



NDU JOURNAL

2009

**Selected papers by faculty and
members of the courses at the
National Defence University**

National Defence University
Sector E-9, Islamabad
www.ndu.edu.pk

NDU Journal

Institute for Strategic Studies, Research & Analysis
National Defence University, Islamabad

Editorial Board

Lieutenant General Muhammad Yousaf	Chairman
Major General Azhar Ali Shah	Member
Rear Admiral Khan Hasham Bin Saddique	Member
Major General Syed Tariq Nadeem Gilani	Member
Brigadier Muhammad Feyyaz	Member

Editor	:	Brigadier Muhammad Feyyaz
Deputy Editor	:	Lieutenant Colonel Dr Saif ur Rehman
Assistant Editor	:	Mr. Abdul Rauf Iqbal

Advisory Board

Ambassador N. A. Shaikh	Former Foreign Secretary Pakistan
Dr. Pervaiz Iqbal Cheema	Dean FCS, NDU Islamabad
Lt Gen T.W. Ghazi (Retd)	Former Secretary Defence Pakistan
Dr. Rodney W. Jones	President Policy Architects Int's USA
Dr. Marvin G. Weinbaum	Scholar in Residence, Middle East
Mr. Bluent Karadeniz	Director of Department Center for Strategic Research MOFA Turkey

NDU Journal is sponsored and edited by the Institute for Strategic Studies, Research & Analysis, National Defence University, Sector E-9, Islamabad, Pakistan.

Statement of fact or opinion appearing in NDU Journal are solely those of the authors and do not imply endorsement by the editors or publishers.

Manuscripts and editorial communications should be directed to editor at the address above. More information for contributors is available at the NDU website.

Website: <http://www.ndu.edu.pk>

Email: disp@ndu.edu.pk

NDU Journal

NDU Journal

Subscription for one copy

- Inland Rs. 200/-
- Overseas US \$ 25/-

Requests for subscription may be addressed to:

Editor, NDU Journal

National Defence University, Sector E-9, Islamabad, Pakistan

Website: <http://www.ndu.edu.pk>

Email: disp@ndu.edu.pk

ISSN: 2073-0926

**Published Annually by
National Defence University
Islamabad, Pakistan**



National Defence University
Sector E-9, Islamabad
www.ndu.edu.pk

CONTENTS

	Page No
• Summaries	i
• Democracy in Muslim World - Myth or Reality <i>Air Commodore Farooq Habib</i>	1
• Existing Education System of Pakistan Psycho-social and Socio-economic Effects <i>Lieutenant Colonel Muhammad Aamer</i>	13
• Globalization: Challenges for Pakistan <i>Air Commodore Shahid Latif Bajwa</i>	32
• Nexus of Nuclear Proliferation <i>Lieutenant Colonel Dr. Muhammad Khan</i>	61
• Subcontinent Security and its Impact on World Security: Challenges and the Way Forward <i>Lieutenant Colonel Sahir Shamshad Mirza</i>	82

Summaries

Democracy in Muslim World - Myth or Reality

P-1

Air Commodore Farooq Habib

The world has witnessed a rapid wave of democratisation, especially since later half of the last century; the Muslim world has been comparatively slower in this transformation. Topical issue is definition and approaches to orchestrate democracy. The diagnosis suggests dismal state of democratization attributed to poor socio-economic indicators along with authoritative state structures and absence of a vibrant civil society warranting focused deliberations in these spheres by Muslim countries.

Existing Education System of Pakistan Psycho-Social and Socio-Economic Effects

P-13

Lieutenant Colonel Muhammad Aamer

Education is a source to liberalize minds through softening the prejudices. Pakistan's education system faces inherent structural problems such as colonial legacy, value absent syllabi, linearity, lack of clear direction. Suggested changes should encompass entire spectrum of education from primary through secondary and higher education and training of trainers. Finally, sustainable growth in the country has direct relation with the quality education.

Globalization: Challenges for Pakistan

P-32

Air Commodore Shahid Latif Bajwa

Globalization has interpretative and structural implications. Understanding the notion and its impact from developing world's perspective is essential. To harness optimum opportunities by globalization, good governance, professionalism and expansion of knowledge base are imperatives for a country like Pakistan. Several options are available ranging from complete integration to non-integration. Changes in domestic environment, social processes and systems are called for to become meaningfully globalised.

Nexus of Nuclear Proliferation

P-61

Lieutenant Colonel Dr. Muhammad Khan

Non nuclear weapons states (NNWS) come under criticism for proliferation and not signing the Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty (NPT). Indeed, P-5 have followed the American suit in nuclear proliferation. Prejudiced application of rights to access to nuclear energy sources and disarmament has marred universality of global treaties. Non-proliferation regime is considered discriminatory. Determining a way forward for the realisation of goals set by the non-proliferation regime is complex process, necessitating a lead role by global powers especially US.

**Subcontinent Security and its Impact on World Security:
Challenges and the Way Forward**

P-82

Lieutenant Colonel Sahir Shamshad Mirza

Sub-continent finds its significance both among the poorest and resource rich regions of the world. Its peculiar geo-political and geo-strategic setting makes it unique in global security milieu. There is a need to reassess its security challenges during current century, harmonise policies to optimally benefit from human and natural resource sprawl, induce extra-regional stakes and involvement for resolving conflicts and harnessing shared goal of development and progress.

DEMOCRACY IN MUSLIM WORLD - MYTH OR REALITY

Air Commodore Farooq Habib

Introduction

In spite of the disagreement over its definition, “Democracy”, is today regarded as the most accepted way of governing a country. While the world has witnessed a rapid wave of democratisation, especially since later half of the last century, the Muslim world has been comparatively slower in this transformation¹.

There exists no consensus, however, on the approaches and techniques to accurately measure the content and quality of democracy in a country². The divergence arises from the differences in the basic definition of democracy, which varies from the minimalist to more elaborate forms. A model following the minimalist definition is given by “Freedom House”, a leading NGO working for promotion of democracy, which measures “**electoral democracy**” in a country based on following minimum criteria.

- A competitive, multiparty political system.
- Universal adult suffrage.
- Regularly contested elections conducted on the basis of secret ballots, reasonable ballot security and the absence of massive voter fraud.
- Significant public access of major political parties to the electorate through the media and through generally open campaigning.

Similarly, there exist other models based on more elaborate definition of democracy – also sometimes referred as “liberal democracy”. One such model is given by Robert Dahl, who calls it “Polyarchy”. The essential conditions for his model include³:

- The mandate to run the government is constitutionally vested in elected officials.

- The elected officials are chosen through frequently held fair and transparent elections
- The right of vote to practically every adult.
- Practically all adult have a right to run for the elective offices.
- Citizens have the right to express themselves freely on the political matters without the fear of any severe punishment.
- Sources of alternative information exist and the citizens have the right to seek it.
- Citizens have the freedom to form associations, parties, including political, and interest groups.

The first four indices cited by Robert Dahl constitute, effectively, the criteria of electoral democracy given by Freedom House, whereas, the last three are reflective of the status of civil liberties and political rights in very basic, but measurable, form. All together, this represents a balanced model to test the status of democracy, both electoral and liberal, in the Muslim World. In our subsequent analysis, we will employ the same model.

Status of Democracy in Muslim Countries

Political systems in Muslim countries vary greatly. In the following paragraphs, these systems are analysed in context of the criteria of electoral and liberal democracy established earlier. However, due to limited space, a detailed study of only three countries is made, while the others are covered regionally.

Malaysia

- **Electoral Democracy in Malaysia.** Malaysia is a federal parliamentary monarchy, with Prime Minister as head of the government, and King as head of the State with only ceremonial powers⁴. Having inherited parliamentary system from the British, it has been having regular elections throughout the last decades⁵, under universal adult suffrage and multi-party system. However, since independence, the United

Malays National Organisation (UMNO), has held the power although in a coalition. The elections in Malaysia have been generally free of massive vote frauds, however the government is blamed for manipulation of electoral boundaries in favour of ruling coalition⁶. There have been complaints, regarding use of state machinery by the ruling coalition, and presence of “phantom voters”⁷, in the elections, though; the reported severity and magnitude of these problems have not been too significant⁸.

- **Political Rights and Civil Liberties.** The ambit of political and civil rights is large, however its study in this paper is limited to the provisions included in Dahl’s model i.e. freedom of expression, alternative information and associational autonomy⁹. The Malaysian Human Rights Commission identifies a multitude of laws, which inhibit political and civil rights of the people. These include the Police Act, which restricts the assembly of people, the Internal Security Act (ISA), which allows detention without trial, and the Printing Presses and Publication Act, which inhibits the media freedom¹⁰. The government is accused of discriminatory use of these laws¹¹. The opposition parties also blame the pro-government mainstream media for unfair treatment and limited access¹². The government is also blamed for selective use of constitutional provision to allow registration of political parties. One of the most serious challenges to civil rights is the practice of arbitrary arrests and detention¹³, and the treatment meted out to former Deputy PM Anwar Ibrahim is a case in point¹⁴.
- **Summary.** Malaysia has made considerable progress on path of democracy and certainly fulfils the necessary conditions of electorate democracy. Notwithstanding, some valid objections to its credentials as liberal democracy, there is certainly positive movement towards that goal as well.

Turkey

- **Electoral Democracy in Turkey.** Turkey follows a parliamentary system, with Prime Minister as the head of the government. Since 1946, Turkey has undergone 15 general elections, which are now contested between more than 20 parties, represented by thousands of candidates¹⁵. The political parties have free access to media and there are no substantive allegations on the free and fair nature of the elections. Such performance leave little doubt about Turkey's status as genuine electoral democracy.
- **Liberal Democracy in Turkey.** The historical dominant political role of military, which has intervened four times, including three direct coups, impinges upon the political rights situation in Turkey. However, the constitutional amendments, adopted in May 2004, demonstrate the gradually diminishing role of military. Most importantly, the National Security Council (consisting of five military representatives), which was once seen as a board of necessity, is now seen as just an advisory board¹⁶. Criticism is also levied on the Turkish governments for continuing with article 301 of the penal code, which sets out punishment for people guilty of speaking on sensitive topics¹⁷. The constitutional article was amended in April last year but its basic provisions remain substantially unaltered. The Government has also made considerable legislative changes called Harmonization Law Packages, which received wide praise from the EU.¹⁸ Turkey has ratified a number of human rights treaties since 1999, and has introduced many legislative reforms, such as setting up human rights monitoring bodies in government ministries¹⁹.
- **Summary.** Turkey, in spite of frequent military interventions, has firmly remained on the path of democratization. A legacy of peaceful transfers of

power through regular elections, qualifies Turkey as an electoral democracy. The diminishing role of military and gradual assertion of civilian government combined with profound and far-reaching changes in social, political and cultural dimensions, qualifies Turkey as a liberal democracy also.

Egypt

- **Electoral Democracy in Egypt.** Egypt remained a monarchy after its independence until the military coup by Nasser in 1952. Subsequently, a strong presidential system was established, which continues to date. The elections, supervised by interior ministry rather than independent commission, are held regularly. These have been consistently won by National Democratic Party (NDP) with more than two third majorities. Obviously, these elections are alleged by the opposition and the independent observers to be massively rigged²⁰. The local elections also present a similar picture. The government candidates swept the local elections in April 2008, after 80% of the opposition candidates were banned from contesting²¹. Hosni Mubarak has been winning the presidential elections, now six times in row, since 1982, amidst massive allegations of use of power to own advantage²².
- **Egypt as a Liberal Democracy.** While a multi party system exists in Egypt, there are severe restrictions on forming new parties.²³ A level playing field is denied to the opposition by use of strict laws. They are allowed limited time on electronic media, in contrast to ruling party.²⁴ Workers in Egypt are allowed to form unions, but the state exerts significant influence over these through various legal restrictions. Human Rights Watch in 2005 and Amnesty International in 2006 reported the routine use of torture, mistreatment of political prisoners and ordinary citizens, and custodial deaths²⁵.

- **Summary.** Strong presidential rule, suspect elections, complete dominance of the ruling party in the political system, and a continuing state of emergency severely undermine the democratic credentials of the state. Consequently, Egypt, does not qualify the minimum conditions for even an electorate democracy.

The Arab World and the Middle East. The Arab world consists of 19 countries located in Asia and Africa. Large differences of historical experience, socio-economic development and the natural resources have impacted the political and cultural landscape of these countries. On the whole, however, the region is not identified with credible democratic practices. Middle East in fact, is considered “exceptional in its resistance to political liberalization, respect for human rights and formal democratic practice²⁶”. While in general, the region is subjected to authoritarian regimes, the characteristics, as indeed, the degrees of authoritarianism differ significantly. For instance, a large number of these countries are ruled by monarchs who exercise enormous executive power. Saudi Arabia, is one such example, having no meaningful legislature, no political parties and no written constitution²⁷. Some monarchies are relatively liberal like Oman, Morocco, Bahrain, Kuwait and Jordan, where the rulers have taken significant steps including elections, (mostly non-party) and formation of a legislative council. Morocco among these has the longest record of multi-party elections, yet, whenever the king's men risked losing, the king dissolved the assembly and changed the rules²⁸. However, such small, half-hearted measures do not indicate any progress towards democratization, as long as the executive power remains with the monarchs. Thus, all that can be said of Arab rulers who liberalize is that at best they are enlightened autocrats, in comparison to those who are only absolute autocrats²⁹. The media too, in all these countries remain in control of the governments and there is hardly a voice of dissent. Within the Arab world, there are countries which have a parliamentary system in place, but there is no real alternative available to the voter to express his choice, either because there exists only a single party like Syria and Libya, or even if a multi party scenario exists, like Yemen, Egypt, Algeria, Sudan

and Tunisia, the domination of the ruling party is so complete that possibility of replacement of the regime does not exist³⁰. There also exists within the Arab states a very small group, including Lebanon and Palestine, which does conform to various institutional requirements of democracy including a multi-party system, relatively free and fair elections and change of governments. Ironically, however, the country with best democratic credentials in the region i.e. Iran, continues to draw the most criticism from the West, while others enjoy friendly relations with the same.

The Central Asia. The Central Asian Republics inherited authoritarian regimes after breaking up from Soviet Union. Little progress has been made ever since with regards to democracy. However, within the CARs, the degree of totalitarianism differs. Kyrgyzstan follows a system which is closest to democracy, however there too; the legislative branch is under significant control of the government³¹. Thus, overall the region remains devoid of any democratic credentials.

The South and South East Asia. The region includes the three most populous Islamic countries including Indonesia, Pakistan and Bangladesh. These countries have constitutions, legislatures and political parties, yet their record of democracy has remained chequered.³² A common feature is the presence of strong politically dominant military, with history of direct and indirect interventions. Though, there are positive signs now in most of these countries, the process remains slow and susceptible to halts.

Summary. Democratization has thus, remained a weaker impulse in Muslim countries, and even the recent wave of democratization³³ in the world has not been able to make profound changes in their political systems. Four distinct groups can be identified in the Muslim world with regards to democratization. Firstly, a very small group including countries like Turkey and Malaysia, with significant democratic credentials. The second group includes countries which have chequered record of democracy like Pakistan, Bangladesh and Indonesia - their democratic progress being halted frequently by military coups. However, these countries continue to show potential and prospects for democratization. The

third group consists of regimes, especially in the Arab world; including, Morocco, Bahrain, Jordan and Kuwait, which despite their autocratic character are trying to decentralize and liberalize without being ready yet to transfer the power. And, finally, we have countries like Saudi Arabia, which are almost stagnant on their authoritative positions, showing no signs of conceding to the call of democratization. All in all, it is a varying picture - rather bleak when compared with the non-Muslim countries, but promising indeed, in the context of past record.

Explaining the Deficit of Democracy in Muslim Countries

Various factors are cited by writers³⁴, which tend to affect the democratization process in a country. The relevance of these factors to the prevailing environments in Muslim world is discussed in preceding to find an explanation of their dismal democratic performance.

Modernization Theory - Relevance to Muslim World.

“Modernization” or socio-economic development is often cited as the main factor which propels societies toward democratic forms of governance³⁵. Within the various socio-economic indices, the academics have differed in choosing the ones which matter most. The Muslim world in general has disappointing socio-economic indices, including overall low per capita income, literacy rates and health indicators. The modernization theory thus, figures out prominently in explaining some of the democracy deficit in Muslim countries. The oil rich Gulf countries, which have one of the poorest democratic records in spite of high income, present an interesting exception. The fact that the major benefit from the oil revenue is accrued to the state which tends to increase its power and wealth vis-à-vis its citizens is often cited as an explanation to this exception³⁶.

The Cultural Theory - Relevance to Muslim World.

Scholars such as Huntington considers various cultures, including Islam, as averse to democracy³⁷. Other writers like Fukuyama, have dispelled the culture-specific theory of democracy.³⁸ In some ways however, the culture attains importance while analyzing

democratization in Muslim countries. Democracy, generally takes roots in a society which has strong political identity and a sense of affinity amongst the citizens which surpasses other loyalties³⁹. Muslim countries today, in many ways, suffer from identity crises. The allegiance to tribes, sects, ethnicities, even ideologies such as Pan Islamism etc, create an identity issue within states, inhibiting the growth of democratic culture. This also explains the fact that countries with a strong sense of nationalism like Turkey, and Iran have performed better than most Middle Eastern countries, which seem to lack this feature. Democracy also requires tolerance, a willingness to listen to other's viewpoint, and acceptance of one's defeat in a democratic process. Forces of extremism, hard-line and stubbornness, which are commonly found in Muslim countries today, thus tend to obstruct the process of democratization.

State and Political Institutions – Relevance to Muslim World. A powerful state, or over dominance of a state in relation to the civil society tends to impede democratization process⁴⁰. Usually, such dominance implies state control over most valued economic opportunities, prompting corruption, nepotism and mismanagement of public funds⁴¹. With such high financial stakes associated with government, the ruling elite become reluctant to relinquish power and participate in democratic competition.

Powerful Military – Relevance to Muslim World. Powerful and politically dominant military presents a significant impediment to process of democracy⁴². In the Muslim majority countries we have ample examples of military domination in the politics, which has impeded the process of democratization in these countries.

Strong Civil Society – Relevance to Muslim World. A robust civil society is considered an important instrument against the authoritative tendencies of the rulers⁴³. Strong autonomous groups and social movements also tend to attract media attention which in turn can bring pressure to bear on authoritative regimes⁴⁴. Traditionally, the Muslim countries have lacked the element of a vibrant civil society. Partly, it is owed to the cultural tradition of respecting the authority of state, and partly due to the lack of self

awareness due to limited exposure to modern education and influences.

Conclusion

The process of democratization in the world has gathered momentum in the post cold war era. Definitional dilemmas of democracy however continue, as the academics attempt to grapple between a minimalist and maximalist approach.

Even based on the minimalist definition, the status of democracy in the Muslim majority countries does not look impressive. Degree of democratization, of course varies from country to country, and on that basis, four groups can be identified. On one hand, there are countries like Malaysia and Turkey, which are consolidating their significant progress in democratisation. The second group consists of countries like Pakistan, Bangladesh and Indonesia, where democracy has been present but in an unsteady state, and they would take time to consolidate democratic traditions. The third group consists of countries, especially in Arab World like Jordan and Morocco that have started to decentralize and liberalize, without allowing meaningful elections which can accomplish a transfer of power. These countries are still far away from qualifying even for the minimum definition of democracy. And finally, there is the group of authoritarian regimes like Saudi Arabia, which disallow even little decentralization, and continue to function without any participation from the people.

Poor socio-economic indicators, especially with regards to education, cultural tendencies, powerful state structure with large public sector, presence of strong, politically dominant military and absence of a vibrant civil society are some of the salient factors which explain the dismal state of democratisation in Muslim world. The deficit in democracy in the Muslim countries is likely to persist, at least for some years, as no perceptible change in the prevailing environments is foreseen. However, the fact that some predominantly Muslim nations have achieved relatively respectable degrees of political freedom suggests that this deficit may not be a permanent condition.

Notes

- ¹ David Potter, "Explaining Democratization", in *Democratization* ed. David Goldblatt and others (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1997), 1.
- ² Laza Kekic, "The Economist Intelligence Unit's Index of Democracy", Annual Report by Economist Intelligence Unit (London: Economist Intelligence Unit, 2007),1.
- ³ Robert Dahl, *Democracy and its Critics* (Yale University press, 1989), 221.
- ⁴ Rainer Heufers, "The Politics of Democracy Malaysia", in *Asien Number 85* (October 2002): 41-44.
- ⁵ Ibid, 40.
- ⁶ Ibid, 48.
- ⁷ John Funston, "Malaysia's Tenth Elections: Status Quo, Reformasi or Islamization?" in *Contemporary Southeast Asia*, Vol.22, No.1, (April 2000):23-59.
- ⁸ Human Rights Commission of Malaysia (Sukaham), *Annual Report*, (Kuala Lumpur: Suhakam, 2007), 8.
- ⁹ Robert Dahl, *Democracy and its Critics* (Yale University press, 1989), 221.
- ¹⁰ Human Rights Commission of Malaysia (Sukaham), *Annual Report*, (Kuala Lumpur: Suhakam, 2007), 14.
- ¹¹ RS. Milne and Diane K Mauzy, *Malaysian Politics under Mahatir*, (London : Routledge, 1999), 105.
- ¹² Sanjeev Miglani, "Malaysian Elections. Are They Fair?" *Reuters*, 6 March 2008.
- ¹³ Suaram, *Civil and Political Rights Report of Malaysia*, (Kuala Lumpur: Suaram, 2008), 6.
- ¹⁴ Rainer Heufers, "The Politics of Democracy Malaysia", *Asien 85. (October 2002):53*.
- ¹⁵ Cengiz Candar, "Redefining Turkey's Political center, *Journal of Democracy* , Number 7 (October 99), 129
- ¹⁶ Gunes Tezcur. "Turkey Divided: Politics Faith and Democracy" 1 *EurActiv* June 2007.
- ¹⁷ Reporters Without Borders, *Annual Report*, (Paris: Reporters Without Borders, 2007).
- ¹⁸ Huseyin Alaz, "What is being done on Human Rights and Democracy in Turkey", in *Confronting the Challenges of Democracy in 21st Century* - fourth Assembly held in Istanbul, 2-5 April, 2006, by the World Movement on Democracy (Istanbul: World Movement of Democracy).
- ¹⁹ Ibid.
- ²⁰ Nazih N Ayubi, *Over- Stating the Arab State.*(London : I.B Tauris, 1995), 417.
- ²¹ Issaka K. Souaré, "Egypt, the Political Process between Opening Up and Control", *Situation Report*, 9 April 2008 by Institute of Security Studies, South Africa (Pretoria: Institute of Security Studies),1.
- ²² Amr Hamzawy, "Opposition in Egypt" in *Policy Outlook No 22, October 2005* by Carnegie Endowment for Peace, (Washington, DC : Carnegie Endowment for Peace, 2005),1.
- ²³ Ibid, 227.
- ²⁴ Ibid, 227.

- ²⁵ Freedom House, *Annual Country Report, Egypt*, (Washington: Freedom House, 2007).
- ²⁶ G Salame, ed. *Democracy Without Democrats*. (London: IB Tauris, 1994), 23.
- ²⁷ Nazih N Ayubi, "Islam and Democracy" in *Democratization* ed. David Goldblatt and others, (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1997), 356.
- ²⁸ Rein Taagepera, "Prospects for Democracy in Muslim Countries" in *Conference on Development, Democracy and the Islamic World*, held on 7 March 2003, by Center for the Study of Democracy, University of California, (California : Centre for the Study of Democracy, 2003), 5.
- ²⁹ Mohib Zaki, "Civil Society and Democratization in Arab World", in *Annual Report 2007* by Ibn Khaldun Center for Development of Studies, (Cairo: Ibn Khaldun Center for Development of Studies, 2007), 7.
- ³⁰ Alfred Stepan and Graeme Robertson in "An Arab More than Muslim Electorate" in *Journal of Democracy* Volume 14, Number 3 (July 2003), 39.
- ³¹ Natalia Zotova, "Evolution of Political Regimes in Central Asia: Ways and Opportunities", *Ferghana Rus Information Agency, Moscow*, 07, March, 2007.
- ³² Vali Nasr, "The Rise of Muslim Democracies" in *Journal of Democracy*, Volume 16, Number 2 (April 2005), 14.
- ³³ David Potter, "Explaining Democratization" in *Democratization*, ed. David Goldblatt and others, (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1997), 9.
- ³⁴ *Ibid*, 24.
- ³⁵ Nazih N Ayubi, *Over- Stating the Arab State*, (London : I.B Tauris, 1995), 399.
- ³⁶ Samuel Huntington, *The Third Wave: Democratization in the Late Twentieth Century*, (Norman : University of Oklahoma Press 1991),65.
- ³⁷ *Ibid*, 298.
- ³⁸ Francis Fukuyama, "Democracy and End of History Revisited" in *Journal of Democracy* Volume 12, Number 3, (April 2000), 119.
- ³⁹ Axel Hadenius, *Democracy and Development*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 1992), 112.
- ⁴⁰ David Potter, "Explaining Democratization", in *Democratization* ed. David Goldblatt and others (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1997), 27.
- ⁴¹ Axel Hadenius, *Democracy and Development* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 1992), 135.
- ⁴² *Ibid*,138.
- ⁴³ David Potter, "Explaining Democratization", in *Democratization* ed. David Goldblatt and others, (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1997), 28.
- ⁴⁴ *Ibid*, 28.

EXISTING EDUCATION SYSTEM OF PAKISTAN PSYCHO - SOCIAL AND SOCIO- ECONOMIC EFFECTS

Lieutenant Colonel Muhammad Aamer

Introduction

Education is a source to liberalize¹ minds through softening the prejudices – whether religious, political, linguistic or ethnic. It must enable an individual to live creatively. This establishes a relationship between basic purpose of education, the basic life tasks and basic life skills. Another virtue of education is the achievement of moral-spiritual self actualization of the individual, the family and the society. Education is a means to transfer traditions and practical knowledge to successive generations. Education is a societal concern and the system of education in a given society has a specific relationship with the nature of society itself.

Pakistan, being an ideological state, has peculiar requirements for education². These obligations can only be performed if our educational system is focused and thriving. Moreover, fast pace of technological development in the last few decades further highlights the need for an educational system which has a futuristic outlook with its roots in the ideological moorings. If we analyze the existing educational system of Pakistan in the above mentioned prologue, we realize that problems of education in Pakistan are many and varied. This paper explores the concept of education along with its relationship with Pakistani society, religion, culture and economy within this context, the aim of this paper is to highlight the psycho- social and socio- economic effects of existing education system of Pakistan. It also suggests measures for ensuring quality education which is vital for sustained growth in the country.

The paper is divided in the following four sections: 1) Education: The Concept; 2) The genesis of education system of Pakistan; 3) Contemporary educational systems; and 4) Structure and context of educational development: The Way Forward.

Education: The Concept

The word 'education' is derived from the Latin word 'educare' which literally means 'to bring out'. Thus education in a way, can mean the bringing out and the development of a mind. The best definition of education is the one given by the Holy Prophet Muhammad (SAS), in one of his favorite prayers as "O Creator – Sustainer: Allah! Grant us Ilm³" 'Ilm' in Arabic is not only information, knowledge or even wisdom. It is enlightenment which transforms one's entire personality and enables one to live a life which is full and fulfilling, integrated and integrative, complete and holistic, purposive and noble, peaceful and progressive.

Recent thinkers like Bertrand Russell believes that real education should aim at making people think and form their own opinion⁴. His ideas are inspired by Rousseau who believed in the free exercise of man's nature. While studying their ideas we must not forget that education is not possible in a social vacuum. In modern times when almost every thing is being judged in terms of economics, a school of thought advocates that aims and objectives of education can only be determined by particular demands of the society and the latter's capacity to consume and absorb trained manpower.

Education has a wider perspective which encompasses materialism and spiritualism, science and religion, reason and faith⁵. These are not at all conflicting requirements for a Muslim society. Our religion gives high importance to mankind's material needs and spiritual obligations. Within this context, educational system of Pakistan should be based on the acquisition of Knowledge, the development of moral values, a sense of social justice, along with the development of ability to tackle economic challenges.

It is generally believed that there is a close connection between education and morals as well as between education and religion. A strong conviction prevails that moral and religious teachings are essential to education. Morals deal with what ought to be done as opposed to what is done. Morality concerns actions which affect the interests and well being of others including

ourselves. The teaching of morals initiates a pupil into areas of knowledge. A strong version of this view is that the real value of these descriptions comes from their moral content. Another approach to this conclusion is that different disciplines teach us different ways of perceiving the world. Moral education influences human behavior positively and therefore moral training runs intellectual training⁶.

The connection between religion and education has been very strong⁷. For educationists like Froebel, education of a child was a matter of bringing out the divine pattern which was implicit in the child. An alternative view is that religion probably essential for education. It is so because religious dimension constitutes one of the forms of knowledge through which humans can make sense of both their world and experience. Religion is thus as important as science, mathematics and art as one way of structuring human experience and is necessary because without it, significant aspects of experience would be left uncared for.

All the important religions of the world regard education as the primary means to promote awareness and spread message of God to the mankind. The spirit of research and critical inquiry is encouraged by all the major religions of the world. Emphasis on observation, experimentation and critical analysis makes education equally important for followers of all the religions. This point shall be highlighted through objective analysis of major religions of the world.

Jewish education might be termed as some sort of a link between oriental and occidental systems. While its literature i.e Old Testament gives more opportunity for reflection and analysis, system of education followed by the Jews was non-progressive and placed minimal emphasis on development of science and art. Education was mostly restricted to the priestly class and was not open to the masses. Most of the teaching was done in temples, while regular schools were not organized.

Early Christians were more or less segregated because of the fear of persecution and ostracism. There was within these groups of

Christians a demand for instruction in the new religion. This led to the establishment of what were called "Cate-Chumenal" held generally in some part of the church buildings as portico. With the passage of time, they became cathedrals and with subsidization and patronage, they became more popular. Monastic education became popular in this period. During the same period, manuscripts were used to preserve literary activity. These schools imparted training in two spheres i.e lower studies including grammar, rhetoric and dialectics and higher studies including mathematics, geometry, music and astronomy.

The intellectual awakening known as renaissance (1400-1600) gave rise to a craze for study of classics. Scientific education developed rapidly during the seventeenth century. Europe and America have made steady progress in education and their development can solely be attributed to the system of education of these countries. Education has been made more attractive and useful by means of rotation and variation. Surveys and experimentation are constantly being made in these countries. One of the results of this activity is the social efficiency of the citizens of these countries.

Holy Prophet Hazrat Muhammad (SAS) was born in Arabia when it was going through its darkest period of history⁸. There was no organized system of education in Arabia. Holy Prophet revolutionized and inspired the people of Arabia. Teachings of Islam transformed not only Arabia but the entire world. One of the basic principles of Islam is the acquisition of knowledge. The first Muslim school was established in Medina in the Holy Mosque where a platform called "Suffa" was used for the purpose of imparting education during the day and a boarding house at night. The desire of the Holy Prophet (SAS) can be seen from the fact that when a few prisoners were taken in the battle of Badr, the ransom fixed for them was to take upon themselves the duty of teaching, reading and writing to the Muslim children.

Schools were established during the days of second caliph Hazrat Umar in all subjugated territories. By middle of the 8th century a regular system of elementary education was adopted.

These schools were generally attached to a mosque and had facilities like libraries and residential accommodation.

Muslim education received a great impetus during the days of Abbasides. They patronized cultural and social activities and there was an outburst of intellectual activity. Translation of ancient works was undertaken. Independent research was also given priority. Establishment of 'Al Azhar' and 'Dar-ul-Hikmat' at Cairo opened vistas for advanced studies and research. There was no set course or duration of learning. This method has also been adopted in modern times especially in United states. Muslims established Madrassahs in all parts of their empire including Europe. The universities of Cordova and Grenada were famous throughout the west⁹. In fact, renaissance in Europe became possible only because of knowledge originating from the world of Islam. The genesis and the aspiration for education in Islam transcends the narrower scope of other systems and concepts of education. We must have the wish to learn and to progress and to become scientifically and economically as efficient as other nations are.

The sociology of education may be defined as a study of relations between education and society. It concerns the educational aims, methods, institutions, administration and curricula of education vis-à-vis economic, political, religious, social and cultural forces of the society. Education creates awareness among the citizens regarding its organization or purpose as well as rights and duties¹⁰. Hence, education performs a dual purpose of preparing a person to achieve distinction in life and making him/her a contributing member of the society. Simultaneously, education has an important role to play in bringing about social changes. However, we need to understand that its role is secondary and it is only a technique used by people with a deliberate and conscious aim. Education is the process of preparing people to fit into complex social structures and to play particular roles as members of more than one institutional group. According to this view, sociology of education must consider / class and cultural composite forces i.e class inequality and schooling, race inequality and schooling, unequal life chances and different family background etcetera.

Culture, in the words of Ralph Linton, is the configuration of learned behavior, whose component elements are shared and transmitted by the members of a particular society¹¹. Thus, the aims and values of a society are also a part of its culture. The transmittance of cultural patterns is often stated as one of the functions of education. Understanding of a particular culture highlights the importance of early years of childhood in conditioning the personality. In this way, culture has a direct bearing on the aim and objectives of education.

Human nature and human personality are interactively at play in any educational system. Personality continues to develop through out our life span for self actualization / realization. Personality development for self actualization/ realization is a creative process which is spread over a life span. The core concern of education is to seek self realization creatively as an interactive and synergized activity. Education and learning become successful when cognition is internalized by the seekers and made integral to his/her personality in mental emotional and even spiritual terms.

The Genesis of Education System of Pakistan

Undoubtedly, future of any state depends greatly on the kind of education the youth receives. The system which we are following even today is the legacy of pre-portioned British India. Thus, it is a historical anachronism. It can hardly be expected to cater for the requirements of an independent, democratic state. In order to suggest changes in the system, it is imperative to study the prevailing system in detail.

The system of education followed in colonial India was introduced by the British primarily for producing clerks and subordinates who were necessary for carrying on the administration of the country in a colonial set up¹². This system of education was designed by lord Macaulay. Essence of this system is better explained in the words of Lord Macaulay himself, "we want Indians in colour but Englishmen in taste and aptitude." At least, that was the objective in the initial stages after replacement of Persian by English as the court language in 1835.

In order to objectively evaluate the education system of Pakistan, it is imperative to understand the pros and cons of the existing system and view the progress/ changes which were made in the last six decades. Despite the colossal problems which Pakistan faced on the eve of independence, the educational aspect was given the foremost priority and an all Pakistan Educational Conference was convened in November 1947, to consider the re-organization of the educational system. Later, in 1952, a six year National Plan of Educational Development for Pakistan was prepared.

From 1958-1970, student unrest and politicization of educational institutions were the major problems which Pakistan faced. Special commissions were set up to improve the standard of education. However, system of education did not emphasize moral, religious and ideological aspects. One of the major causes of dismal performance in the education sector was that meager resources were allocated for the development of education.

The period from 1970-1978 saw nationalization of all educational institutions. Adult literacy drive was initiated as well¹³. An effort was made to bring uniformity in the curriculum and method of teaching in Madrassas, government schools and private educational institutions. The establishment of Universities Grant Commission and National Book Foundation were the major achievements of this period. However, education system suffered due to political instability and economic crisis which Pakistan faced.

From 1979-1989, the Afghan war and subsequent drive of Islamization affected the system of education as well. During this era, major changes in syllabi were made. Madrassa education was encouraged and learning of Arabic was made compulsory upto class VIII. Efforts were made to orientate the system of education towards ideological moorings and subjects of Pakistan Studies and Islamiat were made compulsory upto intermediate level. However, parallel system of education such as curricula of English medium schools continued. On the whole, preferred goals of education were not fully realized.

From 1990-9/11, economic stagnation and political instability were major banes in the development of education in Pakistan. Education further deteriorated with the increasing disparity among social classes. The number of educational institutions could not commensurate the population exodus and lack of will to introduce reforms at the government level compounded the problems. Self-finance scheme was introduced which further commercialized the education.

From 9/11 to present, major reforms were introduced in the system of education. Efforts were made to de-nationalize the institutions and the private sector was encouraged to establish schools, colleges and even universities and professional colleges. Syllabi have been revised and certain radical changes made in subjects of history, Islamiat, geography, English and Urdu. Some of the changes are highly controversial and have off set the ideological course of our system of education.

Our system of education instead of emphasizing on inculcation of values, discipline, social/ civic responsibility and socio-economic productivity stimulates partisan and class difference and churns out educated illiterates. The education system, as a whole, faces a set of complex specific problems. First it is an imposed system which has not been evolved through a gradual process. Second, the educational system in Pakistan ignores grooming aspect of students as productive and useful members of a modern society. Third, this system neither segregated students as per psycho – social and socio- economic requirements of our nation nor it identifies the talent of students for specialization. Fourth, our curriculum still remains confused. We are undecided whether we should encourage scientific and technical education or promote studies of humanities. We are also unclear whether to emphasise on ideology and values or promulgate liberality. Language remains another problem and we have no clear idea whether to continue with English media or not. Fifth, linkages between primary, secondary and higher education are not existent. Number of subjects has not been rationalized at various levels over burdening the memories of students. Sixth, our system of education does not promote/ encourage original thinking. Seventh, System of examination, though has been changed, stifle initiative

and experimentation. Students and teachers focus on achieving higher pass percentage rather than emphasis on learning and bringing out hidden qualities and talent¹⁴. Eighth, our educational system lacks in quality as well as quantity. Involvement of private sector has generated commercialization in education and has added to class difference. Ninth lack of trained teachers adds to the inadequacies of our educational system¹⁵. Tenth, there is a painful lack of educational environment in our country. Teachers as well as students are content as much of superficial knowledge from textbooks as possible that they can pour it out on the examination paper. Moreover, social knowledge is necessary for intelligent and efficient social service and education should infuse this knowledge and endeavor to make the students efficient members of the society. Sociology and other social sciences are not very popular subjects in education of all the classes. Eleventh, vocational and technical training are other areas which are ignored in our educational system. It has no strategy what so ever, to utilize the vast human capital by imparting education which make pupils self sustaining. Twelfth, shortage of instructional facilities like proper school buildings, laboratories, libraries and equipment is major impediment in promoting conducive environment for learning. Thirteenth, misplaced priorities at policy planning level is another grey area affecting progress in the field of education¹⁶. Fourteenth, system being followed at primary level does not cater for inculcating objective thinking and power of reasoning in the young pupil. Moreover, rampant poverty results into large number of dropouts at this level. Fifteenth, our secondary education is purposeless and cumbersome. It neither prepares students to take on higher education nor gives him opportune economic self sufficiency¹⁷. Finally, wide gap in the classes of society is applicable to our education system. We have sophisticated English medium private schools for rich and influential, the ordinary government schools for middle and lower middle class and Madrassas for poor as well as religious minded people.

Contemporary Educational Systems

Before we suggest contours of educational system which is peculiar to our requirements, it seems appropriate to view some

other functional systems so that relevant conclusions can be drawn to modify our own system. This section discusses systems of advanced and some contemporary countries which provide a wider spectrum to analyze the short comings of Pakistan's educational system.

Schools in USA have two major themes around which they are imparting education¹⁸. Firstly, the US produces citizens with necessary skills, knowledge and attitudes to function in the national social, political and economic structure. Secondly, the US educational system ensures that every child is given the opportunity to learn whatever is needed to carryout basic life tasks. Traditional system of learning in USA, incorporates in its theoretical construct the belief that there exists some package of knowledge that is meant to be passed on to continuing generations. It also implies learning by discovery and induction rather than deduction. The system encourages teachers to provide opportunities to the students to explore, test, inquire and make discoveries for themselves. They follow competency based system. Another contour of their system of education is the behavioral psychological approach used in the schools generally based on competition. Scholastic competition is generally regarded as "preparation for life". Profound and lasting learning that takes place in American schools is through unplanned and incidental manner¹⁹. Qualified teachers are the lynch pin in American educational system. They are capable to reach the prevailing level of a child and encourage self actualization. They know that children learn more by doing rather than by hearing.

The curriculum in American system revolves around responsibility, respect, resourcefulness and responsiveness. Extracurricular activities such as speech, debating clubs, athletics and student governments are commonly considered part of the non academic curriculum. However, it may be noted that much of the non- academic learning is derived from the actual structure of the classroom and the institution itself. As regards student evaluation it is prime responsibility of the individual classroom teachers. It is an amalgam of tests of various kinds, observation, classroom performance and some assignments. Counseling is an important

pillar of the educational system in USA. Counselors help students and anxious and confused parents on a host of issues.

The system of education in China aims at transmitting the skills, values and competencies of peculiar Chinese culture through formal and informal ways. Historically, education system of China spans over 2000 years and is based on Confucius' principle which says "in education there should be no class distinction". After the revolution and independence in 1949, communist party of China engaged in rebuilding the schools and setting forth educational needs and goals for the nation. Its cardinal characteristics include faith in the learning ability of virtually every individual, emphasis on positive reinforcement that dominates Chinese educator's attitudes and finally the learning by doing.

Teachers in China are selected and rigourously screened to inculcate a moral responsibility in him to educate his pupils like a son with warmth and respect. Primary and secondary schools curriculum stresses the acquisition of basic skills showing consist of six subjects. However, secondary school curriculum allows the student more flexibility in course offerings. A significant fact is that all schools whether rural or urban have uniform curriculum. At this level, social sciences education and foreign language begin. It should be noted that in all curricular areas, there exist a decidedly practical bent to subject matter. Every day in Chinese schools, students have to perform some productive work in addition to academic programming. Non academic curriculum includes a vast program of physical, moral, political and sports activities. Evaluation is through examinations. Students are also required to take admission test for entrance into secondary and higher classes. As regards counseling, it is teacher's basic responsibility and through it an effort is made to determine which positive and negative characteristics are present and the social influences responsible for them.

British education comprises primary education, secondary education and higher education²⁰. Further, education involves wide range of vocational and non-vocational work undertaken outside the university sector. At a functional level, this involves the

transmission of a range of basic skills and abilities without which the individual cannot achieve economic independence and cannot fully participate in the daily life of society.

At the primary level, disparities between voluntary and state schools have long since been ironed out. However, primary education is not so well resourced as compared to secondary schools. British secondary schools remain dominated by the teaching of subjects and examination. Learning in higher education at university and college, is considered to be the responsibility of the student. Most university and college teachers arrange that students possess sufficient ability to learn for themselves, to work out their own methods of understanding and applying ideas. Modern techniques of teaching are applied by the teachers who are well trained and qualified. Curriculum is liberally designed to develop basic intellectual skills such as literacy and computation.

Evaluation in British educational system encompasses formal, written/essay type examination in one variant or the other. The examination at secondary and higher levels is set by board associated with one of the universities. At the primary level, selective tests are held otherwise student performance is assessed on the basis of their progress and record. As regards counseling, most local education authorities provide a school psychological service at which students with learning or behavioral problems are counselled.

Mexican concept of education carries with it a much broader meaning including non formal aspect of the total learning environment that constitute the formation of human character and personality development²¹. Traditionally, in Mexico, schools are designed as those institutions that bear the chief responsibility for transmitting popular cultural heritage from one generation to another. There also exist an interest in education for its motivating influence in accomplishing the modern state. Approximately 75 percent of all children in modern Mexico are enrolled at the primary level. Secondary school programs are divided into two cycles of three years each to prepare individuals for further education or the occupational market place. Higher education in Mexico is reflected in a number of different types of institutions in

public and private sectors. Learners are viewed as passive recipients of knowledge. Teacher is in complete command of the core subject matter and often delivers it in an encyclopedic manner through a lecture methodology.

Primary curriculum is prepared at the national level and includes subjects like mathematics, natural science, social science, arts, physical education and technical / vocational education. Curriculum at secondary level builds upon a common core initiated at primary level. Technical/vocational institutions exist at senior secondary level. At the higher education level, the nature of study is dependent on the institution attended.

Sri Lankan System of Education. Free education system of Sri Lanka was instituted in the 1940's. It has standardized education in that county which is amply reflected in the literacy rate. Education is imparted through public and private schools. Technical and National training is given due importance as well. Highlight of this system is the organization of tuition classes by the schools to impart extra coaching to their students. It is pertinent to mention that the social system, economy and all other aspects in Sri Lanka are almost based on the system of education.

Having seen the systems of education of advanced as well as contemporary countries, following important conclusions can be drawn related to the existing system of education in Pakistan. First, the prevalent education system hardly caters for social, moral and cultural grooming of students. It is a system which emphasizes more or less on learning certain subjects. Second, assessment is examination oriented which does not encompass talent identification and development. Third, informal education through extra curricular activities is either missing or is ill organized thus remaining far short of desired standard. Fourth, various forms and categories of schools are available in Pakistan serving various classes of society, teaching in different mediums and having different curriculum/syllabi. Fifth, our educational system does not cater for human resource development. Finally, ours is a system which is somewhat confused and does not fulfill the ideological purpose of the country.

Structure and Context of Educational Development The Way Forward

The pace of development in various fields of life strongly, suggests that comprehensive changes are required in our educational system. These changes should be premised upon peculiar ideology of our country, social make up, cultural structure and economic compulsions. It requires concerted efforts to decide upon structure and context of educational development in our country.

Change in education system of Pakistan are necessitated due to a host of reasons. Prevalent frustration among the youth needs to be addressed at priority basis. If radical changes, based on providing an equal opportunity to all the classes of society are not made in educational system of Pakistan, Pakistani youth will continue to serve as fodder for the menace of sectarianism, extremism and fundamentalism. Proposed changes are in addition to the reforms instituted in 2002.

Even after six decades, Pakistani society is in a state of flux²². Underpinning factors for this instability are social injustice, economic disparity, provincial disharmony and rampant corruption. System of education should be enabling, empowering and ennobling- synergizing all sociological processes. It should also serve perennial purpose of education and the basic life tasks by means of the basic life skills taught and learnt as basic educational skills. Our education system needs to satisfy economic and productive functions of our society. It is only through better education that we can attain a position of economic security. We need to have highly skilled academics, scientists, technicians, business or public service administrators who should be selected without discrimination and prejudice.

Ideology of education is the guidepost, which sets the direction of educational enterprise. The quality of national education will not impress automatically unless the ideology is clear and deep rooted. Education as a process needs to be emphasized for reorganization of national education. Educative process should focus more on personality development and productivity of an individual

for the society. A qualitative improvement is required in our system of education which is contingent upon the quality of curriculum, quality of learning and teaching process, quality of administration, quality of human relations and environment in the school, quality of equipment and the quality of the evaluation process.

Aims and objectives of Education in Pakistan. It is imperative that ²³educational system should be reviewed in the backdrop of the aspirations of the people and the socio-economic reorganization of the country. For re-orientation and reorganization of educational system, we should aim at "developing individuals with positive skills". With this aim in mind objectives are being proposed which would help in developing an integrated and balanced educational system. The following five objectives are significant. First, to strengthen the Islamic identity through a progressive and wholesome indulgence in the study of Islam rather than concentrating on Islamic studies. Second, to develop among the people a sense of public duty, patriotism and national solidarity, and to inculcate among them the habits of industry, integrity and devotion to service. Third, to introduce modern methods of solution for determining intelligence and aptitudes so as to affect the diversion of students at appropriate levels to technical, agricultural, scientific, business and vocational institutions in accordance with their ability and aptitude. Fourth, to examine the standards of teaching and research in educational institutions and suggest necessary measures to raise them to the highest possible levels. Finally, to blend moral and economic perspective of education by an integrated approach.

Changes in the Existing Education Policy

Free education upto intermediate level should be ensured. A substantial compensation for poor children should be given so that they can continue education without burdening their parents. Budget for education should be increased and minimum 10% of the GDP should be spent on education as against barely 4% which is being presently spent. Technical institutions should be established at district and tehsil levels. These institutions should help students in developing some skills which would enable their sustenance in the

society. Uniform curriculum/ syllabus be introduced in all the educational institutions. Focus on secondary school education with efforts to developing technical skills is considered to be prudent for socio-economic development of the country. Madrassahs should be modernized and all efforts should be made to bring these in the mainstream. Examination system should be further streamlined so that it becomes more assessment oriented and can identify the talent of individuals. Teachers training should be given special attention. Their pays and privileges be enhanced substantially there by raising their stature and respect in the society. An amalgam of public and grammar schools are recommended. However, selection of students to grammar schools should be strictly based on merit through a competitive examination. Government to ban private professional / technical colleges / universities. Higher education institutions/Universities to chalk out a plan for encouraging research oriented studies as per the capacity in various fields. They should not churn out Ph. Ds without any focus or requirement. Education Task force should be established which should devise a strategy to promote education on war footings. Private corporations/industries to be encouraged sponsoring schools in rural areas. This will reduce burden on national exchequer. Army should run quality educational institutions in remote areas. Self actualization/realization should be encouraged among students. It can be done by remodeling the religious education and interfacing it correctly with moral/mannerism training. Islamic/Pakistani ideology should form the essence of educational system of Pakistan. For this Pakistan Studies should be made more comprehensive and purposeful.

Child Education. An awareness drive is recommended on child education which is strongly significant for Pakistani society. Following measures should be undertaken in this regard. First, Pakistani government needs to regard child welfare as a primary concern in state planning. Second, children need to be groomed systematically molding them into valuable citizens. Focus should be on development of discipline, courage, cooperation and tolerance. Third, positive social virtues like love, kindness, friendship and hospitality should be cultivated among children through concerted efforts of parents and teachers. Fourth, development of self- confidence and assurance at home and school

should be the primary focus of parents and teachers. Finally, institutions of child welfare services is a priority requirement of the time and it should be established at priority.

Following are the proposals for the efficacy of primary education.

Primary education should be interfaced with social institutions and services for moral/ socio- psychological development of children. Special attention be given for teacher's training at this level. Primary education to be designed in a manner so that it broadens the horizon of students by imparting the essential knowledge and skills. Pupil centered approach be adopted at this level. Creative expression of children's abilities be encouraged. Schools should not dissociate themselves from the real affairs of the real life and intellectual side should not be targeted alone. Interactive learning techniques should be adopted at this level. Purpose should be to build understanding rather than pushing hastily the subject matter in the minds of the students.

The objectives of primary education should be as follows²⁴:

First, to make a child functionally literate. Second, to develop all aspects of his personality. Third, to equip him with basic knowledge and skills and prepare him for further education. Fourth, to arouse a sense of civic responsibility. Fifth, to develop habits of industry, integrity and curiosity. Sixth, to develop liking of sports and games. Seventh, study of Islamiyat to foster tolerance and brotherhood, thus generating an understanding of humanity. Finally, Identification of peculiar talent and skill should be endeavored at this level.

Secondary education has most definite place in our education system²⁵. Following are specific recommendations in this regard.

First, objective of secondary education should be more inclusive, embracing the needs of human development. Second, all the students should be encouraged to develop some technical skill at this level. Third, there should be one and not several secondary

school systems. The curriculum of secondary schools should be broadened so that purposeful and practical education can be provided to the students. Fourth, education at this level should be so tailored that it is regarded as a complete stage in itself. It can be achieved by introducing skills development subjects at this level. Fifth, regular career counseling should be arranged for the students at this level. These sessions would help in creating a clear vision among the students with regard to the choice of career subsequently. Finally, at this level, study of Islamiat rather than Islamic studies should be undertaken. For this syllabus of Islamiat should be radically rehashed.

Presently, focus is on higher education which needs rationalization. Following is recommended in this regard. First, rationalization of degree courses be done in the light of capacity building in various fields. Second, quality is important at this level. It can be ensured by inducting students with right aptitude and abilities in right courses/ fields. Third, research in various fields should be sponsored by corporations and industries. Finally, self financed courses at this level be discontinued immediately.

Another important factor in changing the system of education in Pakistan involves the training of teachers. First, Teachers training should hinge upon academic freedom and academic responsibility²⁶. All the school and colleges should organize special teaching programs/workshops. Second, teachers be trained to impart education at various levels specifically. Finally, teachers training colleges should be established at district level.

Conclusion. Without qualitative change in the policies, procedures and practices of the present system of education, we cannot hope for real progress in psycho-social as well as socio-economic realms. Reorganization in the education system should aim at achieving the directional goals through concerted efforts on war footings. We need to give a serious thought to the value of education for our national security and survival. Directional changes in the education system should revolve around our ideology and national purpose. Our educational system should reflect our national priority and ambitions. It should enable us to weave cohesion in our

society and dispel the frictions as well as fissures. Our educational system should promote tolerance and deep understanding of mutual co-existence. Pakistan stands at the cross roads of history. We need to understand the importance of education for progress and prosperity. In today's competing world, we need to act quickly to make up for the lost opportunities.

Notes

- ¹ Ikram Raza, A Futuristic Paradigm of Education in Pakistan(Islamabad: PFI and Margallah Voices, 2005), 34
- ² Ibid, 32
- ³ Al Quran
- ⁴ Samuel Smith, Ideas of the Great Educators(Barnes and Noble Books, 1979), 57
- ⁵ T.W. Moore, Philosophy Of Education(Routledge and Kegan Paul Limited, 1982), 82
- ⁶ Ibid, 65
- ⁷ Edward Ignis, Comparative Education Systems(F.E. Peacock Publishers, 1981), 76
- ⁸ Ikram Raza, A Futuristic Paradigm of Education in Pakistan(Islamabad: PFI and Margallah Voices, 2005), 66
- ⁹ Ikram Raza, A Futuristic Paradigm of Education in Pakistan(Islamabad: PFI and Margallah Voices, 2005), 102
- ¹⁰ A.K.C Ottaway, Education and Society(Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1953), 44
- ¹¹ A.K.C Ottaway, Education and Society(Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1953), 29
- ¹² M. Iqbal, Education in Pakistan(Lahore:Aziz Publishers, 1967), 24
- ¹³ M. Iqbal, Education in Pakistan(Lahore:Aziz Publishers, 1967), 62
- ¹⁴ N.A Baloch, A National System of Education and Education of Teachers(Larkana:Sindh Institute of Policy Studies, 03), 22
- ¹⁵ N.A Baloch, A National System of Education and Education of Teachers(Larkana:Sindh Institute of Policy Studies, 03), 34
- ¹⁶ Naseem Jaffar, Problems of Education in Pakistan(Karachi:Royal Books, 1990), 67
- ¹⁷ Naseem Jaffar, Problems of Education in Pakistan(Karachi:Royal Books, 1990), 67
- ¹⁸ Edward Ignis, Comparative Education Systems(F.E Peacock Publishers, 1981), 133
- ¹⁹ Edward Ignis, Comparative Education Systems(F.E Peacock Publishers, 1981) ,134
- ²⁰ Ibid, 231
- ²¹ Ibid, 312
- ²² M. Iqbal, Education in Pakistan(Lahore: Aziz Publishers, 1967) 123
- ²³ Ibid
- ²⁴ T.W Moore, Philosophy of Education(Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1982), 367
- ²⁵ Naseem Jaffar, Problems of Education in Pakistan(Karachi:Royal Books, 1990), 224
- ²⁶ A.K.C Ottaway, Education and Society(Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1953), 145

GLOBALIZATION: CHALLENGES FOR PAKISTAN

Air Commodore Shahid Latif Bajwa

Introduction

Globalization is a term for the emergence of a global society in which economic, political, environmental and cultural events in one part of the world quickly come to have significance for people in other parts of the world. This paper is aimed at discussing what is globalization as characterized by different schools of thought? What are the forces primarily propelling the process of globalization? What is the role of developed countries and multinational corporations in this process? What is the impact of globalization on developing countries? Is the process evenly affecting the developed and developing countries? And finally, what is the best course of action for developing countries to deal with globalization with particular reference to Pakistan? During the course of research, descriptive research methodology was adopted wherein available literature in the books, magazines, papers, articles and internet was consulted.

Globalization is the result of advancements in communication, transportation, and information technologies. It describes the growing economic, political, technological, and cultural linkages that connect individuals, communities, businesses, and governments around the world. Globalization also involves the growth of multinational corporations MNCs (businesses that have operations or investments in many countries) and transnational corporations (TNCs i.e businesses that see themselves functioning in a global marketplace). The international institutions that oversee world trade and finance play an increasingly important role in this era of globalization.

Human societies across the globe have progressively established closer contacts over many centuries, but recently the pace has dramatically increased. Jet airplanes, cheap telephone service, email, computers, huge ocean going vessels and instant capital flows have made the world more interdependent than ever.

Multinational corporations manufacture products in many countries and sell to consumers around the world. Money, technology and raw materials move ever more swiftly across national borders. As a result, laws, economics, and social movements are forming at the international level.

The phenomenon of globalization is a source of challenge and an opportunity. Reinforced after the end of the cold war, globalization is perceived as a force, which can integrate diverse cultures and enables less developed countries to bridge the gap in knowledge, information and technology. But globalization per se is also considered as a major threat to those societies where the capability to deal with the adverse ramifications of corporate culture, free trade, competitive mode of production and other capitalistic tendencies are limited. From any standpoint, globalization has both positive and negative aspects.

The term “globalization” gained currency mainly in the last quarter of the 20th century. The world has experienced universalizing or globalizing influences since the commencement of the Divine revelations. Modern history reveals that the world has assimilated many universal trends such as, the rise of the nation-state, mass production and division of labour, mass consumption, mass communications, and global social movements. However, the less developed countries (LDCs) and the civil society organizations all over the world remain apprehensive about the current wave of globalization.

However, “globalization” as a term acquired popular usage only after the recent developments in fast flows of trade, finance, technology, and information. Rapid travel and mass communication led to a faster dissemination of the dominant world view that has made the less developed societies uncomfortable as they remain ill-prepared to receive and benefit from the globalization paradigm. However, this paradigm that emerged in an environment external to the developing world is now being pretty much imposed upon them owing to their restricted range of choices and the subsequent weak bargaining position. Nonetheless, the issue can still be approached positively and constructively by the developing countries. That is

even though the range of choices for the developing world might be restricted; it remains free enough to choose from either a reactive response of self-pity and breast-beating or a proactive response¹ aiming at enterprise, initiatives, and decisions in the desired direction of development. For, effective behaviour should be a function of own decisions rather than external conditions. Choice of appropriate response to the current wave of globalization remains very much the sole preserve of the developing world. For, the intervening variable between an external stimulus and response is freedom to choose appropriate response² which the developing world needs to be aware of so as to exercise it in its bid to brave this challenge.

From the vantage point of the developing world, a convergence needs to be struck essentially between the imperatives of globalization and the concerns emanating from its implications for the people in the developing world which is home to about 80% of the global population. Action in this direction is necessitated at both the international as well as national levels so as to achieve inter-country as well as intra-country integration of the people. It will be integration at both these levels that will eventually usher in globalization in the true sense which implies an integration of all the peoples of the world.

The concept of globalization or universalization of thoughts, ideas, systems, and practices is not new.³ This piece of work traces the process of globalization to as far back as the Renaissance when a revival of arts, literature, and learning took place. The historical background of globalization, in modern history is evaluated in Section-2. This step is vital for a communication of the concept of globalization without which third world's response would remain reactive rather than proactive. The role of key players in globalization i.e. International Institutions and Multinational Corporations (MNCs) is discussed in Section -3. The study of impact / effects of globalization, the extent of challenges to the nation state, the relationship between globalization and international buzz words like extremism and terrorism is dealt in Section – 4. The following sections dwell upon the challenges of globalization for Pakistan and the policy measures it must adopt in order to make an

effective response to the external environmental challenges by capitalizing upon the opportunities and averting the threats.

For this purpose, there is a need for Pakistan to overcome the internal weaknesses and build the internal strengths so to achieve intra-country integration as well as integration with the global economy if the current wave of globalization is found irreversible. Pakistan would need to emerge as an effective participant in global economic affairs and decision-making with a view to playing a key role in the worldwide attempts being made to minimize the negative implications of globalization as understood in the conventional sense. Pakistan would then be contributing to the efforts aimed at achieving “true” globalization.

Like many developing countries, Pakistan has not fully prepared itself to blend with and benefit from globalization. This study deals with the problems faced by developing countries in general and Pakistan in particular while embracing the effects of globalization. It also offers remedies to address the problems arising out of it.

CONCEPT OF GLOBALIZATION

Definition of Globalization

A simple description of globalization is that ‘events occurring on one part of the globe can effect and be affected by, events occurring in other, distant part of the globe.’⁴ In research literature, the term ‘globalization’ is closely associated with transnational interdependence and trans-boundary movement. According to Holm and Sorenson, a definition of globalization is ‘the intensification of economic, political, social and cultural relations across borders’.⁵ According to Guillen “Intuitively, globalization is a process fueled by, and resulting in, increasing cross-border flows of goods, services, money, people, information, and culture.”⁶

Globalization in its literal sense is the process of transformation of local or regional things or phenomena into global

ones. It can also be used to describe a process by which the people of the world are unified into a single society and function together. This process is a combination of economic, technological, socio cultural and political forces. Globalization is often used to refer to economic globalization, that is, integration of national economies into the international economy through trade, foreign direct investment, capital flows, migration, and the spread of technology.

Core Aspects and Key Characteristics. The process of globalization is facilitated through a technological revolution in the fields of telecommunications and transportation and in the formation of global financial markets made possible by geo-political and political changes, first and foremost the collapse of the Soviet Union and its Communist satellite states.⁷ Hence, the increasing flow of information, products, people, money, technology and expertise across national borders and its consequences may be viewed as **core aspects** of the globalization concept. **Key characteristics** of globalization are ‘the speed of change and the compression of time and space, produced by electronic communication technologies and other means.’⁸

Historical Perspective

Pre-Modern Globalization. The emergence of this modern phenomenon is actually a pre-historic process which continued to modify according to the prevalent political and economic system. Since times immemorial, the world has been increasingly becoming global. The process started almost as soon as mankind started to trade. The Industrial Revolution in Europe (1830) and Colonialism further hastened the process of economic integration’ albeit in an exploitative fashion. The postwar Transportation and Communications Revolution shrank the world as far as the economic space and time was concerned. State and private-led joint ventures, replaced the world system by creating more institutional space for economic integration among nations.

Cold War Globalization. Just after World War-II, all the victorious nations agreed to collectively manage the global economy through an open market concept under the control of effective

international institutions. This led to the establishment of Bretton Woods Institutions such as International Monetary Fund (IMF) and World Bank in 1944 and subsequently to General Agreement on Tariff and Trade (GATT) in 1947. Hence, the initial period of Cold War era saw an enormous expansion in free trade economy.

Post Cold War Globalization. These were the cross roads when Russia got disintegrated resulting into a uni-polar world. The capitalist system emerged as the only one for managing the world affairs. This time it was not only the economy which affected globalization but it involved other factors such as politics, information, culture, sociology, etc. Thus the scope of globalization became wider. The term ‘globalization’ acquired popular usage only after the recent developments in fast flows of trade, finance, technology and information. Anthony Giddens noted back in 1999 that while the term was hardly used ten years earlier, by the end of 1990s, the term was on everybody’s lips: ‘absolutely no one who wants to understand our prospects and possibilities at the century’s end can ignore it.’⁹

Key Players of Globalization

International Financial and Trade Institutions and Multi-National Corporations are the Key Players of driving the process of globalization.

International Institutions. At the conclusion of World War II, several international institutions were created to manage the world economy and prevent another Great Depression. These institutions include the International Monetary Fund (IMF), the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (now called the World Bank), and the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT), which was expanded and institutionalized into the World Trade Organization (WTO) in 1995. These institutions have not only persisted for over six decades, but they have also expanded their mandates, changed their missions and increased their membership. They have, however, become highly contested. As Joseph Stiglitz notes, “International bureaucrats—the faceless symbols of the world economic order—are under attack everywhere....Virtually every

major meeting of the International Monetary Fund, the World Bank and the World Trade Organization is now the scene of conflict and turmoil.”¹⁰

Conventional wisdom in international and comparative political economy has held that international institutions, like the IMF, World Bank, and WTO (and its predecessor, the GATT), have been largely beneficial for the countries in them. These institutions, it is claimed, constrain the behavior of the most powerful countries and provide information and monitoring capacities that enable states to cooperate.¹¹ All states involved are better off with these institutions than otherwise. Recently, however, evidence has mounted that these institutions may not be so beneficial for the developing countries.

Recent, empirical research asks the question of whether the effect of these institutions on the developing world has been better or worse with their presence than without it. The evidence suggests that even though problems abound with the institutions one cannot deny that without these institutions many developing countries could be worse off in the bilateral negotiations with the most powerful countries.

Multinational Corporations. There is no doubt that leaving aside some of the richest countries in the world, MNCs own most of the world capital and therefore are the main players in the global economy.¹² Their annual turnover reaches the astronomical level of \$100-200 billion, seemingly dwarfing the national economies in the world. Their economic power enables them to play a significant role on the global scene. As MNCs are the main players behind the globalization of market economy; it would be worthwhile to evaluate their positive and negative aspects:

- **The positive aspects**
 - **Financial and technical resources and expertise.** There is no denying the fact that the MNCs bring in certain advantages to the host societies. Huge resources and investments, technology, innovation and

expertise are made available to host societies through these MNCs. A culture of research and development, training in marketing and developing human resource within the organization is also beneficial for the host societies. MNCs also contribute significantly to the exchequer by paying taxes.

- **Good business practices.** Good governance, transparency within the organization, delegation of power, performance based evaluation and incentives program encourage the merit-based approach. The work culture and the professional working environment within the organization are important characteristics of MNCs. As MNCs are trend setters, these practices are also followed by the large national corporations. Even the civil society is influenced by this professional culture. The merit and knowledge based professional culture leads to the promotion of more efficient management and better business education along with other important disciplines in the society.
- **Comforts of life.** The economies of scale, quality control and healthy competition in certain cases lead to price cuts and other incentives to the end user. People get the comforts of life at much cheaper rates and /or at their doorsteps.¹³
- **Infrastructure improvement.** Many MNCs help in improving the infrastructure and provision of basic needs in their specific areas of operation. They do it directly or provide funds to the civil society organizations or give direct charity to improve the living and business conditions in areas where they are operating. While in many cases these are voluntary practices, the

tax exemption facility provided under the law also helps in encouraging such initiatives.

- **Pluralism.** Because of MNCs, a kind of interaction across the boundaries takes place. Even education (particularly business) has to take into account the global perspectives.¹⁴ Global perspectives and cross-cultural understanding increase the adaptability of the students anywhere in the world. This leads to the mixing of cultures and practices and encourages pluralism as well as competition. Out-sourcing by MNCs particularly in services sectors is relatively a new but important phenomenon. The host countries are thus becoming not just the workshop of the world but the back office too.¹⁵ Besides providing employment this is also promoting pluralism. These can be great assets for society if addressed positively.

➤ **The Negative Aspects**

- **Increasing materialism and consumption.** The type of development, being promoted is based on mere material gains. Luxuries and comforts are being turned into needs and necessities. Thus happiness and satisfaction are being associated with luxuries and their acquisition. Thanks to MNCs, “the consumption culture” has over taken almost the whole world, though it first took hold of the developed world.
- **Excessive expansion of credit.** The new credit culture is changing the attitudes towards loans. Loans are being encouraged to facilitate the acquisition of the luxuries of life. The offer of easy credit, consumer financing, credit cards and personal loans by the banks to the middle class is promoting a culture of living beyond means. Life styles are changing

because of it, and not necessarily for the better.¹⁶

- **Corruption and Crime.** Greediness, disparities and sense of deprivation, along with race to acquire new products is also giving rise to corruption and crime. The focus is on acquiring money in whichever manner it comes; even through illegal means if it is not available through legitimate sources. On their part, MNCs also corrupt people in order to capture markets.¹⁷
- **The brain drain.** The term ‘brain drain’ is usually used for talent going towards other countries in search of higher income. MNCs are involved in yet another kind of brain drain. With their capacity to pay, they can hire the most qualified and experienced talent available in the society. Those working with MNCs consider themselves as part of an elite class associated with the global community. Consequently, most of them develop a culture that makes them less relevant to their own societies.
- **Family Fabric.** The culture and life style changes coming in with the spread of MNCs’ influence in society are proving lethal for the family fabric of host societies. Overspending and living beyond means is creating economic pressures, tensions and stress within families. Various indicators prove that women working with the MNCs and other big organizations are under stress when entering into marriages and bearing children. Parents have little time for their family, particularly children.

IMPACT ON DEVELOPING COUNTRIES

The Impact of Globalization

Globalization has wide-ranging political, economic, social and cultural implications. The globalization debate has long extended beyond the confines of economy to cultural changes, such as possible *evolution of global culture*, on the one hand and, on the other, counter-responses to globalization and *the growth of countercultures*, for example, the worldwide resurgence of Islamic militancy and the rise of anti-globalization movements.¹⁸ Much of the literature on globalization, however, focuses on its economic aspects.

‘Threat to nation-states’ is another topic in the globalization debate. It has emerged due to the changes in the international state system brought about by the globalization process, especially the challenge to the state as an independent actor in the international system. Although states respond to new transnational challenges by investing more resources in multilateral organizations, their course of action is being circumscribed by the institutional weight of the largest organizations, such as the UN, EU, WTO and ASEAN etc.

Another prominent challenge to the state comes from the increasing importance of transnational sub-state actors in international politics. The term ‘trans nationalism’ was introduced precisely to fill a gap in the prevailing state-centric paradigm to ‘denote interactions between non-state actors, that is, international interactions that are not directed by states’, as it became clear that the scope and impact of such interactions were too great to be ignored.¹⁹ The challenge to the traditional territorial nation-state and its prerogatives comes from both legal non-state actors, including global civil-activist networks such as anti-globalization movement as well as from illegal actors such as the Columbian drug syndicates and the global terrorist network of Al-Qaeda.

Effects of Globalization

Globalization has various aspects which affect the developing countries in different ways such as:

- **Industrial.** Emergence of worldwide production facilities / markets and hence broader access to a range of foreign products for consumers and companies. Particularly, movement of material and goods between and within national boundaries.
- **Financial.** Emergence of worldwide financial markets and improved access to external financing for borrowers. Simultaneous, though not necessarily purely globalist is the emergence of under or unregulated foreign exchange and speculative markets.
- **Economic.** Realization of a global market, based on the freedom of exchange of goods and capital.
- **Political.** Some use "globalization" to mean the creation of a world government, or cartels of governments (e.g. WTO, World Bank, and IMF) which regulate the relationships among governments and guarantees the rights arising from social and economic globalization.²⁰
- **Informational.** Increase in information flows between geographically remote locations. Arguably this is a technological change with the advent of fiber optic communications, satellites, and increased availability of telephone and Internet.
- **Cultural.** Growth of cross-cultural contacts; advent of new categories of consciousness and identities which embodies cultural diffusion, the desire to increase one's standard of living and enjoy foreign products and ideas, adopt new technology and practices, and participate in a "world culture". Some bemoan the resulting consumerism and loss of languages.
- **Ecological.** The advent of global environmental challenges that might be solved with international cooperation, such as climate change, cross-boundary

water and air pollution, over-fishing of the ocean, and the spread of invasive species. Since many factories are built in developing countries with less environmental regulation, globalism and free trade may increase pollution.

➤ **Social International cultural exchange.** Increased circulation by people of all nations with fewer restrictions.

- Spreading of multiculturalism, and better individual access to cultural diversity (e.g. through the export of Hollywood and Bollywood movies). Some consider such "imported" culture a danger, since it may supplant the local culture, causing reduction in diversity or even assimilation. Others consider multiculturalism to promote peace and understanding between peoples.²¹
- Greater international travel and tourism.
- Greater immigration, including illegal immigration.
- Spread of local consumer products (e.g. food) to other countries (often adapted to their culture).
- World-wide sporting events such as FIFA World Cup and the Olympic Games.

➤ **Technical**

- Development of a global telecommunications infrastructure and greater trans-border data flow, using such technologies as the Internet, communication satellites, submarine fiber optic cable, and wireless telephones
- Increase in the number of standards applied globally; e.g. copyright laws, patents and world trade agreements.

➤ **Legal/Ethical**

- The creation of the international criminal court and international justice movements.
- Crime importation and raising awareness of global crime-fighting efforts and cooperation.

Globalization and Extremism / Terrorism

Globalization has greatly increased the potential of distant conflicts to transform into transnational terrorism by reducing the significance of physical distance. The availability of faster means of transport / communication like aircraft and cell phones / internet have made the movement of extremist groups, their ideologies and required finances equally faster. What we are really seeing in the war on terror is that the increased "dispersion and democratization of technology, information, and finance" brought about by globalization has given terrorist groups greater mobility and access worldwide. Globalization and resultant proliferation of technology thus makes extremism / terrorism easier and deadlier in the short term. However, same technology could be used to track / nab the perpetrators. Moreover, in the long term, social-economic benefits of globalization help shrink the social space on which the terrorist ideologies thrive.²²

Major factor behind al-Qaeda's success is its reliance on cyber space opportunities for propaganda and communication purposes, bringing together disparate communities of sympathizers and supporters, and facilitating contacts between operative cells across continents. It is now believed that al-Qaeda, after Afghanistan, is metamorphosing into a "virtual" network, depriving its enemies of a geographical target. By posting electronic libraries of ideological and theological literature as well as training manuals, tactical handbooks and weapon instructions in written, audio and video formats on the internet, al-Qaeda uses web as 'an Open University' in its effort as fostering an Islamist-jihadist nation in cyberspace.

GLOBALIZATION CHALLENGES FOR PAKISTAN

Impact on National Institutions

Globalization has had serious impact on Pakistan's economy, politics, society, law and religion. Like many other developing countries, Pakistan is experiencing the positive and negative effects of globalization. Along with some negative social effects, with the

opening of its economy in early 1990s, Pakistan has also seen the forces of market and consumerism paving the way for a competitive society. Some of the major fault lines which one can identify in terms of globalization and human development in Pakistan are as follows:-

- The cultural implications of globalization.
- Growing asymmetry in income distribution.
- Growing unemployment because of stress on quality control and standardization of manufactured goods.
- Growing rural-urban divide.
- Failure to create awareness and consciousness in at the grassroots level about the advantages and disadvantages of globalization.
- Environmental fallout of increased industrial activity and growing urbanization.²³

As far as Pakistan is concerned, the confusion over globalization becomes serious because of six parallel societal trends:

- First, the ultra conservative or fundamentalist elements who perceive globalization as nothing but a tool of exploitation by the West and a cultural invasion to pollute the Islamic way of life.
- Second, moderate religious segments of society who are less politicized and are less critical of globalization but have suspicion and mistrust about it.
- Third, the ultra-modern such class who are real beneficiaries of globalization and see things primarily from the point of view of their economic and social interests.
- Fourth, the upper middle class, who see glamour in globalization but have to climb many stairs in order to be co-opted by the capitalist class.
- Fifth, the middle class which has serious misgivings about the economic and cultural fallout of globalization but is at the same time interested in seeking benefits from that system.

- Sixth, the lower class which has minimum awareness about globalization, but is the worst sufferer of development engendered by the market economy.

In Pakistan, radical human rights activists oppose the neo liberal type of globalization. They support instead the movement for the globalization of UN based human rights. The Islamists on the other hand, oppose the recognition in Pakistan of the UN based rights of women and non-Muslims and strive to gain acceptance for Islamic globalization. The state, while subordinating itself to the neo-liberal agenda, usually sides with the Islamists on the question of human rights.²⁴

Culture. Globalization of culture, at its most profound level, sees the growing development of a consumer culture, a culture that seems to encourage a new global vision.²⁵ The response of Pakistani state to various cultural globalizations has been inconsistent, contradictory and confusing. Partly this follows from tensions within its national identity. On the one hand, Pakistan aspires to remain a modernizing Islamic democracy with a commitment to modern democratic freedom, on the other, theocratic tendency, inherent in its freedom movement and later co-opted in its constitutional and legal provisions by successive governments, requires a manifest adherence to Islamic law and morality.

While, cultural globalization aims to push diverse cultures into a melting pot shaping these in such a manner that the culturally underprivileged groups are also able to play their role, there is a backlash against globalization from the cultural nationalists. For Islamists, globalization is a threat to the traditional family system which encourages women to seek independence from the closely knit family system. For modernists, globalization is an opportunity to reshape Pakistan's cultural paradigm by breaking traditional taboos.

Economy. Since early 1980s, Pakistan has pursued a policy of economic reforms and has introduced openness in its economy. Pakistan first committed itself to accepting structural

reforms to liberalize its economic policies to accelerate the pace of integration with global economy.²⁶ After the inception of the WTO regime in 1995, the process of linking Pakistan's economy with the global economy was accelerated.

Globalization was partly instrumental (other factor being the Government's policy on GWOT) in Pakistan being able to achieve a sustainable average economic growth rate of 7.5 % from the year 2005 to 2007. Foreign debt was reduced to US \$ 36.5 billion and the economy no longer depended on foreign aid. Trade policy became more liberal and more export oriented than it was previously. Exports increased to over US \$ 17 billion and the country attracted over US \$ 3 billion foreign investment. **That was a manifestation of the positive effects of globalization.**

In 2008, worldwide economic recession and soaring oil prices created grave problems for Pakistan's economy. Foreign exchange reserves plummeted to an all time low in the first half of FY 2008-09. Deteriorating law & order situation has discouraged the FDI. Flight of capital from the country and resultant dip in Forex reserves has brought us close to the default. Unprecedented rise in the oil prices adversely affected the prices of all essential commodities especially food. That was a **manifestation of the negative effects of globalization.** With the recent about reduction in the oil prices, the Pak economy was on the path of overall recovery. However, some recent ill-advised decisions by the Government and resultant internal turmoil have jeopardized the economic recovery. It has more to do with overall poor governance than with any external factors like globalization.

Trade. Globalization demands quality control, observance of intellectual property rights, removal of subsidies and standardization of the goods manufactured. Initially, the Pakistani exporters were unable to compete with their counter parts in the developed countries because of the conditions imposed under the World Trade Organization (WTO) regime. In Pakistan, the manufacturers who have adjusted themselves to the trade demands of the globalized world are not facing problems as the ones who have failed to adjust to new realities.

The sports goods industry came under bad light due to the allegations of child labour. However, when the issue was addressed amicably, there have been no further restrictions and the industry is making good profit from the exports. The stringent quality control regime has created some problems for the female employees of textile / garment and food crop based industry. This might lead to a significant decline in female employment in Pakistan.²⁷The best way to tackle this challenge posed by globalization would be to develop female human resource and convert this challenge into opportunity. That is the only way to survive in this highly-competitive Global Village to which no one can shut its doors.

Agriculture, industry, and new institutions. The foremost impact of globalization can be seen in Pakistan's cotton policy and its export. A separate Ministry of Textile was established recently to create an environment for healthy competition in the textile trade. Industry, banking, and services sector have also undergone tremendous transformation. The following new institutions were created in Pakistan:

- Ministry of Textile.
- Ministry of IT and Telecom.
- Ministry of Women Development.
- Higher Education Commission (HEC).
- Privatization Commission.
- Board of Investment. (BOI)
- Security & Exchange Commission of Pakistan. (SECP)
- Small & Medium Enterprise.

Some of these institutions have been a success story whereas others have failed to measure up to the expectations. Ministry of IT and Telecom has been instrumental in advancement of Information Technology and revolution in the field of telecommunications. Higher Education Commission (HEC) under Dr. Atta-ur-Rehman managed to channelize the large funds available towards higher education. During his tenure, a large number of foreign scholarships were availed and local Ph D programmes were introduced; controversies regarding the quality of some of the local research

work notwithstanding. Ministry of Textile has made some contribution in promotion of value-added textile exports. Its success has been limited due to powerful international textile lobbies. The performance of Ministry of Women Development, Board of Investment and Small & Medium Enterprise has been at best average. Privatization Commission which was mandated to liquidate under-performing or sick public sector enterprises, has emerged as a party in loot sale of some national assets at the behest of powerful vested interests. Security & Exchange Commission has generally been a failure in safeguarding the interests of a large number of stake holders. In the ultimate analysis, it is surmised that there is no issue with the noble mandate of all these institutions. The problem lies with the implementation which falls prey to the vested interests of powerful bureaucratic and business lobbies.

Human Development. Pakistan, like other developing countries is also facing the challenge of globalization particular with reference to the issue of human development. Ironically, those at the helm of the affairs in Pakistan have failed to understand the two major realities of globalization. First, to develop indigenous technology so as to better the infrastructure and quality of life of the people of this country and to effectively deal with external influences in the shape of superior products influx of information impacting on society. Second, the failure of leadership in Pakistan to unleash a process of knowledge revolution in order to improve the state of human development.

Education. In the wake of globalization, privatization of education is taking place in Pakistan at an unprecedented pace. So far, for instance, over 30,000 private educational institutions have been established in Pakistan.²⁸ The main issue has been the disparity between the standard of education in private / international affiliated institutions and most of the government-owned schools. Whereas, on one hand it has created a breed of youth fully equipped to compete with the world, on the other is a larger breed severely challenged in so far as the competitive world is concerned. It has resulted in creating two distinct classes in the society: English speaking and non-English speaking. The educational gap between the 'haves and the have-nots' have been widened.

Politics. Globalization is also emerging as a driving force behind national policies and the process of democratization of developing countries. Local and national values and identities are being submerged by globalization.²⁹ For instance, it is becoming more difficult to impose and to sustain authoritarian or military rule. Cognizant of likely reactions from the global community, the military take over in Pakistan on October 12, 1999, for instance, did not opt for imposing martial law in the country, unlike the situation in 1958 and 1977. Such political developments were carefully watched and monitored by outside forces. A crack down against religious extremist groups in January, 2002 and again as a fallout of recent Mumbai attacks is another example of political globalization. Globalization is putting up fences and erecting barriers against the rise of fundamentalist tendencies in many countries and more specifically in the Islamic countries with Pakistan in the forefront. Unfortunately, the rising tide has not been stemmed as socio-economic uplift of the deprived segments of society, which happen to be fertile for such tendencies, has not materialized. As such, the social space wherein the extremist ideologies thrive has not been curtailed.

Religion. Muslim societies have been affected by the wave of globalization. Islamic values including family relations and women rights have been subjected to criticism as a result of globalization. The situation has been compounded by the wanton acts of the terrorists who, in the name of Islam, have taken thousands of innocent lives. Ironically such activities have proliferated around the world riding on the vehicle of globalization. Partly out of their sheer ignorance and partly due to the negative / biased projection in media, which is again a vehicle of globalization, a large portion of non-Muslim world has started to take Pakistan as a bastion of extremism and terrorism.

Human Rights. Hand-woven carpets and sport goods produced through child labor in Pakistan have been frequently cited as human rights violations. Western countries even banned the import of such goods, as they wanted certification of 'Free of Child Labor' for the import of such items into their markets. For instance, they also wanted implementation of stronger FIFA (Federation of

International Football Associations) code by the Sialkot Chamber of Commerce and Industry to make sure that human rights violations did not occur. It needs to be pointed out that human rights organizations have failed to seriously take up issues regarding severe human rights violations in Kashmir or Palestine where the involved states continue to exploit the situation by employing the worst form of what is often referred to as 'state terrorism'.³⁰

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Conclusions

In the context of Pakistan, the benefits of the globalization will take place primarily through good governance and rapid economic growth. Few conclusions emerging from the discussion so far are: -

- In the globalized world, only those nations have a chance to succeed who have excelled in knowledge, information and technology. Countries with strong work ethics, sound educational system, social and economic justice, political stability and the rule of law can transform the challenge of globalization into an opportunity.
- The road to human development in Pakistan cannot be smooth if people are without a basic sense of security: the affluent class keeps a monopoly over power, resources, whether human, material or of information. Without inducting professionalism in society through better work ethics, social justice, good formal education, sound technical training and rule of law, the major indicators of human development cannot be positive.
- As long as knowledge is not processed in Pakistan in the shape of power, there will continue to be the curse of poverty, illiteracy, underdevelopment and unemployment. A knowledge based economy and education aimed at benefiting the majority of people

by uplifting their quality of life should be the hallmark of the state and society of Pakistan.

Courses Available. Having closely studied the process of globalization with a view to assess its impact on developing countries which Pakistan is a part of, following are the courses of action available to the developing countries in general and Pakistan in particular: -

- **Course A.** Become part of the globalization by accepting the international norms, in the areas which do not challenge the national identity / interests. In this regard, China is an example which has accepted some fundamental changes even in her culture.
- **Course B.** Become part of the system by accepting all its features. Open the country for free flow of economics, technology, education, media, culture and foreign direct investment with minimal conditions. In this regard, Belgium is an example which is one of the most globalized countries.
- **Course C.** Do not become part of this process, workout own priorities and policies of protectionism to maintain strong grip over all state institutions. This would mean driving yourself away from the mainstream the world which would be somewhat similar to the Cold War era Soviet Union.
- **Recommended Course.** Course 'A' is recommended. This course goes along with the dynamics of Pakistani society. In fact, it is already being followed in one form or the other, by design or by default. Basically what we need to do is strengthen our institutions; be it political, economic, educational, cultural or commercial. The recommendations for complete adoption of this course are discussed in the succeeding paragraphs.

Recommendations

General. Like any development in human society, the MNCs being the main instruments of globalization, have both negative and positive sides. Nevertheless, it is a fact that these MNCs have contributed a lot to growth in developed countries. The reason being they (both societies and MNCs) have progressed side by side and along with each other. It has been an evolutionary development and there are now strong institutions, legislative bodies, regulatory agencies, judicial system and consumer societies to check and maintain the balance from within. However, in case of the developing host societies a rather uneven contest is taking place. This needs to be addressed as discussed in succeeding paragraphs.

Three levels of intervention

- At the grassroots level, popular consumer movements need to be organized to take care of this unequal contest. MNCs need to be influenced to conduct social research related to the host countries' problems and to contribute certain portions of their profit to social sector development, particularly education and social sector development in the host societies. This is one level of intervention.
- The other stage of intervention relates to governments, both at local and global levels. While host societies should legislate according to the local needs ensuring that benefits and burdens are evenly distributed with a bias in favor of low income groups.³¹
- The issue needs to be addressed at the global level by the UN and its relevant (UNCTAD and other) agencies. It needs to be made clear that there should be a global strategy to chalk out a comprehensive program of moving towards healthy competition by the present inequalities. Indeed this is possible if businesses start creating value not only of stake holders but also for the societies and the ecology.

Pakistan Specific

Stable Political System. Being the key institution on which all the other institutions depend, a stable political system should be allowed to take root with least interference from the establishment: civil / military bureaucracy. Free, fair and timely elections will bring out the best from people and strengthen the system. The politicians may falter initially; they will ultimately start to take correct decisions through consensus. The ultimate control of all instruments of national power must lie with the political government.

Economic Revival. In the quest for economic revival, various areas that need immediate attention are:

- **International Trade.** Despite adoption of liberal trade policies over the last decade, there are still some impediments in growth of our international trade, which need to be immediately addressed in order to bring it in line with the global trends. Following steps are recommended: -
 - Revival of investor confidence through removal of procedural hitches and improvement of law and order situation.
 - Improvement in the quality of production through total quality management and competitive pricing in line with the international market.
 - Revitalization of commercial sections of our embassies abroad and posting of competent commercial attaches with well-defined incentive-based trade targets to be achieved in given time.
 - Restructuring and mechanism for close coordination of all Government bodies dealing with exports.
- **Foreign Direct Investment.** Following are the specific areas of improvements: -

- Foreign investors should be allowed to negotiate the terms and conditions of payment of royalty and technical fee suited to them as well as acceptable to the multinationals for transferring technology.
- The government must further liberalize the foreign exchange regime. Foreigners should be allowed to bring in, possess and take out foreign currency and to open accounts and hold certificates in foreign currency. The Government should continue extensive investment incentives including credit facilities, fiscal incentives and visa policy.
- The country must maintain continuity of well thought out investment policies regardless of the change in the government. A stable political system is the key for such continuity.

Promotion of Culture. In this age of media explosion, no society or culture can remain totally isolated from the influence of the other cultures. The best way to safeguard own cultural values and traditions is to take pride in them and infuse same in the younger generation. Following measures are recommended in this regard:

- Revitalization of educational syllabus to promote pride in own culture and encourage pluralism through respect for other cultures.
- Government patronage for holding various cultural events and encouragement of whole-hearted participation by all segments of society and not only the elite class.
- Strict action against the elements who try to sabotage cultural activities in the name of religion.
- Development of the historical sites and allied facilities on international standards to promote cultural heritage through tourism.
- Active role by the media in promotion of own culture and checking invasion of unwanted culture as well as

countering anti-culture propaganda of the fundamentalists.

Foundation of Technical / IT Base. The factors needed to be addressed in this regard are: -

- Focus and generous funding on technical education right from the school level.
- Establishment of international standard institutes of science and technology like the five Indian Institutes of Technology which are regarded as premier world class institutions.
- Special incentives and requisite facilities for HRD in the field of IT and development / export of computer software.

Brain Drain. Rising demand of professionals in modern fields such as Information Technology has resulted in wave of migration from Pakistan to the Western countries. This phenomenon could turn out to be a blessing in disguise. These professionals who are migrating will provide strong linkages and act as I.T experts from Pakistan in the medium to long term. However, in the short term this exodus is creating substantial gap between the demand and supply of technical personnel within Pakistan. This drain on well-trained / competent human resource should be addressed by broadening the base of HRD in the same fields.

Conclusion

In a nutshell, the process of globalization has been taking place for centuries. The modern technological revolution has only hastened the process. Globalization has been affecting both the individuals and the states alike, as the impact of globalization is all encompassing. As a result of globalization, not only the traditional authority of the state has begun to erode, the very basis of the nation-state system is also being questioned. Transnational corporations and institutions have been gaining immense influence. The process has become a source of integration as well as confrontation between and among the states in the present day

international system. Being largely rigid and conservative, the developing societies, states, institutions and values have been experiencing both the advantages and perils of globalization. To what extent the process of globalization would ultimately effect developing countries is as yet difficult to determine.

Globalization offers many opportunities to the nations willing to take risks. However, if nation states sacrifice too much of their identities to the dictates of border less economy, a black lash of globalization can occur. Therefore, in order to reap the benefits of the globalization and to reduce their vulnerability, it is important to open the economies but the liberalization of the economy should be in gradual phases coupled with domestic macro economic stability based on a transparent financial system.

Through the process of globalization the world needs to move towards establishing a true global village, while maintaining the cultural diversity of various countries. Diversity is the beauty of life and is a great human asset. Any effort by a dominant group to impose a particular culture on the rest of the world will create problems for the whole world. What we need is a human face of globalization.

As for future of globalization, it is reasonable to assume that the process of increased interconnectedness, interdependence and softer borders will continue. The CIA-sponsored *Global Trends 2015*, published in late 2000, revised its previous estimates by placing even more emphasis on globalization 'as a more powerful driver' than previously anticipated.

Notes

¹ Stephen R Covey, *The Seven Habits of Highly Effective People*, Ch-1, Sydney: Simon & Schuster, 1989.

² *Ibid.*

³ Paul Streeten, "Globalization: Threat or Opportunity?" *The Pakistan Development Review*, Vol.37, No.4, Part I, Winter 1998, pp.51-76.

⁴ Caroline Thomas, 'Poverty, Development and Hunger', in John Baylis and Steve Smith (eds) *The Globalization of World Politics: An Introduction to International Relations* (Oxford: Oxford University Press,1999),p.464.

- ⁵ Hans-Henrik Holm and Georg Sorensen, *Whose World Order? Uneven Globalisation and the End of the Cold War* (Boulder, Col.: West View,1995), p.4.
- ⁶ www.gsm.uci.edu/econsoc/Guillen.html
- ⁷ Erik Oddvar Erikson, *Globalisation and Democracy* (University of Oslo Press, 1999), ARENA Working Paper No. 23, p.1.
- ⁸ Richards Devetak and Richard Higgott, 'Justice Unbound? Globalisation, States and the Transformation of the Social Bond', (International Affairs 75 (3) July 1999),p.491.
- ⁹ Anthony Giddens, 'Globalisation: An Irresistible Force', Daily Yumiuri June 7, 1999, <http://www.globalpolicy.org/globalize/define/irresfrc.htm>.
- ¹⁰ Joseph Stiglitz, E. 2002. *Globalization and Its Discontents*.(NY: Norton), p.3.
- ¹¹ Helen V. Milner, *Globalization, Development, and International Institutions: Normative and Positive Perspectives*, (Princeton University, September 14, 2005).
- ¹² Khalid Rehman, *The Role of MNCs and their Socio-Economic Impact on Host Societies*, ASCE (University of Karachi), p.23.
- ¹³ Ibid, p.36.
- ¹⁴ N.M. Kondap (Vice Chancellor Narsee Monjee University), *Changing Paradigms*, Business India, October 22, 2006.
- ¹⁵ *Trade on Human Terms*, Asia Pacific Human Development Report,2006,UNDP.
- ¹⁶ Khalid Rehman, *The Role of MNCs and their Socio-Economic Impact on Host Societies*, ASCE (University of Karachi), p.40.
- ¹⁷ A report titled: *Milking Profits*, The Network for Consumer Protection, Islamabad, 1999.
- ¹⁸ Brynjar Lia , *Globalization and the Future of Terrorism*, (Routledge, London and New York), p.19.
- ¹⁹ Louise Richardson, *Terrorists as Transnational Actors*, *Terrorism and Political Violence* 11(4) (winter 1999), p.210.
- ²⁰ Charles E.Hurst., *Social Inequality: Forms, Causes, and Consequences*, 6th ed. P.91 (Wikipedia)
- ²¹ J.Scherer, *Globalization and Promotional Culture*, *New Media & Society* 9/2007,p. 475–496. (Wikipedia)
- ²² Brynjar Lia , *Globalization and the Future of Terrorism*, Routledge, London and New York, p.24.
- ²³ Moonis Ahmar, *Globalization:Economic,Social and Political Dimensions*, ASCE, (University of Karachi), p. 179.
- ²⁴ Ishtiaq Ahmed, *Globalization and Human Rights in Pakistan*, *International Journal of Punjab Studies*, op. cit.
- ²⁵ Abul Kalam, *Challenges of the Age of Globalization*, *Spotlight on Regional Affairs*, (Islamabad: Institute of Regional Studies, Vol.XX, No.4, April2001), P.8.
- ²⁶ Jennifer Bennett, *Globalization and Human Development in Pakistan and India*, (Colombo: RCSS, 2001), p.167.
- ²⁷ Research undertaken by the Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Islamabad.
- ²⁸ Government of Pakistan, *Economic Survey 2004-5*, p.145-6.

²⁹ Catarina Kinnval, C Kinnval, & Kristina Johnson, *Globalization and Democratization in Asia*, (London: Routledge, 2002).

³⁰ Alison Brysk (ed.), *Globalization and Human Rights*, (California:University of California Press,2002) in PI Cheema, *Globalization:Economic,Social and Political Dimensions* ASCE, (University of Karachi), p. 107.

³¹ UN Committee on Trade and Development, *Multinational Corporations in Least Developed Countries*, available at <http://www.globalpolicy.org/reform/2002>.

NEXUS OF NUCLEAR PROLIFERATION

Lieutenant Colonel Dr. Muhammad Khan

General

The world's de jure and de facto nuclear weapon states (NWS) possess a staggering over 26,000 nuclear weapons,¹ which are enough to destroy the planet many times over. Apparently the enormous destructive power of nukes, as displayed in atomic bombing of Japanese cities, compelled the world to vainly seek the existing notions of non-proliferation and disarmament. The cycle of proliferation began with America's quest to monopolise the possession of nuclear weapons. It could not deter other members of the five declared nuclear weapon states (P-5) from making nuclear weapons; likewise the Nuclear Club could not deter India, Pakistan and North Korea from making and testing nuclear weapons.

Similarly, the Club looked the other way once Israel attained the nuclear prowess. NWS have tested an estimated 2053 nuclear devices so far,² contaminating the earth and its atmosphere for a foreseeable future. From the perspective of P-5, the story of proliferation of nuclear weapons dates back to March 5, 1970 once the NPT came into force but for the unwanted members of Nuclear Club, it began on October 9, 1941 once President Roosevelt approved the Manhattan Project—America's nuclear weapons program during World War-II. As Albert Einstein noted; “the unleashed power of the atom has changed everything save our modes of thinking, and thus we drift toward unparalleled catastrophe”³. Interestingly, he was instrumental in convincing President Roosevelt to pursue the nuclear weapons programme.

The world has paid an enormous cost for the pursuit of nuclear weapons; in terms of money, environmental contamination, larger insecurity and a looming danger of any irresponsible use of nuclear weapons by any state(s). According to a 1996 report, America alone had spent a staggering \$5,821 billion⁴ on its nuclear weapons programme. If the U.S. and other members of nuclear club had spent even one-fourth of this amount on poverty alleviation and

on building bridges amongst themselves and the impoverished Global South, they would not have needed the nuclear weapons and could still have maintained their guard through large conventional weapon stockpiles that they possess.

This paper takes a temporal view of proliferation before NPT entered into the force. It also posits that non-proliferation regime is discriminatory as the existing nuclear weapon states themselves have a chequered history and cannot assert other states, non-signatory to the NPT, not to proliferate. Correspondingly, a way forward has also been suggested to break the impasse in the realisation of goals set by the non-proliferation regime.

Nuclear Proliferation in Perspective

The term nuclear proliferation may be defined as the spread of nuclear weapons, fissile material and other materials related to nuclear technology and information associated to these to all those nations who did not possess nuclear weapons prior to the laid down duration as given in NPT. The U.S Department of Defence defines proliferation as the “process by which one nation after another comes into possession of, or into the right to determine the use of nuclear weapons; each nation becomes potentially able to launch a nuclear attack upon another nation”.⁵ These definitions can be considered partisan so the best alternative definition can be “Any nation not abiding by the terms of NPT is indeed considered to be engaging in nuclear proliferation.”⁶

As specified in the NPT, a NWS is the one that exploded a nuclear device prior to January 1, 1967, recognised as a baseline limit for keeping the number of nuclear weapon states to five only. This was done in the perspective that by that time only five countries; United States, Soviet Union (Russia), Britain, France and China could attain this capability by exploding their nuclear devices between 1945 and 1964. These NWS are also called the Permanent five (P-5), named after their permanent membership of United Nations Security Council.

Early Non-proliferation Efforts

According to Hans Blix, the former Director General of the IAEA, “The early U.S. efforts which sought to preclude individual states from producing highly enriched uranium and plutonium and tried to place the nuclear genie in a jointly controlled bottle—were rejected by former Soviet Union under Stalin”.⁷ The US along with Canada and Britain proposed for a central control and regulating of atomic energy through the Baruch Plan; conceived and proposed by Bernard Baruch on the direction of President Truman. The plan proposed to constitute “an International Atomic Development Authority”⁸ for the monopoly “of mining uranium and thorium, refining the ores, owning materials, and constructing and operating plants necessary for the use of nuclear power”.⁹

The regulating authority was to be established by the UNO with the U.S to provide it the necessary information as it was the sole possessor by then.¹⁰ Since the former Soviet Union was apprehensive of the U.S. and Western domination over the regulating authority, therefore, it rejected the plan.¹¹ However, later on President Eisenhower conceived a new strategy for a better control on nuclear proliferation through his ‘Atoms for Peace Programme’, thus expecting too much from this anarchic international state system.

America perhaps thought that it would be able to achieve control over nuclear weapons by offering nuclear technology, equipment and material¹² to other countries for the peaceful uses of nuclear energy. The regime expected in return that through verifications, it would ensure that no misuse of the technology could be made by the recipient states. The programme lacked a strategy that could guarantee the assistance provided for peaceful uses of nuclear technology and related material was not diverted to a weapons programme. Hence the ‘Atoms for Peace’ strategy could not serve the desired purpose of maintaining American monopoly over nuclear weapons or exerting UN control and implementation of the programme. This led the world to the first international agreement for putting a ban on further proliferation of the nuclear weapons in the form of NPT.

Prior to that, the Partial Test Ban Treaty (PTBT) of 1963 was another effort by the U.S. for controlling proliferation and imposing a ban on nuclear testing in the atmosphere and under water. It was primarily a CBM, devised after the 1962 Cuban Missile Crisis to stabilize the super power's relations. All parties to the NPT were obliged to the non-transfer and non-acquisition of nuclear weapons, as enshrined in the Treaty. The NWS undertook not to assist, encourage or induce NNWS to manufacture or acquire such weapons. Practically, this did not happen as India, a non signatory to NPT, was not deterred in its pursuit of nuclear weapons and exploded its first nuclear device in 1974. Similarly, Israel is also believed to have nuclear weapons since late 1960s.

The Architects of Nuclear Genie

German's Discovery of Nuclear Fission. Nazi Germany set up the world's first ever heavy water production plant at Rjukan in the German occupied portion of Norwegian territory. However, prior to that in 1938, two German scientists, Otto Hahn and Fritz Strassman discovered the nuclear fission chain reaction that laid the grounds for the development of first atomic device. During experiments, Hahn found that nucleus of the uranium atom can be split by bombing it with neutrons, which would convert some of its mass into energy. Through one of his old colleague, Hahn's discovery reached to Albert Einstein. Einstein, a former German physicist and head of the Kaiser Wilhelm Institute of Physics¹³ had fled Nazi Germany because of the brutality of the Nazi regime and settled in U.S.

Later on with American and Western support, the Norwegian commandos raided and destroyed the Rjukan Plant on February 27, 1943.¹⁴ An attempt for the transportation of the bits and bobs of the plant was also foiled in another raid by the Norwegian commandos and subsequent air attacks of Allied forces,¹⁵ thus forcing the Nazis to abandon their nuclear programme altogether. Thereafter, no worthwhile progress could be made by the Germans on the nuclear fission chain reaction.

The Manhattan Project. Subsequent to the discovery of nuclear fission chain reaction by German scientists, Einstein found it as an apt opportunity to offset the Nazi's potential. He contacted the U.S President through Alexander Sachs, a Wall Street economist through a letter in August 1939. Einstein wrote to President Roosevelt that "utilizing uranium made it probable that large amounts of power could be produced by a chain reaction and that, by harnessing this power, the construction of extremely powerful bombs..."¹⁶ was conceivable. He also referred the German research on the subject to the President Roosevelt. Roosevelt agreed to Einstein's proposal and constituted a committee to study the project in October 1939.¹⁷

The committee finally recommended establishment of the Manhattan Project, formally named Manhattan Engineer District (MED)¹⁸ for the development of nuclear weapons by the U.S. Under General Leslie R. Groves, the project was undertaken by U.S Army Corps of Engineers from 1942 to 1946. With the three primary sites within U.S, the project was spread over thirty sites with the employment of 130,000 people at the cost of \$2 billion¹⁹. Under the MED, a plutonium production facility was established at Hansford Site; a uranium-enrichment facility at Oak Ridge-Tennessee, and a nuclear weapon research and design laboratory at Los Alamos.

Apart from the scientists from the UK, Canada, France and expatriate Jews from Germany, J. Robert Oppenheimer²⁰, the US physicists supervised the scientific research of the MED on the whole. America's nuclear weapons programme thus was not completely indigenous. Rather, it was a product of Jewish émigré German scientists who settled in the U.S and convinced the Roosevelt Administration that they could produce a nuclear weapon with enormous power. Moreover most of the scientists worked for the project under an ideological motivation against Nazis. Their collective effort geared to make a weapon to punish the Germans.

Historians and analysts of World War-II strongly believe that by the beginning of 1945, Japanese war stamina had reduced significantly, and it could have conceded defeat any time between August and September 1945. The argument gains credence from the

fact that Allies carried out extensive strategic bombing over all the major cities of Japan, including those later hit by nuclear weapons. Japanese war industry and infrastructure were completely neutralized, leading to an unconditional surrender in mid August, 1945. Hence, the use of nuclear weapons by the U.S. was not in fact meant for bringing WW-II to a swift end, rather it was to exhibit its military ascendancy to the world, especially to the Soviet Union.

From the ashes of WW-II, the United States emerged as a matchless power at the global arena that remained the only nuclear power till the Soviet Union attained nuclear capability. This feeling of uniqueness was reflected in President Truman's speech after the use of nuclear weapons over two Japanese cities, when he said; "having found the bomb, we have to use it. We have used it against those who attacked us without warning at Pearl Harbor, against those who have starved and beaten and executed American prisoners of war, against those who have abandoned all pretense of obeying international laws of warfare."²¹

As a sequel to the attack on Japan in 1945, a number of the scientists from Manhattan Project had returned to their countries and some even transferred the nuclear technology to their native countries as well as to others. Since most of them had their real names concealed into code names, therefore, their exact identification was barely known²². However, emotionally, these scientists worked on ideological grounds rather purely for the financial basis.

Soviet Union Goes Nuclear

As discussed above, Soviet Union did not agree to American Baruch Plan, suggesting that all material usable for nuclear weapons be placed under international control. The former Soviet Union, however, had already placed moles in the Manhattan Project and was privy to intricate details of the project. Klaus Fuchs, a German born British scientist, who worked at the bomb research and development laboratory at Los Alamos, was a Russian agent. Therefore, the Soviet Union was also able to collect sufficient

expertise from the German scientists, involved in the Vemork Hydrogen Electrolysis Plant.

However, Fuchs who remained actively involved at Los Alamos along with some other scientists provided the technical assistance to the Soviet Union that led to its first successful nuclear device test in 1949. This development destabilized Europe in particular; France and Britain could no more rely on the nuclear umbrella by the U.S against a potential Soviet nuclear attack and were more inclined to seek their independent nuclear deterrent. However, the Soviet threat was not the only reason of their becoming nuclear. They indeed wanted to maintain their former status of major powers through possession of nuclear weapons.

Britain's Independent Deterrent

The nuclear programme of Britain predates the Manhattan Project. However, during World War-II, the country was not considered safe to establish nuclear plant, mainly because of the German strategic bombing. Being the ally of the US in WW-II, its scientists greatly contributed towards the development of the Manhattan Project. However, consequent to the activation and endorsement of Atomic Energy Act of 1946, the United States, by then the only nuclear power, was barred by law to transfer either the nuclear technology or the expertise to any other state including those who supported it in making the first nuclear device. Out of a number of scientists, working in the Manhattan Project, the British nuclear experts returned home with the designs and other requisite expertise to help their homeland in the development of nuclear weapons. Britain detonated its first nuclear weapon, code named Hurricane, off the Australian island of Trimouille on October 3, 1952.

French Force de Frappe

French had nuclear scientists, like the Curies, even before Nazi Germany contemplated nuclear capability. However, America benefitted from their ground breaking research in the field, while the French 4th Republic did not provide patronage to research till end of World War-II. Russia's nuclearisation spurred France to react.

Though the U.S assured its allies to provide them the nuclear shield against any threat from the Communist Russia, France however, wanted to maintain its old dignity as a major power by having nuclear capability of its own. French strategists like Andre Beaufre and Galois gave the concept of independent deterrence—Force de Frappe that resonated with growing French nationalism. Famous French physicist, Bertrand Goldschmidt can be credited for the bomb. He had rich experience at Manhattan Project as he was part of the British and Canadian team till end of World War-II. He later returned to his own country for the development of France's nuclear programme. France conducted its first nuclear test, code named "Gerboise Bleue", at Reggane, Algeria on February 13, 1960.

China's Entry in to the Club

By 1950s China was completely entrenched in to the Communist camp and Russia felt obliged to share nuclear expertise with its comrades and signed a secret pact with China in 1951. In return Russia benefitted from abundant Chinese uranium ores. This cooperation was however short-lived and lasted till late 1950s after which Russia withdrew; but by then Chinese had the necessary technological infrastructure and their scientists had gained significant expertise and on October 16, 1964 tested their device at the Lop Nor Testing Ground and used an odd codename "596" for the test of its nuclear device.

Traces of Indian Nuclear Programme

India's nuclear programme dates back to 1945 once Homi Jehangir Bhabha returned from U.K. with a doctorate to establish Tata Institute of Fundamental Research with the help of Sir Dorab Tata—his uncle and an industrial tycoon.²³ Bhabha was Rutherford's disciple in U.K. and the latter was one of the most prominent nuclear scientists of his time and architect of the British nuclear program. Bhabha became a member of Indian Atomic Energy Commission (IAEC).

In his inaugural address to the IAEC in April 1948, Nehru said, "We must develop this atomic energy quite apart from war - indeed I think we must develop it for the purpose of using it for

peaceful purposes. ... of course, if we are compelled as a nation to use it for other purposes, possibly no pious sentiments of any of us will stop the nation from using it that way".²⁴

A former US Army engineer, Mr. Kenneth Nichols, who contributed significantly in establishing the Manhattan Project, narrates that; in early 1960s, in a meeting with Nehru and Bhabha, Mr. Nehru turned to Bhabha and asked: "Can you develop an atomic bomb?" Bhabha assured him that he could and in reply to Nehru's next question about time, he estimated that he would need about a year to do it. ... He concluded by saying to Bhabha "Well, don't do it until I tell you to."²⁵

India started its nuclear programme in a lax environment and the West readily offered help. In 1955, India in collaboration with the United Kingdom started constructing its first nuclear reactor.²⁶ In the same year Canada provided India with a 40 MW, Canada-India Reactor and later in 1956, under the Atoms for Peace Programme, the U.S. agreed to provide 21 tons of heavy water for this reactor thus renaming it, Canada-India Reactor US, later truncated as CIRUS. In the absence of any international policy on transfer of technology and being discreet and futuristic in getting the facility without any strings from the U.S, India set up an indigenous programme to manufacture natural uranium fuel for Cirus with its own control over the production of plutonium? The reactor was designed to produce significant amounts of weapon-grade plutonium, some of which was used in 1974 nuclear test.

Cirus became the surrogate for more reactors like Dhruva plutonium production reactor. During the developmental stages of Indian nuclear programme, the Apsara, fuelled by enriched uranium from the United Kingdom, became critical on August 4, 1957, thus becoming the first operating reactor in the whole of Asia (with exception of former Soviet Union) while Cirus reached criticality at BARC on 10 July 1960. Thanks to the U.S. assistance, Indian civilian nuclear programme also started in early sixties at Tarapur.

In their close alliance, the former Soviet Union assisted India in its nuclear and missile programme on a number of occasions. As

per documentary records; in 1983, Techsnabexport illegally sold 4.7 tons of heavy water and arranged its shipment to India via UAE through West German broker Alfred Hempel²⁷. The same company sent 6 tons of heavy water cargoes to Bombay via Zurich in July 1985 and 4 tons of heavy water cargo via truck to West Germany²⁸, for re-export via Zurich to Bombay in December 1985 in complete violation of German export laws. In 1988, an agreement was reached between former Soviet Union and India for supply of two 1,000-megawatt power reactors²⁹ without requiring full-scope safeguards as stipulated in IAEA. From 1988 to 1990, Soviet Union provided two Charlie-1 class nuclear-powered submarines that are usually equipped with eight SS-N-7 anti-ship, nuclear-capable cruise missiles³⁰.

India had signed an agreement with Iran for providing it with 10- megawatt nuclear research reactor, but had to cancel it for the sake of its long term gains from U.S.³¹ However in December 2003, the then Indian Foreign Minister Mr. Jaswant Singh categorically said that, “India has and would continue to help Iran in its controversial bid to generate nuclear energy.³²” Two well-known Indian nuclear scientists Dr. C. Surender and Dr. Y.S.R. Prasad, from the Nuclear Power Corporation of India Limited (NPCIL), faced U.S sanctions on the charges of working in Iranian nuclear plants in 2004³³.

There have been traces of proliferation and export of nuclear material to India by a number of US firms in complete violation of the Export Administration Regulations³⁴. Quite a few have also been even metaphorically investigated. It has been revealed that a case has been reported in the US State Department in which a U.S firm exported technical information to an entity in India associated with its missile programme. In yet another case a U.S firm had made an effort at unlicensed export of bio-toxins to Democratic People’s Republic of Korea through an Indian firm in New Delhi³⁵. Despite poor Indian non-proliferation record, in which the U.S itself has been a party, the former has voluntarily offered India with nuclear technology transfer through the Indo-US Nuclear Deal, ratified in 2008, under unusual circumstances. The Indo-US Nuclear enables Nuclear Supplier Group (NSG) to provide India with Uranium and

other nuclear materials required for the preparation of nuclear energy.

India is secretly managing supply of Tributyl Phosphate (TBP), which is used to separate the plutonium from spent fuel through reprocessing, and its supply has been arranged from Germany and Russia through its trading companies. As its supply and trading is not allowed for unsafeguarded nuclear programme being used for nuclear weapon production, therefore, the Indian companies claim its use to be for non weapon production nuclear complexes, but actually provide it to the former. One such order was for 160 metric tonnes of TBP which was passed through multiple trading companies in India and Europe. In most of the cases the Indian Nuclear Fuel Complex (NFC) “hid behind trading companies and procured TBP without the suppliers knowing that the materials were for the unsafeguarded nuclear programme.³⁶ According to the ISIS, India Rare Earths (IRE), a sub-entity of India’s Department of Atomic Energy, has procured sensitive materials and technology from an international nuclear network for a secret gas-centrifuge uranium enrichment plant codenamed ‘Rare Materials Project’ (RMP) outside Mysore, India”³⁷.

The Case of Israel

Ernst David Bergmann, the founding father of Israeli nuclear weapons programme and first director of Israeli Atomic Energy Commission, along with a number of well qualified physicists and nuclear scientists migrated to Palestine before Israel became an independent country.³⁸ Israel and India are Siamese twins since their nuclear programmes were conceived before their formal independence. Bergman could bypass the bureaucracy to directly access the Prime Minister. Hence he could easily convince the government to run civil and weapons programme in tandem. In 1948, Israeli scientists explored and found uranium deposits near Beersheba and Sidon and started working for production of heavy water at newly created Weizmann Institute of Science and Israel’s Atomic Energy Commission was established under Ministry of Defence in 1952.³⁹

France reportedly provided support sans barriers to Israeli nascent nuclear programme. They undertook joint nuclear research at Saclay, a French nuclear research facility.⁴⁰ French scientists Francis Perrin, a close friend of Bergmann and his team of Manhattan Project veterans remained deeply involved in extending nuclear cooperation and provision of nuclear data to Israel. It is believed that during the period of mutual cooperation, Israeli scientists got advanced expertise in the nuclear technology and even, helped construct the G-1 plutonium production reactor and UP-1 reprocessing plant at Marcoule. France profited from two Israeli patents on heavy water production and low-grade uranium enrichment.

The situation arising out of Arab-Israel War-1956, stepped up the Israeli nuclear programme, once it concluded an agreement with France for EL-3 type thermal nuclear research reactor of 18 MW along with plutonium separation technology in October 1956 and later upgraded to 24 MW and the level of 125-150 MW subsequently. French unwavering support to Israeli nuclear deterrent, as it was officially known, was extended to prop-up the latter as a strategic counterweight to Egypt since Egypt was supporting the Algerian rebels fighting against the French colonialism. It is also said that French provided 2-3 nuclear devices to Israel during the 1967 Arab-Israeli War as a readymade deterrent for use, should a need arise.

Nuclearisation of North Korea

History of North Korean nuclear ambitions can be traced back to late 1960s, when former Soviet Union provided it with a 5 MW⁴¹ research reactor which was later upgraded to 8 MW. Later it established a large scale Atomic Energy Research Complex in the town of Yongbyon with 25 MW platinum based gas-graphite reactor which was operationalized in 1986⁴². “It had 801 channels for stacking fuel rods (10 fuel rods stuck in each channel) and for guiding control rods. Each fuel rod has diameter of 3 cm and length of 50 cm. On an assumption that the 750 of these channels were occupied by fuel, the total fuel would be around 45 tons⁴³”.

The country was able to achieve advance fabrication and conversion capability in 1980s and conducted high-explosive detonation tests. Succumbing to international pressure, it acceded to the NPT in 1985 but withdrew from it in 2003. On October 9, 2006, North Korea conducted a sub-surface nuclear test that measured 4.2 on Richter scale and had an estimated yield less than 1 kiloton. This prompted the UNSC to clamp tough sanctions on the North Korea under its Resolution number 1695.

On February 13, 2007, in a dramatic shift North Korea agreed to dismantle its nuclear facilities. Apparently this was a major breakthrough for regional security in East Asia, considered to be the main achievement of global non proliferation regime in many years and can be credited to Chinese pressure. As per the agreement, North Korea was to dismantle its nuclear programme and seal off all such facilities including shut down of its plutonium producing reactor at Yongbyon in exchange of energy package within sixty days of the agreement. The deal allowed North Korea to retain whatever nuclear weapons it had built, including fissile material. As it turned out later, the North Koreans were just buying time and wanted to give some face saving to China. After the passage of the requisite time period (60 days), the respective parties did not fully implement their obligations. On 25 May 2009, North Koreans tested another nuclear device and the fiasco is likely to continue for a foreseeable future.

Iran's Unique Case

Iranian nuclear programme was conceived in late 1950s and developed in 1970s under the U.S 'Atoms for Peace Programme'⁴⁴. During the early 1970s, Iran like Pakistan, planned about two dozen nuclear power plant, but the programme could not be implemented and completed as the nuclear supplier states led by the U.S. stopped assistance in the wake of Indian nuclear test of 1974. Later the country passed through the 1979 'Islamic Revolution', which resulted into its unpleasant relationship with US and West⁴⁵. Then the country had a long war with Iraq from 1980 to 1988. During this period most of its trained nuclear scientists like Dr. Akbar Etmad

fled the country⁴⁶. Iran started revamping its nuclear programme after 1988.

Iran's case is unique as the West has not been able to prove that Iran has proliferated, rather it can at best be held guilty for violation of its safeguards agreement with the IAEA. In 2002, an Iranian dissident group revealed the sites and secret development of its nuclear programme. Since then the programme is under severe Western criticism and scrutiny. As per the Iranian Government, its nuclear programme is purely for peaceful purposes. Iran formally announced enrichment of uranium in 2006 and turned down an EU proposal intended to help Iran build a safe, economically viable and proliferation-proof civil nuclear power generation and research programme⁴⁷. Between 2006 and 2008 UNSC has imposed a number of sanctions, demanding Iran to suspend its nuclear activities failing which it may be subjected to punitive action under Article 41 of UN's Chapter VII⁴⁸.

According to the IAEA, Iran presently does not possess nuclear weapons, or even weapon-grade uranium. In May 2007, Mr. Mohamed El Baradei, Director General of the IAEA, disclosed that Iran could develop nuclear weapon in a period of three to eight years but the IAEA has not been able to provide sufficient evidence to date⁴⁹. In December 2007, U.S National Intelligence Estimate (NIE) declared that Iran had ended any nuclear weapons related programme in 2003. The report was later disregarded by US and the West alike by saying that Iran is still continuing uranium enrichment and missile development programmes.

On February 22, 2008, the IAEA, through a report, quashed the Western point of view about Iran's nuclear programme. It confirmed that 'all major past issues surrounding Iran's nuclear activities had been fully resolved or were, no longer outstanding at that stage'. Both the U.S and Iran interpreted the contents of the report to their own convenience. The IAEA, however, expressed its concern about Iran's continued uranium enrichment with upgraded centrifuges. On March 3, 2008, brushing aside all positive reports of USA's NIE and IAEA, the UNSC almost unanimously slapped new sanctions on Iran through its Resolution 1803.⁵⁰ On November

27, 2009, the IAEA Boards of Governors and UNSC unanimously adopted a resolution recalling Iran to abide by the previous resolutions on its nuclear programme. Noting its serious concern, the resolution called for suspension of Iran's uranium enrichment activities and its failure to notify the agency about the secret nuclear facilities at Qom⁵¹.

Pakistan's Nuclear Programme

Pakistan Atomic Energy Commission (PAEC) was established in 1956 with the help of Atoms for Peace Programme. Pakistan established its first light water research reactor, Pakistan Atomic Research Reactor (PARR-1), of 5 MW near Islamabad in 1965. The U.S government provided financial assistance for this reactor too. Mr. Zulfikar Ali Bhutto initiated the nuclear weapons programme as a deterrent against any future Indian misadventure in 1972.⁵² Mr. Bhutto announced the appointment of Mr. Munir Ahmed Khan, a proponent of the bomb lobby as Chairman of PAEC in January, 1972 at the Multan conference of senior scientists. He remained Chairman of PAEC till 1991 and was Director of Nuclear Power and Reactors Division of IAEA before his return to Pakistan. It was PAEC that primarily drove the country's nuclear programme and the Western perception that only Dr. A. Q. Khan supervised the programme from its inception till production of weapon is inaccurate.⁵³ Indeed Dr. Khan, a German trained metallurgist joined the Pakistan's nuclear programme in 1976⁵⁴. He brought with him technology/ expertise of gas centrifuge which he had acquired through his position at the classified URENCO uranium enrichment plant in the Netherlands.

Through a deal, France agreed to establish a nuclear reprocessing plant at Chasma in 1975, but later on differences arose over the design of the plant and it withdrew from the project. The project is being completed by Pakistan at its own. Prior this in 1971, the Canadian General Electric Company (CGEC) helped Pakistan in establishment of its first electric power generation reactor; Karachi Nuclear Power Plant (KANUPP). Its capacity is 137 MW. The plant went critical in October 1972. The facility has been under the IAEA safeguards and is used for power production. Canadian assistance

also waned on technical reasons once India exploded its first nuclear device in 1974. China helped Pakistan in establishing its nuclear power plant at Chashma. In 1986, PAEC began work on a 50 MW plutonium production nuclear reactor at Khushab which was completed in 1996 and went critical in 1998. It is a Pakistani designed and built heavy water nuclear reactor.

It is widely assumed that Pakistan crossed the threshold of weapons-grade uranium production in 1985 and by the end 1986, had produced enough fissile material for a nuclear weapon. Pakistan tested its nuclear weapons on May 28 and 30, 1998 in a tit for tat response to Indian nuclear tests of May 11 and 13, 1998⁵⁵. PAEC had completed its nuclear fuel cycle facilities by early 1980s and had carried out the first cold test of a working nuclear device on March 11, 1983.

NPT's Future and the Way Forward

NPT is the pivot of the non-proliferation regime. Forty one years ago, on July 1st, the Treaty was opened for signatures with a hope to avert nuclear war and to promote peaceful application of nuclear technology. Yet with these 'noble aims' and only four nay-Sayers the Treaty has not lived up to the expectations and its future hangs in balance. This was because while the NNWS fulfilled their promises, the NWS have not met their obligations and have rather betrayed the former's trust by extending favours to non-signatories like India. Interestingly, the NNWS have innocently assumed the main burden of the obligation.⁵⁶

The world community is following two parallel and slightly different approaches to achieve the common aim of paving the way towards nuclear disarmament. The non-proliferation regime has happened to be soft on the violators of the NPT compared to the proactive counter proliferation regime, mainly based on U.S national policy. However, both have an inconsistent record of success. It is a unique international agreement that bans possession of nuclear weapons by an overwhelming majority of 189 states and has the stomach to permit possession of the same weapons, for an unspecified period, by only five states.⁵⁷ These handfuls 'Nuclear

Haves' are free to retain their arsenals while asking the majority to attain a Nuclear Zero. The 'Haves-Not' stoically have resisted the tempting magic elixir and are still eyed with suspicion while the veto-wielding powers have violated the treaty and proliferated. Germany, Japan and others have exercised restraints to revoke the NPT; otherwise morals are the only impediment to their weaponisation. The crux is that the proliferators predating January 1, 1967 cannot be jurists themselves.

NPT's viability will depend on whether the NWS fulfil their obligations. Hence the Treaty may unravel once a state or a group may decide to withdraw from the NPT to demonstrate their disappointment and disapproval, even without an intention to go nuclear.⁵⁸ The treaty will be reviewed in 2010 and Pakistan is likely to again come under pressure to sign it, as India and Israel have lately become an exception to rules of the regime. The Lisbon Treaty, that entered in to force on 1 December 2009, has given another interesting dimension of NPT—the status of nuclear weapons of Britain and France. As per NPT, the NWS cannot transfer their weapons to NNWS states. After further unification of Europe and common defence requirements the issue of inheritance and employment of British and French nuclear weapons will rise. As Russia inherited former Soviet Union's coveted status of NWS, will E.U. inherit two nuclear powers' weapons? If they do, the NPT will lose validity and will legally have to include E.U as a NWS thus creating an opportunity for Pakistan and India to achieve that status too.

What is the way forward? A simple answer is 'No' and a complex answer is 'May be Yes'. America is the lead country in global anti-proliferation agenda and can influence the efforts to achieve its goals albeit little success. All multilateral initiatives on anti-proliferation come to a naught since consensus is difficult to build, especially once solutions are only P-5 centric. Hence, the latter have moved away from multilateralism to a shade lower that allows the P-5 or their chosen states to pursue advancement in nuclear technology for peaceful and military purposes. In such an environment there's really no way forward for countries like Pakistan that seek equitable application and implementation of rules

and treaties. Mr. Khurshid Kasuri, in his 2004 visit to U.S as Foreign Minister, expressed this sentiment which also served to dispel any pressure by the hosts to abandon the nuclear programme, “We have now moved to the next stage and are now seeking a new five-plus-three arrangement...we don’t want more nuclear powers.”⁵⁹ However, the EU’s case provides a ray of hope for Pakistan to be included in the Club.

The Treaty’s writ may not be seriously dented by such stance from Pakistan since it is not a signatory to the NPT; however a similar voice from industrially advanced and economically superior signatory states can not only sound a death knell to the NPT but to other anti-proliferation endeavours too. Besides retaining monopoly the P-5 face the paradox of recognizing the three de-facto NWS (Pakistan, India and Israel) and risk making NPT an anathema of NNWS. In a bid to make India a regional hegemon and a counter-weight to China, America may engineer India’s recognition as a NWS. What will be reaction of members of NPT, whose rights will be infringed, is yet to be seen? However, so far all sane voices of five-plus-three solution have not worked. Even the outgoing Director General of IAEA, Mr. El Baradei, was of the opinion that unless Pakistan, India and Israel are brought in to the fold of the non-proliferation regime it will remain incomplete and ineffective.⁶⁰

The nuclear technology, with its bliss in peaceful use and its bane of nuclear weapons has come to stay. From a realist perspective the idealist concepts of disarmament will never reach fruition. Non-proliferation is a vague and evasive concept that has been selectively applied and will not succeed. In an anarchic world only the fittest survive. Hence Pakistan must seek to invoke West’s commercial interests in pursuit of civil nuclear technology and the latter’s governments will automatically fall in line to lift sanctions and open the doors of NSG to Pakistan. One can leave the jilted members of NPT fend for themselves and either seek protection from the NWS or develop their own Force de Frappe by walking out of the Treaty for their supreme national interests.

Conclusion

Non nuclear weapons states (NNWS) come under criticism for proliferation and are criticised for not signing the Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty (NPT). The prelude of the entire debate begins from 1970, when the former Soviet Union, Britain, France and China had followed the American suit. Indeed states arm themselves for reasons of security, which is their inalienable right and the issue of disarmament loses credence once it is not universally applied. Though Pakistan, like India and Israel, is not a signatory of the NPT, however, it respects the near universal acceptance of the regime and following a state policy of not to share the nuclear weapons technology with other states. Thus Pakistan has placed effective regime in its nuclear energy and weapons programme to prevent any future chance of proliferation.

Notes

¹ World Nuclear arsenals -2009, Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, Washington D.C February -2009 >Bulletin of Atomic Scientists.

² Goldblat Jozef, Arms Control: The Guide to Negotiations and Agreements, Sage Publications, 2003. P.58.

³ Retrieved from <http://www.ecotopia.com/webpress/quotes.htm>
>www.spacemotion.com/AlbertEinstein-Quotes.htm.

⁴ Stephen Schwartz, (ed.) *Atomic Audit: The Costs and Consequences of U.S. Nuclear Weapons since 1940* (Washington, DC: Brookings Institution, 1998).

⁵ Dictionary of Military and Associated Terms. US Department of Defense 2005.

⁶ http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Nuclear_proliferation.

⁷ Morten Bremer Maerli and Sverre Lodgaard (Ed), *Nuclear Proliferation and International Society*; Routledge – 2007 (London and New York), p. XIV.

⁸ The Baruch Plan, Presented to the United Nations Atomic Energy Commission, June 14, 1946, available at www.Atomic Archive.com

⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰ Calvocoressi, *World Politics, 1945 – 2000*, Pearson Education India, 2001.

¹¹ Ibid.

¹² Morten Bremer Maerli and Sverre Lodgaard (Ed), *Nuclear Proliferation and International Society*; Routledge – 2007 (London and New York), p. XIV.

¹³ Freie Universitat, Berlin.

¹⁴ Mark Walker, *German National Socialism and the Quest for Nuclear Power-1939-1949*, Press Syndicate University of Cambridge ; New York , 1993.p. 120.

¹⁵ Morten Bremer Maerli and Sverre Lodgaard: *Nuclear proliferation and International Security*; Routledge, London and New York, 2007, p 1.

- ¹⁶ The Manhattan Project: Making the Atomic Bomb; Atomic Archive.com
- ¹⁷ Ibid.
- ¹⁸ Richard Rhodes, *The Making of the Atomic Bomb*; Simon & Schuster, 1986.
- ¹⁹ Stephen I. Schwartz *Atomic Audit: The Costs and Consequences of U.S. Nuclear Weapons*. Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institution Press, 1998. Manhattan Project expenditures.
- ²⁰ Gregg Herken, *The Winning Weapon: The Atomic Bomb in the Cold War, 1945-1950*, Knopf Publishers, New York; 1991.
- ²¹ Lawrence Freedman; *The Evolution of Nuclear Strategy*, Palgrave Macmillan, London; 2003.p. 36.
- ²² <http://www.answers.com/topic/manhattan-project>
- ²³ William H. Overholt (Ed); *Asia's Nuclear Future*, Studies of Research Institute on International Change, Colombia University, West View Press Inc; 1977. P. 165.
- ²⁴ Ibid. pp. 167.
- ²⁵ Origin of India's Nuclear Weapon Program, the Beginning: 1944-1960 retrieved from www.nuclearweaponarchive.org/India/IndiaOrigin.html
- ²⁶ Ibid.
- ²⁷ Indian Nuclear Proliferation Record, South Asia Research and Analysis Studies, August 27, 2009.
- ²⁸ Gary Milhollin, Asia's Nuclear Nightmare: The German Connection, *The Washington Post*, June 10, 1990, Wisconsin Project on Nuclear Arms Control.
- ²⁹ R. Adam Moody, the Indian-Russian Light Water Reactor Deal; the *Nonproliferation Review*/Fall 1997.
- ³⁰ The Soviet Nuclear Break-up - Promise or Peril? By Gary Milhollin and Gerard White, *International Affairs*, February 1992, p. 30.
- ³¹ India and Iran: WMD Proliferation Activities, Congressional Research Service, The Library of Congress, CRS Report for Congress by Sharon Squassoni, November 8, 2006, Order Code RS22530, Foreign Affairs, Defense, and Trade Division.
- ³² Sharon Squassoni, India and Iran: WMD Proliferation Activities, Specialist in National Defense, Foreign Affairs, CRS Report for Congress, Defense, and Trade Division, Order Code RS22530, November 8, 2006.
- ³³ India and Iran: WMD Proliferation Activities, Congressional Research Service, The Library of Congress, CRS Report for Congress by Sharon Squassoni, November 8, 2006, Order Code RS22530, Foreign Affairs, Defense, and Trade.
- ³⁴ William H. Overholt (Ed); *Asia's Nuclear Future*, Studies of Research Institute on International Change, Colombia University, West View Press Inc; 1977. P. 187.
- ³⁵ India and Iran: WMD Proliferation Activities, Congressional Research Service, The Library of Congress, CRS Report for Congress by Sharon Squassoni, November 8, 2006, Order Code RS22530, Foreign Affairs, Defense, and Trade Division.
- ³⁶ Indian Nuclear Export Controls and Information Security: Important Questions Remain, Are Indian export controls and information security congruent with the

promises and cheerleading? By David Albright and Paul Brannan Institute for Science and International Security (ISIS) Report, September 18, 2008.

³⁷ Indian Nuclear Export Controls and Information Security: Important Questions Remain, Are Indian export controls and information security congruent with the promises and cheerleading? By David Albright and Paul Brannan Institute for Science and International Security (ISIS) REPORT, September 18, 2008.

³⁸ Michael Karpin; *The Bomb in the Basement; How Israel Went Nuclear and What That Means for the World*, Simon and Schuster Paperbacks, New York, 2006. Pp. 96-103.

³⁹ Ibid. p. 128.

⁴⁰ Ibid. p. 129.

⁴¹ Pakistan Defence Review, Winter 2007, Volume-XXI, Number-II.

⁴² Ibid.

⁴³ Weapons of Mass Destruction, (wmd), Yongbyon 5-mw(e) Reactor, Gglobal Security Org.

⁴⁴ Volker Perthes, Ray Takeyh and Hitoshi Tanaka, *Engaging Iran and Building Peace in the Persian Gulf Region*, the Tri-lateral Commission, Washington-2008. P. 79.

⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶ An Interview with Akbar Etemad, the shah's chief atomic energy adviser by *Maziar Bahari*, New Statesman, September 11, 2008.

⁴⁷ Richard Falk and David Krieger, (Ed); *At the Nuclear Precipice; Catastrophe or Transformation*, Palgrave Macmillan, New York; 2008. Pp. 101-104.

⁴⁸ The Guardian, 27 September 2008> UNSC Resolutions; 1737 (2006), 1747 (2007), 1803 (2008) and 1835 (2008).

⁴⁹ Richard Falk and David Krieger, (Ed); *At the Nuclear Precipice; Catastrophe or Transformation*, Palgrave Macmillan, New York; 2008. pp. 100-101.

⁵⁰ Ibid. p. 117.

⁵¹ Resolution adopted by the Board of Governors IAEA on 27 November 2009> (GOV/2009/82, Date: 27 November 2009).

⁵² Muhammad B. Alam (Ed); *Essay on Nuclear Proliferation*, Vikas Publishing House Pvt. Ltd, New Delhi, 1995. P. 4

⁵³ Adrian Levy and Catherine Scott-Clark; *Deception; Pakistan, United States and Global Nuclear Weapons Conspiracy*, Atlantic Books; London; 2007. Pp. 7-9.

⁵⁴ Salik Naeem (2009), *The Genesis of South Asian Nuclear Deterrence: Pakistan's Perspective*, Oxford University Press. P. 279.

⁵⁵ Ibid. pp. 270-275.

⁵⁶ Goldblat Jozef, *Arms Control: The Guide to Negotiations and Agreements*, P.58, Sage Publications, 2003.

⁵⁷ Ibid.

⁵⁸ Ibid.

⁵⁹ The Dawn (Karachi), 21 May 2004.

⁶⁰ See El-Baradei's interview with 'Arms Control Today', Arms Control Association Washington, D.C., November 2003.

SUBCONTINENT SECURITY AND ITS IMPACT ON WORLD SECURITY: CHALLENGES AND THE WAY FORWARD

Lieutenant Colonel Sahir Shamshad Mirza

Introduction

The end of Cold war has brought about a dynamic change in the world balance of power and with it the need to redefine the concept of Security in the changing world order.¹ Scholars like Barry Buzan have also stressed upon importance of regional and international security especially highlighting their interdependence. The South Asian regional security is one such example that affects the international political and economic system. However, security in South Asia has always been precarious, considering the depth and multiplicity of social cleavages, animosities and increase in the destructive potential of the Subcontinent's two largest states.² The accumulation of factors like economic deprivation, poverty, lack of education, unemployment and the overarching human security issues vis a vis interests of stakeholders challenge the Subcontinent security.

The subcontinent has a history of wars and conflicts. There are consequently deep-rooted misperceptions and historical antagonism in the region. On several occasions in the past, efforts have been made to help bring about peace and stability but none achieved any meaningful results. History has given us another chance to bring the region some measure of sanity and stability. South Asian stability chiefly revolves around peace between India and Pakistan. Further, a dispassionate analysis would reveal that most of the problems and issues are India centric. Modern India unambiguously regards itself as the dominant power in the region. The subcontinent is also unique because nowhere else in the world two rival nuclear powers are geographically contiguous to each other. Moreover, nowhere the two powers have a flashpoint (of Kashmir) that is the cause of disagreement between the two nuclear rivals. This makes the subcontinent as most perilous in the world. The post 9/11 environment placed Pakistan as a front line state in

Global War on Terrorism (GWOT). Therefore, the subcontinent has to find a solution and way forward to overcome the challenges and benefit from its profitable position in the world politics. This paper attempts to advance some ideas and thoughts on the subject.

Aim

To analyse the prevailing security environment in the context of underlying challenges facing the regional security, the subcontinent and the impact of the subcontinent security on the global security matrix. The paper identifies ways forward to strengthen regional security and improve stability.

Dynamics of Regional Security

The literature identifies two primary referents of security; the state and the individual. Buzan gives great importance to the state as the primary referent of Security. Weaver also regards National Security as the most important level of security. State has been identified on the basis of sovereignty and the society has been explained on grounds of identity.³

Apart from the above mentioned referents international and regionalised conflicts have given way to new challenges and raised suspicions about old assumptions.⁴ Hence when the state centric approach came under criticism it was also due to emergence of a few new referents amongst whom the region and regional security gained special importance. In the regional context, security can thus be defined as ‘the environment conducive for preservation of the core values of constituent nations and the maintenance of national interests within the regions boundaries.’⁵

While dealing with the issue at the conceptual level it is considered that one of the methods to enhance such level of security is to learn from the successes and mistakes of players in other regions. In this regards the European Union is a success story which can be emulated by others.⁶ A formulation of common vision with focal points that can earn mutual gains is yet another method to

improve Regional Security. Regional Security organizations and institutes are considered essential for ensuring a common vision.

Post cold war era has widened the concept of security thus transiting its domain both top down and bottom up that includes from mere nation states to the individual or the people at lower and regional and global at the upper levels. The traditional facets of security studies dominated by state and system based approaches have now been added with other sources that include 'the individual (human security), the social group (identity and societal security), and the region'⁷. Presently, the region, by few scholars, is also considered as a referent object of security.

Strategic Importance of the Subcontinent

The sub continent is one of the poorest regions of the world yet it is one of the most resourceful. In case managed well, the region can be ushered to prosperity that would greatly contribute toward attainment of peace and stability. The presence of large energy resources around the subcontinent and periphery of Persian Gulf and Caspian Sea make this region extremely sensitive and vulnerable to external influences by the world powers. The availability of land access, through available routes, leading to the home of large mineral resources in Central Asia make the strategic significance of subcontinent even more relevant.⁸

The importance of the Indian subcontinent is also self evident from the fact that 'it holds a quarter of humanity'. It also has two nuclear powers and nowhere else in the world, two rival nuclear powers are contiguous or so close to each other. The influence of rapidly growing economy makes the area strategically important especially when this growth 'rests astride the strategic sea lane between Japan and the Persian Gulf'.⁹ The region also has close proximity to the world's three most important waterways, the Strait of Hormuz, Bab – ul – Mandeb and the Strait of Malacca where approximately 60 percent of world's oil and trade transverse through them.¹⁰ The post nuclear milieu poses a few dangers which are of serious concern especially for the United States and other western countries. It is in this backdrop that the United States former

President Bill Clinton has ascribed the subcontinent as 'the world's most dangerous region'.¹¹

The Subcontinent Security Challenges

The regional stability revolves around peace between India and Pakistan. Furthermore, a dispassionate analysis would reveal that most of the problems and issues are India centric.¹²

- From the very beginning, the subcontinent has faced numerous internal cleavages and conflicts involving cross sections of classes, social strata, ethnic and linguistic groups, religious communities and geographical regions. Both main countries i.e India and Pakistan were first exposed to modern development during colonial rule.¹³ The development has never been on the agenda of the colonial planners. Resultantly, the colonial legacy left various ethnic, linguistic and religious groups and geographical regions unevenly developed. In the backdrop of uneven development over a period of time and the absence of a politically viable national alternative, the deprived section of the society responded by seeking the proximate sources for mobilizing militancy and political pressure i.e the assertion of ethnic, linguistic, religious or regional identities.¹⁴
- Inter-state relations in subcontinent are characterised by the existence of a number of bilateral disputes which proved to be too difficult to resolve. Some of them are rooted in the historical past, others are in the current dynamics of bilateral as well as intra-state relations. The main concrete issues over which subcontinent states quarrel can be listed as: territorial disputes inherited from the colonial past like Kashmir and the demarcation of land and maritime boundaries, the sharing of the water resources of common rivers, intra-state conflict involving ethno-linguistic and religious groups with cross-border

- affiliation, conflicting economic interests and smuggling, and illegal cross-border activities.
- The social structure of South Asia is ‘diverse and conflicting’¹⁵ to which the subcontinent is no exception. A composition of heterogeneous society where linguistic, cultural, religious diversity is considered the main feature makes the subcontinent a challenge for South Asian integration.¹⁶
 - Theoretically the process of decolonization was completed with the emergence of independent India and Pakistan but subcontinent is still characterized by domestic undercurrents. Separatist trends are still a common phenomenon and there are at least sixteen such movements going on within India¹⁷. With the end of imperial rule, the newly independent states found them confronted with an environment underpinned by political and economic vacuum. The situation was further aggravated by the misperception of the nascent leadership that security and military strength are synonymous. As a result, lion share of the scarce resources were devoted towards acquiring military strength. Economic and political instabilities invited outside influence and it was made easier when the short sighted leadership laid increased dependence on external aid. Unfortunately success of most of the governments in the region is still determined by the dominance-dependence paradigm fostered by the outside powers.
 - On the socio – economic side the major challenges faced by the Subcontinent includes population explosion, mass poverty, deprivation and underdevelopment.¹⁸ Similarly, economic deprivation, illiteracy and unemployment provide worse conditions for adopting extremism and intolerance¹⁹. The Indian population of 1.16 billion, Pakistan’s 176 millions and Bangladesh’s 156 million, all of these having an average growth rate of 1.5 to 2.2 percent per year are self evident in

- exploring the root cause of the entire security spectrum.²⁰
- The plan for partition envisaged dominions of India and Pakistan and Maharajas, Nazims and Nawabs would resume sovereign status over the territories they ruled and that would be left entirely to their discretion to decide whether they wished to accede to either of the dominions²¹. What is apparent from this partition plan is that it was based on the expectation that all involved would play fair and just. What it failed to address was the inherent differences, social make-up, and historical animosity between Hindus and Muslims. As a result Indian leadership forcefully annexed most the territories, whose fate were left to the discretion of their rulers²².
 - The divergences delineated above in the historical perspective were primarily meant to highlight deep-rooted demographic contrast in the regional context. Instead of bolstering cohesion in the regional framework the constituent communities, primarily Hindus and Muslims, preferred to retain and cherish their respective identities thus confining nationalism and regionalism to their respective areas of geographic independence. This can be attributed to two reasons. First, their priorities, sensitivities, and ethos are at tangent to each other and secondly, they are divergent from within. In such a situation where legacy of social coherence is non-existent, the prospects of unity are not only bleak but further compounded by obedience and adherence to the perfidious practices that perpetrate such discord.
 - The region today faces problems like ethnic conflicts, violation of human rights, terrorism, religious turmoil and host of other serious factors.²³ Whereas the world has witnessed an overall decline in the defence related budget by 12 percent, this region has seen a rise by 35 percent.²⁴ As aptly said, “the human cost of military confrontation between India and Pakistan is becoming quite prohibitive”.²⁵

- The political milieu in the subcontinent has always been dominated by the India – Pakistan relations. The basic cause of difference remains the opposite ideologies due to two different philosophical systems of Islam and Hinduism.²⁶ The second factor of asymmetry in economic and conventional forces spheres between both countries is also instrumental in shaping the relations between both belligerents.²⁷ Finally, the most important cause of disagreement between both countries is, of course, the unresolved Kashmir issue.
- Summary of the challenges can be taken from J N Dixit's works on South Asia. These are:²⁸
 - The societies are plural in nature.²⁹
 - These are multi-lingual and multi-ethnic.³⁰
 - The societies are focussing upon national consolidation and endeavouring to create a cohesive identity for themselves.³¹
 - These confront internal imbalances in the sphere of economic development.³²
 - They confront population explosion and critical population growth and face the challenge of resolving socio-economic and cultural contradictions through democratic means.³³

The Indian Subcontinent, especially during the post 9/11 events, cannot be ignored by the world in general and the western powers in particular. Dangers and trepidation of the west of a possible nuclear proliferation, albeit not possible due to maturity in mindset and procedures adopted by both nuclear rivals, further augment the strategic and geopolitical relevance of the subcontinent within the international arena.

The Subcontinent Security's Impact on World Security

The overt nuclearization of South Asia in 1998, lead towards a sequential development of events that brought in 'paradigm changes in the subcontinent's regional security environment'.

Finally, the post 9/11 events cemented the suspicions of the world that if the Western World has to protect itself from the emerging Islamic fundamentalism and menace of terrorism it has to 'reach out to the locations from where these elements originate'.³⁴

The SAARC, due to its participant members and charter, mainly influences the political and security architecture of the Subcontinent. The Indian dominance within the region and the SAARC factor vis a vis the multilayered South Asian entity depreciate the role of SAARC.³⁵ Overall, SAARC is more of an unceremonious forum dedicated to functional cooperation rather than contributing towards cooperation and development.

Because of its centrality, Afghanistan stands as an important country that can act north – south link between Russia/CARs to Pakistan/Iran. Pakistan's interest in the transportation of CARs' energy resources to its waters is mainly dependent upon Afghanistan's peace, which as of now seems long way off. Besides a peaceful Afghanistan, Pakistan wants a friendly and amenable Afghanistan.

Afghanistan serves as an extension to the energy corridor provided by the subcontinent to the energy resources of Central Asia. In the Pakistani perspective, the important facets including the geographic contiguity and mutual interests are the main factors driving its approach towards Afghanistan. Conversely, Indian influence in Afghanistan has grown over the years wherein the provision of consulates to India close to Pakistani border is being apprehensively viewed by the Pakistan as these do not ideally serve any diplomatic purpose.³⁶

Located at strategically important mouth of the Gulf, Iran has been source of serious concern for US and the West. Her contentions with Pakistan over the issue of Taliban in Afghanistan initiated a new dimension of her increased partnership with India primarily to address her Pakistan specific concerns and her own regional isolation. Though these irritants have now been removed and perceived anti Iran threat also appears to have gone, yet Indo-Iran relationship is on the increase, apparently detrimental to

Pakistan's interests. The diverging and at times converging Pak-Iran interests are likely to keep both the countries competitively engaged. Iran's growing relations and enhanced collaboration with India in numerous projects, especially in the military and intelligence fields is a growing concern for Pakistan. No strong pro Pakistan stance may be expected from her in case of India Pakistan relations, at least in the near future.

The Pakistan – Iran relations have also been affected due to economic struggle and securing of routes to resources rich Central Asian states.³⁷ Pakistan regards relations with Iran as part of compulsions guided by history and geography. The United States – Iran relations have lead the Iranian leadership towards undertaking efforts for improving economic and political relations with Russia, India and China.

China's interests in the context of South Asia as well as other parts of the world have been in harmony with the cardinals enshrined in the Chinese Constitution. Adherence to an independent foreign policy as well as the five principles of mutual respect for sovereignty and territorial integrity, mutual non-aggression, non-interference in each other's internal affairs, equality and mutual benefit, and peaceful coexistence in developing diplomatic relations and economic and cultural exchanges with other countries have been pursued for the last fifty years. Chinese political ambitions envisaged a 'powerful and matchless force' through the unity of the Chinese people and the people of Asia³⁸.

Despite few disagreements, the relations between China and India are moving in a positive direction. On the contrary, Pakistan – China relationship has been an 'all weather'³⁹ wherein both countries have enjoyed cooperation in defence and commercial sectors have been enormous. China has been vigorously pursuing improvement in international diplomatic standing and economic development through its reform programme and Pakistan could play a significant role in the prevalent environment. However, the growing Indo – US relations are a cause of concern for China.⁴⁰

Russia's policy towards South Asia remains unchanged in the post-9/11 period, with its tilt towards India. Even before the 9/11 events, Russia and India, both facing their respective indigenous secessionist freedom movements – Kashmir in the case of India, and Chechnya in the case of Russia - have held similar views on such issues. Russia considered the rise of militant Islam to be emanating from Afghanistan under the Taliban, and was wary of Pakistan's alleged support to the Taliban regime. India and Russia are 'strategic partners', having signed the partnership declaration in October 2000.

As for Russia, terrorism and drug trafficking in the Asian context were the challenges posed by Taliban in Afghanistan. Since Taliban regime was officially recognized by Pakistan, Russia believed it amenable to Islamabad's influence. No doubt Russia believed that Pakistan could play an important role in containing the rise of Islamic fundamentalism in the region. Although these concerns have been marginalised to a very great extent in post 9/11 environment, much needs to be done for regional stability.

Granting India the status of one of the largest strategic trading partner of EU indicates the depth and extent of Indo-Europe common interests. In their relations with Pakistan, they have been following the American lead, pro or anti Pakistan. The EU has potentials to play a mediatory role between India and Pakistan. The historical pattern identifies that the Europeans have had much deeper political and social interaction with the subcontinent than any other nation in the world.⁴¹ The Central Asian market attracts European Union for energy resources. The interests of European Union will always remain in the subcontinent.

Traditionally the United States (US) security calculus has granted wavy importance to the subcontinent. The pattern of US regional interest has not been uniform, transcending from geo-political during the Cold War era to a combination of geo-economic and geo-political afterwards. Accordingly, the degree of relationship fluctuated from 'engagement' to 'forging ties', and similarly the bilateral and multilateral aid have been primarily determined in harmony with its political expediency and diplomatic goals in the region⁴². Having abandoned the support towards Pakistan after

withdrawal of USSR from Afghanistan, leading to present quagmire, the present era witnessed resurgence of special relations essentially due to the geo - strategic importance of the area.

The post 9/11 agenda expressed by the United States envisages; to combat terrorism and Islamic fundamentalism; prevention of Weapons of Mass Destruction (WMD) from so called rogue states and; denial of sophisticated technology to potentially hostile countries.⁴³ This agenda directly affects the subcontinent due to the close proximity of Afghanistan and the reliance of United States on Pakistan to support its forces operating in the Taliban infested provinces of Afghanistan. Thus US concerns primarily remain towards addressing issues of terrorism, religious extremism and nuclear proliferation.

The United States dominates South Asia to counter the post communist expansionism. It also views Pakistan and India as the energy corridors of the region from where Central Asian resources can be transported to the west. The post 9/11 events have placed the subcontinent at a geopolitical advantage where the Global War on Terrorism that is believed to emanate from Afghanistan cannot be fought and won without intimate support from this sub region. If Pakistan is vital because it plays the role of front line state in GWOT, India is also important because of its capability to be used as a counter balance against the rising Chinese threat.

The Subcontinent Security – The Way Forward

The subcontinent security requires a comprehensive approach for enhancing stability and peace within the region. Few strategies towards enhancing the sub regional stability are proffered in succeeding paragraphs.

Nowhere is the need for conflict resolution greater than in subcontinent. The sub region remains involved in tensions and conflicts. In contrast to other regions of similar potential, the subcontinent is overwhelmed with multidimensional problems. It is inhabited by one fifth of mankind, a huge proportion remains below the poverty line and deprived of the basic necessities of life⁴⁴.

Attributing such a misery to scarcity of resources would be unrealistic and is primarily due to incorrect priorities and preferences. In this context, subcontinent has a greater need as well as justification for sub regional cooperation than any other part of the world. But this can only be realised by fostering mutual trust, resolving conflicts, promoting good neighbourly relations and building confidence⁴⁵.

Successful rapprochement is a process that requires courage, imagination, and planning⁴⁶. To settle disputes in a region where legacy of bitterness and deep-rooted antagonism have developed a mind-set that perpetuates, it is important to work out strategies in addition to political will. For any strategy to be successful there has to be a realization first. The political leadership must understand that confrontation is a costly affair and its resolution will accrue mutual benefits. They must agree that geo-political realities cannot be changed by coercive means⁴⁷. Within the rapprochement process, the underlying spirit should be to facilitate positive flows and create a pragmatic framework to deal with the problems at hand.

The subcontinent security warrants a different solution that is acceptable to all stakeholders and parties to the conflict. In this regards, another viable method to improve the security situation within the subcontinent is adoption of a managerial approach. This approach includes cultural relationships, people-to-people contacts and other non-serious issues to be taken on and mutual agreements should be reached upon. This will create an environment of cooperation and understanding and remove suspicions amongst each other. Thereafter, serious issues can be considered after ground for such intricate matters has already been prepared. It could bring the belligerents so close that issues will not remain the same and their sensitivity to the problem will become meaningless

The subcontinent's security, to a large extent, depends on optimistic extra-regional influences instead of exploitative manipulation. Like any other region, positive and enduring environment in this sub region requires comparative international stability, justice, and transparency in world politics. This sounds rather utopian and reality is often not so simplistic. However,

despite inhospitable ground realities, a positive turn can be expected in-line with the extra-regional influences in the region. This does not mean total disengagement of their involvement in the political, military, and economic affairs of the region but there is a need to strike a balance between accomplishment of interests and the extent of domestic abuse. This entails an understanding and realization that undue pressure would only worsen the prevailing regional environment with consequences on global security milieu.

In retrospect, financial assistance and aid has been used as a means to influence domestic and foreign policies of the donees⁴⁸. Aid policy towards the subcontinent has functionally been shaped by the status, ideology and influence of each country within the regional as well as global system. The quality, quantity, and level of aid and technology provided to each country of the region suggests that principal financial institutions do not take a realistic view of economic development problems and processes in the region⁴⁹. A plausible solution to address this issue is to develop a consensual framework of regional economic order, most suited to its needs, preferences, and priorities⁵⁰. An integrated approach is needed for the distribution of resources and transfer of technical know-how. This would decrease their dependency on external aid. This would not only boost their economies but also help confidence-building process among the member nations to expand trade links and share their resources with other members. The impact of the strategy of economic self-reliance would be positive for the sub region.

Security architecture is considered appropriate in the subcontinent milieu. The pillars mentioned below will transform the structure into a proactive problem solving approach. The pillars are explained as follows:

- Strategic restraint between Pakistan and India including avoidance of nuclear arms and missile race.⁵¹
- Peaceful settlement of issues through dialogue and developing of a mechanism to settle them through bilateral and multilateral arrangements.⁵²

- Economic and social revival of the subcontinent through increasing people – to – people contacts, regional cooperation, increase in trade and investment.⁵³
- Increase in cooperation between Asian sub – regions to improve the existing state of security.⁵⁴
- Treaty on conventional arms control between Pakistan and India.
- Increase in regional cooperation through utilisation of good offices of SAARC.

The confidence building process is a European product that has successfully contributed towards conflict resolution. It is a prelude or more precisely a pre – requisite for any conflict resolution process.⁵⁵ In the same manner, 2001 – 2002 witnessed initiation of CBMs between India and Pakistan. The measures focussed upon ‘bilateral and / or unilateral’ agreements on issues of importance and controversy.⁵⁶

Many countries, especially most third world countries, agree that a new world order should be founded on the basis of the Five Principles of Peaceful Coexistence. Only when we replace the old order based upon hegemonism and power politics with a new type of order based upon these principles we can genuinely safeguard world peace and security, guarantee small nation’s independence, sovereignty and territorial integrity. This is the fundamental approach to the resolution of peace and security problems.

South Asia is a place where the Five Principles of Peaceful Coexistence was initiated and, moreover, some countries here have maintained friendly relations with their neighbours for a long time according to the criteria of the five principles and played a very important role in regional peace and security affairs.

There is a requirement to have a new subcontinent order that can ensure security and safeguard the interests of the member states. The new subcontinent order will enable resolution of complex issues in a congenial atmosphere. It will also help towards looking after

each other's common interests and respecting the concerns at the same time.

The Kashmir dispute lies at the 'core of problems between Pakistan and India'.⁵⁷ Peace within the subcontinent is contingent to solution of this problem. In order to move towards any solid conclusion both sides will have to display flexibility that is the pre requisite any meaningful settlement.

The region needs to be stable from within and initiatives like no-war pact and treaty of friendship need to be coupled with measures to cure the root causes rather than symptoms i.e. antagonism based on historical cleavages. These internal guarantees would prove far more efficacious than external ones. The task is rather more laborious than it seems.⁵⁸

What merits is an institutionalized arrangement, aimed at understanding each other and fostering the spirit of restraint and tolerance. Respecting each other's religious and traditional sensitivities would be a good start point followed by pragmatic initiatives by respective religious hierarchies. All this will only be possible in an environment, created by political leadership, conducive for such an initiative.⁵⁹

The subcontinent history is full of examples where natural calamities and disasters have adversely affected the communities. These warrant establishment of Subcontinent Emergency Relief Cell or Emergency Reconciliation and Rehabilitation Agency at the sub regional level. The proposed Subcontinent Crisis Management Cell (SCMC) can be developed as part of SAARC. The SCMC will have the task to provide early warning with instruments installed at the regional level, support relief support operations and coordinate and, if necessary, prioritize aid with NGOs and other donor agencies.

Conclusions

- Strategically, the subcontinent is one of the most significant regions. Inherently it is affluent in terms of natural and human resources. Moreover, its geo-

strategic importance lends more credence in the global context. Unfortunately, it has been turbulent and finding durable security is an intricate affair. The situation confronted seems to stem out from fractured domestic and international environment.

- The nuclear dimension, wherein both nuclear rivals are placed eyeball to eyeball, makes this sub region as one of the most perilous place on the earth. The situation becomes more precarious with the unresolved Kashmir dispute that is undisputedly the most dangerous flashpoint.
- In pursuance of regional stability, the process needs to be replaced by processes of integration and interdependence by recourse to coordinated and purposeful efforts. The objectives of peace and development are only attainable through flexible and cooperative attitudes.
- The subcontinent security is squashed in between two major variances. Whereas, on one hand, it faces daunting challenges of a pluralistic society, population explosion, economic deprivation, unemployment, terrorism and poverty, on the other, mostly interests of the stakeholders govern the sub region. Mostly these clash with the challenges and compel the subcontinent powers to focus asymmetrical energies in gratifying the Great Powers at the cost of sub regional and communal development. The contemporary subcontinent security challenges have to be addressed through an institutionalized mechanism that can address the issues in a wholesome manner otherwise the entire regional stability will remain in an abject state.
- The post 9/11 milieu has altered the world security apparatus. The above mentioned security challenges are being exploited by the small percentage of extremist elements to breed terrorism within Pakistani soil. Pakistan, today, serves as major ally and a front line state in the GWOT.

- The looming energy crisis, with its implications in the near future, within the region further affects the subcontinent security matrix.
- The ways forward encompass political stability, resolution of all outstanding disputes including the core issue of Kashmir and implementing the concept of peaceful co - existence. Regional cooperation and access towards other Asian cooperation mechanisms and alliances (ASEAN, ARF and SCO) has to be viewed within a broader context. However, this remains incomplete without making the available SAARC forum more efficacious.
- In exposition, the subcontinent security dictates the South Asian security and affects the international security, hence the commitment and sincerity within the sub region forms the edifice for constructing a sturdy and an effervescent sub regional security.

Recommendations

- There is a need to formulate a think tank to reassess the security challenges of the 21st Century. The recommendations by the group will form the basis for developing a comprehensive response strategy.
- The subcontinent must look for harnessing external efforts and aids, especially during crisis and emergencies. A sincere sub regional structure, accepted by all, will oversee the economic, regional and political interests in a more meaningful manner.
- Resolute efforts are required to solve the Kashmir Dispute. The managerial approach, that would convert issues into non issues, is required to be adopted in an institutionalized manner.
- Regional cooperation in subcontinent should be based on the principles of sovereignty, equality, territorial integrity, political independence, non-interference in affairs of other states and mutual benefits. Such a strategy must consider developing SAARC into a forum for regional cooperation on all

matters that will accelerate integration of the region. Hence SAARC forum needs a complete rework. The forum must incorporate security and interstate predicaments that affect the harmony amongst member states.

- The continued crisis between India and Pakistan can be resolved by the active involvement of the US, whose presence substantially improves the chances of sub regional stability. The international community, including the UN, should also be asked to play an active and sincere role in this regard.
- Finally, the issues of environmental threats and the overarching concept of human security that will also cater for human resource management at sub regional level must be given a serious thought.

Notes

¹ Dietrich Fischer, *Non Military Aspects of Security: A System Approach* (United Nations Institute for Disarmament Research – UNDIR, 1993), p. 5.

² Srinivas Chary, South Asia Approaches the Millennium: Reexamining National Security, *The Journal of Asian Studies*; Aug 1996; 55, 3; ABI/ INFORM Global, p. 773.

³ Bary Buzan, Ole Weaver and Jaap de Wilde (eds.), *Security: A New Framework for Analysis*, (Lynne Rienner Publishers, London, 1988), p. 67.

⁴ James J Hentz, Ed, *New and Critical Security and Regionalism: Beyond the Nation State*, (Ashgate Publishing Limited, Aldershot, 2002), p. 203.

⁵ Ibid.

⁶ Steven L Spiegel, Regional Security and Level of Analysis Problem, p. 86.

⁷ Gunhild Hoogensen, Bottoms Up! A Toast to Regional Security? Featured Book Reviews, *International Studies Review* (2005), Number 7, [online], Available at Blackwell Synergy, (Accessed : 12 Dec 2008), pp. 269 – 274, this p. 269.

⁸ Charles Undeland and Nicholas Platt, quoted in C Uday Bhaskar, 'Pakistan in New Post Cold War Strategic Context', *Strategic Analysis*, January 1996, p. 1306.

⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰ Ibid, p. 52.

¹¹ Robert Harvey, *Global Disorder*, (Carroll and Graf Publishers, New York, 2003), p.157.

¹² Sahir S Mirza, *Subcontinent Security: The Present, The Way Forward And Its Impact On The Wider World*, MSc Global Security Dissertation, Department of Defence Management and Security Analysis, 2007.

¹³ Abdus Sabur, *South Asian Security in the Post Cold War Era: Issues and Outlook*, ed. Iftekhharuzzaman, "South Asian Security: Primacy of Internal Dimension", pp. 6 -15.

¹⁴ Asgar Ali, (Ed), *Ethnic Conflicts in South Asia*, "The Crisis of a Promise of South Asia", Ponna Wigna Raja and Akmal Hussain, pp. 22 – 25. Also see Sarfraz Muhammad, South Asian security – Problems and Future Prospects, *Defence Research Paper*, Joint Services Command and Staff College, Advanced Command and Staff Course Number 7.

¹⁵ J N Dixit, *India – Pakistan in War and Peace*, (Routledge, London, 2002), Chapter 4.

¹⁶ B. M Jain, *South Asian Security: Problems and Prospects*, (Sangam Books, London, 1987), pp. 16 - 17.

¹⁷ Dr. Shireen M. Mazari, *South Asia 2010: The Instability Factor* by, Institute of Strategic Islamabad.

¹⁸ Maleeha Lodhi, Security Challenges in South Asia, *The Non-proliferation Review*, Summer 2001, p. 118. Also see Sahir S Mirza, *Op cit.*, p.38.

¹⁹ Ibid.

²⁰ Asian Development Bank Report (2006), [online], Available at www.adb.org, (Accessed: 11 Nov 2008), p. 52. Also see http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/South_Asia (Accessed: 10 Mar 2009)

²¹ J N Dixit, *India-Pakistan in War and Peace*, Chapter IV.

²² J N Dixit, *India-Pakistan in War and Peace*, p112.

²³ Ibid.

²⁴ Ibid.

²⁵ A. K Thakur, *Op cit.*, p.107.

²⁶ Rifaat Hussain, *Security and Cooperation in South Asia*, (----), pp. 117 – 118.

²⁷ Ibid.

²⁸ J N Dixit, Future of Security in South Asia, published in *Security in South Asia – Trends and Directions*, pp.7-8, [online], Available at <http://helios.hampshire.pages/southasia.html>, (Accessed: 10 Dec 2008). Also see Sahir S Mirza, *Op cit.*, p.39.

²⁹ Ibid.

³⁰ Ibid.

³¹ Ibid.

³² Ibid.

³³ Ibid.

³⁴ Hugh Tinker, *Political Forces in Asia*, [online], Available at Blackwell Synergy, (Accessed: 11 Dec 2008), pp. 21 – 23, this, p. 21.

³⁵ Kanak Mani Dixit, India Realizing South Asia, *Himal SouthAsian*, March 2007, [online], Available at: <http://www.himalmag.com/2007/march/cover1.htm>, (Accessed: 06 Nov 2008), p.3.

³⁶ See for example internet, <http://www.csmonitor.com/2003/0912/p07s01-wosc.html>, (Accessed: 13 Dec 2008).

³⁷ Ibid.

³⁸ Dr. Maqbool Bhatti, Institute of Strategic Studies, Islamabad.

- ³⁹ Chinese Ministry of Foreign Affairs, internet, <http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/eng/wjz/zwjg/zwbd/t217938.htm> , (Accessed: 05 Jan 2009)
- ⁴⁰ Hasan Askari Rizvi, *Pakistan and the Geo - Strategic Environment* (Saint Martin Press, 1993), p. 138.
- ⁴¹ “EU and South-Asia”, *The Dawn*, Daily Newspaper, September 7, 2001.
- ⁴² B M Jain, *South Asian Security Problems and Prospects*, p 49.
- ⁴³ Dr Maqbool Ahmed Bhatti , *Great Powers and South Asia*, (Institute of Regional Studies, Islamabad,1996), p.15.
- ⁴⁴ Niaz A. Naik, *Security Organisation For South Asia: Mechanism for Conflict Resolution in South Asia*.
- ⁴⁵ Iftikharuzzaman, *South Asia’s Security – Primacy of Internal Dimension*, p167.
- ⁴⁶ Ashok Kumar, *Future of Geo-politics in Asia*, Chapter 10.
- ⁴⁷ Ibid.
- ⁴⁸ B M Jain, *South Asian Security Problems and Prospects*, pp. 146 - 156.
- ⁴⁹ Ibid.
- ⁵⁰ Ibid, p 147.
- ⁵¹ Maleeha Lodhi, *Security Challenges in South Asia*, *The Non-proliferation Review*, Summer 2001, p. 120.
- ⁵² Shaukat Aziz, Prime Minister of Pakistan, *Pakistan: Anchor for Regional Peace and Security*, Lecture delivered on 23 January 2006, Heritage Lectures, Number 929, Published by The Heritage Foundation,), [online], Available at www.heritage.org/research/asiaandthepacific/hl929.cfm, (Accessed: 12 Dec 2008), p.3.
- ⁵³ Maleeha Lodhi, *Security Challenges in South Asia*, *Op. cit.*, p. 120.
- ⁵⁴ Shaukat Aziz, Prime Minister of Pakistan, *Pakistan: Anchor for Regional Peace and Security*, *Op. cit.*, p. 3.
- ⁵⁵ Tariq Rauf, *Confidence Building and Security – Building Measures in the Nuclear Asia with relevance to South Asia*, *Contemporary South Asia*, Number 14 (2), June 2005, pp. 175 – 189, [online], Available at Routledge Taylor and Francis Group, DOI: 10.1080/09584930500314292, (Accessed : 14 Dec 2008).
- ⁵⁶ Ibid, p. 185.
- ⁵⁷ Mr Shaukat Aziz, Prime Minister of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, ‘Dynamics of Pakistan’s Foreign Policy in the New World Order’, *Op. cit.*, p. 3.
- ⁵⁸ Sarfraz Muhammad, *South Asian security – Problems and Future Prospects*, *Defence Research Paper*, Joint Services Command and Staff College, Advanced Command and Staff Course Number 7, p. 30.
- ⁵⁹ Ibid.

GUIDELINES FOR CONTRIBUTORS

NDU Journal is published by National Defence University, Islamabad. The journal consists of selected papers on issues of global, regional and internal significance by faculty and members of the courses at the National Defence University. Manuscripts of 4500–6000 words along with an Abstract of 150-200 words are preferred. All manuscripts should be typed in double-space. Author's biodata not exceeding up to 12 lines should accompany the manuscript. Soft copy as well as hard copy of manuscripts should be sent to the editor at the following address:-

Editor, NDU Journal
Institute for Strategic Studies, Research and Analysis (ISSRA)
National Defence University
Sector E-9, Islamabad, Pakistan
Email: disp@ndu.edu.pk

Referencing: Footnotes should be based on *The Chicago Manual of Style*. Examples are cited hereunder:

Reference to a Book: S. M. Burke, *Pakistan's Foreign Policy: An Historical Analysis*, (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1988), p. 118.

Reference to a Journal: Ali A Mazrui, "Has a Clash of Civilisations Begun? From the Cold War of Ideology to a Hot War of Religion", *IPRI Journal*, Vol. VI, No. 2 (Summer 2006), p. 17.

Reference to a Newspaper article: Pervaiz Iqbal Cheema, "Analysing the SAARC Summit", *The Post* (Islamabad), 23 November 2009.

Reference to a Newspaper: *Dawn* (Islamabad), 30 July 2009.