religion provides the power to the extremists' narratives, it is only through religion that they can be effectively countered.

The proposed argument is embedded in social constructivist approach in international relations theory which deems that humans' behaviour is determined by their identity which itself is shaped by society's values, norms, history, practices and institutions.⁹

The term 'narratives of extremism' in this study, refers to the shared ideas and stories which form the public opinion in Pakistan and promote a particular worldview which tends to be confrontational. 'Countering' the narratives of extremism refers to exploring ways to effectively counter the popular

confrontational notions and replacing them with ideas that promote peaceful coexistence.

Pakistan and the Rising Religious Radicalism

A number of recent studies express concern about the growing religious radicalism in Pakistan. Dr. Hasan Askari Rizvi, a noted Pakistani political analyst, ranks militancy and extremism as the top most challenge faced by Pakistan today.¹⁰ According to him, the growing religious orthodoxy has caused 'irreparable damage to Pakistan's social fabric'.¹¹ The youth is especially vulnerable to the growing radical ideology which is weakening the bond between state and people, as loyalty to a transnational Muslim community replaces the notions of citizenship and civic obligations. The emphasis of radical Islamist discourse for total transformation of society has given rise to a culture of defiance leading to societal anarchy.

Moeed Yusuf, another key political commentator in Pakistan, presents a study showing with empirical data that religious and national identities remain inherently linked in Pakistan.¹² The statistics show that the majority of youth wants to see Pakistan as an Islamic state, and strongly relate themselves with their respective religious sect. They are vulnerable to conspiracy theories and popular discourse based on emotions rather than logic. Fair and Shapiro present the result of polling data obtained in 2009 showing that nearly 70 percent Pakistanis want *sharia* to play a larger role in Pakistan's law and most believing that *sharia* means good governance.¹³

Haider terms this phenomenon as 'Talibanization' of Pakistan which in his view is 'an existential militant Islamist threat' to the country.¹⁴ Haider advocates not only a military but an ideological response to this threat by taking Islamic parties on board and promoting the traditional Sufi Islam which has historically remained popular amongst the masses with its inclusive and flexible teachings.

Although, rising extremism has become clearly visible in recent years, many authors trace its roots to the troubled decade of 1980s. Two important books on this subject refer to the Mecca uprising in 1979 as the starting point of a new wave of Islamist radicalism in the Muslim world.¹⁵

Shahzad¹⁶ and Husain¹⁷ point out that the idea of rejecting Muslim ruling elite as Western agents and transforming Muslim society by force, began to take root after the Mecca incident in 1979. Husain explains the impact of the shockwaves created by this incident across the Muslim world. Shahzad describes in detail the ideological roots of the radical movement in the work of medieval ideologue Ibn Tamiyyah. Both authors agree that the 1979 incident was the beginning of the culture of defiance in the Muslim world.

Ahmad takes a deeper view of the ideological conflict in the country pointing out the ambiguities inherent in Pakistan's constitution and construction of national ideology.¹⁸ He describes how the insistence on a 'fixed ideology' has brushed aside the voices of dissent. Even powerful voices like that of Javed Iqbal¹⁹ to modernize traditional sharia have been completely ignored in the past, allowing a dogmatic ideology to take root in the popular mindset. Disregard of the intellectual tradition in Islam in favor of a fixed ideology created conflicts which were later exploited by the militant extremists.

Basit and Rathore offer an empirical study showing various trends and patterns of radicalization in Pakistan.²⁰ This study presents a mix picture showing public opinion as divided on the question of favoring Taliban. However, on the question of struggle for implementation of *sharia*, majority consider it a *jihad* thus accepting unwillingly and perhaps unknowingly the justification of violence by the militant Islamist groups.

Siddiqa studies the trends among urban and educated youth of Pakistan concluding that educated Pakistani youth has embraced radicalism not because they really understand the underlying ideology but because the popular discourse

promotes such a worldview and alternative discourse is not visible.²¹ The popular stereotypes of 'us vs. them' have been adopted by young minds without much conscious thought. Sial and Anjum conclude that Pakistanis remain confuse over the issues of extremism, jihad and radicalization due to their inherent religiosity which in the absence of education and critical thinking creates uncertainty and confusion.²²

Waseem describes how the public life in Pakistan since 1950s has been increasingly shaped by an alternative religious discourse.²³ Religious parties especially Jamat-i-Islami used education to promote its ideas and influence. Waseem outlines three stages of 'Talibanization' of the country. From the state support to Taliban regime in Afghanistan in 1990s to post 9/11 operations in Federally Administered Tribal Area (FATA) and finally the intensification of conflict between state and militant Islamist groups after the Jamia Hafsa incident. According to Waseem, Pakistan Army has been unable to control internal militancy because it has been cultivating and mobilizing some of these forces itself and wants to keep these elements alive against India. Militant discourse, therefore, has not been controlled and remains freely accessible to the general public.

Khan points out how the Islamist organizations in Pakistan have effectively built on prevalent narratives in Pakistan to promote their worldview.²⁴ The counter terrorism strategy in Pakistan does not take into account the powerful impact of these narratives and ways to counter them. According to Khan, the 'right' message must be crafted and promoted, to effectively counter the militant discourse.

Why do Pakistanis Approve the Militant Islamist Narratives?

As the academics express concern about the widespread support for militant Islamist narratives in Pakistan, examining the factors which constructed this phenomenon becomes imperative. Some key structural factors that gradually built the social consensus towards religious radicalism in Pakistan,

are briefly examined below with reference to the popular narratives they support.

Historical Overview

The 9/11 episode was the culmination of a clash which began centuries ago with the advent of Western modernity in the Muslim lands. Muslims in many parts of the world experienced the invasion of Western modernity as 'aggressive, invasive and exploitative'.²⁵ During the early modern era the relative decline of the Islamic world and the challenge of European colonial rule instigated various debates in the Muslim world. Muslims sought explanation of their decline which gave rise to three different perspectives in the Muslim world.

- The Conservative activists; like Rashid Rida, Hasan al Banna emphasized the revitalization of religion and political change. In South Asia the *ulama* of *Deoband* and the *Ahl-i-Hadith* typically belonged to this group.
- The Secularists; who argued that it is the 'continuing influence of the backward tradition in Muslim society' which is the cause of its decline. Mustafa Kemal Ataturk was a representative of this school.
- The reformists who advocated reform of the medieval scholasticism which has slowed down the growth of Muslim thought.

They sought innovation and dynamism in Islamic thought which is demanded by the modern age. Jamal ud Din Afghani and Muhammad Abduh belonged to this group.²⁶ In South Asia, Allama Shibli Nomani (1857-1914) a well-known Indian Muslim scholar from early 20th century, whose scholarly work and contribution to *Nadwatul Ulama*, a university dedicated to Islamic reform, left a profound impact on modern Islamic thought in India,²⁷ and Muhammad Iqbal, the inspirational poet, philosopher and a leading intellectual of the 20th century, belonged to this school of thought.²⁸

These three strands of thinking continued in the Muslim world. Pakistan, since inception, inherited these debates which were prevailing in other parts of the Muslim world as well during the twentieth century. The tensions between liberal, conservative, Islamist and reformist elements have dominated the discourse on ideology and identity of Pakistani nation up to this day.²⁹

The struggle for Pakistan began when India's Muslim minority sought protection against the Hindu majority domination. The 'Islam in danger' narrative is thus embedded in the public mindset strengthened by the shared experiences of a religiously charged freedom movement, colonial subjugation, Hindu egoism, and a violent partition. Religiously motivated political activism was inherited by the country since its inception in 1947.

The Cold War Milieu

The cold war atmosphere charged with ideological debates, in the later part of the twentieth century intensified the ideological arguments within the Islamic world. Pakistan with its stated claim to be an 'ideological state' remained at the centre of such debates.³⁰ Arguments for the Islamic 'ideology' against Communist, Capitalist ideologies began to shape the public discourse³¹. The urban educated Pakistanis being religiously conservative and emotionally attached to their faith readily engaged with this discourse which gradually became a part of their collective psyche.³² The idea of Islam as religion and tradition gradually gave way to the idea of Islam as an ideology.³³ Ideologies in twentieth century context were essentially radical, confrontational and political. Hence, religious radicalism evolved in Pakistan, accompanied by a host of other factors which steered public perceptions towards this direction.

A central feature of global politics during cold war was the Islamist-capitalist nexus; the Islamist movements of the 20th century joined hands with Western capitalist bloc especially during the last decade of the cold war to wage jihad against

communism. The growth of Islamist militancy is the legacy of this era.

Pakistan's direct involvement in America's cold war politics and battles, as the 'most allied ally'³⁴ in 1950s and 'the frontline state'³⁵ in 1980s and later after 9/11, provided sufficient credibility to the following narratives described by Khan as Al-Qaeda's master narratives, which were sold like hot cakes in Pakistan.

"There is a war going on against Islam, and the West is a major enemy. Muslim rulers are agents of the West".³⁶

The Geography

The perception of being under a constant threat was strengthened in Pakistan by geostrategic concerns as well.³⁷ Surrounded by archrival India in the East, an unstable and often hostile Afghanistan in the West, the enduring Kashmir conflict in the North, which led to at least three full scale wars with India, Pakistan remained preoccupied with security concerns since its inception.³⁸

It is again due to its geostrategic location that Pakistan remained at the centre of world politics during the cold war and later during post 9/11 war on terror. On a number of occasions, geostrategic compulsions got the country entangled into unintended wars. Pakistan remained on the frontline during the wars in Afghanistan in 1980s and 2000s. Owing to its geographical location the country rarely had a choice to stay away from these international battles which left a deep mark on its political and social landscape.

The US Factor

The shared perception of the 'US interference' in Pakistan's affairs has been built over the years due to the strategic and military partnership between the two countries earlier during the cold war and later during the post 9/11 era. Markey describes US Pakistan relations as 'tortured', comparing it

with Sartre's depiction of three sinners doomed to torment each other forever.³⁹

The roller coaster history of US Pakistan relations ,the post 9/11 'War on Terror' , the continuing drone strikes in the country , have intensified anti-US sentiment in Pakistan, providing perfect justification to the militants' struggle against Pakistani state and army for fighting an American war. The reported high civilian casualty rate during US drone strikes, which according to one estimate, goes up to 24%, generates sympathy for militants' worldview and support for militant narratives.⁴⁰ The liberal US aid to Pakistan has done little to improve US image in the country. The aid relationship between the two states remains complex as both tend to have varied perspectives on key issues despite their mutual interdependence.⁴¹The trust deficit at top level is reflected at popular level.

Moreover, the enduring Palestine issue, atrocities committed by Israeli troops on Palestinian soil and the perceived American support to Israel, is another major factor that breeds hostility against the Western hegemony in places like Pakistan. According to Khan;

'A paradigm has developed as an extension of the " war against Islam" narrative which encourages the audience to see events through "us vs. them" lens, with the 'world of Islam' on one side and 'the West' on the other...(this paradigm)...creates a certain tolerance of extremism on the Pakistani streets, which counter- extremists struggle to dispel.'⁴²

Regional and Domestic Dynamics since 1979

The dramatic transformation of the regional scenario post 1979 left a lasting impact on the public perceptions in Pakistan. The Iranian revolution with its powerful anti US sentiment was an unprecedented development in modern history.⁴³ The jihad in Afghanistan invited Mujahideen from all over the world and later the defeat of a superpower in

Afghanistan gave a new life to the rhetoric of Islamic revival and renaissance.

The domestic political environment of Pakistan post 1979, was another major factor which supplemented religious radicalization. The politically motivated Islamization policy of Zia regime led to a notable rise in religious intolerance and sectarianism.⁴⁴

Education was used as a political tool to promote a particular worldview. This led to a series of changes in national curriculum which included distortion of historical narratives, factual inaccuracies, inclusion of rhetoric, hate material and glorification of war etc.⁴⁵

The militant madrasas are also a legacy of this era which changed the nature and character of this traditional institution of learning. Pakistani madrasas were extensively used for the training and recruitment of *Mujahideen* for Afghan jihad. The United States was also involved in radicalization of education in Pakistan during this time to help the cause of Afghan jihad.⁴⁶ For example, it has been reported that textbooks from USAID and University of Nebraska, promoting a militant worldview were distributed in Pakistani madrasas during the Afghan war.⁴⁷ The national education, for many years in Pakistan for various political reasons, promoted radical views which greatly influenced the minds of the subsequent generations.

The Security Paradigm

The military establishment in Pakistan has set the direction, priorities and policies of the country for most part of its history. The dominance of military establishment on country's affairs has earned it the title of a '*parallel state*'.⁴⁸ The military dominance weakened the democratic institutions in the country and undermined the authority of a constitutional state.⁴⁹ Moreover, the security paradigm created by the military got Pakistan involved first in the Cold War and then in the US War on terror. The military strategy to

support militant groups like Taliban in Afghanistan, *Harkatul Mujahideen* in Kashmir⁵⁰, empowered the non-state militant actors and created a risk for country's security by enhancing internal radicalization and inviting external intervention.

So it was a complex mix of global, regional, domestic and historical circumstances that gradually transformed the traditional conservatism of Pakistani society into hostile radicalism, which is willing to buy the extremist narratives that militant groups sell in Pakistan today.

Exploring Alternative Narratives for Pakistan

On an ideological ground, searching for an alternative paradigm for Pakistan which not only effectively counters the extremist paradigm but is also acceptable to the people requires a re-look to the original vision of Pakistan with a fresh perspective. Islam is the answer.⁵¹ The ideas of Iqbal, the man who originally visualized Pakistan, deserve special attention. Iqbal's renowned work '*The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*' offers religious ideas which are an antithesis of fixed religious ideology propagated by radicals. Iqbal presents the idea of religious dynamism asking; 'Is the law of Islam capable of evolution?'⁵² He cites the work of Horten⁵³ declaring that a *Muslim has always adjusted his religious outlook to the elements of culture.*⁵⁴

The following ideas highlighted by Iqbal in his lecture need to be highlighted in our national curriculum and political discourse;

The spirit of Islam is so broad that it is practically boundless. With the exception of atheistic ideas alone it has assimilated all the attainable ideas of surrounding peoples, and given them its own peculiar direction of development.

Iqbal has repeatedly admired and advocated the thoughts of Rumi in his work.⁵⁵ The inclusive spirit of Islam represented in Rumi's thought provides a perfect antithesis to

the exclusivist radical Islam which is plaguing the Muslim world especially Pakistan.⁵⁶ The original values of Islamic faith based on mutual respect, compassion and appreciation of the God's diverse creation must replace the exclusivist, vengeful and radical ideology professed by militant Islamists.

Jinnah's vision needs to be understood better as well.⁵⁷ Ahmed describes the conversion of Jinnah's orientation in politics during the course of his political career.⁵⁸ He credits Iqbal for this conversion stating that Iqbal gave Jinnah an entirely new dimension to his understanding of Islam. Jinnah's vision of an Islamic society was a society that was equitable, compassionate and tolerant.⁵⁹ Ahmed quotes Jinnah as saying;

In any case Pakistan is not going to be a theocratic state to be ruled by priests with a divine mission. We have many non-Muslims – Hindus, Christians and Parsees – but they are all Pakistanis. They will enjoy the same rights and privileges as any other citizen and will play their rightful part in the affairs of Pakistan.⁶⁰

Fazlur Rahman⁶¹ was another powerful voice neglected in Pakistan. His work, especially 'Islam and Modernity; Transformation of an Intellectual Tradition' needs to be carefully studied by those looking for counter narratives for Pakistan. In this work Rahman contends that

At the time of its inception, Pakistan's leaders were generally highly liberal, and, while they wanted to inform their educational system with an Islamic orientation, this Islamic orientation, in their eyes, was not only tolerant but positively liberal'.⁶²

He suggests that it was Islamic education, more than Science and Technology education that demanded attention in Pakistan for '...nuclear technology could be acquired from abroad ...but Islamic thought or rather the capacity for original Islamic thought could not be acquired by Pakistanis either in a Western country or in a Muslim one.'⁶³ But

Rahman notes regretfully that as an ideological state Pakistan failed 'to create an intellectual base for itself',⁶⁴ mostly due to a lack of a milieu of intellectual freedom and an ill founded fear of applying modern research techniques to Islamic materials.⁶⁵

A number of scholars in recent years have pointed towards the need to propagate the intellectual and compassionate side of Islam in order to curb the extremist tendencies. *A Letter to Pakistan*, a manuscript by the renowned American scholar of comparative religion Karen Armstrong, specifically addresses the Pakistani people and pleads them to value and practice the compassion inherent in their religion.⁶⁶ Abdullahi Ahmed An Naim, a distinguished Professor of Law and Islamic sharia, argues that the coercive enforcement of Islam by the state or any other institution is against the Islamic principles which clearly give a free choice to man in terms of his beliefs and actions. He asserts that one can only be a Muslim by free choice not by the enforcement of state or other institutions.⁶⁷ Tariq Ramadan, a Swiss academic philosopher, who is also the grandson of Hasan al Bana of Egypt, repeatedly asserts on various forums that there is no war between Islam and the West and the militant Muslims have in fact 'hijacked' Islam.⁶⁸

Fethullah Gulen is a renowned Turkish preacher whose teachings are based on Turkish religious scholar Said Nursi's ideas. He has been actively preaching interfaith harmony, faith based education and service to humanity as key elements of Islamic practice. He inspired a worldwide movement called *Hizmet* movement (*Hizmet* means 'service' in Turkish) which played a key role in Turkey's recent social transformation.

Faith based peace building is an approach which emphasizes the role of religion in conflict prevention, conflict resolution and building peace. The religious ideas of compassion, tolerance and regard for others form the core of faith based peace building.⁶⁹ Qamar-ul-Huda , a scholar of Islamic theology and ethics at United States Institute of Peace, in a book titled 'Crescent and the Dove', focuses on contemporary Islam and peacemaking, exploring diverse

interpretations, concepts and problems in the field of Islamic peacemaking and peace building.⁷⁰ Esposito and Yilmaz examine Fetullah Gulen' opinion on freedom of thought, pluralism, secularism and democracy describing their positive impact on faith based peace-building initiatives.⁷¹

Some key local and international research institutions including United States Institute for Peace⁷² and Pakistan Institute for Peace Studies⁷³ have recently advocated the need to build peace through religion in the context of Pakistan.

There is a rich heritage of Muslim scholarship in modern times which needs to be explored, understood and promoted through media and education in Pakistan. It is only within the shared paradigm of religion that Pakistanis may be convinced to alter their radical perceptions. Counter terrorism efforts have a greater chance of success when they engage with the popular narratives; they are doomed to fail if they remain ignorant of them.⁷⁴

Conclusion

A viable long term counter terrorism strategy in Pakistan must aim to segregate the militants from the common man. The state of Pakistan in order to convincingly win the battle with the militants must challenge them in the realm of ideas. The following recommendations must be considered for this purpose;

- Education remains the key. For de-radicalization of the society the national curriculum, in general, and the Social Science curriculum in particular, must be redesigned to reduce rhetoric, develop critical thinking skills and promote the religious values of tolerance, respect for diversity and compassion.
- For this purpose the government must partner with not only religious scholars but religious intellectuals. The thoughts of Rumi and Iqbal must be studied and promoted through education and media. Faith-based

peace building must be nurtured in Pakistan to reduce radicalism in the long term.

- The electronic and print media can play an effective role to disseminate the moderate and compassionate religious ideas. Electronic media in particular should be used to promote intellectual debates and discussions. Religious scholars of international repute from all over the world should be invited for lectures and interactive sessions with Pakistani audience. The audience must include young students from universities as well as madrasas. Arranging such inclusive interactive sessions and broadcasting them to a wider audience would help people put their faith in perspective and see the broader aspects of it. The impact of extremist narratives would automatically shrink as a result.
- Social media is another medium which must be effectively utilized to reach a broader audience. The medium is already being used by the militant organizations to propagate their ideas. Instant communication and inter connectedness provided by social media can be used to form a broader forum for dialogue. Opening up to constructive discussions and dialogue alleviates the atmosphere of ignorance under which the extremists' narratives thrive.

Pakistan faces an enemy today which has cleverly borrowed from the ideological narrative of the country to promote its radical extremist worldview. The Pakistanis seem confused in a war that is fought in the name of Islam on both sides. Many seem inclined to support the extremist groups who claim to be more Islamic than the state.

A number of factors make Pakistanis vulnerable to the extremist's propaganda; extremist's claim of fighting for supremacy of sharia, the perceived and real US interference in Pakistan in addition to their insistence on continuing drone strikes, the domination of the military mindset on state policy, the regional dynamic and use of education as a political tool in Pakistan has been one of the key factors which allow the extremist narratives to flourish in Pakistan. One important

factor for the ideological success of the militant groups is the absence of alternative ideas to challenge extremist's claim on religion.

Enlightened and compassionate spirit of Islam found in the works of Rumi, Iqbal, Fazlur Rahman and many other intellectuals in the modern Muslim world must be revived. The scholarly voices within Islamic tradition must be strengthened and promoted through education and media to counter the views projected by the militants.

Notes

¹Pakistan Army's operation against the militant Islamist forces in North Waziristan (FATA) including Tehrik Taliban Pakistan, Al Qaeda and Haqqani Network, launched around mid-June 2014.

For details see <https://www.ispr.gov.pk/zarbezab>.

²See Moeed Yusuf, "a Society on the precipice? examining the prospects of Youth Radicalization in Pakistan." *Reaping the DiviDenD* (2012); Moeed Yusuf. *Prospects of Youth Radicalization in Pakistan: Implications for US Policy*. Saban Center for Middle East Policy at the Brookings Institution, 2008; Smruti S. Pattanaik "'Old' Islamists and 'New' Radicals: Understanding the Politics of Religious Radicalisation in Pakistan and its Implications." *Strategic Analysis* 35, no. 4 (2011): 581-594; Rubina Saigol, "Radicalization of State and Society in Pakistan." *Heinrich Boll Stiftung Pakistan. Retrived on November* (2010); Muhammad Amir Rana, "RADICALISATION IN PAKISTANI YOUTH." *YOUTH AND TERRORISM: A SELECTION OF ARTICLES*: 15.

³'Zarb- e- Azb' is an Arabic word, Azb was the name of the sword of Prophet Muhammad (pbuh) which he used in the battle of Badar; source: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/722202/army-launches-operation-in-north-waziristan/>, June 15, 7.19 pm.

⁴Clint Lorimore, "Obama's challenge: addressing Muslim radicalization in Pakistan." (2009); Mohammad Waseem, *Patterns of Conflict in Pakistan: Implications for Policy*. Brookings Institution, 2011; Moeed Yusuf, "a Society on the precipice? examining the prospects of Youth Radicalization in Pakistan." *Reaping the DiviDenD* (2012); Yusuf, *Prospects of Youth Radicalization in Pakistan: Implications for US Policy*. Saban Center for Middle East Policy at the Brookings Institution, 2008; Pattanaik, "'Old' Islamists and 'New' Radicals: Understanding the Politics of Religious Radicalisation in Pakistan and its Implications." *Strategic Analysis* 35, no. 4 (2011): 581-594; Saigol, "Radicalization of State and Society in Pakistan." *Heinrich Boll Stiftung Pakistan. Retrived on November* (2010); Rana, "RADICALISATION IN PAKISTANI YOUTH." *YOUTH AND TERRORISM: A SELECTION OF ARTICLES*: 15.

⁵See Amil Khan *Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism*. No. 327.US Institute Special Report, 2013; Rana, Muhammad Amir. "Counter-ideology: unanswered questions and the case of Pakistan." *Perspectives on Terrorism* 2, no. 3 (2010); Abbas, Hassan. *A profile of Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan*. MILITARY ACADEMY WEST POINT NY COMBATING TERRORISM CENTER, 2008.

⁶ Listed in the text , p. 6-11.

⁷See Ayesha Siddiqi, "Red Hot Chilli Peppers Islam—Is the Youth in Elite Universities in Pakistan Radical?." *Paper for 'Foreign-Security Policy Series' of Heinrich Boll Stiftung* (2010): 19-20; Nazya Fiaz, "Policy Intervention in FATA: Why Discourse Matters." *Journal of Strategic Security* 5, no. 1 (2012): 49-62.

⁸ A.H. Nayyar, and Ahmed Salim. "The subtle subversion." *The state of curricula and textbooks in Pakistan*. Urdu, English, social studies and civics. Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute (2003); Iftikhar Ahmad, "Islam, Democracy and Citizenship Education: An Examination of the Social Studies Curriculum in Pakistan." *Current Issues in Comparative Education* 7, no. 1 (2004): 39-49.

⁹See Constructivism ; International relations , Encyclopedia Britannica . <http://www.britannica.com/topic/constructivism-international-relations> accessed June 23, 2015.

¹⁰ Hasan Askari Rizvi, " At the Brink?" in *The Future of Pakistan*. ed. Stephen P. Cohen, Lahore: Vanguard Books, 2012 : 187-192.

¹¹ Ibid

¹² Moed Yusuf , " Youth and the Future" in *The Future of Pakistan*. ed. Stephen P. Cohen, Lahore: Vanguard Books, 2012 : 264-268.

¹³ Jacob N. Shapiro and Christine Fair. "Understanding support for Islamist militancy in Pakistan." *International Security* 34, no. 3 (2010): 93.

¹⁴ Ziad Haider, "Ideologically Adrift" in *Pakistan beyond the crisis state*. ed. Maleeha Lodhi, London: Hurst & Company. 2011: 126-128.

¹⁵ Nov-Dec 1979 Seizure of Masjid al Haram in Mecca by Islamist insurgents to overthrow the House of Saud.

¹⁶ Syed Saleem Shahzad, *Inside al-Qaeda and the Taliban: Beyond bin Laden and 9/11*. London: Pluto Press, 2011: 145-148.

¹⁷ Irfan Husain. *Fatal faultlines; Pakistan, Islam and the West*. New Delhi: Harper Collins. 2012: 112-114.

¹⁸ Akbar S. Ahmed, " Why Jinnah Matters" in *Pakistan beyond the crisis state*. ed. Maleeha Lodhi, London: Hurst & Company. 2011 : 21-30.

¹⁹ Javed Iqbal is a prominent intellectual in Pakistan and the son of the national poet and philosopher Muhammad Iqbal.

²⁰ Mujtaba Rathore and Abdul Basit, *Trends and Patterns of Radicalization in Pakistan*. Pakistan Institute of Peace Studies .2010: 8-10, accessed March 10, 2014, <http://www.san-pips.com/download.php?f=131.pdf>

- ²¹Ayesha Siddiq, "Red Hot Chilli Peppers Islam—Is the Youth in Elite Universities in Pakistan Radical?." *Paper for 'Foreign-Security Policy Series' of Heinrich Boll Stiftung* (2010): 19-20.
- ²²Safdar Sial and Tanveer Anjum, *Jihad, Extremism and Radicalization: A Public Perspective*. Pakistan Institute of Peace Studies. 2010: 19, accessed March 12, 2014, <http://www.san-pips.com/download.php?f=119.pdf>.
- ²³Mohammad Waseem, *Patterns of Conflict in Pakistan: Implications for Policy*. Brookings Institution, 2011: 8-10.
- ²⁴Amil Khan, . *Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism*. No. 327. US Institute Special Report, 2013: 8,11.
- ²⁵Karen Armstrong "The battle for God: fundamentalism in Judaism." *Christianity and Islam* (2001):151.
- ²⁶McCloud, Aminah Beverly, Scott W. Hibbard, and Laith Saud, eds. *An introduction to Islam in the 21st century*. John Wiley & Sons, 2013: 117.
- ²⁷ See Nomani, Shibli. "Maqalat-i-Shibli." (1964). Also See Rahman, Fazlur. *Islam and Modernity: Transformation of an Intellectual Tradition*. Vol 15. University of Chicago Press. 1984:56.
- ²⁸ See Mohammad Iqbal, *The reconstruction of religious thought in Islam*. Stanford University Press, 2013. Also See Fazlur Rahman, *Islam and Modernity: Transformation of an Intellectual Tradition*. Vol 15. University of Chicago Press. 1984:56.
- ²⁹Ziad Haider, *The Ideological Struggle for Pakistan*. Hoover Press, 2010.
- ³⁰ Ibid
- ³¹See Said Amir Arjomand, "The emergence of Islamic political ideologies." *The Changing Face of Religion*. Londres: Sage (1989).
- ³²Seyyed Vali Reza Nasr, *Mawdudi and the making of Islamic revivalism*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1996.
- ³³ Ibid
- ³⁴ A title given to Pakistan by US Pres. Eisenhower , source : Khan, Mohammed Ayub. "The Pakistan-American alliance: stresses and strains." *Foreign Affairs* (1964): 195-209.
- ³⁵ A title earned by Pakistan during the Afghan war of 1980s.
- ³⁶From Khan, *Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism*. No. 327. US Institute Special Report, 2013: 3
- ³⁷Hasan Askari Rizvi, *Pakistan and the geostrategic environment: a study of foreign policy*. St. Martin's Press, 1993.
- ³⁸ Ibid
- ³⁹Daniel S. Markey, *No Exit from Pakistan: America's Tortured Relationship with Islamabad*. Cambridge University Press, 2013
- ⁴⁰William Saletan, *Don't Blame Drones*. April, 24, 2015. http://www.slate.com/articles/news_and_politics/foreigners/2015/04/u_s_drone_strikes_civilian_casualties_would_be_much_higher_without_them.html accessed July 16, 2015.
- ⁴¹See S. Akbar Zaidi , *Who benefits from US aid to Pakistan?* Carnegie Endowment for International Peace. Sep 21, 2011.

http://carnegieendowment.org/files/pakistan_aid2011.pdf accessed July 16, 2015.

⁴²Khan, Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism.No. 327. US Institute Special Report, 2013: 8.

⁴³Karen Armstrong, "The battle for God: fundamentalism in Judaism." *Christianity and Islam* (2001):278.

⁴⁴Touqir Hussain, "The Islamization of Pakistan, 1979-2009." (2009).

⁴⁵Abdul Hameed Nayyar and Ahmed Salim. *The subtle subversion: the state of curricula and textbooks in Pakistan Urdu, English, Social Studies and Civics*. Sustainable Development Policy Institute, 2005.

⁴⁶See Kronstadt, K. Alan. "Pakistan-US Relations." LIBRARY OF CONGRESS WASHINGTON DC CONGRESSIONAL RESEARCH SERVICE, 2009.

⁴⁷See Christine Fair, *Militant Recruitment in Pakistan: A New Look at the Militancy-Madrasah Connection*. Asia Policy, Number 4, pp. 107-134. , 2007.

⁴⁸ See Mazhar Aziz. *Military Control in Pakistan: The Parallel State*. Routledge,2007.

⁴⁹Ibid

⁵⁰ Muhammad Waseem, *Patterns of Conflict in Pakistan: Implications for Policy*. Brookings Institution, 2011: 11

⁵¹ Al Qaeda's master narrative ; see Khan, Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism. No. 327. US Institute Special Report, 2013: 5,10.

⁵² Iqbal, *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*. Edited & annotated by M. Saeed Sheikh. Institute of Islamic Culture, Lahore.1996: 130.

⁵³ Ibid., Horten Professor of Semitic Philosophy at the University of Bonn.

⁵⁴ Ibid ; 130

⁵⁵ Ibid. , Also see *Kulliyat-e-Iqbal* by Muhammad Iqbal ; Qaiser , Nazir. Iqbal, Muhammad. *Rumi's Impact on Iqbal's Religious Thought* .Iqbal Academy Pakistan,1986.

⁵⁶See for example Sefik Can. *Fundamentals of Rumi's Thought: A Mevlevi Sufi Perspective*. Tughra Books,2004; Cyrus Masroori , " An Islamic Language of Toleration: Rumi's Criticism of Religious Persecution", *Political Research Quarterly* (2009).

⁵⁷Muhammad Ali Jinnah; Founder of Pakistan.

⁵⁸Akbar S.Ahmad.Jinnah, Pakistan and the Islamic Identity.The Search for Saladin .Oxford University Press. 1997:73-74.

⁵⁹Akbar S. Ahmad, " Why Jinnah Matters" in *Pakistan beyond the crisis state*.ed. MaleehaLodhi, London: Hurst &Company.2011 : 28 .

⁶⁰Ibid., Jinnah, Feb 1948; in a broadcast to the people of United States of America , p.28.

⁶¹Fazl ur Rahman (1919-1988), A Pakistani American scholar , who served as head of the Insitute of Islamic Research in Pakistan during 1960s and as Professor of Islamic thought in University of Chicago.

⁶²Fazlur Rahman. *Islam and Modernity: Transformation of an Intellectual Tradition*. Vol 15. University of Chicago Press. 1984:111.

⁶³ Ibid, 113

⁶⁴ Ibid, 117

⁶⁵ Ibid, 120

⁶⁶ See Karen Armstrong, *A Letter to Pakistan*. Oxford University Press. 2011.

⁶⁷ Abdullahi Ahmed An-Naim. *Islam and the Secular State: Negotiating the future of Sharia*. Harvard University Press. 2009.

⁶⁸ See for example Tariq Ramadan. *The Paris attackers hijacked Islam but there is no war between Islam and the West*. *The Guardian*. 9 Jan, 2015. <http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2015/jan/09/paris-hijackers-hijacked-islam-no-war-between-islam-west> accessed July 16, 2015.

⁶⁹ See Tsjeard Bouta, S. Ayse Kadayifci –Orellana & Muhammad Abu Nimer (2006). *Faith based peace building; Mapping the analysis of Christian Muslim and multifaith actors*. Netherland Institute of International Relations. http://www.clingendael.info/publications/2005/20051100_cru_paper_faith-based%20peace-building.pdf accessed June 24, 2015 ; p 1.

⁷⁰ Huda, Qamar-ul. *Crescent and dove: peace and conflict resolution in Islam*. US Institute of Peace Press, 2010.

⁷¹ John L. Esposito, and Ihsan Yilmaz. *Islam and Peacebuilding: Gulen Movement Initiatives*. Blue Dome Press. 2010: 25.

⁷² See USIP publications : Qamar-ul Huda, ed. *Crescent and dove: peace and conflict resolution in Islam*. US Institute of Peace Press, 2010; Susan Hayward, "Religion and Peacebuilding." (2012); David R Smock and Qamar-ul Huda. *Islamic peacemaking Since 9/11*. United States Institute of Peace, 2009.

⁷³ See *Engaging Religious Scholars for Promotion of Peace*. Pakistan Institute for Peace Studies ; source: <http://www.san-pips.com/download.php?f=112.pdf>.

⁷⁴ Khan, Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism. No. 327. US Institute Special Report, 2013

STRUGGLING IDPS OF NORTH WAZIRISTAN IN THE WAKE OF OPERATION ZARB-E-AZB

Nida Hameed

Abstract

Pakistan has been adversely affected by the war on terror. It has caused humanitarian catastrophe on an unimaginable scale. Pakistan being the frontline state has conducted number of operations against militants in the FATA region. In the aftermath of the operation Zarb-e-Azb; thousands of people fled from their homes and temporarily migrated to safe areas to seek refuge. This research paper explores the challenges faced by IDPs of North Waziristan during the operation Zarb-e-Azb and in particular highlight challenges which IDPs are facing on return. On return to their native areas IDPs have faced immense challenges due to lack of comprehensive resettlement plan by the government of Pakistan. The research will suggest some recommendations that how government can duly respond to the crisis. How government can support voluntary and durable returns?

Key words: Operation Zarb-e-Azb, Militants, Return, North Waziristan, FATA, Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs).

Introduction

The government of Pakistan launched counterinsurgency operation against terrorist groups in North Waziristan tribal agency on 15th June 2014. The operation impelled large scale displacements to adjoining districts of Lakki Marwat, Banu, Hangu, Tank and Dera Ismail Khan. Large numbers of people were forced to vacate their homes and they left behind valuable belongings such as furniture, electronics, livestock, standing crops etc. On 8th July 2014, FATA Disaster Management Authority (FDMA) made the figures public of those displaced in the aftermath of the operation Zarb-e-Azb. According to FDMA data “the total number of internally

displaced persons (IDPs) till the time registered with the authorities was 787,888. Moreover, the total number of families counted was 62,493, including 211,549 male and 236,883 female members, while the number of children was 339,456.”¹ With every passing day the number of IDPs increased. United Nations Office for Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (OCHA) issued data till 5th September 2014 as, the overall registered displaced population from North Waziristan was 961,000 in numbers.²

According to FDMA representative, “the government was determined to register every displaced person in order to ensure speedy distribution of relief amount, goods and other services so that no family remained deprived of the facilities”.³ Ironically government of Pakistan remained ill-equipped in dealing with large scale humanitarian crisis. Authorities were condemned for a lack of preparedness for the inevitable exodus of IDPs.⁴ Pitiably IDPs were on foot from North Waziristan to Bannu in the scorching heat, and on their arrival they were not been provided with the kind of assistance they were suppose to receive. IDPs faced a multitude of difficulties in registration process, water shortage, endless line up to ration points, lack of electricity facilities, inadequate health facilities and extreme weather conditions etc. IDPs preferred to stay temporarily with close friends and relatives in hired accommodations moreover; they preferred to stay in government schools instead of government provided tents.⁵ This evacuation phase was badly handled by the government of Pakistan.

In January 2015 almost 90 percent of the area was declared clear of militants by Pakistan’s military hence return becomes the next important phase. Federal Minister for State and Frontier Regions Abdul Qadir Baloch, announced that the displaced tribesmen of North Waziristan will return to their native areas as soon as the middle of February. The process of return and rehabilitation will be completed shortly but the government of Pakistan requires huge amount for this return phase because displacement was on a large scale.

Operation Zarb-e-Azb had long been expected due to terrorist activities from time to time even during peace negotiations. Therefore, the Government of Pakistan should have been prepared for humanitarian crisis. Now as IDPs are returning, pressing challenge is to craft such conditions which can sustain voluntary and durable returns. This comprises rehabilitation, reconstruction, and restoration of livelihoods and access to basic necessities. This requires a well thought-out plan for the post-operation environment. As according to Holmes, “most States confronting the crisis of internally displaced persons do not have national policies or institutional mechanisms to cater the needs of IDPs”. Now the question arises whether Pakistan is one of those states as aforementioned in the statement of Holmes.

Background of the Operation Zarb-e-Azb

After general elections 2013, peace negotiations were announced by newly elected Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif. On 1st March 2014, one month truce was agreed between the government and the Taliban.⁶ Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) spokesperson Shahidullah Shahid said, “All comrades to respect the decision and refrain from any activity during the ceasefire period.” Pakistani authorities responded to his statement and said, “They would reciprocate the gesture by immediately stopping the “surgical strikes” against the extremists, thus raising hopes that the seven-year-long violent insurgency in Pakistan would finally come to an end.”⁷

On 26th March 2014, first round of talks was held between members appointed by the Taliban and the government of Pakistan in Islamabad at Khyber Pakhtunkhwa House.⁸ Pakistani government team comprised of four i.e.: “PM Advisor on National Affairs Irfan Siddique veteran journalist, Rahimullah Yusufzai, former ambassador and expert on Afghanistan affairs Rustam Shah Mohmand and former ISI official Amir Shah to facilitate the dialogue. Whereas, banned militant organisation Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) nominated Pakistan Tehrik-i-Insaf (PTI) chief Imran Khan, Maulana Samiul Haq, former chief cleric of the Lal

Masjid in Islamabad Maulana Abdul Aziz, Professor Mohammad Ibrahim of the Jamaat-i-Islami (JI) and Mufti Kifayatullah, a former lawmaker of the Jamiat Ulema-i-Islam (JUI-F) from Mansehra to hold talks with the government negotiators. However, PTI chief Imran Khan backed out of the Taliban committee after his party declined a request for him to represent them in peace talks with the government today. Moreover, Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam Fazl (JUI-F) chief Maulana Fazl ur Rehman also announced that he would not participate in the dialogue process.”⁹ Other than these two, rest of the representatives travelled to the designated area near Afghan border by helicopter. After a preliminary meeting with the Taliban all the committee members were very optimistic about the dialogue. Their expectations were high that soon there will be break from the past rancorous events.

“The Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) emphasized upon two major points in order to continue peace talks. One was the creation of a demilitarised peace zone in mountainous Shakto in South Waziristan Agency of FATA, to allow freedom of movement and two, the release of non-combatants.”¹⁰ By late March “the government agreed to release 12 low-level prisoners but it refused Taliban demands for a “peace zone” where militants could move freely in South Waziristan.”¹¹

Unfortunately, there was no peace even during the ceasefire because militants continued their terrorist activities and the reason was that government of Pakistan didn't agree upon all the demands. Some of the major attacks carried out were, “On 3rd March 2014, a gun and grenade attack at Islamabad's lower courts killed 11 people including an additional session judge. A bomb blast at Islamabad's vegetable market killed 23 people on 9th April 2014”.¹² On 16th April 2014 the Pakistani Taliban announced that they were ending a six-week-old cease-fire but would continue peace talks with the Pakistani government.¹³ On 21st April 2014, TTP killed a civilian and five policemen in the area of Badhaber Peshawar whereas, on 22nd April 2014 TTP exploded a police vehicle in Charsadda killing one policeman and injuring 14

policemen and 26 civilians. On 26th April 2014, bombing in Karachi again killed six and injured 28.¹⁴

Last nail in the coffin of peace talks was the 8th June 2014 Karachi airport incident when 10 militants attacked the Jinnah International Airport Karachi. 36 people were killed, including all 10 attackers, and at least 18 were wounded.¹⁵ Taliban spokesman Shahidullah Shahid gave statement regarding the attack as, “The main goal of this attack was to damage the government, including by hijacking planes and destroying state installations. This was just an example of what we are capable of doing and there is yet more to come. The government should be prepared for even worse attacks.”¹⁶

After one week of the attack, on 15th June 2014 the Government of Pakistan, launched full-fledge operation named *Zarb-e-Azb* against militant groups in North Waziristan Agency of Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA). This operation was launched after exhaustion of the option of talks with militants. Militants were not ready to lay down their arms even during ceasefire as mentioned above. As a result of the operation there was an influx of Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs). Locals fled from their homes and migrated to safe areas in order to save their lives.

Definition of an IDP

According to the UN Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement (1998), “Persons or groups of persons who have been forced or obliged to flee or leave their homes or places of habitual residence, in particular as a result of or in order to avoid the effects of armed conflict, situations of generalized violence, violations of human rights or natural or human-made disasters, and who have not crossed an internationally-recognized state border.”

Rights of an IDP

The UN Guiding Principles on IDPs clearly state that, “internally displaced persons are entitled to enjoy, in full equality, the same rights and freedoms under international and domestic law as do other persons in their country.”

According to John Holmes, “Internally displaced persons (IDPs) are less clearly identified and protected than refugees but are often particularly vulnerable. They may lose their property and access to livelihoods; they run a high risk of being separated from family members; they may be discriminated against merely for being displaced; they often lack identity cards, which make it more difficult for them to access basic services and prevents them from exercising their political rights. They are also often more vulnerable than other groups to abuse by others. The most difficult vulnerability to measure, though, is their loss of dignity and as the period of displacement increases, their sense of hope.”¹⁷

Protection of an IDP

As displaced people are within the national territory, the IDPs do not qualify for the international services that the ‘refugees’ are entitled to under the international law. Protection as well as rehabilitation of the internally displaced is the moral and legal liability of their own government. There are 12 benchmarks of National Responsibility which governments should take towards ensuring successful national response to internal displacement.¹⁸

National Responsibility

To assist governments with the task to address problems of internal displacement, Erin Mooney introduced twelve benchmarks of national responsibility.¹⁹ They are all those steps which government can easily perform to help and cater the needs of displaced people. It is a comprehensive document based on government’s duty towards its displaced population.

Its emphasis is on protection of rights of displaced in harmony with international law. Twelve benchmarks are as follow:

- “Preventing displacement and minimizing its adverse effects;
- Raising national awareness about the problem;
- Collecting data on the number and condition of IDPs;
- Supporting training on the rights of IDPs;
- Creating a legal framework upholding the rights of IDPs;
- Developing a national policy on internal displacement;
- Designating an institutional focal point on IDPs;
- Encouraging national human rights institutions to address internal displacement;
- Ensuring that IDPs participate in decision making;
- Supporting durable solutions;
- Allocating adequate resources to address internal displacement; and
- Cooperating with the international community when national capacity is insufficient.”²⁰

The above mentioned initiatives suggested by Erin Mooney are common objectives for all the countries burdened by internal displacement. Pakistan has hardly applied any of the benchmarks of national responsibility in handling its worst IDPs crisis. By acting upon these benchmarks IDPs crisis can be managed and resolved easily and smoothly. Moreover, their rights can be protected.

Influx of IDPs

With the launch of counterinsurgency operation Zarb-e-Azb temporary migration of population from North Waziristan started. According to ISPR administrative support was provided to internally displaced people on various check points and support included essential food items and medicines. Various registration points at Saidgai post were established separately for male and female to enhance the organized evacuation of civilians. A tented village was established for the IDPs at Bakka Khel near Bannu which

according to the UNHCR had the capacity to accommodate two hundred thousand people. “An army medical corps field hospital was established in Bannu for displaced persons.”²¹ The IDPs were provided cash assistance both by the Federal and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa governments. Political management and FDMA also tried to participate as swiftly as the security forces in logistical and administrative arrangements. In the beginning of June 2014 around 450,000 IDPs arrived in Bannu. Later on, number of IDPs was increased to 572,529. According to United Nations Office OCHA, “as of 5th September, 2014 the total registered displaced population from North Waziristan is around 961,000 individuals (89,954 families).”²² Overall slowly and gradually number of IDPs increased. Most of the population was of women and children.

The Federal Government disbursed over 1.24 billion rupees as cash assistance among IDPs in the first two months after they left their homes. Similarly, the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Government disbursed 779.967 million rupees under Esaar-e-Pakhtunkhwa Programme among 56,590 IDPs families. Each family was provided 23,000 rupees under the Esaar programme. Whereas, the United States gave aid of \$ 31 million and the government of United Arab Emirates (UAE) gave \$20.5 million for the internally displaced of North Waziristan for relief purposes.²³ Relief agencies played vital role as well by helping the government in relief matters.

Problems of IDPs

There are short term and long term problems of internally displaced people. Short term problems which IDPs face are immediate relief, shelter, food, medicines, clean drinking water, sanitation etc. However, the long term problems are scary as well as challenging because IDPs need to rebuild their homes which have been ruined and destroyed during the operation. For this they require significant help of the government as well as international donors. North Waziristan will face massive reconstruction and development challenges. Following return phase of North Waziristan IDPs is discussed.

Return of IDPs to North Waziristan

By 16th December 2014, “Pakistan Army cleared 90 percent of North Waziristan Agency of terrorists.”²⁴ According to chief officer of Zarb-e-Azb Operation (Major General Zafarullah Khan), “forces killed 1,198 terrorists and injured 356 during the on-going military operation launched in June 2014.” 2,708 square kilometre of area was cleared in June and so was it vacated while military pledged to clear rest of the areas of North Waziristan as well. During the warfare Pakistan Army had 197 casualties. Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif praised its military while saying, “Operation Zarb-e-Azb had inflicted a fatal blow on terrorists and Pakistan’s armed forces had given exemplary sacrifices in this operation.”²⁵ North Waziristan is an area of intense weather especially in winters but Pakistan military effectively applied its counterterrorism strategies and operated successfully in risky terrain. Partially peace has been restored as a result of operation and full can be restored with the successful return phase.

According to ISPR, “Huge cache of arms and ammunition, communication equipment, and other logistics facilities, used by terrorists have been destroyed uprooting their ability to attack as a coherent force.”²⁶ During the ongoing Military Operation Zarb-e-Azb in large numbers alleged terrorists have been arrested by the Pakistan army. With the mutual decision of military and civil leadership, these alleged terrorists would be tried in the military courts. Trial of terrorists will be on priority bases because the ones involved in major terrorist activities will be tried first and then the terrorists with the minor activities will be tried accordingly.

On 8th December 2014, “Army gave go-ahead to civilian authorities to start the phase-wise return of over one million internally displaced persons (IDPs) to North Waziristan Agency (NWA).”²⁷ Chief of Army Staff General Raheel Sharif approved the phase-wise return of the IDPs after reviewing progress so far made in the North Waziristan operation.²⁸ The government announced IDPs could return as early as February, causing them to rejoice on the streets of Bannu with

drums and dancing.²⁹ Federal Minister for Safron announced the return of the Internally Displaced of North Waziristan by the middle of 15th February 2015.³⁰

Challenges on Return

“When displaced people of Swat started going home in July-August 2009, they returned to find destroyed houses, schools, clinics and hospitals; damaged fields and orchards; markets crippled by food shortages; and the military’s continued curfews.”³¹ Now after months of displacement, thousands of war-affected Pakistanis who had been displaced from their hometowns in the restive North Waziristan tribal region are returning. They anticipate the same situation they will face as their countrymen faced in South Waziristan.

Therefore displaced people argue that they are not sure whether the government is committed to pledges it made to pay compensation on their losses and rebuild their shattered houses. The return of the Pakistani displaced people could turn into a major challenge between the government and the army if the government fails to fulfil all its commitments. The internally displaced people from North Waziristan demand compensation and reconstruction of their homes before they return from the IDP camps.³² They have also demanded compensation for basic necessities before they return to North Waziristan.

While giving an interview to Tribal News Network, tribesmen said, “houses, markets and other infrastructure had been destroyed in military operation against militants in the agency and that the government should complete reconstruction work before sending them back to the area.”³³ According to displaced people, government should at least disburse rupees three lacs to each family because when they return may face serious problems in their lives. Their houses, business have been completely ruined moreover harsh weather of their area makes them more vulnerable.

According to Government of Pakistan, it requires \$753 million aid for the rehabilitation of the IDPs. On 11th November, 2014 Pakistan conducted 2nd donors conference for return and rehabilitation phase. The government requested for \$753 million (Rs 75.4 billion) for its return and rehabilitation agenda. The World Bank and European governments responded to the request by providing assistance of \$375 million. UK to provide assistance of \$150 million, World Bank to provide assistance of \$108 million where as Italy to provide assistance of \$76 but United States didn't provide any assistance to the IDPs.³⁴ It was expected that the US would announce aid for internally displaced in the third donors' conference. But the US ambassador to Pakistan Richard Olson did not commit any aid for displaced people. In the earlier meeting, "Olson had told Pakistan's Finance Minister Ishaq Dar that the US would disburse \$532 million to Pakistan under the Kerry-Lugar assistance package, of which \$250 million would be for the IDPs."³⁵ It seems the United States has come under unrelenting pressure from India over its monetary assistance to its ally, Pakistan. India wants the US to block all the assistance to Pakistan until and unless all those alleged terrorists are not punished who were the architects of the attacks on Indian soil.

Pakistan has to distribute assistance in various sectors of the devastated North Waziristan. The total assistance Pakistan asked for was Rs 75.4 billion. From this total amount "Islamabad wants to spend Rs 12.5 billion for cash disbursement, Rs 11.5 billion for rehabilitation costs, Rs 1.4 billion for transportation and Rs15 billion for compensation of damaged private property, Rs 5 billion for restoration of basic services and Rs 30 billion for reconstruction activities."³⁶ Moreover government of Pakistan also require Rs 35 billion for establishing a Counter Terrorism Task Force.

According to FATA Disaster Management Authority report, "damaged facilities sector-wise breakup is that total 31 educational institutions (six 100 percent, nine 50 percent and sixteen 20 percent), eight health facilities, two buildings of the works and services department, 13 facilities of livestock, seven

agriculture, eight public health engineering, 35 municipal committee including 21 shops, two sport facilities and 19 irrigation department have been damaged.”³⁷ Major issues which IDPs will face on return are:

- Insecurity
- Shortage of food
- Damage of property
- Ruined Infrastructure
- Unemployment
- Education
- Health facilities
- Psychological Problems

Insecurity

Return of the displaced people to their native towns will chiefly depend on the security situation of North Waziristan. “The military claims to have purged 90% area of militants, killing more than 2,000 militants in the process and dismantling their command and control centre and ammunition factories.”³⁸ Still 10% area is to be cleared and for that airstrikes are carried out from time to time. IDPs were glad when government announced return phase from 15th February 2015 because they stayed away from their hometowns for a long period. But on 27th January 2015 at least 76 suspected terrorists were killed in spanking new air strikes in North Waziristan Agency amidst Chief of Army Staff General Raheel Sharif’s reiteration that the military would never abandon the tribal areas without restoring normalcy.³⁹ However, such promising statements give the IDPs strength to return despite the security apprehensions.

Shortage of Food

IDPs will face serious problems regarding shortage of food because markets have been destroyed. Standing crops have been ruined completely. And agricultural land must have been vandalised during operation.

Damage of Property

It is hard to assess the damages to property, when people will return they will experience traumatic environment as their houses would have been destroyed completely. There might not be clue to their property. Governor Sardar Mahtab told reporters that the government would compensate militancy-affected families. He said, Rs: 400, 000 would be paid for completely damaged house and Rs: 160, 000 for partial damages of house.⁴⁰ Now the actual question arise here, what mechanism would they apply in order to evaluate the complete and partial destruction?

Ruined Infrastructure

FATA administration has carried out damage need assessment survey of the government owned properties in Mirali and Miranshah sub-divisions of North Waziristan. The government's infrastructures worth one billion rupees have been turned into rubble in the conflict-stricken North Waziristan Agency where as private property survey has to be yet conducted.⁴¹

Unemployment

When IDPs will return they will face harsh reality of unemployment because of devastation of the area. Farmers suffer huge financial losses because their standing crops were destroyed during operation. Their fields were completely ruined which will take time to make it ready for cultivation. A survey was conducted by an NGO to see how IDPs were employed before operation Zarb-e-Azb. Locals work as daily wage labourers; they are also involved in agricultural crop production where as some work in public and private sector. Some are also supported by foreign remittances.

North Waziristan is one of the poorest and downtrodden areas of Pakistan. Now with the extreme devastation it will be challenging to find work on daily basis? Whereas agricultural land is ruined farmers will not be able to grow maize which is

a cash crop that provides livelihood to a vast majority of the affected areas. Prior when operation was conducted in Malakand region government decided to bar farmers from growing maize along roadside because the crops could provide shelter to the militants. Such decision was criticised by the farmers because what they believed was that it will multiply their financial woes.⁴² The same situation may happen in North Waziristan. Therefore people will not have work in the fields and they won't be able to support their families.

Education

Education has been the focal target of militants. "The Taliban in the region were vocal critics of the educational institutions, particularly against women education on so called religious pretexts."⁴³ Most of the educational institutes were destroyed by the militants. This will leave huge numbers without any means of education. Secondly not even a single government has paid much attention to education sector of FATA region. According to the education figures, until 2001 the annual expenditure on education in FATA region had been Rs: 1.5 billion. After the initiation of war on terror the education budget was nearly doubled to Rs: 2.7 billion. Education budget of FATA needs to be increased. This is a depressing situation, particularly for the marginalized communities and low income people. That is why literacy rate is low of that region i.e. "17.42 percent as compared to the 59.6 percent at federal and provincial levels altogether."⁴⁴

Health Facilities

As hospital buildings have been completely damaged and destroyed during operation, therefore people may not have access to emergency healthcare. Locals will need urgent dispensaries. Moreover there will be lack of female doctors and nurses which is an urgent requirement of the females.

Psychological Problems

Returnees may have psychological problems because on their return to their native areas, they will witness the destruction of their towns. This will lead to psychological problems in the community.

Recommendations

Below are some recommendations that how government of Pakistan with the help of INGOs and NGOs can duly respond to the IDPs crisis and how government can encourage voluntary returns.

- It is obligation upon the government of Pakistan to ensure sustainable security. People require assurance from the government that their security will be respected.
- Government of Pakistan must provide basic services i.e. shelter, sanitation, safe drinking water, cooked food etc to the IDPs of North Waziristan.
- Government of Pakistan must aid an organized and voluntary return of the displaced people because voluntary return is the right of the internally displaced people (IDPs).
- The government must have high esteem for the principle of voluntary returns. For instance displaced must be allowed if they want to prolong their stay in any of the adjacent districts, or relocate elsewhere in the country if they feel unsecure.
- It is obligation upon the government of Pakistan to help reconstruct markets, mosques, schools, hospitals, roads etc.
- It is obligation upon the government of Pakistan to compensate locals whose crops have vanished from the land, whose livestock has died or gone missing, whose shops have been robbed and destroyed and rest of the livelihoods.
- Developed countries in particular United States should help the Pakistani government in giving a reasonable

compensation package to the IDPs of North Waziristan. The compensation must be comprised of sufficient money to reconstruct damaged houses and people could start their livelihoods by starting some business or any other form of work which they were doing before operation.

- United States has been using drones for a long time. It should give suitable amount to the government of Pakistan to reconstruct schools, hospitals, police stations and roads.
- The Government of Pakistan must initiate micro finance banking to the IDPs. This will offer them opportunities in different sectors. This project will support farmers and small industries. They will be able to rehabilitate their cultivable land. Both men and women can benefit from it by having sustainable livelihood.
- International Non Government Organizations (INGOs) and Non Government Organizations (NGOs) must assist the government of Pakistan to help meet the needs of the displaced people. They may provide water, cash, cooking material, toilets and hygiene kits. They must establish number of distribution points to provide food to returning families.
- Beside FATA Disaster Management Assessment there should be assessment of damages by The World Bank and Asian Development Bank. This will make the donation process transparent and international community will donate more for reconstruction.
- The Emergency Response Unit (ERU) of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa government must perform more efficiently.
- The Government should swiftly restore electricity and telecommunication system, water supply, irrigation channels, wells infrastructure requires repair as well.
- For reconstruction and repair locals must be hired in order to provide them short term employment.
- In the aftermath of operation the government of Pakistan must promote democratic institution building.

- As short term measure government of Pakistan with the help of humanitarian organizations must establish field hospitals and provide free medication.
- As long term measure FATA region requires economic development. So that people can get jobs easily in their area instead of going abroad for labour to earn their livelihood. It is one of the poorest regions with high unemployment and underdevelopment.
- North Waziristan requires excellent Hospitals for better health facilities so that locals don't feel any sort of discrimination.
- North Waziristan requires sufficient funds allocation for socio-economic uplift.
- The Government of Pakistan must increase education budget so that maximum students can benefit from education. It is a positive sign that federal government has announced scholarship scheme for the students of FATA region. Besides scholarships technical training has been launched by FATA Secretariat whereby eighty thousand students will be trained in different trades.
- Moreover the government should also provide security so that parents remain comfortable when they send their children to schools. As most of the children stopped going to school because of threats from militants.
- The National Disaster Response Plan (NDRP) requires up gradation in its efficiency to cope with all disasters.
- Most importantly by keeping health of children in consideration government of Pakistan must initiate polio campaign to eradicate polio from North Waziristan.

Conclusion

Operation Zarb-e-Azb was not the first of its kind in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) nor will it be the last one. Pakistan military will keep on conducting military operation to clear militants from Pakistan. And military continues to conduct operations till the normalcy returns to the FATA region. Operation Zarb-e-Azb had long been

expected due to terrorist activities even during peace talks, but still the government of Pakistan was ill prepared for humanitarian crisis. Government should have been prepared for every eventuality.

Pakistan has no plan to tackle large scale movement of civilians. The Government of Pakistan must map the needs of Internally Displaced Persons because large scale return of IDPs of North Waziristan will generate lot of challenges. Therefore pressing challenge is to craft such conditions which can sustain voluntary and durable returns. In prior IDPs situation, the Provincial Relief Commissioner, and a representative of UNHCR, endorsed a policy for returns i.e. returns should be voluntary, informed, dignified, safe and sustainable.

As according to government's plan IDPs return will take around one year to complete. Now the actual challenge for the government of Pakistan is to make relief, rehabilitation and reconstruction efforts responsive to needs of local communities of North Waziristan. Failure to do so will overturn any gains on the battlefield and turn local community against the government of Pakistan. Moreover alienation will make them vulnerable to recruitment in militant camps. The area is entirely devastated in the operation. The displaced families of North Waziristan need immediate relief in the form of compensation for their damaged houses and other basic necessities for livelihood.

Notes

¹ Zahir Shah, "North Waziristan IDPs figure reaches 800, 000," *Dawn*, July 8, 2014. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1117879> (accessed January 12, 2015).

² "Pakistan humanitarian Dashboard: NWA displacement," *Relief Web*, September 10, 2014. <http://reliefweb.int/report/pakistan/pakistan-humanitarian-dashboard-nwa-displacement-10-sep-2014>

³ "Pakistan humanitarian Dashboard: NWA displacement," op. cit.

-
- ⁴ Jon Boone and Emma Graham, "Pakistan unprepared for refugees fleeing operation against Taliban," *The Guardian*, June 26, 2014. <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2014/jun/26/pakistan-displaced-military-operation-taliban-north-waziristan-humanitarian-assistance> (accessed January 14, 2015).
- ⁵ Relief International, "North Waziristan Internally Displaced Population: Assessment of IDPs in District Dera Ismail Khan, Khyber Pakhtukhwa, Pakistan (Rapid Assessment June 20 to 24, 2014).
- ⁶ "Pakistani Taliban announce month long ceasefire," *Dawn*, March 2, 2014. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1090330/pakistani-taliban-announce-month-long-ceasefire> (accessed January 15, 2015).
- ⁷ "Pakistan's fragile ceasefire with the Taliban," *DW*, March 3, 2014. <http://www.dw.de/pakistans-fragile-ceasefire-with-the-taliban/a-17469415> (accessed December 20, 2014).
- ⁸ "First day of Pakistan Taliban peace Talks concluded," *BBC News*, March 26, 2014. <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-26731838> (accessed December 25, 2014).
- ⁹ "Govt, Taliban committees to hold first meeting tomorrow," *Dawn*, February 3, 2014. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1084664> (accessed December 24, 2014).
- ¹⁰ http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/terroristoutfits/ttp_t12014.htm (accessed December 20, 2014).
- ¹¹ Ismail Khan and Declan Walsh, "Taliban end a ceasefire with Pakistan," *The New York Times*, April 16, 2014. http://www.nytimes.com/2014/04/17/world/asia/pakistani-taliban-end-ceasefire-with-government.html?_r=0 (accessed December 24, 2014).
- ¹² Mohammad Shehzad, "Holding Fire," *The Friday Times*, May 2, 2014. <http://www.thefridaytimes.com/tft/holding-fire/> (accessed December 24, 2014).
- ¹³ Ismail Khan and Declan Walsh, op. cit.
- ¹⁴ Mohammad Shehzad, op. cit.
- ¹⁵ "Gunmen attack Karachi international airport," *AlJazeera*, June 9, 2014. <http://www.aljazeera.com/news/asia/2014/06/heavy-fighting-reported-at-karachi-airport-201468185852200231.html> (accessed December 20, 2014).
- ¹⁶ Andrew Buncombe, "Karachi Airport attack: Taliban trying to hijack plane in assault that left dozens dead," *The independent*, June 8, 2014, <http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/karachi-airport-attack-five-killed-as-gunmen-attack-terminal-officials-say-9509711.html> (accessed December 20, 2014).

¹⁷ “Ten Years of the Guiding Principles on Internal displacement,” *Forced Migration Review*, December 2008. <http://www.refworld.org/pdfid/4c6cf2372.pdf> (accessed December 20, 2014).

¹⁸ See Brookings-Bern Project on Internal Displacement, Addressing Internal Displacement: Framework for National Responsibility, 2005. <http://www.unhcr.org/50f94dcc9.pdf>. (accessed December 20, 2014).

¹⁹ Deputy Director of the Brookings Institution University of Bern Project on Internal Displacement.

²⁰ “Addressing Internal displacement: A Frameworkwork for National Responsibility,” The Brookings Institution-University of Bern: Project on Internal displacement, April 2005. http://www.brookings.edu/fp/projects/idp/20050401_nrframework.pdf (accessed December 21, 2014).

²¹ “Press Release,” *ISPR*, June 23, 2014. https://www.ispr.gov.pk/front/main.asp?o=t-press_release&date=2014/6/23 (accessed December 22, 2014).

²² “Pakistan humanitarian Dashboard: NWA displacement,” *Relief Web*, September 10, 2014. <http://reliefweb.int/report/pakistan/pakistan-humanitarian-dashboard-nwa-displacement-10-sep-2014> (accessed 25 Dec 2014).

²³ “US, UAE provide \$51m for N Waziristan IDPs,” *The Express Tribune*, July 6, 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/731993/us-uae-provide-51m-for-n-waziristan-idps/> (accessed 29 December 2014).

²⁴ “Zarb e Azb: Army says 90% of North Waziristan cleared,” *The Express Tribune*, November 16, 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/791954/zarb-e-azb-army-says-90-of-north-waziristan-cleared/> (accessed 29 December 2014).

²⁵ Abdul Manan, “Zarb e Azb inflicted fatal blow on terrorists,” *The Express Tribune*, December 10, 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/804568/zarb-e-azb-inflicted-fatal-blow-on-terrorists-pm/> (accessed December 20, 2014).

²⁶ “910 militants killed since start of Operation Zarb e Azb,” *The Express Tribune*, 3 September 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/757315/910-militants-killed-to-date-since-start-of-operation-zarb-e-azb-ispr/> (accessed December 30, 2014).

²⁷ Kamran Yousuf, “Winding up the offensive: Army gives nod for the return of the IDPs to N Waziristan,” *The Express Tribune*, December 8, 2014. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/803426/winding-up-the-offensive-army-gives-nod-for-return-of-idps-to-n-waziristan/> (accessed December 30, 2014).

-
- ²⁸ Kamran Yousuf, op. cit.
- ²⁹ “Dried Out: IDPs complain of water shortage,” *The Express Tribune*, January 7, 2015. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/817788/dried-out-idps-complain-of-water-shortage/> (accessed 20 January 2015).
- ³⁰ “Pakistan: Repatriation of North Waziristan IDPs to begin from Feb 15: Safron,” *Dawn*, January 21, 2015.
- ³¹ “Pakistan: The Worsening IDP Crisis,” *International Crises Group*, September 16, 2010. <http://www.crisisgroup.org/~media/files/asia/south-asia/pakistan/b111%20pakistan%20-%20the%20worsening%20idp%20crisis.ashx> (accessed December 21, 2014).
- ³² “NW IDPs demand compensation before repatriation,” *Press TV*, November 5, 2014. <http://www.presstv.ir/detail/2014/11/05/384908/nw-idps-demand-compensation-before-repatriation/default.html> (accessed December 25, 2014).
- ³³ “North Waziristan families demand compensation, basic facilities before repatriation,” *Tribal News Network*, January 15, 2015. <http://radiotnn.com/?p=10554> (accessed January 20, 2015).
- ³⁴ Shahbaz Rana, “Operation Zarb e Azb: US declines to commit aid for displaced persons,” *The Express Tribune*, January 10 2015. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/819538/operation-zarb-e-azb-us-declines-to-commit-aid-for-displaced-persons/> (accessed January 15, 2015).
- ³⁵ Shahbaz Rana, op. cit.
- ³⁶ Shahbaz Rana, op. cit.
- ³⁷ Zulfiqar Ali, “Infrastructure worth Rs 1b turned into rubble in North Waziristan,” *Dawn*, January 1, 2015. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1154410> (accessed January 15, 2015).
- ³⁸ “76 terrorists killed in North Waziristan air raids,” *The Express tribune*, January 28, 2015. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/828787/76-terrorists-killed-in-waziristan-air-raids/> (accessed January 30, 2015).
- ³⁹ “76 terrorists killed in North Waziristan air raids,” op. cit.
- ⁴⁰ “Repatriation of North Waziristan tribesmen likely in March,” *Dawn*, January 30, 2015. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1160406/repatriation-of-north-waziristan-tribesmen-likely-in-march> (accessed February 2, 2015).
- ⁴¹ Zulfiqar Ali, “Infrastructure worth Rs 1b turned into rubble in North Waziristan,” op. cit.
- ⁴² Muhammad Ali, “Militant threat in Malakand: Govt tells farmers not to grow maize along roads,” *Dawn*, August 9, 2009.

*Struggling IDPs of North Waziristan in the Wake of
Operation Zarb-e-Azb*

⁴³ Ahmad Ali Naqvi, Shah Zaman Khan and Zainab Ahmad, "The Impact of Militancy on Education in FATA," *A Journal of Peace and development* 2 (2012): 26.

⁴⁴ Ahmad Ali Naqvi, Shah Zaman Khan, Zainab Ahmad, *op. cit.*, 24.

THE EVOLVING DYNAMICS OF DETERRENCE STABILITY IN SOUTH ASIA

*Muhammad Shafiq ur Rehman and Dr. Muhammad Saif ur
Rehman*

Abstract

It is anticipated that the states possessing nuclear weapons rarely involve in conflicts but the South Asian nuclear environment explicates a diverse notion. Both India and Pakistan are traditional rivals since their inception and nuclear factor has shaped a highly volatile environment for sustaining strategic stability in the region. The two states may have been compelled to constrain their conflicts due to their emerging deterrence capabilities except a limited conflict during Kargil crisis in 1999. Pakistan's posture of Minimum Credible Deterrence (MCD) provided nuclear umbrella during crises and the existing nuclear calculus of the two states derives leverage for establishing regional strategic stability. But the disparity between India and Pakistan due to their growing nuclear force postures with missile developments and their contradicting nuclear strategies have made Pakistan's strategic stability critical for its foreseeable future.

Key Words: Nuclear Weapons, Strategic Stability, Minimum Deterrence, Nuclear Calculus of South Asia.

Introduction

The states seek to ensure their security and sovereignty by adopting multiple strategies i.e. military modernization, economic growth and developing alliances. Nuclear weapons play a dominant role in military modernization by maintaining the security and survival among the states. The states having nuclear weapons adopt multiple strategies to deter the aggressors. Pakistan and India are traditional rivals, since nuclear tests of May 1998; the centrality of nuclear weapons has changed the strategic approach between the two

states. It is assumed that the chances of nuclear escalation are unlikely among the states possessing the nuclear weapon due to the fear of Mutual Assured Destruction (MAD). But the strategic analysts are suspicious as they have predicted the vulnerabilities of nuclear exchange between India and Pakistan. According to Richard Nixon, 'there is no probability of nuclear exchange among the states possessing nuclear weapons while in South Asia; the chances of nuclear conflict exist between India and Pakistan'.¹ After analyzing the Pak-India strategic environment, Robert M. Gates showed grave repercussions to Seymour Hersh, 'if both the states come to a war, it will be a nuclear war'.²

The jingoistic political culture is fed, sustained and expressed itself in a more extreme form in the declared or undeclared political agenda of a number of religious groups and political parties in both the states. Religion is the most dominant factor in shaping the strategic culture in India and Pakistan. Edward A. Tiryakian elaborated religion as the people who share ethnicity and language but differ in religion may slaughter each other.³ According to Rashtriya Sevek Sangh (RSS), 'the dropping of nuclear bombs over Pakistan as a solution to the longstanding Pakistani hostility and belligerence against India'.⁴

The Indian elite assume that Pakistani elite has the intentions for further fragmentation of India to reduce its international status⁵. Both blame each other for starting the three wars fought between them. They also hold each other responsible for internal turbulence and terrorism in their countries.⁶ Reinforcing each other, the dominant strains in this culture create a fertile ground for starting or drifting towards a nuclear war. In a conflict situation when intense emotional frenzy seizes, both the elites become ready to use nuclear weapons which generate serious security repercussions not only for the two states but for the remaining states in the South Asian region. The nuclear weapons have attained a centre stage between India and Pakistan in 1986-87 during Brasstacks crisis⁷ and the two states were at the brink

of nuclear conflict during Kargil crisis in 1999⁸, in 2001-2002 military standoff⁹ and Mumbai terrorist attack in 2008¹⁰.

The two states were away from nuclear escalation due to their nuclear postures but it is critical to predict that both the states will avoid nuclear exchange in future. This paper examines the significance of nuclear weapons in the strategic stability of South Asia by seeking the answers of the following questions.

- What are the existing nuclear postures and delivery mechanisms of India and Pakistan?
- What are the latest developments in missile systems of India and Pakistan?
- How can the nuclear postures and missile developments of both the states distress to the regional strategic environment?
- How many probabilities of nuclear war exist in the South Asian region?
- What is the impact of India's Cold Start Doctrine (CSD) and Ballistic Missile Development (BMD) on the strategic stability of Pakistan?

Theoretical Explanation

Understanding the role of nuclear weapons for the peace and stability of the states, the concept of power is strikingly central to realism, as it is a prerequisite for any group in attaining objectives, no matter what is the nature of the objective and Carr stressed that power is a necessary factor of every political order.¹¹ Morgenthau stated that power is rooted in the nature of humankind.¹² Hostli maintains that power is the general capacity of a state to control the behaviour of others.¹³ During World War II, international politics was a struggle for power among the states.¹⁴ Power has become the focal point for the sovereignty of the states and realists iron law explains it as, 'the stronger do what they have the power to do and the weaker accept what they have to accept'.¹⁵ In the cases of Nazi Germany and Czechoslovakia in 1939, the Soviet Union and Hungary in 1956, Indonesia and East Timor in 1975, the weaker states had to submit to the will of the stronger.

Power provokes the significance of weapons and when conventional weapons are not sufficient, a country seeks nuclear weapons as in the case of Pakistan. Initially, Pakistan did not intend acquiring nuclear weapons, but India's first nuclear test of May 1974 diverted Pakistan's attention for obtaining nuclear weapons and its main objective was to create a balance of power for preventing any war in future.¹⁶ Kenneth Waltz described the main argument relating to India's nuclear aspirations as, 'for enhancing its international standing and prestige to provide leverage in international affairs'.¹⁷ For justifying Indian nuclear ambition, Raj Rammana quotes:¹⁸

There was never a discussion among us over whether we should or not make the bomb. How to do it was more important? For us it was a matter of prestige that would justify our ancient past. The question of deterrence came much later.

Pakistan's quest of nuclear weapons is attributed to rise from the desire to negate India's conventional superiority as Kenneth Waltz stated, 'states acquire nuclear weapons for containing fear of present or future conventional strength of adversary power'.¹⁹ Furthermore, India wants to get the status of regional hegemon in South Asia. George K Tanham of Rand Corporation elaborated Indian aspiration of regional hegemon during his visits to India with the impression that Indians considered the whole South Asian region as one political unit; a strategic entity and they intended to deny Pakistan's potential to challenge this claim.²⁰ Most of the Indian strategists assume that Pakistan is a main hurdle in the Indian way for becoming the regional power in South Asia.²¹ India's aspiration of regional dominance created serious security concerns for Pakistan. Security is expanded in several explanations as Buzan described it in terms of power,²² Morgenthau equated it with survival,²³ Trager and Sanunie have delineated it from a policy perspective as, 'it is that part of government policy having as its objective, the creation of national and international conditions favourable to the

protection or extension of vital values against existing and potential adversaries'.²⁴ According to John Garnet, 'security means freedom from insecurity'.²⁵ Walter Lippmann elaborated as, 'a state is secure when it is not in danger of having to sacrifice core values if it wishes to avoid war, and is able, if challenged to maintain itself by victory in such a war'.²⁶ Pakistan's security perceptions are 'Indo-Centric' because both the states are traditional rivals since their inception.

Pakistan assumes India as an aggressive state which is the prime threat to its security.²⁷ The security dilemma for Pakistan refers to the consequences due to which states maximize their arms strength for their protection under condition of international anarchy.²⁸ Kaufman defined the security dilemma as a situation in which both sides have a credible fear of ethnic extinction.²⁹ Robert Jervis argues, 'security dilemma exists when both sides may be willing to give up the chance of expansion if they can be made secure but a number of other factors, the fear that the relative power is dangerously increasing, technology, events outside their control and their subjective security requirements- put such a solution out of reach'.³⁰ For Kenneth Waltz, 'states have to survive with their security dilemma which is not due to their intentions but by their situations. A dilemma cannot be absolutely resolved but dealt to some extent'.³¹

For sustaining and containing security dilemma, Pakistan planned to initiate a nuclear programme and succeeded in developing nuclear weapon in mid 1980s.³² India continued enhancing its nuclear stockpiles during 1974-1998³³ that was a severe security threat for the stability of Pakistan. Mearsheimer defines stability as, 'the absence of war and major crisis',³⁴ According to Jaswant Singh, 'stability assumes a state of balance between the two adversaries even though there may not be parity between them',³⁵ Thus for sustaining its strategic stability, Pakistan conducted nuclear tests on May 28 and 30, 1998 in response to India's nuclear tests of May 11 and 13, 1998. After becoming de-facto nuclear powers, both the states are enhancing their nuclear stockpiles which endangered Pakistan's strategic stability that's why Pakistan

decided to follow Minimum Deterrence (MD). Which has been illustrated in the context of its strategic objectives.³⁶ Redney Jones termed it critical to find out the 'minimum' in the South Asian context, as he stated:³⁷

Does 'minimum' imply the sufficiency of small number of nuclear weapons? Nuclear weapons held in reserve? Low readiness or alert rates of nuclear force? Renunciation of nuclear war fighting? Mainly counter-value targeting? Alternatively, does the term minimum merely make virtue today's facts of life in the Subcontinent's limited resources, scarce weapons materials, unproved delivery systems, and still undeveloped technical military capabilities?

Minimum must be dynamic and credible and for overcoming the deficiencies of minimum deterrence to a feasible extent, some nuclear states renamed it as 'Minimum Credible Deterrence (MCD)'.³⁸ Thus, for assuring MCD and sustaining their upcoming survival, security, and strategic stability, both the states planned to intensify their nuclear postures.

Nuclear Calculus and Delivery Mechanisms of India and Pakistan

It is critical to estimate the nuclear calculus of the two states because the nuclear programs of both the states are clandestine in nature. The volume of nuclear stockpiles, the capabilities relating to delivery can be predicted by analyzing the capacity of the nuclear installations of both the states. In 2010, it was calculated that India had developed almost 100 nuclear warheads and its Dhurva reactor has the capacity to generate weapon-grade plutonium for 5 nuclear weapons annually.³⁹ Moreover, India is busy in constructing an additional breeder reactor for developing nearly 25 nuclear weapons per year.⁴⁰ Federation of American Scientists⁴¹ and Robert Wall⁴² claimed that India would make 90-110 nuclear weapons till 2013.

As for Pakistan's nuclear stockpiles are concerned, Rodeny W. Jones estimated about 110 nuclear weapons by 2010.⁴³ While, Robert Wall⁴⁴ and Federation of American Scientists⁴⁵ estimated up to 120 nuclear weapons till 2013. Dinshaw Mistry anticipated that both India and Pakistan would have the capacity to generate enough fissile material for 200 to 250 nuclear weapons.⁴⁶ The two states are not only striving for enhancing their nuclear stockpiles⁴⁷ but they are developing first generation nuclear capable delivery vehicles for maintaining their nuclear threshold.⁴⁸ Besides Pakistan, India is planning to counter China's deep strike capability and the *Sukhoi-30 MKI* aircraft has the potential with a normal range of 3200 km with 800 kg payload and can be extended about 7000 km by providing air-to-air refuelling.⁴⁹

In 2010, Pakistan has acquired China's JF-17 Thunder which comprises the highly advanced machinery and has the ability to carry 3000 kg load with a range of 3000 km.⁵⁰ A large number of these aircrafts of the two states are deployed close to their borders, in the suburbs of Lahore (Sargodha) and New Delhi (Ambala and Hindan).⁵¹ The capitals of both the states are within the range of these aircrafts. The largest industrial and economic centres of both the states, Karachi and Mumbai are also within the range of these aircrafts.

A numeric parity of nuclear weapons as compared to conventional military balance is non-essential and detrimental because an adversary having large collection of nuclear arsenals can be successfully deterred with small reliable nuclear weapons.⁵² It facilitates comparatively less industrially developed states to collect the resources for minimum deterrence ability in the absence of alternative options for assuring its strategic stability. According to Waltz:⁵³

Unlike conventional strategy, a deterrent (nuclear) strategy does not rely upon extent of territory, thus removing major cause of war, and deterrence effectiveness a dependent upon one's capabilities and the will to use these capabilities.

The growing nuclear stockpiles and the delivery mechanisms of both the states intensify their capabilities to deter each other but the mindsets of their political and religious groups compel them to use of nuclear weapons against each other despite pretending the consequences of nuclear exchange.

Developments in Missile Systems of India and Pakistan

The existing India's missile programme is based upon *Prithvi* and *Agni* series and *Agni* had been designed to expand India's nuclear capabilities especially for containing Pakistan and China, except *Agni* I which is designed for restraining Pakistan only. *Agni* I has been tested up to the range of 1200 km and *Agni* II to range between 1200 to 2000 km with a payload of 1000kg in each case.⁵⁴ A particular variant of *Agni* I is Pakistan specific with a range of 700 km.⁵⁵ *Agni* II+/IV was tested in 2010 having the range of 3000km with payload of 2000kg.⁵⁶ *Agni* III projected up to the range of 3500-5000 km with 2000-2500 kg payload containing three solid fuel stages, and was tested in 2011.⁵⁷ *Agni* V was tested in 2012 up to a range of 5000 km with a payload of 5000 kg.⁵⁸ Submarine launched *K.15* having the range of 700 km with 6000 kg payload was tested in 2008.⁵⁹ Parhar tactical ballistic missile with a range of 150 km was tested in 2011, while *Nirbhay* cruise missile was tested in 2013.⁶⁰ Multipurpose *Brahmos* cruise missile with a range of 700 km was tested in 2013.⁶¹ Additionally, India is developing a sea born missile *Sagarika* which would be dual in character (ballistic as well as air breathing).⁶²

Third, during mid and late 1990s, Pakistan assembled and developed the indigenous variants of *Hataf* III, *Hataf* IV and *Hataf* V. *Hataf* III or *Ghaznavi*, is derived from Chinese M.II missiles, with a range of 300 km with possibly a 500kg payload.⁶³ *Hataf* IV or *Shaheen*, was tested in April 1999 and was drawn from China's M-9. *Hataf* IV has the capacity to carry a payload of 1000 kg up to the range of 750 km.⁶⁴ Pakistan successfully tested surface-to-surface, liquid fuelled

intermediate-range missile (IRBM), *Hataf V* or *Ghauri* missile in April 1998 which expanded Pakistan's capability to target up to a range of 1500 km with a nuclear or conventional payload of 700 kg.⁶⁵ *Hataf V* or *Ghaur* is based on the North Korea's *No-dong* and *Taepo-Dong* missiles which were derived by Russian technology.⁶⁶

Fourth, during 2000 and early 2010, Pakistan tested new short and medium-range missiles. Some of the tests occurred in response to India's missile tests especially during 2001-2002 military standoff or due to the regional and domestic political events after 2002.⁶⁷ This phase comprises the series of *Hataf* missile from VI to IX. *Hataf VI* or *Shaheen-II* was tested in 2004 with a range of 2000 km and a payload of 500-700 kg.⁶⁸ After the successful tests of *Hataf VI*, Pakistan diverted its attention towards developing cruise missiles and *Hataf VII* or *Babur CM* ground-launched cruise missile was tested in 2005 with the range of 700 km with payload of 450 kg.⁶⁹ *Hataf VIII* or *Babur CM* cruise missile enhanced air-launch missile capacity of Pakistan Air Force.⁷⁰ The main argument of the two states for acquiring a series of 'nuclear capable strategic' and tactical conventional missile systems were to deter each other but any miscalculation due to their poor strategic cultures and technological backwardness might endanger the environment for unintended nuclear confrontation between them.

It is observed in the history that in the post nuclear paradigm whenever parity exists between India and Pakistan, the two states were away from conflicts except mere exchange of verbal threats. The missile postures of the two states indicate that they have the potential to target all the important military and civilian installations of each other and this power parity forced the two states maintain amity between them, but the growing military capabilities of the two states have shaped the vulnerabilities for their future.

India's CSD and Ballistic Missile Defense (BMD) Strategies and Pakistan's Response

The Indian army initiated Cold Start Doctrine (CSD) to ignite a conventional move against Pakistan which would have an extensive damage to the defense line of Pakistan before the intrusion of world community in resolving the issue.⁷¹ Pakistan condemned CSD and warned India for any misadventure and introduced *Nasar* (Hataf-IX) besides refining its conventional defense strategy.⁷² *Nasar* is capable to deliver a comparable response against India's massive retaliation. Lt Gen (R) Khalid Ahmad Kidwai elaborated that the prime objective of *Nasar* is to consolidate the deterrence capability of Pakistan at all levels of the threat perception.⁷³ India's 'Cold Start' doctrine created a diverse situation for the strategic stability of Pakistan. Pakistan's response for containing Cold Start aggravated the danger of nuclear escalation between the two states. Although the development of *Nasar* missiles provides the leverage to Pakistan against India especially for matching the India's conventional armed superiority, but the existing issues between the two states may drift towards a severe clash in future.

India intends to acquire BMD and Phalcon airborne warning and surveillance system for reducing and marginalizing the credibility of Pakistan's missile penetration.⁷⁴ Zafar Iqbal Cheema expressed some reservations about the credibility of BMD and argued that it has limited capability to intercept cruise and ultra-supersonic ballistic missiles but declared that it could undermine the deterrence capability.⁷⁵ It would be hardly viable for India's BMD in intercepting *Nasar* due to its speed and low apogee. Christopher Clary and Vipin Narang claim that India's BMD has not the potential to intercept *Nasar*.⁷⁷

The BMD and Phalcon system would further aggravate the asymmetry between India and Pakistan and the discrepancy of power between the rival states has always been disadvantageous for strategic stability.⁷⁶ Classical deterrence theory predicts that India's commencement of BMD may

perhaps compel Pakistan in pursuing towards operational nuclear weapons for sustaining strategic parity and stability. For maintaining its credible nuclear force posture, Pakistan would wage conflict and a distressing deterrence/management trade-off as Scott D. Sagon described it as vulnerability/invulnerability paradox.⁷⁷ The operationalization and deployment of nuclear weapons capability gives rise to a new conflict dynamic which creates a new strategic atmosphere having elements of discriminating instability.⁷⁸ Thus, the India's BMD would generate massive spiral aggressive nuclear arms-race in which the two states would be under strain due to less stability and limited security which will provide the argument for Pakistan to reconsider its MCD.

Conclusion

Currently, the two states have the potential to deter each other's nuclear aspirations but their upcoming military preparations generate grave concerns relating to enduring peace and stability in the South Asian region. Despite the existing global trends relating to the nuclear deterrence, the emerging South Asian strategic environment provides disagreements due to the existing disputes between India and Pakistan. The induction of nuclear weapons highlights the suspicions between Indo-Pak relations and despite maintaining stability and preventing all-out war, it might become the source of instability at the lower end of the conflict. The existing nuclear calculus and missile developments of the two states specify their capabilities to target all important civil and military installation of each other which cause nuclear arms race that may create disparity between them. Despite nuclear arms race, there are some other factors i.e. the mindsets of political and religious groups, lack of technological advancements, and poor culture of conflict management and miscalculations which may endorse the probabilities of nuclear war between the two states. India's instigations about CSD and BMD may lead Pakistan to follow enormously aggressive stance for the existence of its strategic stability. South Asia's strategic stability might be assured by adopting two ways; first, the mediating role of international

community has a considerable impact in resolving the issues between the two states. It is the prime responsibility of the world community especially the US to force the two states in determining their core issues on firm grounds. Second, lack of trust is the focal point of disagreements between the two states and by initiating Confidence Building Measures (CBMs), both the states can normalize their relations and resume negotiations for establishing the stability in the South Asian region in future.

Notes

¹ Richard Nixon, *Seize the Moment: America's Challenge in a One-Superpower World*(New York: Simson and Schuster, 1992), pp.21-22.

² Seymour M. Hersh, 'On the Nuclear Edge', *The New Yorker* (29 March 1993), downloaded from www.newyorker.com/magazine/1993/03/29/on-the-nuclear-rdge on February 24, 2015

³ Edward A. Tiryakian, 'Reflections on the Sociology of Civilizations', *Sociological Analysis*, Vol.35, No.1 (Summer 1974), p.125.

⁴ *The Panchajanya*, New Delhi (20 June, 1999).

⁵ Dr. Inayatullah, 'Nuclearisation of India and Pakistan: Security or Holocaust?', *The News* (December 17, 2000)

⁶ *Ibid.*

⁷ In December 1986, India launched a military exercise 'Brasstacks' and behind the exercise, India had a covert plan to provoke Pakistan into war. The scale of mobilization was too huge to precedent during peacetime comparing as some exercises conducted by North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) in Europe. India mobilized nine divisions and around a thousand armored vehicles deployed along the border. See Iram Khalid, 'Brasstacks Crisis in 1986-87', *South Asian Studies* Vol. 27, No.1 (January-June 2012), pp.37-40. Indian troops carried live ammunition, engendering a perception in Pakistan that India was likely to attack Pakistan. See Zafar Iqbal Cheema, *Indian Nuclear Deterrence* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2010).p.402.

⁸ Kargil was the first military conflict in nearly 30 years between any two nuclearised rivals in the world and the largest-scale conventional military engagement ever between any two nuclear states. 'The Usuri River conflict of the late 1960's and early 1970's between China and USSR never involved air strikes nor had the same escalation potential. The Kargil war held a serious potential for escalation of the nuclear level. Both the countries exchanged nuclear threats 13 times within 35 days during Kargil war. See Praful Bidwai. "Chasing the Mirage of Nuclear Stabilization, in

‘Security and Nuclear Stabilization in South Asia’ in Imtiaz Alam. (ed) *SPANAS South Asian Studies*, Vol.VII. Free Media Foundation Lahore, (2006), p.52. This is an indication that both the countries would not hesitate to threaten each other with nuclear arsenals in future.

⁹ A small group of militants attacked the Indian parliament on 13th December 2001, and India blamed Pakistan for supporting the militants and planned for pre-emptive military action against Pakistan and rose to extraordinary levels through most of 2002. Both the countries mobilized their forces on their borders, and became red alert for war for ten months. Involving a million troops, this was said to be one of the world’s greatest military mobilization since World War II. During the hair-raising stand-off, India and Pakistan came close to the brink of actual armed conflict at least twice in January, and then again in May-June 2002. India threatened a ‘limited’ conventional strike at alleged terrorist training camps across the LOC. Pakistan openly warned India that any conventional attack by India, however limited, would precipitate an all-out confrontation, with a nuclear escalation potential. See Kamal Matinuddin, ‘India-Pakistan Standoff,’ *Regional Studies*. Quarterly Journal of the Institute of Regional Studies, Islamabad, Vol. XXI, NO.3, (Summer 2003), p. 23.

¹⁰ Both the states have been dominated a new phase in a troublesome relationship due to a Mumbai terrorist incidence in 2008. The Indian city of Mumbai faced a series of terrorist attacks on November 26, 2008. The well-armed groups targeted two luxury hotels, a restaurant, a railway station and a hospital and killed 95 persons and took hundreds of hostages, including American and British guests resided in the hotels. The attacks highlighted tension between the two states. See Safdar Mahmood, *International Affairs* (Lahore: Jahangir printers and Publishers, 2012), p372. Also elaborated Mohammad Waqas Sajad, Mahwish Hafeez and Kiran Firdous ‘The Search For Peace-Pakistan and India’ downloaded from www.1299222963_5786578.pde at March 4, 2011. India issued threats to Pakistan for instigating surgical strikes on the training camps of accused culprits of Mumbai incidence and in response; Pakistan warned India that any India’s aggression will lead towards a full-fledge war. See Will Pakistan strike back if India attacks?’ down loaded from www.pakistanization.wordpress.com/tag/will-pakistan-strikeback-if-india-attacks/ on May 5, 2014.

¹¹ E.H Carr, *The Twenty Years Crisis* (London:Perennial, 1939), p.297. Also quoted Scott Burchill and Andrew Linklater, p.72

¹² Morgenthau offers the definition of power: man’s control over the minds and actions of other men, in John Baylis and Steve Smith (ed) ‘*The Globalization of World Politics, An Introduction to International Relations*’ (New York, Oxford University Press, 2001), p.150.

¹³ K.J. Hostli, ‘*International Politics: A Framework for Analysis*’ (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.Prentice Hall, 1967), p.193

- ¹⁴ Scott Burchill and Andrew Linklater, *Theories of International Relations* (New York: St. Martin Press, 1996), p.76.
- ¹⁵ John Baylis and Steve Smith, p.145
- ¹⁶ T.V.Paul, James. J.Writz and MichealFortman (edited), *Balance of Power: Theory and Practice in Twenty First Century* (California: Standford University Press, 2004), p.4
- ¹⁷ Kenneth Waltz, 'The Spread of Nuclear Weapons; More May be Better' *Adelphi Paper.No.171*. (London, International Institute of Strategic Studies. 1981), cited by GurmeetKanwal, '*Nuclear Defence; Shaping the Arsenal*'(New Delhi, Knowledge World, 2001) pp. 9-10. Due to its centuries old Hindu civilization, its 3,000 kilometers depth, its peninsula projecting hundreds of miles into the Indian Ocean, being population wise the second largest nation on earth and having been recognized as the largest democracy in the world, its leaders have aspirations and ambitions to become a major world power.See K.M. Desilva. "*Problems of Governance in Sri Lanka*" (New Delhi; Konark Publishers. 1993).p-392.
- ¹⁸ Raj Rammana was quoted by Muhammad Mushtaq and Muhammad Jawad Hashmi, 'Regional Hegemonic Aspirations of India; A Review of Indian Nuclear Program' *Pakistan Journal of Social Science*, Vol.32, No.1 (2012), p.253.
- ¹⁹ Kenneth Waltz, cited by GurmeetKanwal, pp. 9-10.
- ²⁰ George K Tenham, *Essays on Indian Strategic Thoughts* (Santa Monica: Rand Corporation, 1992), p.31.
- ²¹ Syed Ali Mujtaba, *Sounding on South Asia*(New Delhi: New Dawn Press, 2005), p.27
- ²² Barry Buzan, *People, States and Fear: The National Security Problems in International Relations* (Brighton: Wheatsheaf Book Ltd, 1983), p.4.
- ²³ Hans Morgenthau, *Politics Among Nations* (London: Knopf, 1973), p.7.
- ²⁴ Frank N. Trager and Frank L. Samonie, 'An Introduction to the Study of National Security' in F.N. Taregar and P.S. Kronenberg (eds), *National Security and American Society* (Kansas: Kansas University Press, 1973), p.36.
- ²⁵ John Garnet (ed) *Theories of Peace and Security* (London: Oxford University Press, 1980), p.31.
- ²⁶ WalterLippman (ed) *The Globalization of World Politics, An Introduction to International Relations* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2001), p.255.
- ²⁷ Zarar Iqbal Cheema, 'An Interpretive Analysis of India-Pakistan Strategic Culture and Its Impact on South Asian Peace and Security' *Regional Studies*, Vol.xxvi, No.3 (Summer 2008), p.17.

²⁸ India and Pakistan involved in conflicts in 1948, 1965 and 1971, and during the conflicts, the two states were away from the fear of nuclear escalation.

²⁹ Alasdair Blair and Steven Curtis, *International Politics* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2009), p.134.

³⁰ Kaufman. S. J. 'Spiraling to Ethnic War: Elites, Masses and Moscow in Moldova's Civil War,' *International Security*, (1996), pp.38-108.

³¹ Robert Jervish, 'Was the Cold war a Security Dilemma?' *Journal of Cold-war Studies*, Vol.3, No.1 (2001), p.41.

³² Kenneth Waltz, 'Theory of International Politics' (New York; MC Graw-Hill, 1979), p.187.

³³ Dr. A. Q. Khan disclosed Pakistan's capability during an interview with an Indian Journalist that, 'nobody can undo Pakistan or to take us for granted. We are here to say and let me be clear that we shall use the bomb if our existence is threatened, quoted Zafar Iqbal Cheema, *Indian Nuclear Deterrence*, p.402.

³⁴ Ibid, p.209.

³⁵ John J. Mearsheimer was quoted by F.C.Zagare and D.M.Kiglour, *Perfect Deterrence* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), p.4.

³⁶ Jaswant Singh was quoted by Feroz Hasan Khan, 'Challenges to Nuclear Stability in South Asia', *Non Proliferation Review*, Vol.10, No.1 (2003), p.62.

³⁷ Herbert F. Yark contended: the minimum deterrence is lemmatized in two ways; one in terms of its objectives and the remaining in terms of its means. In terms of objectives, it intends to deter the use of nuclear arsenals by someone else and not more than that. In term of means, minimum deterrence involves a limited numbers. Herbert F. Yark, *Arms and the Physicist* (New York: American Physical Society, 1994), p.373.

³⁸ R.W. Jones, 'Minimum Nuclear Deterrence Postures in South Asia: An Overview' downloaded from www.fas.org/irp/agency/dod/dtra/minimum-se.pdf on May 9, 2014

³⁹ Zafar Iqbal Cheema, 'Pakistan's Posture of Credible Minimum Deterrence: Current Challenges and Future Efficacy' *Margalla Papers, Special Edition* (2008), p.47.

⁴⁰ Global Fissile Material Report 2011: Nuclear Weapon and Fissile Material Stockpiles and Production' downloaded from www.fissilematerials.org/library/gfmr11.pdf on May 20, 2014.

⁴¹ Dinshaw Mistry, 'Missile Proliferation and Deterrence Stability in South Asia' in Michael Krepon and Julia Thompson (eds), *Deterrence Stability and Escalation Control in South Asia* (Washington D.C: Stimson, 2013), pp.127-128.

⁴² 'Federation of American Scientists: Status of World Nuclear Forces' downloaded from www.fas.org/programs/ssp/nukes/nuclear-weapons/nuke-status.html on May 13, 2014.

⁴³ Robert Wall, 'China Nuclear Stockpile Grows as India Matches Pakistan Rise' downloaded from www.bloomberg.com/news/2013-06-02/china-nuclear-weapon-stock-grows-as-india-matches-pakistan-rise.html on May 13, 2014.

⁴⁴ Rodney W. Jones, *Minimum Nuclear Deterrence in South Asia: An Overview*.

⁴⁵ Robert Wall, 'China Nuclear Stockpile Grows as India Matches Pakistan Rise'

⁴⁶ 'Federation of American Scientists: Status of World Nuclear Forces'

⁴⁷ Dinshaw Mistry, p.128

⁴⁸ India is constructing two more reprocessing plants at Tarapur and Kalpakam and their production is expected in 2014 which will contribute in boosting 100% increase in their production of Weapon-Grade Plutonium. Additionally, India is establishing nuclear enrichment plant at Rattahalli for fulfilling the requirements of nuclear submarines which are planned to launch in 2015. Expressed Raja Raman, 'Estimates of India's Fissile Material Stocks,' pp.81-83, downloaded from www.scienceandglobalsecurity.org/archieve/sgs16rajaraman.pdf on May 13, 2014. Similarly, Pakistan is developing its fourth Khushab nuclear reactor which will enable Pakistan in producing lighter and smart nuclear arsenals with higher yield. Stated Zafar Khan, 'Pakistan's Minimum Deterrence and its Policy Approach toward Fissile Materials: Security Concerns and the Region's Changed Strategic Environment', *The Korean Journal of Defense Analysis*, Vol.26, No.1 (March 2014), p.55. India has the capability of producing hydrogen bombs, stated Francois Heisbourg, 'The Prospects for Nuclear Stability Between India and Pakistan', *Survival*, Vol. 40, No.4 (Winter 1998-1999), p.79.

⁴⁹ Francois Heisbourg, 'The Prospects for Nuclear Stability between India and Pakistan' *Survival*, Vol.40, No.4 (1998-1999), p.78.

⁵⁰ Srinjoy Choudhary, 'Sukhoi Capable of Hitting Chinese Targets' *The Statesman* (28 September 2002). Suresh Dhanda also quoted, 'Nuclear Deterrence in South Asia: An Assessment of Second-Strike Capability,' *World Affairs*, Vol.13, No.4 (Winter 2009), p.98.

⁵¹ CAC/PAC JF Thunder' downloaded from www.allmilitaryweapons.com/2011/11/cacpac-jf-17-thunder.html on May 15, 2014. JF Thunder is highly sophisticated, all weather, light weight, day/night multi role aircraft developed by a joint venture of Pakistan Aeronautical Complex Camra and Chengdu Aircraft Industry Corporation of China.

⁵² Francois Heisbourg, p.80.

⁵³ William T.R.Fox, 'International Control of Atomic Weapons' in Bernard Brodie (ed), *The Absolute Weapons* (New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1946), p.181.

⁵⁴ Kenneth Waltz, pp. 5-6.

⁵⁵ Suresh Dhanda 'Nuclear Deterrence in South Asia: An Assessment of Second-Strike Capability,' *WorldAffairs*, Vol.13, No.4 (Winter 2009), p.102.

⁵⁶ Ibid. This missile weighs 12 tones with solid fuel and is viable to mount by road mobile transport carrier or by railroad launch cars.

⁵⁷ Dinshaw Mistry, p.124.

⁵⁸ India Defence Consultants' downloaded from www.indiadefence.com/AGNIMISSILE.htm on May 18, 2014.

⁵⁹ Dinshaw Mistry, p.124.

⁶⁰ Ibid.

⁶¹ Ibid.

⁶² Ibid.

⁶³ Francois Heisbourg, p.81

⁶⁴ Samina Yasmeen, 'South Asia after the Nuclear Tests: Prospects for Arms Control', *Pacific Review*, Vol.11, No.3, (October 1999), p.241

⁶⁵ Ibid.

⁶⁶ Ibid, pp.241-241.

⁶⁷ Suresh Dhanda, p.103.

⁶⁸ Dinshaw Mistry, p.125

⁶⁹ Shaheen-II or Hataf-6' downloaded from www.fas.org/nuke/guide/pakistan/missile/shaheen2.htm on May 21, 2014.

⁷⁰ Muhammad Daheem, 'Pakistan's missile capability' downloaded from www.pakobserver.net/detailnews.asp?id=178539 on May 21, 2014.

⁷¹ Dinshaw Mistry, p.126

⁷² Rizwan Zeb, 'Deterrence Stability; N-Redlines and India-Pakistan Conventional Imbalance' *Regional Studies*, Vol. XXVII, No. 2 (Spring 2009), p.36. According to 'Cold Start' doctrine, the Indian Army will establish Integrated Battle Groups (IBGs) which will consist of eight small-sized divisions. During operation, extensive air support from IAF and Naval aviation will be provided to IBGs. The main objective of the doctrine is to get victory by rapid mobilization of forces before the intervention of external powers i.e. US and China on behalf of Pakistan. During aggression, maximum fire power will be utilized without any delay until the attainment of military objectives. In the coming conflict, the India's army will not intend to dismember Pakistan as it was taken during 1971 war and according to Walter Ladwig, 'the main aim of India's army is to make shallow territorial gains, 50-80 kilometer deep, that could be used in post-conflict negotiations to extract concessions from Pakistan. Explained Walter C. Ladwig III, 'A Cold Start for Hot Wars? The Indian Army's New Limited War Doctrine,' *International Security*, Vol. 32, No.3 (Winter 2007/2008), pp.6-9.

⁷³ Suresh Dhanda, p.103

⁷⁴ ISRP Press Release downloaded from www.isrp.gov.pk/front/main.asp?70=t-press-release=1721 on February 25, 2015

⁷⁵ Suresh Dhanda ,p.108. BMD is a defensive shield which identifies the incoming missiles of the aggressor by utilizing advanced surveillance capabilities and Phalcon system would empower India to trace the flights of Pakistani aircrafts including their flight positions within the radius of 400 km.

⁷⁶ Zafar Iqbal Cheema, 'Pakistan's Posture of Credible Minimum Deterrence: Current Challenges and Future Efficacy,' *Margalla Papers, Special Edition* (2008), p.48

⁷⁷ Christopher Clary and Vipin Narang, 'Doctrine, Capabilities, and Instability in South Asia' in Michael Krepon and Julia Thompson (eds), *Deterrence Stability and Escalation Control in South Asia* (Washington D.C: Stimson, 2014), p.100. Shortest flight time would make complicated for any missile defense system to interrupt especially in the case of Nasir missile.

⁷⁸ Zafar Nawaz Jaspal,, 'Ballistic Missile Defense: Implications for India-Pakistan Strategic Environment', *NDU Journal*, Vol No.xxv, (2011), p.2

KASHMIR DISPUTE: A LEGAL PERSPECTIVE

Dr. Raja Muhammad Khan

Abstract

Despite the passage of almost seven decades, people of the former Princely State of Jammu and Kashmir are waiting for their right of self-determination, promised by United Nations. Whereas, there are over twenty five UN resolutions, calling for the solution of the dispute, India is reluctant to grant Kashmiris as their right of self determination. By denying the implementation of UN resolutions, and occupying the state through the deployment of over 700,000 troops, India is clearly violating international law and UN resolutions. Though the legal status of the instrument of accession has been questioned by neutral writers and experts of international law, the instrument to safeguard the Kashmiris' right to decide their future as per their wishes in its various articles. Over last twenty-five years, Indian security forces deployed in Indian Held Kashmir (IHK) have committed massive human rights violations. In fact, the dispute about the State of Jammu and Kashmir is an issue of right of self-determination for the Kashmiri people. The paper therefore, puts into debate, the legal perspective of Kashmir dispute in the light of guarantees, provided by international law, provisions of human rights, related agreements and conventions.

Keywords: Kashmir, UN Resolution, India, International Law

Introduction

Human security is the most significant agenda of state security. The elements of human security constitute security of individuals, communities and societies. The basic right to live, survive, cherish and prosper in life is for every human being and is explicitly guaranteed in the international law.¹ This is regardless of cast, creed, faith and geographical identity of the

person or community in question. The provision of human rights and security are categorically stated both in international law and in the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR).

In the theoretical perspective, the right to self-determination or Self-Determination Theory (SDT) is an individual's and community's right to freely decide their political, social, cultural and economic status. According to International Law, the right to self determination is fundamental human right. The principle of self determination is significant part of the Charter of UNO. According to the norms of international law, and principles of international Court of justice, the right to self determination is held by the people fundamentally and not by the government. Self-Determination Theory (SDT) was developed by Edward L. Deci and Richard M. Ryan.² Its main focus is on supporting natural intrinsic tendencies, human motivation and personality in an effective and healthy ways. As a meta-theory for framing motivational studies, the SDT "focus on how social and cultural factors facilitate or undermine people's sense of volition and initiative, in addition to their well-being and the quality of their performance"³. It also deals with "individual's experience of *autonomy, competence, and relatedness*."⁴

Despite global prohibition on torture even during the times of national emergency, deaths through torture of Kashmiri people have been a common phenomenon in Indian held Kashmir (IHK) by Indian security forces. Factual reports of killing innocents, torture, hostage taking, and rape have been prominent among a wider variety of human abuses in IHK since 1990.

Kashmir is a case study for the self-determination; Kashmir has all the elements that a nation state should fulfil.

- It has a territory larger than many nation states from Africa to Europe and Asia.
- It is rich in natural resources.
- It is home to more than 13.65 million people.⁵

- It has a history of independence or self-governance.
- It owns a distinct culture, languages and deity.

India, the largest democracy in the world, continues to occupy 66% area of Kashmir in an undemocratic manner. Free elections are not a norm in Kashmir. Wherever a voice for human rights was raised it was curbed by arrest, torture, killing, or other such means. The main agenda here therefore, is to correlate Kashmir's right to self determination with violation of basic human rights. Because now there are political tactics being used to alter the demographic landscape of Kashmir: over half a million non-Kashmiris have been settled in Indian held Kashmir.

The basic provision of international law is that; "individuals should not be arbitrarily deprived of their lives, and homicide should be deterred, prevented and punished."⁶ These rights are further secured and protected by the 'Universal Declaration of Human Rights-1948'.⁷ The declaration emphasizes on 'innate freedom and equality, puts a ban on discrimination and states that, "Everyone has the right to life, liberty and security of person."⁸ Unfortunately, with all these safeguards and guarantees for the human beings, through various agreements, declarations and covenants, the people of IHK are being humiliated, discriminated, torture and killed as if there is no law meant for their protection and safeguard.

The Instrument of Accession; Myth or Reality

While tracing history of the state, one may find many discriminations and ruthless handling of Kashmiri masses at the hands of the Indian occupation forces. The current phase of sufferings of the Kashmiri people started with decolonization of Subcontinent in 1947. Decolonization of India was a difficult decision for the British Government; however, two factors obligated the latter to eventually vacate this strategically significant part of Asia. The first factor was the local protests against the protracted British rule that had transformed this particular colony into a nuisance for the

crown. Sustainance of the colonies due to the fiscal retardation of the crown was imminent. Therefore, the British Government was compelled to announce the decolonization and the partition plan of India on June 3, 1947. This was followed by passing the Indian Independence Act by British Parliament on July 17, 1947. Article 1 of the Independence Act, paved the way for the decolonization of India and its partition into the two states, India and Pakistan. In its Article 7, the Independence Act declared the suzerainty of 'His Majesty' over the Indian states. According to this Article, suzerainty of His Majesty over the Princely States lapsed on August 15, 1947, sequel to which all treaties and agreements, which were enforced until the date of passing of this Act, between rulers of these state, and His Majesty also lapsed.⁹

There were over five hundred sixty-five Princely states in British India at the time of its partition. According to Article 7 of the Indian Independence Act, all agreements between British Government with Princely states or their rulers lapsed on 15th of August 1947.¹⁰ The State of Jammu and Kashmir had 'class A' status, enjoying special autonomy and was sold to Gulab Singh by East India Company in 1846 through Kashmir Sale Deed (KDS). The provision of this article slabs Maharaja Sir Harisingh to be the legal ruler of the state after August 15, 1947. If he was not the legal ruler of the state, how could he sign the instrument of accession (if at all it was signed) with India? It is to be kept in mind that, this title to the state was granted to him by the British Government (East India Company) under the Treaty of Amritsar popularly known as the 'Kashmir Sale Deed' signed on 16 March 1846 and lapsed on of 15th August 1947.¹¹

Apart from above mentioned facts, Lord Mountbatten, the Last Viceroy of India, during his special meeting with Chamber of Princes in New Delhi on July 25, 1947, said that all Princely States were practically free to join any one of the dominions; India or Pakistan. Nevertheless, he clarified that, two pre-conditions have to be kept in consideration while acceding to any dominion. These pre-requisites include; the geographical contiguity of the Princely states and wishes of the

subjects of these states.¹² Owing to overwhelming Muslim population, both the factors in the former Princely State of Jammu and Kashmir were favouring its accession to Pakistan.

This aspect was violated by Lord Mountbatten himself, the subsequent Indian rulers and Maharaja Harisingh. This was indeed, the first violation of Indian Independence Act, the very basis of partition of India. This is why it is said that, Kashmir is unfinished agenda of Indian partition. Otherwise, the State of Jammu and Kashmir is not just a piece of land, the fate of which could be sealed or signed away through any Instrument of Accession, which has no legal value, even if it was ever signed before Indian invasion into the state. What could have been the deciding factor was the free will of people of the state, the right of self determination.

Musings of the various scholars of the International Relations include the question of whether the Instrument of Accession was really signed by the Maharaja or not? From the perspective of international law, any treaty or an agreement once enter into force by a UN member, needs to be registered with the United Nations Secretariat.¹³ There exists no evidence, which proves that, Instrument of Accession was ever presented in the UNO or shared with Government of Pakistan. Furthermore, in 1995, India announced that, original copy of the Instrument of Accession had either been stolen or lost.¹⁴

Aftermath of Indian Invasion

Once the popular Kashmiri demand; accession with Pakistan was not met by Maharaja Harisingh, the people of the state revolted against Dogra rule and later established Azad Jammu and Kashmir Government on October 24, 1947. Even today, this day is being regularly celebrated in Azad Kashmir each year as the day of independence and state's accession to Pakistan. The Kashmiri revolt propelled the Maharaja to ask for Indian military assistance, by making a formal request through Mr. R.L. Batra, the deputy Prime Minister of Maharaja. The Indian Government however, conditioned the military assistance with state's accession to

India, which Maharaja Harisingh was never. Nevertheless, on October 27, 1947, Indian Army landed at Srinagar Airport, which India claimed was done after formal signing of Instrument of Accession with Maharaja Harisingh. The illustrious British writers like Alastair Lamb and Victoria Schofield contested in their writings about the signing of any Instrument of Accession between Maharaja Harisingh and India before October 27, 1947. V.P. Menon, Indian civil servant (states secretary), however, stated otherwise and said that, signing on accession treaty was done on 26 October 1947.¹⁵ V.P. Menon's statement was contradicted by then Kashmiri Prime Minister, Mr Mahajan, who accompanied V.P. Menon from Delhi to Jammu and vice versa.

Legal frameworks may support one cause on mere technicality but the primary issue of importance is that of human dignity which trumps all laws of man. This is supported in words of Jawaharlal Nehru that, "I say with all respect to our Constitution that it just does not matter what your Constitution says; if the people of Kashmir do not want it, it will not go there. Because what is the alternative? The alternative is compulsion and coercion..." Then again if legality is scrutinized closely, there are many safeguards in the instrument of accession, which guarantee the sovereignty of the state's future. Clause 7 of the instrument says, "Nothing in this instrument shall be deemed to commit me in any way to acceptance of any future constitution of India ..."¹⁶. Clause 8 of the Instrument further elaborates; "Nothing in this Instrument affects the continuation of my sovereignty in and over this state....."¹⁷.

Even if the instrument of accession is accepted as a legal document, signed by the Maharaja and Indian government it clearly states that, "after the restoration of law and order in the State of Jammu and Kashmir and the expulsion of the raiders, its future will be decided in accordance with the wishes of the people of the State."¹⁸ UNO followed suit in all twenty-four resolutions, it passed from time to time. Apart from this, Indian leadership had made a number of commitments with Kashmiri people, Government of Pakistan

and to the world community that after the restoration of peace in the state, its future would be decided as per the wishes of the people of Jammu and Kashmir through a UN mandated plebiscite, the fulfillment of which is still awaited.

Mr. Alexander Simon, the British High Commissioner to India revealed in a top-secret letter addressed to the British Government that, despite having no formal accession treaty till-date (27 October, 1947), ten Indian aircrafts loaded with arms and troops were dispatched to Kashmir from New Delhi on the morning of 27 October 1947.¹⁹ There is yet another significant factor, had there been any accession treaty, between Indian government and Maharaja, why could it not be published in the Indian White Paper of 1948? Despite all these facts, the legal query still unanswered is that, why the IHK was given a special status through Article 370 of the Indian Constitution, which is not the case with any integral Indian state.

Another perception prevails that, after the invasion of the state by the Indian forces, Maharaja Harisingh may have been forced to sign the instrument of accession. Supposedly, if this is deemed true, the Instrument of Accession stands tainted. It is a dubious legality that can be challenged on grounds that it was obtained under intimidation and duress. The International Court of Justice has highlighted that, “under international law an agreement concluded under the threat or use of power is rendered null and void.”²⁰ The UN Charter also has the same interpretation and it is recognized in the Article 52 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties.

The UN Interpretation of Kashmir; Integral Part of India or Otherwise

Once differences arose between the Indian Premier Nehru and Sheikh Abdullah over the future status of the state in 1951, India imprisoned Sheikh Abdullah and through bogus Legislative elections, got the accession resolution approved in favour of Indian union in 1952. This was done despite clear directive of UN Resolution dated March 30, 1951. The

resolution affirmed that the convening of a Constituent Assembly as recommended by the General Council of the "All Jammu and Kashmir National Conference and any action that Assembly might attempt to determine the future shape and affiliation of the entire state or any part thereof would not constitute a disposition of the state in accordance with the above principle." ²¹ After this, India stepped back from conducting of the plebiscite and later started calling the state its integral part.

Subsequently on January 24, 1957, UNSC passed another resolution and reminded both the governments and authorities on both parts of Jammu and Kashmir that, the principle embodied in its previous resolutions that, the final disposition of the State of Jammu and Kashmir will be made in accordance to the will of the people expressed through the democratic method of a free and impartial plebiscite conducted under the patronage of the United Nations. Both resolutions clearly state that, "any action which the Kashmir Constituent Assembly may have taken or might attempt to take to determine the future shape of state or any of its part would not constitute the disposition of the state and that election of the State's Constituent Assembly cannot be a substitute for plebiscite."²² From the legal perspective as per UN resolutions, IHK Legislative Assembly had no authority to declare Kashmir as an integral part of India.

The UN has passed a number of resolutions regarding the Kashmir dispute, but the fact that these resolutions were passed under Chapter-VI of its Charter hence cannot be enforced and the resolutions have the status of being non-binding. This indeed is one of the biggest obstacles to the resolution of the Kashmir dispute. Had these resolutions been passed under Chapter VII, which deals with binding UN resolutions, the fate of the disputed territory could have been decided much earlier. In addition, the resolutions passed by the UNCIP were also non-binding as, it was an agency of good offices and had no power to impose the decisions. It would be erroneous to establish that since these resolutions were not legally binding on India and Pakistan, that they had not been

implemented as such in real sense. In fact, they imposed a moral responsibility on India and Pakistan to ascertain the will of the Kashmiri people by holding a plebiscite in Jammu and Kashmir.

Right of Self-Determination: A Comparative Study

The right of self determination embodies the basic right of the people for making decision for their destiny. It is the core principle of international law and fully protected in the charter of United Nations and International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights for all people.²³ The concept of self determination is as old as the Greek city state(s) remained significant during French and American revolutions, refined by Woodrow Wilson in his fourteen points, thus incorporated into the League of Nations and got centrality in the Charter of United Nations. Post World War-II, the principle of right of self determination becomes the leading cause of the European decolonization of Asia and Africa.²⁴ Pakistan and India were among the initial states which got independence in August 1947. In the case of Palestine, the right of self determination accorded to Palestinians by UN in its resolutions 181 and 194 was denied by Israel.²⁵ United States, Britain and France remained in direct support to the Israel in its expansion and violation of UN resolutions. The UN Partition Plan gave 53% land to Israel and 47% to Palestinians, but today, Israel is occupying over 80% of the total landmass, restricting Palestinians in two narrow areas of Gaza and West Bank. In the case of Palestine, there has been a clear violation of this UN mandated right of self determination.²⁶

In the case of East Timor; it was the province of Indonesia, not a non self governing territory.²⁷ East Timor indeed was a province of Indonesia, as the people of this province through exercise of their right of self determination voted in favour of the Indonesia when “People's Assembly” formally requested integration with Indonesia following its decolonization from Portugal in 1975.²⁸ However, there has been claim that, Indonesia occupied it through the use of force in 1976 and People's Assembly ratified it without having a popular support

from the masses. In any case the people ultimately decided to be independent from Indonesia, thus without having many UN resolutions, East Timor got independence status in 2002, under the notion of the right of self determination. East Timor had the support of US, and European Union. There were allegations against Indonesia that, while administratively controlling East Timor, it had violated the human rights by, “political, social, and cultural repression; and by entering into treaties on behalf of the East Timorese for self-serving economic reasons.” India too, has violated the human rights in IJK and still doing that. In case of Palestine, Israeli repression over the Palestinian people is a routine matter. Despite presence of dozens of UN resolutions, this dedicated active support of US and EU is not available in the case of Kashmir and Palestine issues, thus remained unresolved.

In February 2008, once Kosovo Parliament declared that, Kosovo will be independent and sovereign state, there were mixed responses from major power houses. The US and Western countries favoured the declaration, but Russia along with some other countries declared the declarations as against the International law.²⁹ Later on, most of the countries have recognized the Kosovo’s independence. According to Johan Ryan, “The UN charter gives people the right to self-determination and by virtue of that right they are free to determine their political status. Quebec in Canada has exercised that right, and there should be no reason why Crimea could not do the same.”³⁰ International Court of Justice too, has given its verdict about the legality of Kosovo’s right of self determination and independence.

In case of Crimean accession with Russia, there arose another legal lacuna, whether it could accede with Russia. There are two arguments about this accession. First; the entire process of accession was forced upon by Russia, thus lack transparency and obligations of international law were not met. Second argument was that, Crimea was originally part of Russia, annexed with Ukraine in 1954 once the latter was part of former Soviet Union. It was meant to maintain a strong grip over the states annexed but, was not a part of Russia.

Similarly, demographic changes were made in Central Asian region. Now, once Ukraine was parting ways with Russia (by joining NATO), the Russian origin population of Crimea decided to join back their parent country. They adopted the legal procedure of referendum by the people and through Crimean Parliament.³¹ Like Crimea, Indian held Kashmir enjoys a special autonomous status under Article 370 of Indian Constitution. This article is the only link between IHK and India. Then, there are dozens of resolutions for the determination of right of self-determination by people of Kashmir to decide their future status as per their wishes. There were no human rights violations in Crimea by Ukraine, even then, the Crimean decided to leave the latter. But in the case of IHK, India has perpetrated unprecedented human rights violations and is under Indian occupation too, therefore, must get their right of self determination as their basic right.

Constraints with Bilateralism

Following the Simla Agreement of 1972, India prefers resolution of issues through a bilateral approach. Whereas in this accord both the countries agreed to “settle their differences by peaceful means through bilateral negotiations”, there was no mention of by passing or leaving aside the UN resolutions on Kashmir issue. Rather, clause I of Article 1 of the agreement clearly states that, “the principles and purposes of the Charter of the United Nations shall govern the relations between the two countries.”³² In a way, UN role was reiterated in the Simla Agreement. Then, Kashmir is not a bilateral issue rather it has four parties; Kashmiri being the first party to the dispute, besides, India, Pakistan and United Nations. Even China should be party to the dispute, having a part of Kashmir (Aksai Chin) under its control.

Then, over the years, the bilateral approach has not worked, primarily, owing to a non-cooperative Indian attitude. The agreement whilst considering the bilateralism sacred does not thwart any third party mediation or facilitation. It says, “That the two countries are resolved to settle their differences

by peaceful means through bilateral negotiations or by any other peaceful means mutually agreed upon between them.”³³ The hardened Indian stance, sticking to bilateralism speaks of its delaying tactics and lack of determination for the resolution of core disputes like Kashmir.

In the recent history, there have been pressures from United States and some European countries over India and Pakistan for the resolution of Kashmir dispute, particularly during the period of escalation and mobilization of forces. Unfortunately, the United Nations resolutions on Kashmir are under Chapter-VI of its Charter, hence cannot be enforced. This fact was even highlighted by former UN Secretary General, Kofi Annan in March 2001, during his visit to Pakistan. Replying to a question he said that the UN resolutions on Kashmir did not come under Chapter Seven of the UN charter, therefore are not self-enforcing. In the case of East Timor and Iraq (1991), UN resolutions were under Chapter 7, thus enforceable. The resolutions on Kashmir need cooperation of both the parties for implementation.³⁴ For the US, EU and other major powers, consent of both India and Pakistan is needed to play the role of mediator or facilitator.

Nonetheless, owing to its strategic partnership with India, U.S seems less interested to play a dominant role for the resolution of Kashmir issue except rhetorically. Therefore, US stance with respect to Kashmir is essentially one of neutrality based on maintaining cordial relations with India without foregoing a relationship with Pakistan.³⁵

New Debate; Abrogation of Article 370 and Integration of Kashmir into India

A debate is underway in India, whether or not to abrogate Article 370 of Indian Constitution, which gives Indian held Kashmir, a special status. For the Indian leaders, especially BJP, as an election promise, Article 370 is an irritant and they are making grounds for doing away with it. Nevertheless, for the people of IJK, Indian occupation, its brutalities and daily crackdowns and human rights violations are the real

problems. For them, even Article 370 is a symbol of foreign occupation, though under the prevailing circumstances, Kashmiri from IHK will like to guard it, until they attain their right of self-determination. Contrary to the Indian efforts of abrogating article 370, the people of occupied Kashmir would like India to stop human rights violations through its security forces in the first instance. Subsequently, they would like the implementation of UN resolutions (right of self-determination), through UN sponsored plebiscite. Since India has an inflexible approach towards both, therefore, there is a dire need that the international community and United Nations play their role to beseech India. However, whether it is Indian occupation or continuation of the Article 370, it is the Indian rule over occupied Jammu and Kashmir in particular, which Kashmiri people have been fighting against ever since 1947.

Today, Article 370 is the only linkage between India and IHK, and even this article does not give India legitimacy over the state of Jammu and Kashmir. Drafted in part XXI of the Indian Constitution, this article relates to, “Temporary, Transitional and Special Provisions. Except for Defence, Foreign Affairs, Communications and ancillary matters (matters specified in the Instrument of Accession) the Indian Parliament needs the State Government's concurrence for applying all other laws.”³⁶

Indeed, the Kashmiri people in IHK live under different laws, including those related to citizenship, ownership of property, and fundamental rights, as compared to the integral Indian states. Except for four areas mentioned above, Indian parliament has no legal authority to make laws for the state. Article 5 of IHK Constitution provides full protection to the state's legislature. At the time of drafting and incorporation of this Article into Indian Constitution, the then Indian Law Minister B.R. Ambedkar had opposed it. He even ridiculed Sheik Abdullah by saying, “You wish India should protect your borders, she should build roads in your area, she should supply you food grains, and Kashmir should get equal status as India. But Government of India should have only limited

powers and Indian people should have no rights in Kashmir. To give consent to this proposal, would be a treacherous thing against the interests of India and I, as the Law Minister of India, will never do it.”³⁷For the people of IHK, Article 370 is nothing except a continuation of Indian rule.

Indian Strategy for 2014-Election in IHK

Now, through the abrogation of this Article, Bhartiya Janta Party (BJP) led Indian Government intends complete integration of the state of Jammu and Kashmir with Indian Union. In order to do that, BJP has worked out a strategy to manipulate the State’s Election-2014 in IHK, the way Nehru did in 1952, after imprisoning Sheikh Abdullah. The strategy included that, through a well-orchestrated plan, Modi Government should get maximum Legislative Assembly seats (at least 44 plus) mainly from Jammu and Ladakh provinces. This would have given Indian Government sufficient maneuvering space to bring demographic changes in the state through Legislative Assembly resolutions. Once there would be majority seats of BJP and its alliance in assembly, India can get the results of its own choice, against the wishes of masses and through such a manipulated and engineered IHK Assembly, will get a vote of state’s permanent accession with Indian Union by doing away with the Article 370.

To its bad luck, the BJP could bag twenty-five seats, otherwise a great success and formed Government with People’s Democratic Party (PDP). In fact, India has record of changing the demographic character of Kashmir. Following the mass Muslim migration from Jammu Province from 1947 to 1971, India inhabited Hindu population from elsewhere into the state, thus, converting the Muslim majority into minority. In 2008, while in the midst of completing its long term surreptitious agenda in Valley, India had to confront yet another indigenous Kashmiri upsurge. This was sequel to allotment of 800 kanals of forestland to Shri Amarnat Shirine Board in complete violation of State’s law on allotment of property. This was yet another attempt to inhabit the Hindu population for bringing demographic changes in the Valley,

which has 95 percent Muslim population. The Kashmiri protest against this allotment was responded by killing dozens of the innocent protestors and imposing economic strangulation by blocking Jammu-Srinagar Highway by Indian security forces and BJP workers. The economic blockade of Valley, caused wastage of hundreds of thousands tons of perishable items, as these items could not be taken to the Indian markets. This resulted into loss of millions of dollars to local Kashmiri business community and farmers.

Post Election-2014; an Alternative Indian Strategy for IHK

Failing to form a Government of its own, the BJP has decided to undo the very unified character of the IHK. The broad contour of the plan is to eliminate the very identity of Kashmiris- the Kashmiriyat, though indirectly, India is working on it since 1950s as. In Jammu region, despite mass Muslim migration, Hindu majority was restricted to three districts (Jammu, Udhampur and Kathua) only. Other three districts; (Poonch, Doda and Rajouri) had Muslim majority. India Curved out additional four districts (Riasi, Ramban, Samba and Kishtwar), all having Hindu majority. Overall, India (BJP) is trying to prove that, Jammu is a Hindu majority province and its people are inclined towards India. For the Ladakh Region, India plans differently. Practically, this area is controlled directly by the New Delhi and masses are persuaded to ask for their separate identity; the Buddhist or regional identity- away from Kashmiriyat. A rift is created between Valley people and people of the Leh and Kargil-Dras. Within Ladakh, there is a huge gap between Buddhists and Muslims of Kargil-Dras.

In Valley, India is planning separate union territory for the Hindu Pandits, where they could feel more secure and their culture is protected. Two movements of Kashmir Pandits are active for their separate homeland. One; Punun Kashmir and the other is Bantustan. Since Pundits are pro India, thus, through Punun Kashmir Pandits demand establishment of their own secure regions or homeland in the Valley of Kashmir

comprising regions of the Valley to the East and North of river Jhelum. According to Bantustan; three identified 'settlements' will be carved out of existing populated areas of Kashmir Valley for the Hindu Pandits. For this purpose, there would be allotment of 17,000 kanals of land for Bantustans. This would mean displacing the already traumatized Muslim populace of Valley for having new secured autonomous regions for Hindu Pandits. According to a Congress MP, Mani Shankar Aiyar-Congress, "The worst of a coalition of opposites, such as we have in Jammu and Kashmir, is that to keep the alliance going, the partners indulge in what can only be described as competitive communalism"³⁸ Indeed, the Crux of New Indian Strategy for IHK is, doing away with the Kashmiri identity-Kashmiriyat, dividing the people on communal and ethnic lines, subsequent demise of right of self-determination and finally, the state's merger into Indian Union or annexation of its parts with other Indian states, after abrogation of Article 370.

The Perspective of International Law

Whereas International human rights law prohibits the arbitrary deprivation of life under any circumstances, Article 6 of International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), prohibits derogation from the right to life, even during occasions of emergency. Its Articles 4 and 7, explicitly ban torture, even in times of national emergency or when the security of the state is threatened³⁹. Indian Army and paramilitary forces operating in the held Kashmir, have deliberately and methodically violated the fundamental human rights and international norms on human rights law, to which Indian Government is responsible, being signatory of these laws.

A world with human beings and without rules is a jungle devoid of consideration morality. Thus, it would be futile to look at the Kashmir issue without taking all the legal aspects under close scrutiny. The international humanitarian law, applicable to the right of self-determination in conflict zone of IHK is found in Article 3 Common to the four Geneva

Conventions of August 12, 1949, known as the 'Common Article 3' which provides international law and standards governing the conduct of parties in an internal armed conflict, including government forces and insurgents.⁴⁰ It states that: "Persons taking no active part in hostilities, including members of armed forces who have laid down their arms and those placed hors de combat by sickness, wounds, detention, or any other cause, shall in all circumstances be treated humanely, without any adverse distinction founded on race, colour, religion or faith, sex, birth or wealth, or any other similar criteria."⁴¹

Unfortunately, in IHK, the human rights violations like; torture, hostage taking and rape have been used as weapon.⁴² The Common Article 3 forbids all of these human abuses. India however, blatantly violated this international humanitarian law and its security forces killed innocent Kashmiri people, molested women folk and tortured thousands just on the basis of suspicions under the inhuman repressive laws like Armed Forces Special Power Act, Public Safety Act and similar other provisions. It is worth mentioning that, two more international human rights treaties deals with right of self-determination of Kashmiri masses. These include; the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (xi), and the International Covenant on Social, Economic and Cultural Rights (xii). Common article 1, paragraph 1 of these Covenants provides that;

"All people have the rights of self-determination, by virtue of that right they freely determine their political states and freely determine their economic, social and cultural development."⁴³

The Discriminatory Indian Laws

Indian Government is continuing its repression on Kashmiri masses through a number of discriminatory laws, imposed in the state, since 1990. Among these laws, Armed Forces Special Power Act (AFSPA) empowers the security forces "to shoot at sight or arrest people without a warrant."⁴⁴

Few years back, Omar Abdullah, the former IHK Chief Minister tried his best to revoke this law from the occupied state. Unfortunately, he could do very little, despite his meeting with then Indian Army Chief, General VK Singh, Defense and Home ministers. Indian Army and former Indian Defense Minister, AK Antony, strongly resisted the move and were able to convince the Chief Minister of IHK for not pursuing the issue any further.⁴⁵

Challenging the United Nations

After 1948 Kashmir War, UN established a United Nations Military Observer Group in India and Pakistan (UNMOGIP), for monitoring the ceasefire between Pakistani and Indian forces deployed along Line of Control (LoC). In early 1950s, Sir Owen Dixon, the United Nations Representatives to UNCIP, reported to the Security Council that;

“In the end, I became persuaded that India’s agreement would never be obtained to demilitarization in any such form, or to provisions governing the period of plebiscite, conducted in conditions sufficiently guarding against intimidation, and other form of abuse by which the freedom and fairness of the plebiscite might be endangered.”⁴⁶

However, after Simla Agreement-1972, India gradually stopped UN military observers to visit areas which are deeply embedded in abject poverty and beaten down by violence. So much so, during LoC ceasefire violations, in January 2013, once Pakistan demanded neutral investigation through UN military observers, India rejected the proposal.⁴⁷ India even denied legal status and the very validity of UNMOGIP. In a way, India negated UN mandate and its resolutions. It was distressing once the Permanent Indian Representative to the UN, Mr Hardeep Singh Puri said that, “UNMOGIP's role had been ‘overtaken’ by the 1972 Simla Agreement.”⁴⁸ Nevertheless, later on, Mr Martin Nesirky, the spokesperson of the UN Secretary General, clarified that, “UNMOGIP can only be terminated by a decision of the Security Council”⁴⁹ not by the yearning of India. In July 2014, Indian Government

ordered the UNMOGIP to vacate a Government building, which was in their use since long, a step towards their ultimate expulsion from India subsequently. Surprisingly, there has been muted response from the UN on this legated role of UN by India.

It is misfortune of the people of Kashmir that, civilized international community and United Nations have done very less to give them their right of self-determination. With the massive human rights violations by Indian security forces after the re-emergence of Kashmiri struggle in 1990 and its two phased revival in 2008 and 2010, United Nations could have taken measures to break the impasse. With the global silence over the human rights violations in Kashmir and UN ineptness, India continued reign of terror on Kashmiri people, torturing and killing those who demanded their freedom and incarcerating the popular leaders in order to silence the opposition. In order to do so, India continued enhancing its security forces in IHK. Through discriminatory laws, Indian security forces have the freedom to detain and torture the civilians, gang rape the womenfolk, torch the villages and desecrate the places of worship and holy shrines. While this has been happening, United Nations and human rights organizations could not prevailed over India to stop violation of human rights.

The Way Forward

Indeed, Kashmir belongs to the Kashmiris, therefore, India must stop harping on about its misleading slogan of calling it as its integral part. It is not integral Indian state, rather, an occupied state. There is a need that major powers and UN should seriously revisit their role over the future status of Kashmir and give Kashmiri people their right, as granted in UN Charter and its resolutions. The international community and major powers have to re-awaken their conscious and role. India should stop violations of human rights and respect UN Charter and its resolutions on the settlement of the dispute.⁵⁰ Among the contemporary global disputes, Kashmir is the longest unresolved dispute on the agenda of the United

Nations Security Council. Today, South Asia is one of the most unstable regions in the world. In all the prospects, the road to peace and stability in South Asia lies in the final settlement of the Kashmir dispute. The dispute has been a ban for peace in the region. This fact was even highlighted UN Secretary General, Mr. Ban Ki Moon on February 4, 2009, once he visited Pakistan. He said that, Kashmir is the main cause of instability in South Asia and accentuated the concerned parties to resolve it through negotiations. He had shown similar sentiments earlier in November 2008. Earlier, the former US President Mr. Bill Clinton once declared Kashmir dispute as, “the most dangerous place on earth”.⁵¹

Sequel to revival of political struggle of Kashmiri masses in 2010, the former Indian ambassador and lawmaker, Mr Kuldip Nayar reminded India that, despite heavy military deployment of Indian Army in the Occupied Kashmir, India could neither restore peace nor resolve the dispute to the satisfaction of the masses.⁵² According to this scholar, “Every now and then there is an incident in the valley to register the people’s discontent.”⁵³

Taking cover of its secularism, democracy and a international lobbying, India has created an impression on the international community that, it has successfully neutralized the Kashmiris demand for their right of self-determination in its illegally occupied portion of the state of Jammu and Kashmir. Nevertheless, this notion is far from the factual position in the occupied part of Kashmir. Indeed, the situation in Kashmir has not improved; rather, Indian occupation forces are committing massive human rights violations there with a renewed vigour.

Following some of the extreme steps, taken by BJP Government under Prime Minister Narindra Modi over the future of Kashmir, it seems less likely that, Kashmiri will get their right of self determination. Modi’s Government is trying to divide Kashmir and Kashmiris on religious, ethnic and territorial basis. This all is being done to do away with the

identity of Kashmir and Kashmiryat. These aggressive designs of BJP have created a frustration in all parts of Kashmir.

There is an immediate need that, Indian leadership should realize its global and regional obligations and adopt a realistic approach for the realistic solution Kashmir, as per the wishes of its subjects. The world community has a moral role to persuade India for the implementation of UN resolutions on Kashmir. If at all India is serious for a peace in South Asia, it would have to come to the negotiating table to resolve the main dispute. The sporadic incidents like the Mumbai attacks and change of governments in either country should not become a hurdle in the finalization of the agreements between two countries and implementation of international commitments, particularly, UN resolutions. After all wars and conflicts have never solved the disputes, rather issues are always settled at the negotiated tables.

The UN efforts at resolving the status of East Timor needs to be considered in this regard. In East Timor, the Security Council under chapter VII of the UN charter authorized an International Force for East Timor to determine the freely expressed will of the people. All the international human rights bodies unequivocally agree both that human rights are systematically denied in Kashmir and that Kashmiri people should be given the opportunity to exercise their right of self-determination. The conflicts in East Timor and Kosovo are comparable to Kashmir in this respect, and the legal framework applied in each case may provide similarly applicable solutions for Kashmir.

Kashmir is a tragedy, no doubt about it, for Pakistan and India and more so for the people of Kashmir. Learning something from their costly experience, both the countries are now trying to tread upon a different path, shifting from paranoia and reflexive hostility to a more rational way of looking at each other. To their mutual benefit, one might add, for a never-ending hostility never served anyone's interests. Let us by all means, stir the still waters of Kashmir through diplomacy and negotiations and in accordance with the wishes

of the Kashmiri people. For an objective and result orientated progress, Kashmiri leadership from both sides of the Line of Control should be made a party to negotiations process between India and Pakistan.

In the wake of Indian latest move, strong resistance has to be put up strong resistance against its strategy of dividing Kashmiri people and destroying the Kashmiri identity (Kashmiryat) at all costs. In this regards, Kashmiri masses and leadership need to play important role through; awareness campaigns-academia-seminars and media including social media. There have to be diplomatic efforts by all diplomatic missions of Pakistan lobbying for convincing the global community, international organizations and United Nations against this overt Indian strategy. Bringing a political resolve and commitment away from rhetoric by all main stream political parties and Government of Pakistan on Kashmir dispute is also needed. The Government of Pakistan should clarify with India about five aspects: status of Kashmir as an entity –its unresolved nature-will of Kashmiris, Human rights violations and UN resolutions over Jammu and Kashmir dispute. All is possible only once there is a dedicated support from international community, dedicated leadership support from Pakistan, a unified and committed Kashmiri leadership on both sides of divide, away from personal or party agendas with an unflinching resolve about the future of Kashmir.

Conclusion

The methods and techniques to address different conflicts depend on their nature, sources of origin and their surrounding environment. In case of Kashmir, if direct negotiations are not possible, or not result oriented, as seen from the past experience, there is no harm in getting support from the UN or any major power as a facilitator. Otherwise, this dispute is neither bilateral nor bound to be resolved bilaterally. The facilitating party can promote communication among the parties, negotiate various options for solutions and

finally convince the stakeholders for the acceptance of most appropriate solution as a way forward.

It is unambiguously stated in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights that, “Whereas it is essential if a man is not to be compelled to have recourse, as a last resort, to rebellion against tyranny and oppression, the human rights should be protected by the rule of law.”⁵⁴ Besides, Article 1 of the declaration declares that, “All human beings are born free and equal in dignity and rights. They are awarded reasons and conscience and should act towards one another in a spirit of brotherhood.”⁵⁵ Besides, the international law states that, all people have right to self-determination and their human rights should be protected. This shows that international law is a guarantor of peace, human rights and democracy. The people of Kashmiri deserve their basic right and security to their lives in the light of international law as well as universal declaration of human rights. All tomorrows will depend on peace in this region, all progress shall be subject to a rightful fulfilment of needs of the youth in Kashmir and all prosperity of South Asia will stem from this periphery, if resolved. Let hope stay adrift and aloft. After all it is hope that keeps the world going.

Notes

¹ Velásquez Rodríguez v. Honduras, “The Right to Life in International Law,” 1998 (accessed on June 12, 2015) at www.icrc.org

² Deci, E. L., & Ryan, R. M. (1985). *Intrinsic motivation and self-determination in human behavior*. New York: Plenum.

³ Deci, E. L., & Ryan, R. M. (2000). The “what” and “why” of goal pursuits: Human needs and the self-determination of behavior. *Psychological Inquiry*, 11, 227-268.

⁴ Ryan, R. M., & Deci, E. L. (2000). Self-determination theory and the facilitation of intrinsic motivation, social development, and well-being. *American Psychologist*, 55, 68-78.

⁵ Jammu and Kashmir: population distribution, 1981 and subsequent growth; retrieved on September 11, 2015, at: <http://kashmirstudygroup.com/awayforward/mapsexplan/population.ht>

ml. The population has grown much more than this, but exact data is not available.

⁶Velásquez Rodríguez v. Honduras “The Right to Life in International Law,” 1998 (accessed September 1, 2014) at www.icrc.org

⁷ The Universal Declaration of Human Rights: Human Rights Charter,” (accessed September 1, 2014) at; ww.un.org/documents

⁸ The Universal Declaration of Human Rights: Human Rights Charter,”(accessed September 1, 2014) at ww.un.org/documents

⁹V. P. Menon, *Transfer of power in India*, Chennai Orient Longman, 1957

¹⁰ *Indian Independence Act 1947*. *Opsi.gov.uk*. Retrieved on 2013-07-12.

¹¹ Ibid.

¹² Ibid.

¹³Vikas Kapur and Vipin Narang, “The Fate of Lawlessness?”, Stanford University, at www.stanford.edu, (accessed on August 27, 2014)

¹⁴ Ibid.

¹⁵ V. P. Menon, *Transfer of power in India*, Chennai Orient Longman, 1957.

¹⁶ A.G Noorani, “Article 370: Law and Politics”, *Frontline*, 2000.

¹⁷Ibid.

¹⁸Ijaz Hussain, *Kashmir Dispute: An International Law perspective*, Quaid-e-Azam University Press Islamabad, 2000.

¹⁹Alastair Lamb, *Kashmir: A Disputed Legacy: 1846 – 1990*, Oxford University Press Karachi, 1992

²⁰Ibid

²¹ Resolution of the Security Council, March 30, 1951. The Official Website of the Government of Pakistan. Accessed on June 24, 2015 at; <http://pakistanspace.tripod.com/archives/51un.htm>.

²²Harsh Dobhal, *Writings on Human Rights, Law, and Society in India: A Combat Law Anthology: Selections from Combat law*, Human Rights Law Network New Delhi, 2011

²³ Legal Information Institute, Self determination (international law), Cornell University Law SchoolSearch Cornell, Available on; https://www.law.cornell.edu/wex/self_determination_international_law.

²⁴ Denv. J. Int'l L. & Pol'y 275 (1994); Gregory H. Fox, Self-Determination in the Post Cold War Era: A New International Focus?, 16Mich. J. Int'l L. 733 (1995).

²⁵ Lia Syed, Palestinian Right to Self-determination, Global Policy Forum, December 15, 2003. Retrieved on September 4, 2015 at: <https://www.globalpolicy.org/component/content/article/189/38197.html>

²⁶ Ibid.

²⁷ Bingbin Lu LLB (Fudan), *The Case Concerning East Timor and Self-determination*, Murdoch University Electronic Journal of Law, Volume 11, Number 2 (June 2004. Retrieved on September 5, 2015 at: <http://www.austlii.edu.au/au/journals/MurUEJL/2004/17.html>.

²⁸ Ibid.

²⁹ Christopher J. Borgen, Is Kosovo a Precedent? Secession, Self-Determination and Conflict Resolution, Wilson Centre, Jul 7, 2011. Retrieved on September 5, 2015 at: <https://www.wilsoncenter.org/publication/350-kosovo-precedent-secession-self-determination-and-conflict-resolution>.

³⁰ Professor John Ryan, Crimea vs. Quebec: The Legal Right to a Referendum on Self-Determination, World News Daily-Information Clearing House, March 12, 2014. Retrieved on September 5, 2015 at: <http://www.informationclearinghouse.info/article37924.htm>

³¹ AP, 'Crimean parliament votes to join Russia, referendum on move March 16', FoxNews.com, 6 March 2014, Retrieved on September 5, 2015 at; <http://www.foxnews.com/world/2014/03/06/crimea-leader-says-11000-pro-russian-troops-in-control-region/>

³² Charter of the United Nations, Chapter I: Purposes and Principles (accessed September 1, 2014) at www.un.org/en/documents.com

³³ UN Resolution On Kashmir Irrelevant - Kofi Anan (accessed September 1, 2014) at www.thekashmir.wordpress.com

³⁴ Ibid.

³⁵ "Documents 101-200," U.S. Department of State, (accessed September 1, 2014) at www.2001-2009.state.gov

³⁶ Khurshid Ahmad Mir, Debating Article 370 of Indian Constitution, International Journal of Research (IJR), Volume 2, Issue 3, March 2015. Accessed on May 30, 2015 at; <http://internationaljournalofresearch.org>.

³⁷ Sanjana Pandit, "5 things you need to know about #Article 370", *dna* (accessed September 1, 2014) at www.dnaindia.com

³⁸ Mani Shankar Aiyar, NDTV, BJP Moves to Destroy Kashmiriyat, April 13, 2015, retrieved on September 12, 2015 at; <http://www.ndtv.com/opinion/bjps-moves-to-destroy-kashmiriyat-754479>.

³⁹ Vinod Sharma, *Human Rights Violation: A Global Phenomenon*, A P H Publishers New Delhi, 2002

⁴⁰ “Behind the Kashmir Conflict: The Applicable International Law,” Human Rights Watch, (Human Rights Watch Report, July 1999), (accessed September 1, 2014) at www.hrw.org

⁴¹ “Treaties and States Parties to Such Treaties,” International Committee of Red Cross, (accessed September 1, 2014) at www.icrc.org

⁴² Harsh Dobhal, *Writings on Human Rights, Law, and Society in India: A Combat Law Anthology: Selections from Combat law*, Human Rights Law Network New Delhi, 2011.

⁴³ “International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights,” United Nations Human Rights, (accessed September 1, 2014) at www.treaties.un.org

⁴⁴ “India: Briefing on The Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act, 1958,” Amnesty International, (accessed September 2, 2014 www.amnesty.org

⁴⁵ Vikas Kapur and Vipin Narang, “The Fate of Lawlessness?” Stanford University, at www.stanford.edu, (accessed on August 27, 2014).

⁴⁶ Vikas Kapur and Vipin Narang, “The Fate of Kashmir International law or Lawlessness?,” Stanford University, May 28, 2006, (accessed August 1, 2014) at www.stanford.edu.org

⁴⁸ “Adjustments in the ceasefire line, The Hindu” February 9, 2013, accessed August 26, 2014, www.tribuneindia.com

⁴⁹ “UN mission in Kashmir can be terminated only by UNSC, The Hindu” January 23, 2013, accessed Aug 26, 2014, www.hindu.com

⁵⁰ Charter of the United Nations, Chapter I: Purposes and Principles (accessed September 1, 2014) at www.un.org/en/documents.com

⁵¹ Pankaj Mishra, “A Jihad Grows in Kashmir,” *New York Times*, August 26, 2008, accessed August 26, 2014, www.nytimes.com

⁵³ Kuldip Nayar, “The Kashmir question Time to give up entrenched positions,” *Tribune India*, April 3, 2012, accessed August 26, 2014, www.tribuneindia.com

⁵⁴ Ibid.

⁵⁵ Ibid.

USE OF PRINT MEDIA FOR CONFLICT RESOLUTION AND PEACE BUILDING: A CASE STUDY OF KASHMIR DISPUTE

Dr. Anjum Zia and Hajrah Syedah

Abstract

This paper analyzes the print media coverage of Kashmir dispute, which is one of the most simmering issues between Pakistan and India. The research is based on the notion that media has potential to influence conflict prevention and its resolution. Kashmir issue intermittently appears in international media and rarely in research journals, thus, providing a room for further research. This study is confined to the content analysis of selected newspapers from Pakistan (Dawn), India (The Times of India) and the United States (The New York Times). Focus was to analyze the news, editorials/editorial notes and letters to editors pertaining to Kashmir conflict. The key findings confirmed that coverage of the issue is negatively framed and invariably centered on violence, violent events and failed to highlight peaceful alternatives, which anticipated further violence. It concludes that print media of the mentioned countries, regardless of its capacity, did not perform any pivotal role for peaceful resolution of Kashmir conflict.

Keywords: Kashmir dispute, print media, conflict resolution, content analysis, media in contemporary world.

Introduction

The Kashmir dispute is not only causing damage and untold misery to Kashmiris, both in property and life but also a root cause of confrontation between Pakistan and India for the last six decades. International Crisis Group Report 2003 indicated Kashmir conflict as a key cause of tension between the two countries. Kochler reported “it has proven to be the most stubborn problem of international politics for more than sixty years”¹. This unresolved matter has kept the both neighbouring countries on a dangerous course of

confrontation ever since inception. The division of India along communal lines by the imperial rulers was to prove a Pandora's box for the future generations. Tremendous drain of resources incurred by the two countries on military build-up and arms-race including the acquisition of nuclear bombs is a result of their confrontation over Kashmir².

Apart from the governments and 'international multilateral organizations' for instance, UN and NGOs, media is another significant actor that influences efforts for prevention and resolution of conflicts. Advancement in communication technology has minimized the governments' monopoly over information and supported individuals and non-state actors to become significant partners in international affairs including conflict resolutions. Recently, news media has become a fundamental arena of violent conflict, from Iraq to Afghanistan or Israeli-Palestinian dispute, media's role has changed considerably both in resolution or fomenting conflicts. Now people know much more about conflicts as information about developments in national and international affairs reaches sooner to them³. Considering this dispute as the most risky nuclear flashpoint in South Asia and momentous potential of media in advocacy and resolving conflicts, this paper analyzes print media's role in peaceful resolution of Kashmir issue.

By applying content analysis, the study investigates as already mentioned national newspapers of three countries viz Pakistan, India (directly involved) and the USA (as a mediator). Print media was focused as it plays a significant role in shaping the political reality, and readers not only learn about the given issue but also realize the importance attached to it. Further opinion pages are forming as well as reflecting the public opinion, thus, based on the concept of conflict resolution, it analyzed whether their coverage has potential to contribute to peaceful resolution of the issue or not, which is disturbing global peace in general and South Asian stability in particular. The specific objectives were to gauge the frequency of content published with reference to Kashmir issue in selected newspapers of the stakeholders. Also to analyze and

compare coverage by newspapers in the light of conflict resolution approach.

Historically, Kashmir has been a victim of communally biased media much before India and Pakistan became two independent nations and Kashmir emerged as a conflict between them. This communally biased media later on in its 'ultra-nationalist' avatar spoiled every move for the resolution of the dispute. It has also been observed that the media of Pakistan and India is always being used by their respective governments to project official stance with reference to Kashmir issue thus, shaped the public minds accordingly. The propaganda creating hatred and distrust among people of both the countries. General A.G. L. McNaughton, the UN mediator highlighted the threat that non-resolution of Kashmir issue could spoil the peace in this region. He stated "as long as dispute over Kashmir continues, it is a serious drain on military, economic and above all, on spiritual strength of the two countries⁴. The political polarization and permanent tension along with increase of political and religious extremism amongst the stakeholders blocks the way of settling this issue and normalize relations between the two countries.

International Crisis Group Report 2003 states "media coverage of Kashmir issue is controlled by the government in Pakistan". Media in Pakistan is not supporting to bring Pakistan and India closer⁵. Similarly, Josy Josep, 'Times of India' opines that "most Indian newspapers are reinforcing the standpoint of Indian government"⁶. 'Reporters without Borders' reported "Indian media propagates every social or political issue and favours India's stance instead of independent approach"⁷. Another research reveals Indian media focuses on killings by militants while Pakistani television projects violation of human rights by Indian forces. Media is an accomplice in the reductive framing of Kashmir conflict as a national security issue and terrorism, whereas Indians view Kashmir exclusively as a territorial dispute.⁸

Since 1947, Kashmir issue is internationally-recognized and a focus of several UN resolutions⁹. It is considered an issue of international community that has implications for global peace and security, due to nuclear potential of three powers actually controlling parts of the disputed territory. Every year, scores of books on different dimensions of the dispute are added to Kashmir bibliography. Extensive research has been done on Kashmir dispute but media's role in its resolution is neglected by scholars, historians or media professionals. Media had its role in the past but communication technological advancement has significantly increased its responsibility for conflict resolution. While noticing acclaimed significance of media.

Conflict Resolution and Media

In 1970s, a Norwegian scholar 'Johan Galtung' introduced peace journalism as a self-conscious, working concept for journalists covering conflicts and wars. He described peace journalism as a "broader, fairer and more accurate way of framing stories, drawing on insights of conflict analysis and transformation"¹⁰. Galtung observed these traditional war journalism is modelled after sports journalism, focusing on winning as the only thing in a zero-sum game. Peace journalism approximates health journalism. A good health reporter would describe a patient's battle against cancer, and yet inform readers about the cancer's causes as well as the full range of possible cures and preventive measures. Paluck stated "Media and conflict has been extensively studied, but research lacks at media's role in peace building and conflict resolution"¹¹. The conflict or war is treated as news value, while reporting media reports are generally sensational, and a tool to increase ratings and circulations¹².

Galtung and Vincent viewed war journalism mainly focuses on violence and pays less attention to inspect the structural origins of the conflict. Conversely, peace journalism is an advocacy, interpretative approach to reporting on war, conflict and violence¹³. Peace journalists spotlight on news stories that promote peace initiatives; reduce religious and

ethnic differences' prevent further conflict' focus on the structure of society, and support conflict resolution, reconciliation and reconstruction. Lee and Maslog expressed "Journalism scholars supported peace culture by rejecting war reporting against peace journalism"¹⁴. Thus, the last decade witnessed rise in the practice of 'peace journalism' and research in the field.

Media's potential to promote peace and reconciliation through news and entertainment programmes has been established by research¹⁵. Patel expressed "media can play a preventive, constructive and proactive role in conflict prevention". Manoff described "Media can support peace-keeping operations by exposing violations, publicizing and enforcing human rights and moral norms". It can act like mediator and create pressure on the governments to address brewing and existing conflicts. It practiced conflict resolution approach by educating the community about existing conflict resolution resources and other successful cases of conflict management¹⁶.

In the light of above discussion, this study explores if Indian and Pakistani media have adopted this approach, which might help in bringing peace to this region. Only resolution of lingering issues between two nuclear neighbours can bring them together and the USA can better accomplish its targets of war on terror in Afghanistan with mutual support of them. The US media can play a pivotal role by publishing supporting content for conflict resolution between the two states. America's role in Kashmir is always welcomed by Pakistan because, being a super power', its media can highlight this issue while suggesting measures for its resolution"¹⁷. In Pakistan, media has the potential to influence public opinion thus, responsible to assist in contemporary conflicts resolution by suggesting applicable solutions. Although contribution of media in suggesting peaceful resolution of Kashmir dispute has been acknowledged but due to the significance of the issue, media should cope with the situation more positively.

Conflict resolutions cannot be observed until all the key contributors realize their due responsibilities. Ganguly says that political thinkers, defense analysts, media, etc. have been suggesting peaceful resolution of Kashmir conflict and supposed that it will eventually be resolved through combination of negotiation, force and compromise among opposing parties¹⁸. India claims to be the world's largest democracy, and in democracy, press is considered to be the most effective fourth pillar of the state. Recent economic growth of India enhanced the demand for resolving all conflicts¹⁹. If media put efforts in resolving Kashmir conflict then Pakistan and India can concentrate on development and eventually achieve prosperity.

Lee depicts media power as symbolic and persuasive. He states that media primarily has the potential to control the minds of readers or viewers²⁰. Achieving conflict resolution or peace through media is one of the Track Two Diplomacy²¹. Powerful media messages have the potential to influence attitudes and behaviour of people, a major stage in the process of resolving issues particularly in poor countries where most of the conflicts take place²². Pakistan and India are important economies of the region and nuclear powers thus, tension between them is damaging the peaceful environment. Both are spending huge budget on defense whereas majority of their people are deprived of basic needs. Davison remarked that media can fortify international understanding by promoting mediation, negotiation and other conflict resolution mechanisms²³. Wolfsfeld anticipates that media can positively influence peace and nature of debate about peace process. He suggested that during conflict, media can itself reframe issues to make the conflict more tractable, which in turn, helps the parties in reframing issues and formulating possible solutions²⁴.

Although media has the potential to play effective role in conflict resolution and peace building but research shows that concerned media never remains supportive because journalists use frames to present central point, stock phrases and stereotypical images to maintain a specific interpretation

of an event²⁵. The frames generally set-up by media professionals and pressure groups in the society including political parties, policy makers, religious leaders, corporate sector, etc. The press is deliberately misinterpreting facts thus exonerates government's careless policies reported in 2003. Further analyzed the reporting frames of US press and concluded that US print media selected two aspects of the Kashmir conflict to highlight religion and warfare.

Media's role in formation of foreign policy is significant but portrayal of Muslims was dominantly negative in the US press²⁶. Al-Zahrani and Aziz have indicated to 'Time' 'ABC TV' and 'The New York Times' about this aspect and focused on the crisis. Maximum stories portrayed Muslims and Arabs negatively²⁷. A comparative study of Pakistani newspapers on Kashmir issue indicates that Daily *Nawa-i-Waqat* has reported more human rights violations in Kashmir than Daily *Jang*, which has more circulation²⁸. Indian Institute of Journalism and New Media Report suggested in view of the economic and geographical proximity of countries, Indian media should pay more attention to Kashmir conflict resolution.

The above cited studies indicate that Kashmir issue is decisive in normalizing relationships between India and Pakistan. Media's role is critical for peaceful conflict resolution. Therefore, present study has examined the coverage and contribution of influential newspapers representing in India, Pakistan and US in suggesting peaceful resolution of Kashmir issue.

Considering Kashmir conflict as an international and core dispute between India and Pakistan, 'Content Analysis' of respective newspaper's coverage on the issue was essential to be evaluated however, considering the mediator's role of USA between them and the most influential country in United Nations that has the capacity and power to resolve this conflict, American newspaper has also been analyzed. It is one of the most prestigious dailies of United States and enjoys

widespread respect among the reading public and elites including policy makers²⁹.

Considering print media as an independent and conflict resolution as the dependent variable of present study, coverage of this issue was investigated in chosen newspaper from 1st of October 2008 to 31st of December 2008. The period of the study was focused on the basis of judgmental sampling. The preferred time was substantial as Mumbai attacks took place during the epoch that affected the state of relations between the two countries and eventually the media coverage. In view of conflict resolution approach, media is expected to act like mediator and create pressure on the governments to resolve the developing and existing conflicts including Kashmir issue during this chaos. A study “print media functioning as peace building mechanism for conflict resolution” concludes “during chaos, dependency of public on press for latest information regarding contemporary development is highly increased”. Media would be influential if portraying conflict situation with objective approach and avoid provoking abhorrence among public.

A coding sheet was created by allotting specific codes to the content of media for instance, news stories, letters to the editor, editorials and editorial notes that were published in selected dailies regarding Kashmir conflict during specified period of time. Newspaper’s content directions of the selected conflict were separately measured and the data was marked on three point scale including positive or supportive, negative or unsupportive and neutral or balanced. Before data collection, impartial coders were trained for unbiased depiction of the content i.e. positive, negative or neutral. The coding sheet having with parameters of data analysis and said content supplied to coders.

The unit of analysis coded positive if the violent aspect of the conflict was not unnecessarily highlighted and published information was identical or similar in all the selected newspapers. It also categorized as supportive, if language (words) used was not increasing the intensity of the dispute

rather avoiding instigating or exposing any information that can encourage or provoke discrimination/hatred on the basis of race, ethnicity or nationality and gender disability of any individual/group involved in the dispute. Further, if the content was unbiased, avoiding sensationalism, not supporting any party, condemning fierce acts, focusing on peaceful resolution and suggesting negotiations to resolve the Kashmir conflict were considered supportive.

The content of chosen newspapers was labeled negative if it was triggering the dispute by giving partial coverage or only publishing the violent aspect of the conflict and distorting the situation. Further, the content is coded negative, if it was able to create intolerance or detestation over fundamental issues of race, ethnicity or nationality and gender disability of any individual/group involved in the dispute and provided unfair support to any party. If the coverage supporting armed activities and appreciating aggressive acts or ferocity of all stakeholders by presenting them heroes, was taken as negative.

Coverage of targeted newspapers was coded as neutral, if it didn't fall in positive or negative group or boosting up the Kashmir conflict. Data is considered as neutral, if it gave a balanced or fair coverage to the issue.

Findings and Analyses

Findings of the study revealed that all the sampled newspapers published editorials/editorial notes, news stories and letters to editor during the chosen time period. Daily 'The Times of India' published 87 news stories on Kashmir conflict which is the highest in number. Daily 'Dawn' published 65 news stories whereas minimum coverage was given by 'The New York Times' which published 04 news stories during the selected time period (Table 1). Data reveals that maximum news coverage to the Kashmir issue was given by 'The Times of India' followed by 'Dawn' but 'The New York Times' slightly covered this issue.

Table 1 shows that news coverage by Daily ‘Dawn’ was most positive (31%) on the contrary one-fourth (25%) of news stories framed positively by Daily ‘The New York Times’ whereas, Daily ‘The Times of India’ remained at bottom of the list and presented only one fifth of the news stories that fell in positive category. Similarly, Daily ‘Dawn’ published most of the neutral news whereas Daily ‘The Times of India’ brought out 36% of neutral coverage and Daily ‘The New York Times’ did not publish any such news story on Kashmir conflict.

It is also pertinent to note that Kashmir conflict received minimum but negative coverage in Daily ‘The New York Times’ published from US. Data validates that maximum coverage by Daily ‘The New York Times’ was negative with 75%, whereas Daily Dawn gave minimum negative (15%) coverage to the issue in comparison to other two newspapers. Coverage by ‘The Times of India’ witnessed 44% negative regarding conflict resolution approach because the published material may impose worse effect on the conflict situation.

Table 1: News Stories published during October 2008 to December 2008 regarding ‘Kashmir Issue’ in selected newspapers

News Stories										
	October			November			December			Total
Codes	+	0	-	+	0	-	+	0	-	
Dawn	06	16	03	09	11	05	05	08	02	65
Times of India	08	09	10	08	15	14	02	07	14	87
New York Times	01	0	0	0	0	01	0	0	02	04

Note: positive, negative and neutral categories are presented as ‘+’, ‘-’, ‘0’, respectively in the table.

As far as the editorials/editorial notes are concerned, again ‘The Times of India’ published the maximum unit (05). On the other hand Daily ‘Dawn’ produced 03 and ‘The New York Times’ wrote only 01 editorial note (Table 2). This shows that maximum editorials/editorial notes appeared on the opinion pages of ‘The Times of India’ followed by ‘Dawn’ to discuss and impact the opinion of policy makers, experts and general public on Kashmir conflict. However, ‘The New York Times’ published only one editorial note, which indicates that it does not consider Kashmir conflict as a significant issue to be highlighted in the opinion pages. This also indicates the newspaper’s policy to keep the Kashmir dispute out of sight of the general public. Table 2 also reveals that Daily ‘Dawn’ published 33% and ‘The Times of India’ produced 60% negatively structured editorials / editorial notes on Kashmir issue during the selected time whereas ‘The New York Times’ ignored this issue altogether in its editorials but published 01 editorial note which was positively framed.

Table 2: Editorial/Editorial Notes published during October 2008 to December 2008 regarding ‘Kashmir Issue’ in selected newspapers

	Editorial/Editorial Notes									Total
	October			November			December			
Codes	+	0	-	+	0	-	+	0	-	
Dawn	0	0	0	01	0	01	01	0	0	03
Times of India	0	0	0	01	0	0	01	0	03	05
New York Times	0	0	0	0	0	0	01	0	0	01

Note: positive, negative and neutral categories are presented as ‘+’, ‘-’, ‘0’, respectively in the table.

Table 3 illustrates that number of ‘letters to the editor’ published in ‘The Times of India’ ‘Dawn’ and ‘The New York Times’ were 11, 05 and zero respectively. Important to note is that US newspaper did not print even a single ‘letter to the editor’ which reflects that there may be no or minimum level of awareness of the issue among the general public in USA. Additionally, the content of 64% ‘letters to the editor’ published by ‘The Times of India’ described this issue negatively. However, Daily ‘Dawn’ published this unit but 20% of them fell in negative category.

**Table 3: Letters to the Editor published during
October 2008 to December 2008
regarding ‘Kashmir Issue’ in selected newspapers**

Letters to the Editor										
	October			November			December			Total
Codes	+	o	-	+	o	-	+	o	-	
Dawn	01	0	0	02	0	0	01	0	01	05
Times of India	04	0	05	0	0	01	0	0	01	11
New York Times	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0

Note: positive, negative and neutral categories are presented as ‘+’, ‘-’, ‘o’, respectively in the table.

Overall findings depict that the selected newspapers gave negatively framed or neutral coverage to the issue in its news stories as compared to positive/supportive to resolve the dispute peacefully. Similarly, less space was devoted to opinion pieces i.e. editorials/editorial notes on the issue and the published were also tended to be framed more as war journalism instead of peace journalism. It is apparent from the data that ‘The New York Times’ gave minimum coverage and ‘Dawn’ gave maximum and neutral coverage to the issue

whereas most of the time 'The Times of India' stayed negative while covering Kashmir dispute.

Findings indicate that all the selected newspaper more or less covered the Kashmir issue but nominally framed positively with reference to conflict resolution. The selected print media, invariably highlighted violence that potentially aggravates the conflict. They failed to emphasize on the peaceful alternatives but anticipated more violence. Among all the targeted newspapers, minimum coverage of Kashmir issue was found in 'The New York Times'. The newspaper's policy is quite obvious from the findings. The less coverage of the issue particularly on opinion pages (editorial/editorial notes) and absence of letters to editor depict the priorities of the paper. It is important to mention that because of the too little coverage of Kashmir issue, the level of its awareness among the general masses is very low as not even a single letter to the editor was found in the paper.

Although 'Times of India' gave maximum coverage to the issue but most news stories were treated negatively, this coverage instead of suggesting peaceful solution to the conflict intensified violence in Kashmir. Therefore, the study concluded that 'The Times of India' followed the policy of its government thus, its approach was biased and negative towards portraying the issue. Most of the time, the coverage remained negative and did not present any peaceful resolution of the conflict. Kashmir conflict was not treated as an international issue by Indian press that is affecting peace of South Asian region in particular and the world in general.

Therefore, it can be said that Indian press is widening the gap between Pakistan and India. On the contrary, Daily 'Dawn' adopted neutral approach and published more neutral news stories, editorials/editorial notes and letter to editor as compared to other selected newspapers but failed to forcefully highlight the need of conflict resolution and hardly suggested any possible peaceful solutions for Kashmir conflict. 'The New York Times' did not give due coverage in creating awareness among the public about importance and sensitivity of this

conflict. Thus, it can be argued that none of the newspapers was following the conflict resolution approach or playing a significant role towards normalization.

Nevertheless, print media coverage to Kashmir conflict confirms that due importance and preference was not given to it. Consequently, Pakistani, Indian and the audience from the world over were not aware of sensitivity of this issue and thus do not show antagonistic concern about its solution. On the contrary, with reference to the negative press coverage, it concludes that media is disseminating frustration and intolerance among readers. Hence, press coverage of concerned countries can be the fearsome weapon in enhancing violence. Such media propaganda and disinformation shapes public opinion and feelings accordingly. It may push the state of affairs to more destructive and apprehensive situation.

This study observed that contemporary press coverage of Kashmir dispute generally follows inappropriate approach to cover conflict. Though dialogue between Pakistan and India was initiated several times but due to various reasons the peace process hit snags, for instance, Mumbai attacks took place during December 2008, resultantly the dialogue and measures for confidence building clogged for unlimited time. Hence, Kashmir conflict resolution went on the back burner and Indian press while supporting their Government's point of view beefed-up with the negative reporting. Previous studies also revealed that media tends to reflect their government stands particularly in case of conflict. A country's media does not likely to remain neutral in a conflict involving its government³⁰.

The study by Lee in 2010 also concluded that this was not surprising to discover the strongest war journalism framing in the reporting of Kashmir issue by Indian and Pakistani media. They are embroiled in territorial battle over Kashmir for more than six decades and their press coverage continues to adopt a knee-jerk style of conflict reporting, with little consideration for long-term peaceful perspective. Lee mentioned that these

two states have a long account of enmity, having fought three wars including two over Kashmir in 1947 and 1965 with slight progress in peace negotiations. The Kashmir conflict is possibly the major acrimonious that involves not only the disruptive factor of religion but also the minefield of national sovereignty. Enmities hardened over time, and it is debatable if the press is playing a contributory role in resolving the issue. The findings of present study supports the above mentioned conclusion.

It has been observed that generally media is the only source of information in absence of direct contact. In current scenario, when circumstances are tense between Pakistan and India, peoples' media dependency for latest information increased heavily and unavoidably. United States has an arbitrator's role in resolving Kashmir issue, as urged by Pakistan, but the findings confirmed that 'The New York Times' a representative of American print media did not confer a noticeable coverage to the issue. Another important point is that whenever 'The New York Times' covered the issue, mainly it favored India's view point regarding Kashmir dispute instead of publishing independent, unbiased and impartial opinion. Most of the news (75%) in 'The New York Times' were negatively framed which confirmed that United States print media does not follow peace journalism. This result coincides with the earlier studies regarding conflict resolution approach, for instance to some extent, it is not surprising that traditional frames of war journalism prevailed more in line with foreign wire services than locally written news. Western news agencies tend to report violence and conflict more saliently than any other news stories from developing countries³¹.

The findings proved that press while covering Kashmir issue followed the socio-political agenda of its own country. It would also be imperative to understand that large but negative coverage cannot make any difference or enhance the pace of peace process. However, fair and positive coverage by independent and influential newspaper with

peace resolution approach to the issue may change the present scenario.

The findings of this paper accomplished that press coverage of the Kashmir conflict was inclined towards highlighting violence more instead of its resolution. Thus, media legitimized aggression by constant negative coverage and generally ignored the peaceful resolution of the conflict therefore, can be viewed although print media has potential to resolve conflicts by augmenting peace process; newspapers of all the selected countries were not giving due coverage to the issue and playing their role positively and effectively for the conflict resolution.

Conclusion

This study offered a quantitative contribution to the Kashmir issue resolution which has received mostly anecdotal or normative discussion. By applying the Galtung's concept of war/peace journalism, the study analyzed the content of print media of Pakistan, India and United States. On the basis of the content analysis, it can be concluded that the Kashmir issue was not highlighted with positive approach by the print media; rather it was negatively structured or neutral most of the time. During covering Kashmir conflict, print media of each country has set frames according to their socio-political context and covered the issue accordingly and highlighted violence and militancy, nationalism and patriotism, biasness towards some parties, etc.

The coverage of the conflict is dominated by war journalism, which indicates that the value of peace journalism is not realized. India and Pakistan, embroiled in a decades-old territorial clash over Kashmir, have demonstrated through Pakistani and Indian newspapers that print media continues to adopt an imprudent, unreflective type of coverage of conflicts, with a minor consideration for long-term and peaceful solutions. Thus, the strong war journalism by Indian and Pakistani newspapers is not surprising. Therefore, the study concludes that print media was not used effectively and

efficiently for Kashmir conflict resolution and peace building in the region. On the contrary, the role played by the media was more capable in increasing intensity of the conflict and eventually to anticipate suggestions for peaceful resolution of Kashmir dispute.

Many a times, in conflict theatres media ignores the conflict resolution approach. It does not remain neutral and emerges as a party to the conflict. It sells negative stories that capture public attention rather than analyzing and putting forward a balanced view in conflict theaters. Therefore, the study suggests to media practitioners that structural changes are required for peace journalism to evolve into a feasible, mainstream approach to news coverage of conflict. News and opinion writings instead of following hard news patrons are more likely to be framed at peace building and conflict resolution approach. One of the logical implications is that media organizations must modify notions of news values for reporting conflict.

The findings clearly outline challenges posed by established media content writing norms on conflict resolution and need of incentives for media to engage in peace journalism. Peace journalism does not often attract commercial interest, which leaves it to or other donors. Developing media initiatives with a sustainability plan is a key to long-term success and peace. Sustainability must include not only a strategy for necessary actions but also plan for funding. To recognize and encourage the peace journalism/journalists, peace awards may also be announced by the media or other organizations. The findings may also assist media study institutions and training centers in preparing customized peace journalism programs and building a case for offering such courses.

Notes

¹ Kochler, Hans. 2008. The Kashmir problem between Law and Real Politics. Global discourse on Kashmir 2008. Indo-Pak changing perceptions on Kashmir. Keynote Speech at International Progress

*Use of Print Media for Conflict Resolution and Peace Building:
A Case Study of Kashmir Dispute*

Organization, Brussels. Accessed December 12, 2010. <http://i-p-o.org/Koechler-Kashmir-Brussels-April2008-V3.pdf>

² Khan, Nasir. 2008. The Kashmir issue and the violence in the Indian subcontinent. Peace and Justice Post, News, Views and Comments. Accessed December 19, 2010. <http://sudhan.wordpress.com/2008/12/10/the-kashmir-issue-and-the-violence-in-the-indian-subcontinent/>

³ *ibid*

⁴ Zahid, Mohammad. 2014. The Kashmir Dispute & Role of Media. Kashmir awareness forum. Accessed on 12 Mar. 2014. <http://www.kashmirawareness.org/Article/View/25212/kashmir-dispute-role-media>

⁵ Chandran, Suba. 2009. Water and trade issues. Seminar report on conflict resolution and peace building debriefing of an Indo-Pak Track II Dialogue. Institute of Peace and Conflict Studies. New Delhi. Accessed January 12, 2010. <http://www.ipcs.org/seminar/pakistan/conflict-resolution-and-peace-building-debriefing-of-an-indo-pak-799.html>

⁶ Raju, Subramanyam. 2001. Third-generation Indian perceptions of the Kashmir issue. Regional Centre for Strategic Studies. Accessed December 18, 2010. http://www.rcss.org/publication/policy_paper/ps_18.pdf

⁷ Nawaz, Mohammad. 2006. Mass Communication: an Introduction to Information Revolution, Theories, Skills and Practices. Islamabad: Higher Education Communication. Pakistan

⁸ Manchanda, Rita. 2002. Militarized Hindu nationalism and the mass media. Kathmandu: South Asia Forum for Human Rights. Retrieved from <http://www.safhr.Org/pdf/paperseries11.pdf>

⁹ Sultan, Mohammad. 2000. Globalization, media and the Kashmir dispute. Islamabad: Institute of Strategic Studies. Accessed October 23, 2011. http://www.issi.org.pk/journal/2000_files/no_4/article/3a.htm

¹⁰ McGoldrick, Annabel. and Lynch, Jake. 2000. Peace Journalism—How to do it. Accessed June 2, 2010. <http://www.transcend.org/pjmanual.htm>

¹¹ Paluck, Elizabeth Levy. 2009. “Reducing intergroup prejudice and conflict using the media: A field experiment in Rwanda”. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*. 96(3), 574–587.

¹² Allen, Tim. and Seaton, Jean. 1999. *The Media of Conflict: War Reporting and Representations of Ethnic Violence*. London: Zed Books.

¹³ Galtung, Johan. and Vincent, Richard. 1992. *Global Glasnost: Toward a New World and Information Order?* Cresskill, N.J. Hampton Press.

¹⁴ Lee, Ting Seow. and Maslog, Crispin. 2004. War or peace journalism? Asian newspaper coverage of conflicts. Paper presented at the

International Communication Association, New Orleans, LA. Accessed May 27, 2010. http://www.allacademic.com/meta/p112365_index.html

¹⁵ Dahinden, Philippe. 2007. Information in Crisis Areas as a Tool for Peace: The Hirondelle experience. In A. Thompson (Ed.), *The Media and the Rwanda Genocide*. London: Pluto Press.

¹⁶ Manoff, Robert Karl. 1997. The media's role in preventing and moderating conflict. Virtual Diplomacy Conference. Institute of Peace. Washington, D.C.

¹⁷ Yusuf, Mohammad. 2010. On the Issues: U.S.-Pakistan-India. Washington: UnitedStates Institute of Peace. Accessed February 15, 2011: <http://www.usip.org/publications/the-issues-us-pakistan-india>

¹⁸ Galtung, Johan. 2002. Media: Peace Journalism. Accessed September 25, 2010. <https://www.nicr.ca/programs/PeaceJournalism.htm>

¹⁹ Fai, Ghulam Nabi. 2010. Resolution of Kashmir issue guarantees peace in South Asia. *Al-Jazeera: Cross-Cultural Understanding*. Editorial published on December 15, 2010

²⁰ Lee, Youngae. 2007. Korean Hurricane Media Discourse Analysis (Master's thesis). Louisiana State University. Accessed March 15, 2011. <http://etd.lsu.edu/docs/available/etd-06142007-114724/unrestricted/KHMDA.pdf>

²¹ Patel, Tejas. 2005. News coverage and conflict resolution: Aid or impediment. University of Queensland, Australia. Accessed January 20, 2011. <http://www.scribd.com/doc/191254/Tejass-M-Phil-Media-and-Conflict-Resolution-2005>

²² Geelen, Michiel, Van. 2002. The Role of the Media in Conflict Prevention, Conflict Management and Peace Building: An Overview of Theory and Practice. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Netherlands and the Netherlands Association of Journalists. Accessed February, 24 2011.

www.forumzfdakademie.de/files/va_media/nid2149.media_filename.pdf

²³ Davison, Walter Phillips. 1974. *Mass Communication and Conflict Resolution: The Role of the Information Media in the Advancement of International*. USA. Praeger Publishers.

²⁴ Wolfsfield, Gadi. 2003. "The news and the second intifada". *Palestine-Israel Journal*. 10(2): 11-16.

²⁵ Vreese, Claes De. 2002. *Framing Europe. Television News and European Integration*. Amsterdam: Aksant Academic Publishers.

²⁶ Ali, Shahzad 2008. "U.S. mass media and Muslim world: Portrayal of Muslim by Newsweek and Time 1991-2001". *European Journal of Scientific Research*, 21(4): 555-577.

*Use of Print Media for Conflict Resolution and Peace Building:
A Case Study of Kashmir Dispute*

²⁷ Sinha, Dipankar. 2002. Kargil episode in Bengali print media. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 37. Abstract Accessed November 23, 2010. <http://www.jstor.org/pss/4412336>

²⁸ Pervaiz, Mohammad. (2005). "Human rights violation in occupied Kashmir: A comparative study on extent of coverage in press". *Gomal University Journal of Research*. 21(2): 39-50.

²⁹ Ray, Durage. 2004. *Frames in the U.S. Print Media Coverage of the Kashmir Conflict* (Master's thesis). University of South Florida. Accessed April 14, 2011. <http://etd.fcla.edu/SF/SFE0000436/Completeness.pdf>

³⁰ Hiebert, Ray. 2003. "Public relations and propaganda in framing the Iraq war: A preliminary review" [Electronic version]. *Public Relations Review*. 29, 243-255.

³¹ Hachten, William. A. and Scotton, James, F. 2006. *The World News Prism: Global Information in a Satellite World*. Malden, MA: Blackwell.

GOVERNANCE IN PAKISTAN: LEGITIMACY REGIME OF NGOs

Tahir Ul Mulk Kahlon

Abstract

Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) have proliferated dramatically in Pakistan. They have become a part of contemporary governance with crucial roles to overcome challenges and threats to governance and national security. While their roles have been evolving, they are under scrutiny of government, media, and civil society. The spread of NGOs and simultaneously militancy/terrorism in Pakistan is seen by many Pakistanis as a complementary phenomenon. Rising influence of NGOs is attributed to absence of government and the governance failure is considered as a major cause of the rise of militancy. This paper examines the milieu of the NGOs in Pakistan and the prevalent practices and attitudes towards their legitimacy and accountability. It explores complexities of NGOs' legitimacy, drawing from and adding to the literature on governance and national security. This paper takes a descriptive approach and a democratic theoretical perspective that is so close to the ideology of Pakistan. It reflects as to how legitimate NGOs can become vital social organizations, or conversely, a security risk without public support for their missions. It provides an understanding as to what this sector is doing or not doing for Pakistan, and concurrently suggests measures for its efficacy.

Introduction

Pakistan has been exposed to conflict and terrorism for the last three decades with varying intensity. The security threats are multidimensional ranging from internal to international which have ripped the very fabric of society and put severe strains on its governing mechanisms. Government institutions face declining resources but enormous problems and

extensive spaces for their operations. Consequently, it has created space for non-state actors to fill the vacuum. Global politics have pushed Pakistan to become a frontline state, initially to counter the leftist and later the rightist extremism. In both situations, Pakistan was a conduit of military operations and hence, a fertile ground for growth of national and international NGOs in the multibillion security market. The simultaneity in the growth of NGOs and terrorism in Pakistan gives a look of a complementary phenomenon. Both NGOs and fragile security milieu are thus considered the two sides of the same coin. Putting it scholastically, one may refer to it as the problem of legitimacy of NGOs to engage in the functions of the state as they find little acceptance with skeptical Pakistani nation. NGOs do not have the power of the government, thus their survival hinges on credibility and legitimacy. If that becomes shady, their roles in society will be contested radically. Hence, study of NGOs in Pakistan, though a manifestation of governance overwhelmingly has national security connotations.

NGOs have become a part of contemporary governance with crucial roles to overcome challenges threatening interdependent world¹. While their roles have been evolving, they have come under scrutiny of government, media, and civil society. It has resulted in deep international concerns focusing on their accountability and legitimacy². People suspect their credentials and powerful stakeholders raise doubts on their ideologies and intentions to advocate policies and engage in public service. They are also criticized to be unaccountable and websites like “NGO Watch” are dedicated to expose NGO activities³. These questions hit at the very heart of their legitimacy to engage in actions that are principally the domain of government.

This paper examines the milieu of the NGOs in Pakistan, their prevalent practices and public attitudes towards their legitimacy and accountability. It reflects as to how NGOs with their legitimacy can become vital social organizations in Pakistani context, or conversely, a security problem without public support for their missions. It provides an

understanding as to what this sector is doing or not doing for Pakistan.

NGO Phenomenon in Pakistan

Phenomenal growth of NGOs in Pakistan in the past few decades is mainly credited to inflow of massive foreign funding due to the security situation of this region, dominated by the protracted American War on Terror in Afghanistan. USA, being one of the donors, claims to have channeled more than ten billion dollars after the incident of 9/11. Consequently along with Afghan refugees, Pakistan was also a 'refuge' of international NGOs working for/in Afghanistan and beyond. This could be attributed to proximity of Islamabad and Kabul, liberal visa regime, and porosity of Pak Afghan border that allows NGOs' workers to travel across even illegally. Another reason for proliferation for NGOs could be oscillation of Pakistan between democracy and dictatorships. Such political instability provided fertility to NGOs to sprout on any known human issue. Natural calamities in the shape of earthquake (2005), and floods (2010-2011-2014-2015) also provided rationale to philanthropic sector and those with modern technological equipment and professional expertise, rush to Pakistan to get it out of trouble. With money raining on one pretext or the other, both governmental and non-governmental sector reached out to fill their buckets. Pakistan thus now relishes a both government and NGO glut.

Any phenomenon which attains power and grows rapidly in a society will surely come under public as well as business scrutiny. One finds Pakistani NGOs subjected to all types of criticism challenging their legitimacy to exist. They are termed undemocratic creatures, insensitive to culture and religion, existing with the sole aim to act as an agent of foreign countries. However, all NGOs are not evils or business concerns. They have many good works to their credit and people in Pakistan have contributed billions of Rupees as charity through these organizations for the welfare of the poor and needy. Are NGOs doing something or do they exist as a vocation for rich and powerful? Are they working for Pakistani

people or do they have a foreign agenda? The succeeding paper dilates on major roles of NGOs in Pakistan

Humanitarian Assistance: Many NGOs in Pakistan focus on providing services to the poor and those in need. They are engaged in many human development ventures and government has relied on them to deliver aid to the needy. At any time of need and disaster, NGOs were faster than government to come to the support and meet people's demands. This is in line with global trend as documented by Mathew that "subject to availability of funds, NGOs have outperformed government in the delivery of many public services."⁴ Generally, Pakistani NGOs have been more dynamic than government in far flung, barren and rural areas of Baluchistan. Agha Khan Foundation has deep roots and extensive involvement in development projects in Northern Areas of Pakistan. Overall, NGOs have been efficient and forthcoming to assess and meet the public needs due to their acquaintance with grass root organizations and superior functional abilities.

Professional Guidance: NGOs focus on specific issues, collect relevant information, and then publicize it to promote awareness.⁵ This makes NGOs specialists in their jobs. They are competitor of state in professionalism and offset the averseness of government in monitoring state functions. Pakistani government as well as businesses have often reached NGOs to acquire specialist advice and input. NGOs have been forthcoming with their technical and legal knowledge to contribute professionally. In one example, an NGO provided data to government to celebrate world women's day. The government used and published it but the name of NGO was not explicitly cited.⁶

Financial Support: Pakistani governments have traditionally pushed rural development and poor to the lowest priorities and instead going for money guzzler visible projects for political mileage. NGOs can boast budgets of billions, though this is rare. They have, in some cases, highlighted governance gaps, and used their money to push these issues

back on the 'decision agenda' of the government. NGO have attained such power through the money, they possess. More funds also mean extended abilities to do work for the needy. The money power puts these NGOs in a position to monitor government actions or inactions on 'people's agenda'. NGOs provide valuable information, travel to needy people in remote locations and create a supporting infrastructure for delivering goods and services. Pakistani NGOs have spent money on many public issues that governments have ignored. Their money enables people to lobby for policies, do research and generate policy options. They have tried to fill gap between requirements of the people and the competencies of government. This has given some credibility and legitimacy to Pakistani NGOs and their projects.

Government's Watchdog: NGOs with their expertise have been a tool to monitor Pakistani governments' compliance with national and international standards. They have been compelling government for transparency by waging media campaigns. Some Pakistani NGOs have launched effective media campaigns to force both government and private businesses to change their detested policies or improve and speed up the implementation of desired projects. NGO monitoring has been vital on development issues and political rights of Pakistanis. Without them, governmental performance could be bleak. As documented by Synder, "When you all go home, it is the NGOs that keep a close eye on governments. We force government to act where it refrains due to political or financial priorities".⁷ It has led to greater implementation concerns by political governments. For example, Pakistani NGOs have closely monitored the implementation of governments' labour and wage policies in the private sector. They have been instrumental in getting concession for citizens where even government was reluctant to question corporate practices due to fear of losing the anticipated revenue. This is commendable in a country like Pakistan, where most political governments have been hostage to business enterprises.

Supporting Minorities: Pakistani NGOs have done work on gender issues specially empowerment of women in Pakistan. They have worked for the rights of Christians, for the emancipation of agricultural tenants (Haries), worked for Hindu population in Thar and supported families of people missing during American War on Terror in Afghanistan. They have spoken for power devolution and pressurized successive governments to increase public spending in underdeveloped areas. NGOs have pushed governments for child education, safe motherhood programmes, run literacy programmes, worked in slums (katchiabadis), post conflict rehabilitation, and worked “under donor pressure” for making penal laws on honour killings. Pakistani NGOs have worked against use of drugs and for the rehabilitation of addicts. They provide voice to voiceless, speak to remedy their pains and have advocated justice for poor. They have highlighted dismal prison conditions and raised voice on rights of prisoners.

Criticism on Pakistani NGOs

“The answer doesn’t lie in the over regulation of the NGOs or their donors but a total dismantling of the NGO-industrial complex. Until then, conferences and consultations on ‘labour rights’ can continue to be held at five star hotels – which for one are known to underpay their employees – without a hint of irony and we’d continue to have lots of project reports to show for it”⁸. The Dawn

The greatest criticism of Pakistani NGOs is on their legitimacy. Such criticism finds its foundations in the lack of transparency and accountability in this sector. Legitimacy of this sector comes under severe scrutiny when NGO projects extend to the turfs of strong religious clergy or the feudal structure which sustain on the perpetuity of poverty and illiteracy. Pakistanis have expressed doubts that operations of NGOs are categorically impervious. This is not at tangent to global perceptions about NGOs. They employ influence on government decisions behind closed doors and without

pluralistic participation.⁹ This brings into light the democratic connotation of their legitimacy. NGOs are also considered to be anti-state and working on foreign agendas to seek funding. People believe that power and influence of NGOs should be controlled by some legal measure in order to provide some form of visibility and accountability in cases of their preconceived irresponsibility. Major criticism on NGOs is as follows.

Despotic: Many Pakistani NGOs do not follow democratic values in management of their organization. This is however, no different from NGOs elsewhere in the world.¹⁰ NGOs in Pakistan do not choose their leaders or governing members in any contemporary pluralistic manner. As Johan said, “They make their policies without any input or consultation from their members. Most of their projects are conceived top down and thrust down for implementation. Such projects often reflect the interests of the leadership than that of the organization or its employees.”¹¹ Most of them do not draw on a popularly supported constitution. Many do not have a constitution at all and those who do are in accessible. NGO leaders relish wide-ranging discretion regarding what policies should be followed. Which is to be followed sincerely with focus and potency and which is to be just a semblance of activity? In Pakistan, it is strange that even well-established NGOs function undemocratically like a ‘family’ NGO. Even NGOs having standing with United Nations are least democratic. Mertussays, “This could be so because their policies and projects are based on the concerns of a well-defined constituency.”¹²

Pakistani NGOs speak for women, speak against religious injunctions, patriarchy, and class discrimination etc, without having any mandate from any of these communities. They claim to speak for children, who by themselves have no idea as to what is good or bad for them. They have consistently lobbied for people’s right to education which is already a fundamental right in the constitution and there are numerous government departments at all levels to execute this constitutional provision. Despite that, residents of capital city

of Pakistan, having highest literacy rate, were thrust with persistent media “Ailaan” (pronouncement) that “education is a virtue”. An overnight NGO (with half Pakistani elitist owner) had appeared from nowhere with money from an international donor. This owner ‘has been’ an employee and contractor of USAID, and is himself foreign educated with foreign demeanour. People of Pakistan never choose the NGOs they encounter, or approach them to be their representatives. They have neither approved nor are made part of their agenda setting. Thus, NGOs contradict basic moral and normative rule that is to govern with the consent of the governed.¹³

Foreign Agents: Pakistan is filled with rich and large NGOs from the developed West. Most of these organizations are either working directly or through their associated Pakistani NGOs. The purpose of their agenda is thus either subtle and masked or not openly shared with their targeted communities. Polio vaccination project is an excellent example of such projects. The project has not been able to achieve its targets because some NGOs’ workers were found spying for the donor countries. The conservative society in the Northern parts of Pakistan has even declared this vaccination against the teachings of Islam, which essentially is a consequence of lack of trust on the NGOs. Thus, it is the foreign donors who create and fund the projects. Pakistani NGOs simply tow them without any question. This is “only to get funds. It makes them rich and enables them to live in Islamabad in plush offices and cozy houses.”¹⁴

Alien Development Perspective: While the richest NGOs are from the developed western countries, Pakistani NGOs are comparatively minion. Larger NGOs attract the greatest donor funding. About fifty of 2,000 NGOs control eighty percent of NGO resources.¹⁵ The power of international development agenda setting thus has remained and will perhaps continue to remain in the hands of rich Western NGOs. International donors impose their self-interested agenda. No doubt that Pakistani press has every now and then blamed NGOs as foreign agents. The repetitiveness thus

becomes dappled by moving into the realm of anti-state agenda. This manner of imposing and carrying agenda is what encourages government officials, citizens, as well as some NGOs to question the legitimacy of such NGOs. One NGO manager told me that he was doing a project on child labour. Knowing that an INGO was about to fund a programme on literacy, he dropped the child programme and started a literacy initiative to obtain the funding.¹⁶ Another smaller women NGO leader proclaimed that Pakistanis having dual nationalities use western nationality to rope in foreign donors and local nationality to consume these funds on paper projects. They are oblivious of social realities in Pakistan.¹⁷

Elitist: Gary says that “criticism on legitimacy and accountability of NGOs is the developing elitism disguised in professionalism.”¹⁸ Pakistani NGO leaders do not represent the poor and voiceless. NGO managers are rich and absolutely not in touch with the poor segments of Pakistani society that they assert to represent. Those who run Pakistani NGOs are from power wielding networks. NGOs are used for preservation of personal interest or class interests. Most of them have an interest in the perpetuation of their NGO and the persistence of their projects. NGOs may be a vocation, a profession or a business. While such criticism is normative for our politicians and public servants, its application on NGO sector goes against the very philosophy of these organizations.

Careerism: With increased funding to NGOs in Pakistan especially after 9/11 and Kerry Lugar Act, there has been a surge in wages and job security for NGO employees leading to increased competition for jobs in NGOs. This has led to professionalism and careerism. It exists in the developed world and it does so in Pakistan. In the developed world however, it is not the wealthy or most internationally connected who join NGOs. It is the same employees who hop from one NGO to another or from government to private agencies. Conversely in Pakistan, NGO sector boasts wealthier employees who are socially mobile at international level and our ‘Diplomatic Enclave’. Their lifestyle, perks, privileges and comfort take them away from abject realities of the lives of the

people they work for. Pakistani NGOs managers and owners have become virtually a shadow copy of their donors from the West.

Self-Preservation: Pakistani NGOs management engages in enhancing their persona, rather than the objectives and policies they espouse to project. Instead of being servants to the poor and oppressed, as they claim on their websites and in their missions, they have become privileged class of our society. One government official dealing with these NGOs at provincial level commented that, “many championing human rights come from elite backgrounds. They have very selective and limited membership base. They are a community of narrowly interested professionals or careerists. NGOs should be a medium of social justice or ideological movement. But it has become the specified language of choice professionals with its own rites and methods.”¹⁹ NGOs in Pakistan have become a money-spinning business. Even globally, the sacred human issues have become a certificate of privilege personality building with plenty of professional jobs.²⁰ NGOs with enormous funding and media attention have become exclusive phenomenon, especially in Islamabad.

Legitimacy of Pakistani NGOs

Democratic Dimension: Democracy has progressively grained into political values of Pakistani population. That is how one assesses the legitimacy of these organizations. However, many government institutions are also non-democratic but no criticism has ever been directed to those institutions. For example, Pakistanis do not question the legitimacy of religious institutions or private educational institutions. Similarly, there are many public companies, private companies, housing societies, transport agencies, semi government departments etc. that, though having undemocratic credentials, are legitimately accepted despite being undemocratic in character. While democracy is good as a value, it does not fit into the philosophy of the existence of this sector. Majority rule can mean tyranny of majority, exploitation of minorities, and so on. If NGOs follow

egalitarian procedures, they might cease to claim emancipation of women, protect racial factions, and speak for oppressed and voiceless minorities. Thus, the very value we look into the structure of NGOs for its legitimacy can be at tangent to its mission. Moreover, what will be their *raison d'être* in a democracy because there is already a government representing majority. Also, the cost of having membership and representation is expensive and therefore, unattainable for many smaller NGOs.²¹

The criticism does have a merit. Pakistani NGOs can buy public opinion by funding selectively. Pakistani people have frequently denounced NGOs as a means of cultural interventionism. While democracy and formal representation of people may not be possible, NGOs in Pakistan still need to be accountable for their claims to represent voiceless. These claims are thrust on government through popular media as and when NGOs attempt to lobby for a law or a policy or most importantly, for seeking foreign funding. They make such claims to bolster their legitimacy but in reality, those are mostly self-serving.

Accountability Dimension: NGO legitimacy and improved functioning need a transparent system of accountability. Well-financed NGOs are likely to have more power than their poorer counterparts, and the lack of accountability is likely to keep this power unchecked.²² Scholars advise that more than representation, accountability is necessary to assure that NGOs behave responsibly and ethically. NGOs can willingly ignore the “big picture” as they are more interested in the objectives linked with donor funding.²³ This goes against the public interest, meaning that people will not be helped on merit or based on their needs but as a consequence of political and financial battles in the arena of aid. An NGO in Lahore knew that women in villages are an important part of farming culture. Yet, it was foreign donors who asked it instead to teach these women to stitch clothes to alleviate their poverty. Another Gujranwala based NGO did a similar thing for the village women and instead, went to improve their adult literacy rates. Some NGOs end up working

against the very interest of the people they support due to their limited knowledge of its beneficiaries and lack of accountability to them. Inadvertently, they end up harming people while they think they are helping them. An NGO was paid for releasing women held in bonded labour. The outcome was more women in bonded labour as it suited the ulterior motives of the kiln owners and labour women both.²⁴ Similarly, NGOs helped people on both sides of the war, providing aid to both victim and terrorists during current American war on Afghanistan. Boutros-Ghali has been on record to ask NGOs to pay due attention to the politics in aid to peacekeeping missions. This takes a cue from the phrase that it is perfectly acceptable to lie for a good cause. There are unlimited accounts of NGOs engaging in lies and other unethical practices.²⁵ Many NGOs have adopted this as their main philosophy.

Financial accountability is extremely necessary. People of Pakistan lack trust in NGOs because NGOs have been reported to pocket money meant for projects. It is also because their leaders are very wealthy and public perception is that they are rich through stealing money meant for them.²⁶ NGOs being accountable to their beneficiaries mean projects that produce sustainable benefits. An official succinctly sums up that “NGOs go for small projects lasting ridiculously for short periods, have no serious long-term vision, are not transparent and are designed by their foreign masters. Delays in projects go in their favour as it means pays and perks for longer time. They create a friendly auditing and a weak monitoring system. While reviewing projects, they interview those whom they have provided financial benefits and not the targets of the project”.²⁷

Neoliberal Dimension: NGOs in Pakistan rely on government and foreign funding to act on their missions. This is true for other countries, both developed and developing, like America, Sri Lanka, Nepal, Kenya, and Bangladesh. This dependency compromises the very features that provide independence and freedom of action to NGOs. UN does the same for of its NGOs to facilitate their support to host

countries.²⁸ However, by selecting NGOs for funding, the UN influences the ideologies and politics of the host nations.²⁹ To get money from UN, Pakistani NGOs are ever inclined to adapt their schemes to echo UN thoughts, whether it is in the interest of their beneficiaries or not. UN also uses its funding clout by offering pleasure international junkets to NGOs managers.

Funding from private donors is also problematic as they carve up the territory and fiefdoms. The pressure on local NGOs is thus enormous to mimic donor behaviour and rhetoric.³⁰ Pakistani NGOs hunt for shards of the foreign aid which is controlled through foreign embassies in Islamabad. Some, who survive on specific donor money, start behaving and thinking like their donors. This results in conformity of planned projects, and causes visible rivalry among Pakistani NGOs. Then they indulge in bad governance practices confronting and blaming other NGOs which are their competitors.³¹ Power is sought and gained through funding and consumed to obtain funding. Those who advocate speaking for marginalized have been marginalized by the 'big fish and made voiceless.'³² Thus, big NGOs in Pakistan dominate not only the domestic policy making but also international dialogues by thrusting their agenda.

There is a sever struggle between NGOs for "breaking news" to prey funds. NGO names have become brands. Name in Islamabad has real value. Donations and government grants come with infamy. Looking objectively, it is not bad to have vibrant media coverage. But this has led to exaggerated claims of transgression and bigoted press on a single issue at the expense of other more pressing issues.

Accreditation: Exercise of power by NGO must be legitimate and made accountable. Government thus has to intervene to establish a system to implement it. Pakistan has many laws under which various NGOs have registered to claim legitimacy. Government has also created few structures at public and private level to accredit NGOs. While government merely boasts a redundant bureaucratic structure (Trust for

Voluntary Organizations, TVO), one elitist NGO called Pakistan Center of Philanthropy (PCP) exists only to accredit, but simultaneously to promote its own interests. Most of such accreditations are merely to evade income tax liabilities. PCP somehow has been provided with a questionable mandate by Pakistani tax authorities to be a certifying agency to get income tax incentives. Many organizations who have not opted for this certification process, view PCP itself as an illegitimate mechanism of certification. NGO certifying another NGO can potentially turn into an unholy alliance for corruption. Amazingly, leadership of PCP itself was part of a funded study which recommends creation of such a certifying agency. One is thus not surprised to note that only few NGOs currently hold “certification” from PCP.

Conclusion

Are NGOs something good for Pakistan and considered legitimate by people? This remains a very difficult question as the perceptions are on both extremes. It is mainly the beneficiaries of this phenomenon who are very enthusiastic about these organizations. Such beneficiaries include people serving in these organizations, with deep acknowledgement and support coming from the NGOs leaders and managers. However, there is resentment and censure of NGOs originating from the middle and upper middle class citizens, academia, media and government agencies who look at these organizations very suspiciously. Such scepticism does have its root in the American War on Terror in Afghanistan. It gets practically manifested in the violent reactions to some NGO programmes especially in KP.

Looking at output side, perhaps these organizations are considered to provide more benefits than their discernable costs. This is a rationalistic view, as people think they get something without paying for it. This provides a prima facie legitimacy to these organizations. The negative answers are serious but are considered to be manageable. If serious efforts are made to tap potential of these organizations, the threats that they face to their legitimacy can easily be addressed. Both

NGOs and civil society might have to relook at their attitudes. Especially, NGOs will have to look for measures of coexistence with local, provincial and federal governments in Pakistan. It would enable both the partners to gain from each other.

Pakistan needs NGOs that are professional and committed to indigenous culture and philosophies. Such NGOs should have a very motivated team to head and manage these organizations instead of making it a family business. This sector must draw in volunteers who do not make NGOs as their vocation. Pakistani NGOs also need to reflect high standards of transparency, accountability and representation to be accepted as legitimate providers of collective goods. If Pakistani NGOs start paying attention to resolve these problems, they will not have to look towards foreign donors as Pakistanis are one of the leading philanthropic nations in the world. It will enable them to play important roles not only at national but also international levels.

Notes

¹Brown, D., Jagadananda (2007) "Civil Society Legitimacy and Accountability: Issues and Challenges", CIVICUS, 2007, 43 p.

²Kovach, H., Neligan, C., Burall, S. (2003). *Power without Accountability?* London: One World Trust, Global Accountability Project

³Nomi, K. (2003) "Bush to NGOs: Watch Your Mouths," Globe and Mail, Canada: June 20, 2003.

⁴Mathews, J. (1997) "Power Shift", Foreign Affairs 50, 63.

⁵Stanley Foundation, (1999) "The United Nations and Civil Society: The Role of NGOs" -Report of the Thirtieth UN Issues Conference, February 19-21

⁶Director APWA (2013) Author Interview with, on March 15, 2013

⁷Snyder, S (2005) "NGO Joint Statement on the Secretary General's Proposed Human Rights Council" April 18, 2005

⁸Newspaper "The Dawn" Sunday Magazine Published on May 25, 2014

⁹Mertus, J, (2009) *From Legal Transplants to Transformative Justice: American University International Law Review*. 1335, 1372-73

¹⁰Archer, R. (2003) "Deserving Trust: Issues of Accountability for Human Rights NGOs, (April 2003)

¹¹Johan, H (2014) Author discussion with , Program Manager at an INGO in Islamabad: September 19, 2014

- ¹²Mertus, J. (1999)“*From Legal Transplants to Transformative Justice*” American University International Law Review. 1335, 1373-74
- ¹³Supra Note 12
- ¹⁴Mehmood, K. (2014) Author discussion with, Beneficiary of a missionary NGO in a local slum in Islamabad. August 17, 2014
- ¹⁵Univ, P. (2014) Human Rights and Development 100-01
- ¹⁶Hussain T. (2013) Author Discussion with, NGO ‘Nashaiman’ Waziarabad: June 15, 2013
- ¹⁷Aqsa, M (2014) Author Interview with, Tahrik-I- Niswan, Karachi April 26, 2014
- ¹⁸Gary, J. (2013) “*The NGO Challenge: Whose Democracy is it Anyway*” presented paper at American Enterprise Institute Conference, June 11, 2003
- ¹⁹Director(2014) Author Discussion with, Social Welfare Department, (anonymity) Lahore: September 15, 2014
- ²⁰McDougall, G. (2004)“*A Decade in Human Rights Law: Decade of NGO Struggle*” 11 HUM. RT. BR. 12, 15
- ²¹Deserving Trust: Issues of Accountability for the Human Rights NGOs , Report for Consultation, April 2003
- ²²Supra Note 18
- ²³Id
- ²⁴EDO (2014) Author Discussion with, Social Welfare of Hafizabad January 21, 2014
- ²⁵UN Press Releases (2012), NGO/296, PI/1029 PI/1272 etc August 28, 2012
- ²⁶ During my interviews, expensive restaurants were a favorite rendezvous of NGO people
- ²⁷ Author interview with senior government officer in Ministry of Economic Affairs, Islamabad, October 18, 2014
- ²⁸Report of the Panel of Eminent Persons on United Nations–Civil Society Relations, We the peoples: civil society, the United Nations and global governance, A/58/817 June 11, 2004
- ²⁹NGO Participation in the World Conference Funding Process, www.igc.org/igc/gateway/arn/worldconf
- ³⁰Supra Note 20
- ³¹Supra Note 20
- ³²Supra Note 18